



Delegation for relations with Iran

D-IR_PV(2010)0916

MINUTES
of the meeting of Thursday 16 September from 2010, 09.00 to 10.00
BRUSSELS

The meeting opened at 09.05 on Thursday, 16 September, with Mrs Barbara Lochbihler in the chair.

1. Adoption of the draft agenda PE 446.315

Mrs Lochbihler announced that, under point 5, Mr Belder would be updating members on progress on his report. Otherwise the agenda was adopted.

2. Adoption of the minutes of the meeting of 13 July 2010 PE 446.302

The minutes were adopted without amendment.

3. Chair's announcements

Mrs Lochbihler gave details of the joint letter that she had written with Mrs Hautala to Ayatollah Khamenei and Mr Larijani on a number of issues, including the situation of the Bah'ai community and the case of Mrs Ashtiani. An answer had been received to the letter in which the position of the Iranian authorities was reiterated.

She noted that on 26 August 2010 she had written to the Iranian Ambassador in Brussels on a number of cases of human rights defenders, including Mrs Shiva Nazar Ahari. Mrs Ahari had since been released on bail of \$500,000. There had not yet been a verdict on her case.

Mrs Lochbihler also referred to an interview she had given, specifically on the nuclear power plant in Bushehr and a meeting she had held on the worsening situation of the Sufis in Iran. She noted that the subject of religious minorities would be on the agenda of a subsequent

meeting of the delegation.

Mrs Lochbihler also noted that she had held two meetings with the Iranian Ambassador on 3 and 14 September. On these occasions there had been discussion of the European Parliament resolution of 8 September 2010 and the programme for the European Parliament delegation visit to Tehran.

Mrs Lochbihler noted that the American tourist, Sarah Shourd, had been released on 14 September 2010. The Iranian authorities had also announced that the sentence of death by stoning on Mrs Ashtiani had been suspended; however the danger of the death penalty had not been removed. The press release by Mr Buzek had not been completely accurate on the situation but the position had been made clear in the European Parliament resolution. Mrs Lochbihler noted that had been an initiative in 2003 by human rights defenders to get the Iranian Parliament to abolish the penalty of death by stoning and this had been re-tabled in June 2009. The case now lay with the Guardian Council. There were others, in addition to Mrs Ashtiani, who could face stoning and it was important to strengthen the forces in the Majlis which sought to reform the situation.

4. Briefing by the European Commission on recent developments in EU-Iran relations, with specific reference to the issue of sanctions

Mrs Lochbihler introduced the speakers from the European Commission: Mr Giuseppe Busini and Mr Albert Straver. She noted that the United States Ambassador to the United Nations, Ms Susan Rice, had called on 15 September for a redoubling of international efforts to enforce the UN Security Council (UNSC) sanctions on Iran.

Mrs Lochbihler then gave the floor to Mr Straver. The speaker noted that "sanctions" were now termed "restrictive measures" following the coming into force of the Lisbon Treaty. On 9 June 2010 the UNSC had adopted Resolution 1929 - the latest in a series of measures aimed at preventing Iran from developing a nuclear weapons programme. The US Congress had decided to introduce further sanctions, going beyond what the UN had already decided. On 17 June 2010 the European Council had agreed on "1929 Plus", in which there were additional measures that also went beyond those of the UNSC. This had been adopted as CFSP 2010/413 on 27 July 2010. The Commission had to put the measures to Council under Article 215 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union. The proposal COM 2010/459 had been tabled on 31 August 2010. There would be another proposal before the end of September. The package would probably be adopted in October 2010.

The process had been very cumbersome and the measures were unprecedented, including access to the capital market; restrictions on the oil and gas sectors; and systematic controls on all capital transfers and payments over EUR10,000. Export bans would be put in place on almost all items on the "dual use" list. There would be an export ban on equipment that could be used for repression of opposition forces, a measure that was not directed specifically at Iran's nuclear programme. Some measures were new and the sanctions regime was probably the most comprehensive that had ever been implemented. The aim was to achieve a comprehensive settlement and to ensure that Iran could not develop nuclear weapons, while not denying it the opportunity to develop nuclear power for peaceful purposes. Baroness Ashton was currently looking forward to a reply from Iran and wanted the inspections of its

nuclear facilities to be restarted and negotiations to be resumed.

