European Parliament
2014-2019

Committee on Budgetary Control

2016/0281(COD)

12.4.2017

OPINION

of the Committee on Budgetary Control

for the Committee on Foreign Affairs, the Committee on Development and the Committee on Budgets


Rapporteur: Indrek Tarand
AMENDMENTS

The Committee on Budgetary Control calls on the Committee on Foreign Affairs, the Committee on Development and the Committee on Budgets, as the committees responsible, to take into account the following amendments:

Amendment 1

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 1

Text proposed by the Commission

(1) The Union’s ambitious External Investment Plan (EIP) is needed to support investments starting in Africa and the Union’s Neighbourhood as a means to promote the sustainable development goals of the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (‘the 2030 Agenda’) as well as the commitments under the recently revised European Neighbourhood Policy thus addressing root causes of migration. It should also contribute to the implementation of the Paris Agreement on Climate Change (COP 21).

Amendment

(1) The Union’s ambitious External Investment Plan (EIP) is needed to support investments starting in Africa and the Union’s Neighbourhood as a means to promote the sustainable development goals of the United Nations 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (‘the 2030 Agenda’), as well as the commitments under the recently revised European Neighbourhood Policy, thus addressing one of the main root causes of migration. It should also contribute to the implementation of the Paris Agreement on Climate Change (COP 21).

Amendment 2

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 2

Text proposed by the Commission

(2) The EIP should incorporate the Union commitment under the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development. It should also allow European investors and private companies, including small and medium-sized enterprises, to participate more effectively to sustainable development in partner countries.

Amendment

(2) The EIP should incorporate the Union commitment under the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development. It should also allow European investors and private companies, in particular small and medium-sized enterprises, to contribute more effectively to sustainable development in partner countries, with the emphasis very much on 'sustainable'.
Amendment 3
Proposal for a regulation
Recital 4

Text proposed by the Commission

(4) The EIP should provide an integrated financial package to finance investments starting in regions of Africa for countries that are signatories to the Partnership Agreement between the members of the African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States of the one part, and the European Community and its member States, of the other part, signed in Cotonou on 23 June 2000 and the Neighbourhood countries, thereby creating growth and employment opportunities, maximising additionality, delivering innovative products, and crowding-in private sector funds.

Amendment

(4) The EIP should provide an integrated financial package to finance investments starting in regions of Africa for countries that are signatories to the Partnership Agreement between the members of the African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States of the one part, and the European Community and its member States, of the other part, signed in Cotonou on 23 June 2000 (the ACP-EC Partnership Agreement) and the Neighbourhood countries. This should provide additional growth and employment opportunities, maximise additionality and help deliver innovative products, by encouraging the use of additional private-sector funds, promoting sustainable development and a circular economy. A balanced geographical approach should be ensured so that all signatories to the ACP-EC Partnership Agreement and all Neighbourhood countries have a fair chance to access funding under the EIP.

Amendment 4
Proposal for a regulation
Recital 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

(4a) In the light of the findings of the European Court of Auditors\(^{\text{a}}\) regarding the use of blending in the external relations of the Union, which highlighted the fact that for nearly half of the projects examined there was insufficient evidence to conclude that the grants were justified, and that for a number of those cases there
were indications that the investments would have been made without the Union contribution, it is paramount that blending should only be used where the Commission can clearly demonstrate its added value.

\[1\] ECA special report No 16/2014 “The effectiveness of blending regional investment facility grants with financial institution loans to support EU external policies”.

Amendment 5
Proposal for a regulation
Recital 6

**Text proposed by the Commission**

(6) Furthermore, the EFSD should operate as 'one-stop-shop' to receive financing proposals from financial institutions and public or private investors and deliver a wide range of financial support to eligible investments. The EFSD Guarantee should be backed by the EFSD Guarantee Fund. The EFSD should deploy innovative instruments to support investments and involve the private sector.

