



Plenary sitting

A8-0148/2018

26.4.2018

REPORT

on the proposal for a decision of the European Parliament and of the Council
on the mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund
(application from Belgium – EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar)
(COM(2018)0156 – C8-0125/2018 – 2018/2043(BUD))

Committee on Budgets

Rapporteur: Eider Gardiazabal Rubial

CONTENTS

	Page
MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION	3
ANNEX: DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL.....	7
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT.....	9
ANNEX: LETTER OF THE COMMITTEE ON EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS	12
ANNEX: LETTER OF THE COMMITTEE ON REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT	15
INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE	16
FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE.....	17

MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

**on the proposal for a decision of the European Parliament and of the Council on the mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (application from Belgium – EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar)
(COM(2018)0156 – C8-0125/2018 – 2018/2043(BUD))**

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the European Parliament and the Council (COM(2018)0156 – C8-0125/2018),
 - having regard to Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 on the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (2014-2020) and repealing Regulation (EC) No 1927/2006¹ (EGF Regulation),
 - having regard to Council Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 1311/2013 of 2 December 2013 laying down the multiannual financial framework for the years 2014-2020², and in particular Article 12 thereof,
 - having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 2 December 2013 between the European Parliament, the Council and the Commission on budgetary discipline, on cooperation in budgetary matters and on sound financial management³ (IIA of 2 December 2013), and in particular point 13 thereof,
 - having regard to the trilogue procedure provided for in point 13 of the IIA of 2 December 2013,
 - having regard to the letter of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs,
 - having regard to the letter of the Committee on Regional Development,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgets (A8-0148/2018),
- A. whereas the Union has set up legislative and budgetary instruments to provide additional support to workers who are suffering from the consequences of major structural changes in world trade patterns or of the global financial and economic crisis, and to assist their reintegration into the labour market;
- B. whereas the Union's financial assistance to workers made redundant should be dynamic and made available as quickly and efficiently as possible;
- C. whereas Belgium submitted application EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar for a financial contribution from the EGF, following 2 287 redundancies in the economic sector classified under NACE Rev. 2 division 28 (Manufacture of machinery and equipment) in the NUTS level 2 Hainaut region BE32 in Belgium;

¹ OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 855.

² OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 884.

³ OJ C 373, 20.12.2013, p. 1.

- D. whereas the application is based on the intervention criteria of point (a) of Article 4(1) of the EGF Regulation, which requires at least 500 workers being made redundant over a reference period of four months in an enterprise in a Member State, including workers made redundant by suppliers and downstream producers and/or self-employed persons whose activity has ceased;
1. Agrees with the Commission that the conditions set out in Article 4(1) of the EGF Regulation are met and that Belgium is entitled to a financial contribution of EUR 4 621 616 under that Regulation, which represents 60 % of the total cost of EUR 7 702 694;
 2. Notes that the Belgian authorities submitted the application on 18 December 2017 and that, following the provision of additional information by Belgium, the Commission finalised its assessment on 23 March 2018 and notified it to Parliament on the same day;
 3. Recalls that this is the second application from Belgium for a financial contribution from the EGF in relation to redundancies at Caterpillar, following application EGF/2014/011 BE/Caterpillar in July 2014 and a positive decision thereon¹; notes that there is no overlap between the workers supported through that case and the current application;
 4. Notes that Belgium argues that the redundancies are linked to major structural changes in world trade patterns due to globalisation, to worldwide competition in the construction and mining machinery sectors, and to the consequent decrease in the Caterpillar Group's share in the machinery market; notes that the redundancies are related to the restructuring and cost-cutting global plan announced by Caterpillar in September 2015;
 5. Expresses concern that, as a result of less restrictive environmental regulation and lower labour costs, firms operating in third countries may be more competitive than those operating in the Union;
 6. Is aware of the decrease in production of the mining sector in Europe and the dramatic decline in EU-28 exports in that sector since 2014, the increase in the European steel price and the high production costs for machines resulting therefrom, in particular compared to China; regrets, however, that the Caterpillar Group has decided to allocate the volumes produced in the Gosselies plant to other production units in France (Grenoble) and to other plants outside Europe, including China and South Korea; which resulted in an abrupt shut down of the Gosselies site and the making redundant of 2 300 workers, plunging thousands of families into a social and human drama even though the Gosselies site was profitable, in particular following the investments made in previous years;
 7. Deplores that the workers of the Gosselies site were informed of the closure of the site by a simple communiqué; deplores the fact that this brutal decision was not made in consultation with the local and regional authorities; deplores the total lack of information and respect for workers and union representatives, who received no information prior to