Mr Busini stressed that the sanctions had not been adopted to punish the people of Iran but to bring its government back to the negotiating table and reach a settlement. The EU sanctions were not an isolated case because - as well as the USA - a number of other countries had adopted additional sanctions. These included Australia, South Korea and Japan, with Canada also working on the issue.

Mrs Lochbihler asked about coordination between the EU and other countries on sanctions. Mr Straver stressed that the EU was indeed coordinating with its partners on developing a common strategy on sanctions in order to bring Iran to the negotiating table. He underlined that the international coalition on the issue had already achieved a great deal.

Mr Belder wanted to know if the EU representatives in Tehran had been able to estimate what the effect of the sanctions had been and what would be the response of the Iranian people. He noted that former President Rafsanjani had warned that the sanctions would have a serious effect on the Iranian economy.

Mr Straver said that it was too early to judge the economic effects of the sanctions but there had been psychological effects and western companies were already withdrawing from Iran because of the uncertainty of the situation. The adoption of the sanctions had probably triggered some debate in the Iranian establishment and Mr Rafsanjani's expression of concerns contrasted with the response of President Ahmadinejad. Mr Busini noted that there were already reports of some shortages in certain raw materials.

Mr Belder noted that there were loopholes in the sanctions network and pointed to Dubai and some of the Gulf States as countries that might not always cooperate fully with the implementation of the regime. Mr Busini agreed that, in some cases, sanctions had been circumvented by countries - both neighbouring and others. He stressed that the real challenge was to put together as much international support as possible and to ensure close cooperation with partners so that other companies from no-EU countries did not replace EU companies that had withdrawn from the Iranian market.

Mrs Ernst noted that in the past sanctions against Iran had not been effective. She wanted to know what checks had been made in advance to confirm that the sanctions would actually have an effect on Iran's nuclear programme. She was concerned that sanctions would be counter-productive by giving a boost to the more radical elements in Iran. She also asked how the checks on capital transfers over EUR10,000 would take place.

Mr Lechner asked what legally binding instrument was in place for the sanctions and what was the timeframe. He also wanted to know about the mechanisms for monitoring the implementation of the sanctions. Finally he asked how to ensure that the sanctions did not have an adverse effect on EU companies.

Mrs Rosbach noted that Iran was a very large country with mountainous terrain and wanted to know how the monitoring would actually take place in the field.

Mr Straver reiterated his comments on the legal base for sanctions, stressing that regulations were mandatory for member states and were implemented by national authorities. The threshold of EUR 10,000 was necessary as otherwise the administration would be

overburdened. For transactions up to EUR 40,000 the authorities needed to be simply notified. Above that figure there needed to be a special request to the national authorities for authorisation. He accepted that there might be detrimental effects on EU economic interests; however it was recognised that this was justified as there was a threat to global security.

Mrs Lochbihler thanked the speakers and looked forward to returning to the issue after a period of about six months when there could be an evaluation of the effects of the sanctions.

5. Activity of the Delegation during the remainder of 2010

Mrs Lochbihler reminded members that she had requested authorisation for a delegation to travel to Tehran from 7 to 11 October 2010. She noted that at the previous meeting Mr Scurria had been the only member to speak against a visit going ahead. However, he had since asked to travel if the delegation were to actually go to Tehran. She did not want to re-open the debate on whether it was appropriate to travel. She stressed, nonetheless, that the programme for the planned visit had been discussed with the Iranian Ambassador and it had been her intention that time should be set aside for meetings with civil society. She noted that Mr Stevenson, Chair of the Iraq delegation, had written to President Buzek, arguing against the visit taking place.