**Amendment**

(6) Furthermore, the EFSD should operate as a 'one-stop-shop', receiving financing proposals from financial institutions and public or private investors, providing guidance and all the necessary information for investors wishing to invest in development activities and delivering a wide range of financial support to eligible investments. The EFSD Guarantee should be backed by the EFSD Guarantee Fund. The EFSD should deploy innovative instruments to support investments in sustainable development in partner countries and involve the private sector.

Amendment 6
Proposal for a regulation
Recital 8

**Text proposed by the Commission**

(8) Moreover, the Strategic Board should support the Commission in setting

**Amendment**

(8) Moreover, the Strategic Board should support the Commission in setting
strategic guidance and overall investment goals. The Strategic Board should also support coordination and coherence between the regional platforms. This should ensure complementarity of the various instruments in external action. The Strategic Board should be co-chaired by the Commission and the High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy to ensure consistency and coherence with Union external policy objectives and partnership frameworks with third countries.

Amendment 7

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 8 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(8a) The EFSD Guarantee should not be used to fund major infrastructure projects which have a low impact on job creation and whose cost-benefit ratio renders the investment unsustainable. The EFSD Guarantee should only fund projects whose implementation is not controversial from the environmental, financial and social points of view on the basis of an independent in-depth ex ante assessment and an adequate cost-benefit analysis.

Amendment 8

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 14

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(14) In order to increase the impact of the EFSD Guarantee in view of the needs in the regions concerned, Member States should have the possibility of providing
contributions in the form of a guarantee or
cash. Those contributions could be
earmarked by region, sector or investment
window. **development and create decent employment opportunities** in the regions concerned, Member States should have the possibility of providing contributions in the form of a guarantee or cash. Those contributions could be earmarked by region, sector or investment window.

Amendment 9

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 16

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(16) The Commission should report annually to the European Parliament and the Council on the financing and investment operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee with a view to ensuring accountability to the European citizens. The report should be made public in order to allow relevant stakeholders, including civil society, to express their views. The Commission should also report annually to the European Parliament and the Council on the management of the EFSD Guarantee Fund so that accountability *and transparency* are ensured.

Amendment

(16) The Commission should report annually to the European Parliament and the Council on the financing and investment operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee with a view to ensuring accountability to the European citizens. The report should be made public in order to allow relevant stakeholders, including civil society, to express their views. The Commission should also report annually to the European Parliament and the Council on the management of the EFSD Guarantee Fund so that accountability, *transparency and effectiveness of the management* are ensured.

Amendment 10

Proposal for a regulation
Recital 17 a (new)

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(17a) In the light of the findings of the European Court of Auditors’ Special Report No 14/2014, the Commission should annually evaluate the improvement in its management capacities to make the operations of the EFSD more effective and transparent.

________________
Amendment 11

Proposal for a regulation
Article 3 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The EFSD shall contribute to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals of the 2030 Agenda with a particular focus on sustainable growth, job creation, socio-economic sectors and on the support to micro, small and medium sized enterprises, thus addressing root causes of migration and contributing to sustainable reintegration of returned migrants in their countries of origin while maximising additionality, delivering innovative products and crowding in private sector funds.

Amendment

2. The EFSD shall contribute to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals of the 2030 Agenda with a major focus on the eradication of poverty, on sustainable growth respecting economic, environmental and social rights, on the creation of more and decent jobs, on the creation of a circular economy, on socio-economic sectors, improving access to public services, on climate change mitigation and adaptation, on the involvement of local communities and on the support to micro, small and medium sized enterprises, thus addressing root causes of migration and contributing to sustainable reintegration of returned migrants in their countries of origin while maximising additionality, delivering innovative products and crowding in private sector funds.

Amendment 12

Proposal for a regulation
Article 5 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

It shall provide strategic guidance and support the Commission in setting overall investment goals as regards the use of the EFSD Guarantee. The strategic board shall also support overall coordination and

Amendment

It shall provide strategic guidance and support the Commission in setting overall investment goals as regards the use of the EFSD Guarantee, the criteria of eligibility of investment to the regional platforms.
coherence between the regional investment platforms and with the external lending mandate operations managed by the EIB, including the EIB resilience initiative. 