¹ Decision (EU) 2015/471 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 March 2015 on the mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (application EGF/2014/011 BE/Caterpillar, from Belgium) (OJ L 76, 20.3.2015, p. 58).

the closure of the company; insists, therefore, on the importance of strengthening the supply of information to and consultation with workers in the Union;

8. Insists on the mitigation of the socio-economic consequences for the Charleroi region and the making sustained efforts for its economic recovery, in particular with the help of the European Structural and Investment Funds;
9. Recalls that the redundancies in Caterpillar are expected to have a significant adverse effect on the local economy; stresses the impact of that decision on many workers in suppliers and downstream producers;
10. Notes that the application relates to 2 287 workers made redundant at Caterpillar and five suppliers, the majority of whom are between 30 and 54 years of age; points also to the fact that more than 11 % of the redundant workers are between 55 and 64 years of age with skills specific to the manufacturing sector; underlines that the job seekers in Charleroi are mostly low-skilled (50,6 % do not have an upper secondary education) and 40 % are long-term unemployed (more than 24 months); deplors the fact that, following those redundancies, the unemployment rate is expected to rise by 6,1 % in the region of Hainaut, according to the Public Employment Service of Wallonia (FOREM); in light of this fact, acknowledges the importance of active labour market measures co-funded by the EGF for improving the chances of reintegration in the labour market of these groups;
11. Welcomes the fact that personalised services co-financed by the EGF will also be provided to up to 300 young people under the age of 30 not in employment, education or training (NEETs);
12. Notes that Belgium is planning five types of actions for the redundant workers and NEETs covered by this application: (i) individual job search assistance, case management and general information services, (ii) training and re-training, (iii) promotion of entrepreneurship, (iv) contribution to business start up, (v) allowances; stresses that it must be ensured that the financial help is effective and focused;
13. Welcomes the decision to provide training courses designed to match the development priorities of Charleroi set out in the CATCH plan¹;
14. Is content that the income support measures will account for 13,68 % of the overall package of personalised measures, well below the maximum 35 % set out in the EGF Regulation, and that those measures are conditional on the active participation of the targeted beneficiaries in job-search or training activities;
15. Welcomes the fact that the coordinated package of personalised services was drawn up in consultation with a working group, which included the Public Employment Service for Wallonia, the investment fund SOGEPa, the representatives of the trade unions and other social partners; calls on the Belgian and Walloon authorities to actively participate in the process;

¹ Plan Catalysts for Charleroi (CATCH), Accélérer la Croissance de l'Emploi dans la Région de Charleroi, September 2017, <http://www.catch-charleroi.be/>.