Mrs Lochbihler informed the meeting that authorisation to travel had been granted by the Conference of Presidents but that this was subject to two conditions. These were that Mrs Ashtiani should not be executed and that the delegation should be free in its movements and free to meet whomsoever it chose, including members of the opposition. The first condition could only be fulfilled through a decision by the relevant court in Iran and there could not be any guarantee that the Iranian authorities would reach a decision on this case in the near future. She believed that the imposition of this condition raised an important matter of principle for the Iran delegation, in view of the fact that other delegations travelled to countries where the death penalty was in force, such as Saudi Arabia, North Korea, the United States and Japan. She had consulted with the Bureau and other members of the delegation and would be writing to ask the European Parliament authorities to establish if this now represented a change in policy for delegations in general.

She believed it to be "relatively unrealistic" that the condition regarding the removal of Mrs Ashtiani's death sentence would be met by the Iranian side in the immediate future. She stressed that placing such conditions on the visit did not encourage those forces in Iran which wanted to engage in dialogue with the European Union. If it was the case that only the Iran delegation was to be subject to specific conditions, this clearly represented a limitation on the delegation's ability to operate effectively as it was prevented from meeting with its counterparts. She would be writing to the Parliament's authorities on the matter.

Mr Belder could agree with what Mrs Lochbihler had said. He expected clarification of the conditions that had been placed on the delegation. He stressed that it was very important to speak to a wide range of opinion within Iran and wanted to know if there was a list of people with whom the delegation should talk that could be forwarded to the authorities in Tehran. He had heard from contacts in the EU embassies in Iran that it was now very difficult to speak to representatives of civil society and there were risks of repercussions. He underlined that he wanted to go to Iran but stressed that it was important to be met with a wide range of civil

society.

Mrs Lochbihler stressed that during the previous attempt to travel to Tehran there had been plans to contact people who were prepared to meet with the delegation. A number of other members of the standing delegation had refused to recognise this fact. On the occasion of the previous attempt to travel there had been a very positive response to the European Parliament delegation visit from a number of members of the Iranian opposition and civil society who wanted to maintain dialogue with the EU.

Mr Skylakakis supported Mrs Lochbihler and stressed that there were a large number of people in Iran who wanted change to come about and that contacts should be maintained with them.

Mrs Lochbihler stated that she was looking forward to a response from the Tehran authorities and for clarification from the Conference of Presidents on this matter. However, if there was no change, she proposed to cancel the delegation meeting scheduled for 28 September 2010 as this had been intended to be a preparatory meeting for a visit. She considered it to be an illusion to think that the delegation could travel under the current conditions.

She announced that on 26 October 2010 the main agenda item would be the situation of ethnic minorities in Iran and on 30 November 2010 the issue of religious minorities would be the subject for discussion. She also reminded members that she - along with other members - had tabled a written declaration on human rights violations in Iran, which required more signatures if it was to be adopted.

Mr Belder then asked how the delegation could decide whether it would travel under the conditions imposed by the Conference of Presidents - conditions which he did not consider to be clear. Mrs Lochbihler reiterated that she had discussed the conditions with the Iranian ambassador and she had prepared a letter to President Buzek and the Conference of Delegation Chairs on the matter. She could not, however, believe that the Iranian authorities would give a positive response to the condition regarding the death sentence on Mrs Ashtiani in time to enable the visit to take place on the specified dates. If the situation changed unexpectedly she would call an emergency meeting of the delegation.

Mr Belder stated that he was still researching and writing his report. The first exchange of views would be in the Foreign Affairs Committee on 5 October 2010. A draft text would be prepared by the end of September or early October,. There would be four parts to the draft covering: the internal situation in Iran; the human rights situation and the efforts that could be made by the EP to support civil society; the external relations of Iran; and the nuclear issue. Mr Belder stressed that he was struck by the courage of the people who were defending human rights in Iran and the importance of the women's movement.

Mrs Lochbihler thanked Mr Belder and looked forward to discussing the text with him in due course.

6. Any other business

Mr Belder stated that he was still researching and writing his report. The first exchange of views would be in the Foreign Affairs Committee on 5 October 2010. A draft text would be prepared by the end of September or early October. There would be four parts to the draft covering: the internal situation in Iran; the human rights situation and the efforts that could be made by the EP to support civil society; the external relations of Iran; and the nuclear issue. Mr Belder stressed that he was struck by the courage of the people who were defending human rights in Iran and the importance of the women's movement.