The strategic board shall also support overall coordination, cooperation and coherence between the regional investment platforms and with the external lending mandate operations managed by the EIB, including the EIB resilience initiative. **The strategic board activity shall be overseen by a steering committee on a permanent basis within the European Parliament.**

**Amendment 13**

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 5 – paragraph 2**

**Text proposed by the Commission**

2. The strategic board shall be composed of representatives of the Commission and of the High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy (High Representative), of the Member States and of the EIB. The Commission may invite other contributors to become members of the strategic board having regard where appropriate to the view of the board. **Partner Countries and relevant regional organisations, the eligible counterparts and the European Parliament** may be given observer status, where appropriate. The strategic board shall be co-chaired by the Commission and the High Representative.

**Amendment**

2. The strategic board shall be composed of representatives of the Commission and of the High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy (High Representative), of the Member States, of the European Parliament, of the EIB and of the African and Neighbourhood partner countries. The Commission shall invite other contributors to become members of the strategic board having regard to the view of the board. **Relevant regional organisations and other stakeholders such as civil society groups** may be given observer status, where appropriate. The strategic board shall be co-chaired by the Commission and the High Representative. **The strategic board shall ensure that a diverse range of stakeholders in partner countries is properly consulted.**

**Amendment 14**

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 6 – paragraph 1**
1. **The** Union shall provide an irrevocable and unconditional guarantee on first demand to the eligible counterpart for the financing and investment operations covered by this Regulation starting in the African and Neighbourhood partner countries.

**Amendment 15**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 7 – paragraph 3

**Text proposed by the Commission**

3. The maximum period allowed for eligible counterparts to conclude agreements with financial intermediaries or final beneficiaries shall be four years after the conclusion of the relevant guarantee agreement.

**Amendment 16**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – title

**Text proposed by the Commission**

Eligibility criteria for the use of the EFSD Guarantee

**Amendment**

Eligibility *and debarment* criteria for the use of the EFSD Guarantee

**Amendment 17**

Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

**Text proposed by the Commission**

1. The financing and investment operations eligible for support through the EFSD Guarantee shall be consistent and

**Amendment**

1. The financing and investment operations eligible for support through the EFSD Guarantee shall be consistent and
aligned with Union policies, in particular development and neighbourhood policies of the Union, the partner countries' strategies and policies and aim at supporting the following general objectives:

Amendment 18
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point -a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(-a) achieve the Sustainable Development Goals of the 2030 Agenda;

Amendment 19
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(a) contribute to economic and social development, with particular focus on sustainability and job creation (in particular for youth and women), thus addressing root causes of migration and contributing to sustainable reintegration of returned migrants in their countries of origin;

Amendment 20
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point b

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(b) target socio-economic sectors, in particular infrastructure including sustainable energy, water, transport, information and communications technologies, environment, sustainable use
of natural resources and blue growth, social infrastructure, human capital, in order to improve the socio-economic environment; of natural resources and blue growth, social infrastructure, human capital and the circular economy, in order to improve the socio-economic environment, while also taking account of the priorities of the beneficiaries of the EFSD Guarantee;

Amendment 21
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point b a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

(ba) involve people living in the areas concerned in the planning of the projects funded;

Amendment 22
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) provide finance in favour of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises with a particular focus on private sector development;

(c) provide finance in favour of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises with a particular focus on developing a stable local private sector that is viable over time;

Amendment 23
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 1 – point e a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

(ea) not to be in any way linked to non-cooperative jurisdictions as referred to in Article 20;

Amendment 24
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 2 – introductory part
2. The EFSD Guarantee shall support financing and investment operations which in particular:

Amendment 25
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 2 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission
(c) are economically and financially viable, taking also into account the possible support from, and co-financing by, private and public partners to the project;

Amendment
(c) are demonstrated to be economically and financially viable, taking also into account the possible support from, and co-financing by, private and public partners to the project;

Amendment 26
Proposal for a regulation
Article 8 – paragraph 2 – point ea (new)

Text proposed by the Commission
(ea) respect human rights enshrined in international law.