16. Recalls its resolution of 5 October 2016 on the need for a European reindustrialisation policy in the light of the recent Caterpillar and Alstom cases, voted by a large majority, which calls for Europe to deploy a genuine industrial policy based in particular on research and development and innovation, but also emphasizes the importance of protecting Union industry from unfair commercial practices in third countries;
17. Notes that the Belgian authorities have provided assurances that the proposed actions will not receive financial support from other Union funds or financial instruments, that any double financing will be prevented and that they will be complementary to actions funded by the Structural Funds;
18. Reiterates that assistance from the EGF must not replace actions which are the responsibility of companies, by virtue of national law or collective agreements, or measures for restructuring companies or sectors;
19. Stresses that as of 15 March 2018, only 591 of the dismissed workers had found a job; insists, therefore, that an analysis be carried out at the end of the EGF intervention period in order to assess whether further reintegration aid should be deployed; regrets that the previous decision on the mobilisation of the EGF concerning this company (EGF/2014/011) led to a relatively low percentage of beneficiaries becoming reemployed; hopes that the current proposal will take account of this experience;
20. Recalls that in line with Article 7 of the EGF Regulation, the design of the coordinated package of personalised services should anticipate future labour market perspectives and required skills and should be compatible with the shift towards a resource-efficient and sustainable economy;
21. Calls on the Commission to urge national authorities to provide more details, in future proposals, on the sectors which have growth prospects and are therefore likely to hire people, as well as to gather substantiated data on the impact of the EGF funding, including on the quality of jobs and the reintegration rate achieved through the EGF;
22. Recalls its appeal to the Commission to assure public access to all the documents related to EGF cases;
23. Approves the decision annexed to this resolution;
24. Instructs its President to sign the decision with the President of the Council and arrange for its publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union*;
25. Instructs its President to forward this resolution, including its Annex, to the Council and the Commission.

ANNEX: DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL

on the mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund following an application from Belgium – EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar

THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND THE COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION,

Having regard to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,

Having regard to Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 on the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (2014-2020) and repealing Regulation (EC) No 1927/2006¹, and in particular Article 15(4) thereof,

Having regard to the Interinstitutional Agreement of 2 December 2013 between the European Parliament, the Council and the Commission on budgetary discipline, on cooperation in budgetary matters and on sound financial management², and in particular point 13 thereof,

Having regard to the proposal from the European Commission,

Whereas:

(1) The European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (EGF) aims to provide support for workers made redundant and self-employed persons whose activity has ceased as a result of major structural changes in world trade patterns due to globalisation, as a result of a continuation of the global financial and economic crisis, or as a result of a new global financial and economic crisis, and to assist them with their reintegration into the labour market.

(2) The EGF is not to exceed a maximum annual amount of EUR 150 million (2011 prices), as laid down in Article 12 of Council Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 1311/2013³.

(3) On 18 December 2017, Belgium submitted an application to mobilise the EGF, in respect of redundancies in Caterpillar Solar Gosselines and its 5 suppliers. It was supplemented by additional information provided in accordance with Article 8(3) of Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013. That application complies with the requirements for determining a financial contribution from the EGF as laid down in Article 13 of Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013.

¹ OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 855.

² OJ C 373, 20.12.2013, p. 1.

³ Council Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 1311/2013 of 2 December 2013 laying down the multiannual financial framework for the years 2014-2020 (OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 884).

(4) In accordance with Article 6(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013, Belgium has decided to provide personalised services co-financed by the EGF also to 300 young persons not in employment, education or training (NEETs).

(5) The EGF should, therefore, be mobilised in order to provide a financial contribution of EUR 4 621 616 in respect of the application submitted by Belgium.

(6) In order to minimise the time taken to mobilise the EGF, this decision should apply from the date of its adoption,

HAVE ADOPTED THIS DECISION:

Article 1

For the general budget of the Union for the financial year 2018, the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund shall be mobilised to provide the amount of EUR 4 621 616 in commitment and payment appropriations.

Article 2

This Decision shall enter into force on the day of its publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union*. It shall apply from [*the date of its adoption*]*.

Done at Brussels,

For the European Parliament

For the Council

The President

The President

* Date to be inserted by the Parliament before the publication in OJ.

EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

I. Background

The European Globalisation Adjustment Fund has been created in order to provide additional assistance to workers suffering from the consequences of major structural changes in world trade patterns.

According to the provisions of Article 12 of Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 1311/2013 laying down the multiannual financial framework for the years 2014-2020¹ and of Article 15 of Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013², the Fund may not exceed a maximum annual amount of EUR 150 million (2011 prices). The appropriate amounts are entered into the general budget of the Union as a provision.

As concerns the procedure, according to point 13 of the Interinstitutional Agreement of 2 December 2013 between the European Parliament, the Council and the Commission on budgetary discipline, on cooperation in budgetary matters and on sound financial management³, in order to activate the Fund the Commission, in case of a positive assessment of an application, presents to the budgetary authority a proposal for mobilisation of the Fund and, at the same time, a corresponding request for transfer. In the event of disagreement, a trilogue shall be initiated.