Mrs Lochbihler thanked Mr Belder and looked forward to discussing the text with him in due course.

There was no other business.

7. Date and place of next meeting

The next scheduled meeting was now to be held on 26 October 2010, unless an emergency meeting was called to discuss a delegation visit.

The meeting closed at 1015 hrs.

**ПРИСЪСТВЕН ЛИСТ/LISTA DE ASISTENCIA/PREZENČNÍ LISTINA/DELTAGERLISTE/
ANWESENHEITSLISTE/KOHALOLIJATE NIMEKIRI/KATAΣΤΑΣΗ ΠΑΡΟΝΤΩΝ/RECORD OF ATTENDANCE/
LISTE DE PRÉSENCE/ELENCO DI PRESENZA/APMEKLĒJUMU REĢISTRŠ/DALYVIŲ SAŖAŠAS/JELENLÉTI ÍV/
REĢISTRU TA' ATTENDENZA/PRESENTIELIJST/LISTA OBECNOŠCI/LISTA DE PRESENÇAS/LISTÁ DE PREZENÇÁ/
PREZENČNÁ LISTINA/SEZNAM NAVZOČIH/LÄSNÄOLOLISTA/DELTAGARLISTA**

Бюро/Mesa/Předsednictvo/Formandskabet/Vorstand/Juhatus/Προεδρείο/Bureau/Ufficio di presidenza/Prezidijs/Biuras/Elnökség/ Prezydium/Birou/Predsednictvo/Predsedstvo/Puheenjohtajisto/Presidiet (*)
Barbara Lochbihler, Kurt Lechner
Членове/Diputados/Poslanci/Medlemmer/Mitglieder/Parlamendiliikmed/Μέλη/Members/Députés/Deputati/Deputāti/Nariai/Képviselek/ Membri/Leden/Poslowie/Deputados/Deputați/Jäsenet/Ledamöter
Bastiaan Belder
Заместници/Suplentes/Náhradníci/Stedfortrædere/Stellvertreter/Asendusliikmed/Αναπληρωτές/Substitutes/Suppléants/Supplenti/ Aizstājēji/Pavadouojantys nariai/Póttagok/Sostituti/Plaatsvervangers/Zastępcy/Membros suplentes/Supleanți/Náhradníci/Namestniki/ Varajäsenet/Suppleanter
Antonya Parvanova, Ketih Taylor, Anna Rosbach, Theodoros Skylakakis

187 (2)
193 (3)
46 (6) (Точка от дневния ред/Punto del orden del día/Bod pořadu jednání (OJ)/Punkt på dagsordenen/Tagesordnungspunkt/Päevakorra punkt/Ημερήσια Διάταξη Σημείο/Agenda item/Point OJ/Punto all'ordine del giorno/Darba kārtības punkts/Darbotvarkēs punktas/ Napirendi pont/Punt Agenda/Agendapunt/Punkt porządku dziennego/Ponto OD/Punct de pe ordinea de zi/Bod programu schôdze/ Točka UL/Esityslistan kohta/Föredragningslista punkt)

Наблюдатели/Observadores/Pozorovatelé/Observatører/Beobachter/Vaatlejad/Παρατηρητές/Observers/Observateurs/Osservatori/ Novērotāji/Stebėtojai/Megfigyelők/Osservatori/Waarnemers/Observatorzy/Observadores/Observatori/Pozorovatelia/Opazovalci/ Tarkkailijat/Observatörer

По покана на председателя/Por invitación del presidente/Na pozváni předsedy/Efter indbydelse fra formanden/Auf Einladung des Vorsitzenden/Esimehe kutsel/Με πρόσκληση του Προέδρου/At the invitation of the Chair(wo)man/Sur l'invitation du président/Su invito del presidente/Pēc priekšsēdētāja uzaicinājuma/Pirmininkui pakvietus/Az elnök meghívására/Fuq stedina tač-'Chairman'/Op uitnodiging van de voorzitter/Na zaproszenie Przewodniczącego/A convite do Presidente/La invitația președintelui/Na pozwanie predsedu/Na povabilo predsednika/Puheenjohtajan kutsusta/På ordförandens inbjudan