Amendment
2a. The EFSD Guarantee shall not support financing and investment operations which:

Text proposed by the Commission
(a) are linked to the military or
security sector;
(b) support the development of nuclear energy;
(c) further promote fossil fuel and carbon lock-in;
(d) have significant environmental external costs, especially with large-scale infrastructures;
(e) are in sectors or projects that risk undermining human rights in partner countries, especially those of local and indigenous communities, such as the forced displacement of populations, land grabbing, paramilitary operations or activities in deforested areas. A publicly available ex ante human rights and environmental impact assessment shall be carried out to identify such risks.
(f) are suspected of environmental infringements and damage to society or to local communities, taking the precautionary principle into account.

Amendment 28
Proposal for a regulation
Article 13 – paragraph 7

Text proposed by the Commission

7. From 1 January 2021, if, as a result of calls on the EFSD Guarantee, the level of resources in the Guarantee Fund falls below 50% of the provisioning rate referred to in paragraph 5, the Commission shall submit a report on exceptional measures that may be required to replenish the EFSD Guarantee Fund.

Amendment

7. From 1 January 2021, if, as a result of calls on the EFSD Guarantee, the level of resources in the Guarantee Fund falls below 50% of the provisioning rate referred to in paragraph 5, the Commission shall submit a report on:

(a) the cause of the shortfall, with detailed explanations; and
(b) should it be deemed necessary, any exceptional measures that may be required to replenish the EFSD Guarantee Fund.
Amendment 29

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

1. The Commission shall submit an annual report to the European Parliament and to the Council on the financing and investment operation covered by the EFSD Guarantee. This report shall be made public. It shall include the following elements:

Amendment

1. The Commission shall submit an annual report to the European Parliament and to the Council on the financing and investment operation covered by the EFSD Guarantee. That report shall be made public. It shall include the following elements, which shall be presented in a country-specific format:

Amendment 30

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) an assessment of the financing and investment operations in operation and covered by the EFSD Guarantee, sector, country and regional levels and their compliance with this Regulation;

Amendment

(a) an independent assessment of the financing and investment operations in operation and covered by the EFSD Guarantee, sector, country and regional levels and their compliance with this Regulation, in particular with the principle of additionality;

Amendment 31

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point a a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

(aa) an assessment of the achievements of overall investment goals set up by the strategic board pursuant to Article 5;

Amendment

(aa) an assessment of the achievements of overall investment goals set up by the strategic board pursuant to Article 5;
Amendment 32
Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point a b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ab) an assessment of the overall contribution to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals of the 2030 Agenda;

Amendment 33
Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point a c (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ac) an assessment of the share of funding devoted to financing and investment operations relevant for political commitments of the Union on renewable energy, energy efficiency and climate change;

Amendment 34
Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point a d (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ad) an assessment of the quality of the operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee and their related risk exposure, either political, operational or financial;

Amendment 35
Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point b
(b) an assessment of the added value, the mobilisation of private sector resources, the estimated and **actual** outputs and the outcomes and impact of the financing and investment operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee on an aggregated basis, including the impact on employment creation;

Amendment 36

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point f

(b) an assessment of the added value, the mobilisation of private sector resources, the estimated and **achieved** outputs and the outcomes and impact of the financing and investment operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee on an aggregated and long-term basis, including the impact on employment creation;

Amendment 37

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1 – point g

(f) an **independent** assessment of the added value of financing and investment operations of the eligible counterparts, and of the aggregate risk associated with those operations;

Amendment 38

Proposal for a regulation
Article 16 – paragraph 1

1. By 31 December 2020, the

1. By 31 December 2020, the
Commission shall evaluate the functioning of the EFSD. The Commission shall submit its evaluation report to the European Parliament and the Council, containing an independent evaluation of the application of this Regulation. This report shall be submitted without delay by the Commission in the event that the approved financing and investment operations absorb in full the amount of the EFSD Guarantee available before 30 June 2020.