II. Belgium's application and the Commission's proposal

On 18 December 2017, the Commission adopted a proposal for a decision on the mobilisation of the EGF in favour of Belgium to support the reintegration in the labour market of workers made redundant by Caterpillar Solar Gosselies (Caterpillar) and five suppliers operating in the economic sector classified under NACE Rev. 2 division 28 (Manufacture of machinery and equipment). The redundancies made by the enterprises are located in the NUTS level 2 Hainaut region BE32. The proposal was transmitted to the European Parliament on 23 March 2018.

This is the fourth application to be examined under the 2018 budget and the fifteenth in the economic sector classified under the NACE Rev. 2 division 28 (Manufacture of machinery and equipment) since the establishment of the EGF. It concerns 2 287 workers made redundant and refers to the mobilisation of a total amount of EUR 4 621 616 from the EGF for Belgium.

The application was sent to the Commission on 18 December 2017 and supplemented by additional information by 4 February 2018. The Commission finalised its assessment on 23 March 2018 and has concluded, in accordance with all applicable provisions of the EGF Regulation, that the application meets the conditions for a financial contribution from the EGF, as referred to in Article 4(1) of the EGF Regulation.

¹ OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 884.

² OJ L 347, 20.12.2013, p. 855.

³ OJ C 373, 20.12.2013, p. 1.

Belgium argues that the redundancies are linked to major structural changes in world trade patterns due to globalisation, the worldwide competition in the construction and mining machinery sectors, and the consequent loss of machinery market share by Caterpillar. The fall in the mining sector's production in Europe (decrease from EUR 234 million in 2012 to EUR 180 million in 2015), the dramatic decline in EU 28 exports since 2014, the increase in the European steel price and the high production costs for machines resulting therefrom have led to the reduction in workforce at the Caterpillar site in Gosselies.

The dismissals occurred in the Hainaut region, which is facing a high unemployment rate. The job seekers in Charleroi are mostly low-skilled (50,6 % without an upper secondary education) and 40 % are long-term unemployed.

A large number of redundant workers are men. The large majority of them are between 30 and 54 years old, whilst 11,51 % are between 55 and 64 years old. Up to 300 are young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs) under the age of 30. Active labour market measures co-funded by the EGF are all the more important for improving the chances of reintegration in the labour market of these groups.

The five types of actions to be provided to redundant workers and for which EGF co-funding is requested consist of:

– Individual job search assistance, case management and general information services. These measures include personalised job search assistance, such as counselling and career guidance, as well as open information services for workers and NEETs.

– Training and re-training: This includes vocational and continuing training addressed to workers and NEETs.

– Promotion of entrepreneurship: This measure will provide the participants with a system of support for entrepreneurs, which foresees a close collaboration with the regional authorities dedicated to support self-employment.

– Contribution to business Start up: This measure will provide start-up grants to promote self-employment, the creation of business activity, to launch and establish a full-time or a part-time business.

– Allowances: These include training allowances; mobility allowances for longer commuting distance; back to education allowances; job search allowances; and entrepreneurship allowance.

According to the Commission, the described measures constitute active labour market measures within the eligible actions set out in Article 7 of the EGF Regulation and do not substitute passive social protection measures.

The Belgian authorities have provided all necessary assurances regarding the following:

- the principles of equality of treatment and non-discrimination will be respected in the access to the proposed actions and their implementation,
- the requirements laid down in national and EU legislation concerning collective redundancies have been complied with,

- the dismissing enterprises, which have continued their activities after the lay-offs, have complied with their legal obligations governing the redundancies and provided for their workers accordingly,
- the proposed actions will not receive financial support from other Union funds or financial instruments and any double financing will be prevented,
- the proposed actions will be complementary with actions funded by the Structural Funds,
- the financial contribution from the EGF will comply with the procedural and material Union rules on State aid.