Съвет/Consejo/Rada/Rådet/Rat/Nõukogu/Συμβούλιο/Council/Conseil/Consiglio/Padome/Taryba/Tanács/Kunsill/Raad/Conselho/Consiliu/Svet/Neuvosto/Rådet (*)
Roberta Garabello, Lene Hove
Комисия/Comisión/Komise/Kommissionen/Kommission/Euroopa Komisjon/Επιτροπή/Commission/Commissione/Komisija/Bizottság/Kummissjoni/Commissie/Komisja/Comissão/Comisie/Komisia/Komissio/Kommissionen (*)
Albert Straer, Giuseppe Busini
Други институции/Otras instituciones/Ostatní orgány a instituce/Andre institutioner/Andere Organe/Muud institutsioonid/Άλλα θεσμικά όργανα/Other institutions/Autres institutions/Altre istituzioni/Citas iestādes/Kitos institucijos/Más intézmények/Istituzjonijiet ohra/Andere instellingen/Inne instytucje/Outras Instituições/Alte instituții/Iné inštitúcie/Druge institucije/Muut toimielimet/Andra institutioner/organ

Други учасници/Otros participantes/Ostatní účastníci/Endvidere deltog/Andere Teilnehmer/Muud osalejad/Επίσης Παρόντες/Other participants/Autres participants/Altri partecipanti/Citi klātesošie/Kiti dalyviai/Más résztvevők/Partecipanti ohra/Andere aanwezigen/Inni uczestnicy/Outros participantes/Alți participanți/Ini účastníci/Dруги udeleženci/Muut osallistajat/Övriga deltagare	
Billiet Stijn, Carolina Komotajts, Carolin O'Callaghan, Paolo Barabesi, Sprackett, Max Winerhoff, Hülya Tapti, Rebecca Grannemann, Mohammad Safaei, Georg Heitz, Alexandra Bärtl, P. Accard, Madelaine Benda, M. Kovacs	
Секретариат на политическите групи/Secretaría de los Grupos políticos/Sekretariát politických skupin/Gruppernes sekretariat/Sekretariat der Fraktionen/Fraksioonide sekretariaat/Γραμματεία των Πολιτικών Ομάδων/Secretariats of political groups/Secrétariat des groupes politiques/Segreteria gruppi politici/Politisko grupu sekretariāts/Frakciju sekretoriai/Képviseletcsoportok titkársága/Sekretarjat gruppi politici/Fractiesecretariaten/Sekretariat Grup Politycznych/Secr. dos grupos políticos/Secretariate grupuri politice/Sekretariát politických skupin/Sekretariat poliitčnih skupin/Poliittisten ryhmien sihteeristöt/Gruppernas sekretariat	
PPE	Rino Trombetta
S&D	Peter Reichert
ALDE	Isabella Marzullo
ECR	
Verts/ALE	Sabine Meyer
GUE/NGL	Karin Schuttpeitz
EFD	
NI	

<p>Кабинет на председателя/Gabinete del Presidente/Kancelář předsedy/Formandens Kabinet/Kabinett des Präsidenten/Presidendi kantseleri/Γραφείο Προέδρου/President's Office/Cabinet du Président/Gabinetto del Presidente/Priekšsēdētāja kabinets/Pirmininko kabinetas/Elnöki hivatal/Kabinett tal-President/Kabinet van de Voorzitter/Gabinet Przewodniczącego/Gabinete do Presidente/Cabinet Preşedinte/Kancelária predsedu/Urad predsednika/Puheenjohtajan kabinetti/Talmannens kansli</p>	
<p>Кабинет на генералния секретар/Gabinete del Secretario General/Kancelář generálního tajemníka/Generalsekretærens Kabinet/Kabinett des Generalsekretärs/Peasekretäri büroo/Γραφείο Γενικού Γραμματέα/Secretary-General's Office/Cabinet du Secrétaire général/Gabinetto del Segretario generale/Ġeneralsekretära kabinets/Generalinio sekretoriaus kabinetas/Főtitkári hivatal/Kabinett tas-Segretarju Ġenerali/Kabinet van de secretaris-generaal/Gabinet Sekretarza Generalnego/Gabinete do Secretário-Geral/Cabinet Secretar General/Kancelária generálneho tajomníka/Urad generalnega sekretarja/Pääsihteerin kabinetti/Generalsekreterarens kansli</p>	
<p>Генерална дирекция/Dirección General/Generální ředitelství/Generaldirektorat/Generaldirektion/Peadirektoraat/Γενική Διεύθυνση/Directorate-General/Direction générale/Direzione generale/Ġenerāldirektorāts/Generalinis direktoratas/Főigazgatóság/Direktorat Ġenerali/Direktoraten-generaal/Dyrekcja Generalna/Direcção-Geral/Direcții Generale/Generálne riaditeľstvo/Generalni direktorat/Pääosasto/Generaldirektorat</p>	
<p>DG PRES DG IPOL DG EXPO DG COMM DG PERS DG INLO DG TRAD DG INTE DG FINS DG ITEC</p>	<p>Rosemary Opacic; Sandro D'Angelo</p>
<p>Правна служба/Servicio Jurídico/Právní služba/Juridisk Tjeneste/Juristischer Dienst/Öigusteenistus/Νομική Υπηρεσία/Legal Service/Service juridique/Servizio giuridico/Juridiskais dienests/Teisės tarnyba/Jogi szolgálat/Servizz legali/Juridische Dienst/Wydział prawny/Servíço Jurídico/Serviciu Juridic/Právny servis/Pravna služba/Oikeudellinen yksikkö/Rättstjänsten</p>	
<p>Секретариат на комисията/Secretaría de la comisión/Sekretariát výboru/Udvalgssekretariatet/Ausschusseksretariat/Komisjoni sekretariaat/Γραμματεία επιτροπής/Committee secretariat/Secrétariat de la commission/Segreteria della commissione/Komitejas sekretariāts/Komiteto sekretoriatas/A bizottság titkársága/Sekretarjat tal-kumitat/Commissiesecretariaat/Sekretariat komisji/Secretariado da comissão/Sekretariat comisie/Sekretariat odbora/Valiokunnan sihteeristö/Utskottssekretariatet</p>	
<p>Tim Boden;</p>	
<p>Сътрудник/Asistente/Asistent/Assistent/Assistenz/Βοηθός/Assistant/Assistente/Palīgs/Padējējas/Asszisztens/Asystent/Pomočnik/Avustaja/Assistenten</p>	
<p>Ainhoa Markuleta</p>	

- * (P) = Председател/Presidente/Předseda/Formand/Vorsitzender/Esimees/Πρόεδρος/Chair(wo)man/Président/Priekšsēdētājs/Pirmininkas/Elnök/Chairman/Voorzitter/Przewodniczący/Preşedinte/Predseda/Predsednik/Puheenjohtaja/Ordförande
- (VP) = Заместник-председател/Vicepresidente/Mistopředseda/Næstformand/Stellvertretender Vorsitzender/Aseesimees/Αντιπρόεδρος/Vice-Chair(wo)man/Vice-Président/Priekšsēdētāja vietnieks/Pirmininko pavaduotojas/Alelnök/Víci 'Chairman'/Ondervoorzitter/Wiceprzewodniczący/Vice-Présidente/Vicepreşedinte/Podpredseda/Podpredsednik/Varapuheenjohtaja/Vice ordförande
- (M) = Член/Miembro/Člen/Medlem./Mitglied/Parlamendiliige/Μέλος/Member/Membre/Membro/Deputāts/Narys/Képviselő/Membri/Lid/Członek/Membro/Membri/Člen/Poslanec/Jäsen/Ledamot
- (F) = Длъжностно лице/Funcionario/Úředník/Tjenestemand/Beamter/Ametnik/Υπάλληλος/Official/Fonctionnaire/Funzionario/Ierēdnis/Pareigūnas/Tisztviselő/Ufficial/Ambtenaar/Urządnic/Funcionário/Funcionar/Úradník/Uradnik/Virkamies/Tjänsteman