Amendment 39
Proposal for a regulation
Article 16 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. By 31 December 2020 and every three years thereafter, the Commission shall evaluate the use of the EFSD Guarantee Fund. The Commission shall submit its evaluation report to the European Parliament and the Council. That evaluation report shall be accompanied by an opinion of the Court of Auditors.

Amendment

2. By 31 December 2020 and every three years thereafter, the Commission shall evaluate the use and the functioning of the EFSD Guarantee Fund. The Commission shall submit its evaluation report to the European Parliament and the Council. That evaluation report shall be accompanied by an opinion of the Court of Auditors on the management of the EFSD guarantee fund and the effectiveness and additionality of EFSD operations. Where adjustments to the EFSD Guarantee Fund are deemed necessary or in the event that the EFSD Guarantee Fund is extended beyond 2020, that evaluation report shall be accompanied by a legislative proposal to amend this Regulation accordingly.

Amendment 40
Proposal for a regulation
Article 17 – paragraph 1
Text proposed by the Commission

In accordance with its transparency policies and general Union principles on access to documents and information, the eligible counterparts shall make publicly available on their websites information relating to all financing and investment operations covered by the EFSD Guarantee under this Regulation, relating in particular to the manner in which those operations contribute to the requirements of this Regulation.

Amendment 41

Proposal for a regulation
Article 17 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 17a

The eligible counterparts shall also facilitate access to information on the legal bases that exist and shall strategically publicise financing and investment operations in order to bring the Fund’s activities closer to citizens, public opinion and possible private investors.

Amendment 42

Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1. The external audit of the activities undertaken in accordance with this

1. The external audit of the activities undertaken in accordance with this
Regulation shall be carried out by the Court of Auditors in accordance with Article 287 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) and is thus subject to the discharge procedure in accordance with Article 319 TFEU.

Amendment 43
Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 2

**Text proposed by the Commission**

2. For the purpose of paragraph 1 of this Article, the Court of Auditors shall, at its request and in accordance with Article 287(3) TFEU, be granted access to any document or information necessary to carry out its *task*.

**Amendment**

2. For the purpose of paragraph 1 of this Article, the Court of Auditors shall, at its request and in accordance with Article 287(3) TFEU, be granted access to any document or information necessary to carry out its *auditing tasks*.

Amendment 44
Proposal for a regulation
Article 18 – paragraph 2a (new)

**Text proposed by the Commission**

2a. By 30 June 2020 and every three years thereafter, the Court of Auditors shall publish a special report on the use of the EFSD Guarantee Fund and on the efficiency and effectiveness of the EFSD.

**Amendment**

2a. If at any stage of the preparation, implementation or closure of financing and

Amendment 45
Proposal for a regulation
Article 19 – paragraph 1

**Text proposed by the Commission**

1. The Commission or the eligible counterparts shall notify the European

**Amendment**

1. If at any stage of the preparation, implementation or closure of financing and
Anti-Fraud Office (OLAF) promptly and provide it with the necessary information when, at any stage of the preparation, implementation or closure of financing and investment operations covered by this Regulation, they have grounds for suspecting fraud, corruption, money laundering or any other illegal activity that may affect the financial interests of the Union.

Amendment 46

Proposal for a regulation
Article 19 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

OLAF may carry out investigations, including on-the-spot checks and inspections, in accordance with the provisions and procedures laid down in Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 883/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Regulation (Euratom, EC) No 2185/96 and Council Regulation (EC, Euratom) No 2988/95 in order to protect the financial interests of the Union, with a view to establishing whether there has been fraud, corruption, money laundering or any other illegal activity affecting the financial interests of the Union in connection with any financing and investment operations covered by this Regulation. OLAF may transmit any information obtained in the course of its investigations to the competent authorities of the Member States concerned.

Amendment

OLAF shall carry out investigations, including on-the-spot checks and inspections, in accordance with the provisions and procedures laid down in Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 883/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Regulation (Euratom, EC) No 2185/96 and Council Regulation (EC, Euratom) No 2988/95 in order to protect the financial interests of the Union, with a view to establishing whether there has been fraud, corruption, money laundering, financing of terrorism, tax fraud, organised crime or any other illegal activity affecting the financial interests of the Union in connection with any financing and investment operations covered by this Regulation. OLAF may transmit any information obtained in the course of its investigations to the competent authorities of the Member States concerned.