Belgium has notified the Commission that the source of national pre-financing or co-funding are the Walloon Public Employment Service (FOREM) and the Region of Wallonia. The financial contribution will be managed and controlled by the same bodies which are responsible for the European Social Fund (ESF).

III. Procedure

In order to mobilise the Fund, the Commission has submitted to the Budgetary Authority a request to transfer a global amount of EUR 4 621 616 from the EGF reserve (40 02 43) to the EGF budget line (04 04 01).

This is the fourth transfer proposal for the mobilisation of the Fund transmitted to the Budgetary Authority to date during 2018.

The trilogue procedure shall be initiated in the event of disagreement, as provided for in Article 15(4) of the EGF Regulation.

According to an internal agreement, the Employment and Social Affairs Committee should be associated to the process, in order to provide constructive support and contribute to the assessment of the applications from the Fund.

ANNEX: LETTER OF THE COMMITTEE ON EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS

D(2018)16023

Mr Jean Arthuis
Chair of the Committee on Budgets
ASP 09G205

Subject: Opinion on the mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (EGF) for the case EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar

Dear Chair,

The Committee on Employment and Social Affairs (EMPL) as well as its Working Group on the EGF examined the mobilisation of the EGF for the case EGF/2017/010 BE/Caterpillar and adopted the following opinion.

The EMPL committee and the Working Group on the EGF are in favour of the mobilisation of the Fund concerning this request. In this respect, the EMPL committee presents some remarks without, however, putting into question the transfer of the payments.

The deliberations of the EMPL committee are based on the following considerations:

- A) Whereas this application is based on Article 4(1)(a) of Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013 (EGF Regulation) and relates to 2 287 workers made redundant by Caterpillar – Solar Gosselies and five suppliers operating in in the economic sectors classified under the NACE Revision 2 Division 28 (Manufacture of machinery and equipment n.e.c.);
- B) Whereas, to establish the link between the redundancies and major structural changes in world trade patterns due to globalisation, Belgium argues that the main reason behind the workforce reductions is the worldwide competition in the construction and mining machinery sectors, and the consequent loss of machinery market share by Caterpillar;
- C) Whereas 92,47% of the workers targeted by the measure are men and 7,53% are women; whereas 85,34% of the targeted beneficiaries are aged between 30 and 54 years, while 11,51% are between 55 and 64 years;
- D) Whereas, in 2014, Belgium made an EGF application covering 1 399 workers at this enterprise and the current proposal includes the remaining 1 997 workers at the site.

Therefore, the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs calls on the Committee on Budgets, as the committee responsible, to integrate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution concerning the Belgian application:

1. Agrees with the Commission that the intervention criteria set out in Article 4(1)(a) of the Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013 are met and that, therefore, Belgium is entitled to a financial contribution of EUR 4 621 616 under this Regulation which represents 60% of the total cost of EUR 7 702 694;
2. Emphasises that the region of Hainaut's unemployment rate is expected to rise by 6,1% and that job seekers in Charleroi are mostly low-skilled and that there is a high proportion of long-term unemployment;
3. Welcomes the decision to provide training courses designed to match the development priorities of Charleroi set out in the CATCH plan¹;
4. Welcomes Belgium's decision to draw up the co-ordinated package of personalised services in consultation with a working group, which included the Public Employment Service for Wallonia, SOGEPa², trade unions representatives and other social partners.
5. Is content to see that the income support measures will be 13,68% of the overall package of personalised measures, well below the maximum 35% set out in the Regulation; and that these actions are conditional on the active participation of the targeted beneficiaries in job-search or training activities;
6. Notes that the EGF co-funded personalised services for the redundant workers include individual job search assistance, case management and general information services, training and re-training, promotion of entrepreneurship, contributions to business start up, and allowances;
7. Regrets that the previous EGF mobilisation concerning this company (EGF/2014/011) led to a relatively low percentage of beneficiaries becoming reemployed; hopes that the current proposal will take account of this experience;
8. Welcomes the decision to provide personalised services co-financed by the EGF to up to 300 young people not in employment, education or training (NEETs) under the age of 30 in view of the high level of youth unemployment in this region;
9. Expresses concern that the third-country firms may be more competitive than those operating in the EU as a result of less restrictive environmental regulation and lower hourly labour costs;
10. Notes that the Belgian authorities have provided assurances that the proposed actions will not receive financial support from other Union funds or financial instruments, that any double financing will be prevented and that they will be complementary with actions funded by the Structural Funds;