Amendment 47

Proposal for a regulation
Article 19 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 2
Where such illegal activities are proven, the eligible counterparts shall undertake recovery efforts with respect to its financing and investment operations covered by this Regulation that are concerned by such activities, and shall also provide to the relevant authorities all information needed for investigation and possible prosecution.

Amendment 48

Proposal for a regulation
Article 20 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. In their financing and investment operations, the eligible counterparts shall not support any activities carried out for illegal purposes, including money laundering, terrorist financing, organised crime, tax fraud and tax evasion, corruption, and fraud affecting the financial interests of the Union. The eligible counterparts shall not participate in any financing or investment operation through a vehicle located in a non-cooperative jurisdiction, in accordance with its policy towards weakly regulated or non-cooperative jurisdictions based on policies of the Union, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development or the Financial Action Task Force.

Amendment

1. In their financing and investment operations, the eligible counterparts shall not support any activities carried out for illegal purposes, including (but not limited to) money laundering, terrorist financing, organised crime, tax fraud and tax evasion, corruption, fraud or other activities affecting the financial interests of the Union. The eligible counterparts shall not participate in any financing or investment operation through a vehicle located in a non-cooperative jurisdiction, in accordance with its policy towards weakly regulated or non-cooperative jurisdictions based on policies of the Union, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development or the Financial Action Task Force.

Amendment 49

Proposal for a regulation
Article 20 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. In its financing and investment operations, the eligible counterpart shall apply the principles and standards set out

Amendment

2. In its financing and investment operations, the eligible counterpart shall apply the principles and standards set out
### PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>European Fund for Sustainable Development (EFSD) and establishing the EFSD Guarantee and the EFSD Guarantee Fund</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Committees responsible</td>
<td>Date announced in plenary AFET 27.10.2016 DEVE 27.10.2016 BUDG 27.10.2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion by</td>
<td>Date announced in plenary CONT 1.12.2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rapporteur</td>
<td>Date appointed Indrek Tarand 15.11.2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule 55 – Joint committee procedure</td>
<td>Date announced in plenary 16.2.2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussed in committee</td>
<td>22.3.2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date adopted</td>
<td>12.4.2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Result of final vote</td>
<td>+: 18  --: 2  0: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members present for the final vote</td>
<td>Nedžhmì Ali, Jonathan Arnott, Inés Ayala Sender, Tamás Deutsch, Martina Dlabajová, Luke Ming Flanagan, Ingeborg Gräßle, Cătălin Sorin Ivan, Jean-François Jalkh, Arndt Kohn, Bogusław Liberadzki, Fulvio Martusciello, José Ignacio Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Claudia Schmidt, Bart Staes, Hannu Takkula, Indrek Tarand, Marco Valli, Derek Vaughan, Joachim Zeller</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substitutes present for the final vote</td>
<td>Monika Hohlmeier, Julia Pitera, Miroslav Poche</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>18</th>
<th>+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALDE</td>
<td>Nedzhmi Ali, Martina Dlabajová, Hannu Takkula</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPE</td>
<td>Tamás Deutsch, Ingeborg Gräßle, Monika Hohlmeier, Fulvio Martusciello, Julia Pitera, José Ignacio Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Claudia Schmid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;D</td>
<td>Inés Ayala Sender, Cătălin Sorin Ivan, Arndt Kohn, Boguslaw Liberadzki, Miroslav Poche, Derek Vaughan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GREENS</td>
<td>Bart Staes, Indrek Tarand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2</th>
<th>-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EFDD</td>
<td>Jonathan Arnott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPE</td>
<td>Joachim Zeller</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EFDD</td>
<td>Marco Valli</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENF</td>
<td>Jean-François Jalkh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUE/NGL</td>
<td>Luke Ming Flanagan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key to symbols:**
- + : in favour
- - : against
- 0 : abstention