¹ Plan CATCH, Accélérer la Croissance de l'Emploi dans la Région de Charleroi, Septembre 2017
<http://www.catch-charleroi.be/>

² Sogepa is as an investment fund that provides investment services and accompanies business reorganization initiatives driven by credible and sustainable economic and industrial projects.

11. Welcomes Belgium's confirmation that a financial contribution from the EGF will not replace actions the enterprise concerned is required to take by virtue of national law or pursuant to collective agreements;
12. Recalls that in line with Article 7 of the Regulation, the design of the coordinated package of personalised services should anticipate future labour market perspectives and required skills and should be compatible with the shift towards a resource-efficient and sustainable economy.

Yours sincerely,

Marita ULVSKOG

Acting EMPL Chair

ANNEX: LETTER OF THE COMMITTEE ON REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Mr Jean ARTHUIS
Chairman
Committee on Budgets
European Parliament

Subject: **Mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund**

Dear Mr Arthuis,

A Commission proposal for a decision to mobilise the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (EGF) has been referred for opinion to the Committee on Regional Development. I understand that it is intended that a report on this will be adopted in the Committee on Budgets on 23-24 April 2018:

- **COM(2018)0156** proposes an EGF contribution of EUR 4 621 616 for 2 287 workers made redundant in Caterpillar Solar Gosselies (Caterpillar) and five suppliers. Caterpillar operates in the economic sector classified under the NACE Revision 2 Division 28 (Manufacture of machinery and equipment). The redundancies made by the enterprises concerned are located in the NUTS level 2 region of Hainaut region (BE32) in Belgium.

The rules applicable to financial contributions from the EGF are laid down in Regulation (EU) No 1309/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 on the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund (2014-2020) and repealing Regulation (EC) No 1927/2006.

The Committee coordinators have assessed this proposal, and asked me to write to you reporting that the majority of this Committee has no objection to this mobilisation of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund to allocate the above-mentioned amount as proposed by the Commission.

Yours sincerely,

Iskra MIHAYLOVA

INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

Date adopted	24.4.2018
Result of final vote	+: 27 -: 2 0: 0
Members present for the final vote	Jean Arthuis, Richard Ashworth, Reimer Böge, Gérard Deprez, Manuel dos Santos, André Elissen, José Manuel Fernandes, Eider Gardiazabal Rubial, Ingeborg Gräßle, Monika Hohlmeier, John Howarth, Bernd Kölmel, Vladimír Maňka, Siegfried Mureşan, Liadh Ní Riada, Jan Olbrycht, Răzvan Popa, Paul Rübig, Petri Sarvamaa, Indrek Tarand, Inese Vaidere, Monika Vana, Tiemo Wölken, Marco Zanni
Substitutes present for the final vote	Jean-Paul Denanot, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Ivana Maletić, Andrey Novakov, Tomáš Zdechovský

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

27	+
ALDE	Jean Arthuis, Gérard Deprez, Anneli Jäätteenmäki
ENF	Marco Zanni
GUE/NGL	Liadh Ní Riada
PPE	Richard Ashworth, Reimer Böge, José Manuel Fernandes, Ingeborg Gräßle, Monika Hohlmeier, Ivana Maletić, Siegfried Mureşan, Andrey Novakov, Jan Olbrycht, Paul Rübig, Petri Sarvamaa, Inese Vaidere, Tomáš Zdechovský
S&D	Jean-Paul Denanot, Eider Gardiazabal Rubial, John Howarth, Vladimír Maňka, Răzvan Popa, Tiemo Wölken, Manuel dos Santos
Verts/ALE	Indrek Tarand, Monika Vana

2	-
ECR	Bernd Kölmel
ENF	André Elissen

0	0

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention