

**EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT**  
Delegation to the EU-Russia PCC

**EU-RUSSIA PCC WORKING GROUP**

**31 March - 1 April 2010**  
**Moscow**

**REPORT**

DIRECTORATE-GENERAL FOR  
EXTERNAL POLICIES OF THE UNION

---

26 April 2010  
ME/MC/cs

## **Brief summary**

The composition of the working group was the following: Mr Knut FLECKENSTEIN, Chair, Mr Alojz PETERLE, 2nd Vice-Chair, Mr Adam GIEREK, Mr Sergej KOZLIK, Mr Alexander MIRSKY, Mr Slawomir NITRAS, Mr Pavel POC, Mr Dominique RIQUET, Mr Csaba TABAJDI and Ms Tatjana ZDANOKA.

During its visit to Moscow, the Working Group held meetings with the discussions with Russian NGOs and the Civic Centre on cultural and academic issues as well as the situation of human rights in Russia. It also met with the Federation Council and some Members of the State Duma, where the issues of common European identity, Cultural, Academic and research cooperation were addressed. The meeting with Russia's Deputy Foreign Minister centred on the current state of EU-Russia relations and the state of negotiations of the next EU-Russia agreement. As this meeting took place the day after the two terrorist attacks in the Moscow metro which cost the lives of more than forty people, the Chair deposited flowers in one of the metro stations amidst many Moscow citizens and journalists. He also presented the Delegation's and the European Parliament's condolences in all the meetings.

\* \* \*

## **Introduction**

The calendar of activities of the EU-Russia Parliamentary Cooperation Committee for 2010 foresees three working groups to discuss the issues of common European identity, cultural space, academic and research cooperation (first working group meeting in Moscow 31 March and 1 April), civil society and democracy values in EU and Russia (second working group meeting in Perm 27 and 28 May) and new security strategy (third working group meeting in Brussels 28 and 29 September). The working groups will be followed by a PCC 13-15 December in Strasbourg.

## **Preparatory meeting for the first working groups visit to Moscow**

The preparatory meeting took place on Tuesday, 23 March in Brussels. The Chair opened the meeting and informed the Members that the Delegation received a letter from Mr Marek MIGALSKI, asking the Delegation to support the demonstrators in Moscow and Saint Petersburg on 31 March 2010. The Chair informed that the Bureau of the Delegation has exchanged letters on this issue with the Russian counterparts in the Duma and the Federation Council. He also informed that the President of the EP asked him to represent the European Parliament in Saint Petersburg on 7 April 2010 on the 65th anniversary of the end of the WWII organised by the Parliamentary Assembly of the CIS countries and on 8 April 2010 on a conference organised by the Council of Europe on future of the European security.

The Chair invited Mr Sven-Olov CARLSSON, representative of the European Commission, to present the state of play of the EU-Russia PCA negotiations with a special focus on the common space on research and education, including cultural aspects. Mr CARLSSON informed that the new agreement should include all fields of cooperation, including trade, investment and energy. The eighth round of negotiations has been concluded and good progress has been achieved in some fields. The group on culture and research is more advanced, but thus has less progressed recently.

Mr LANDSBERGIS asked the representative of the Commission on the visa-facilitation agreement with Russia and on the position of the EU Council on Georgia. Ms BADIA I CUTCHET asked whether the EC is debating with Russia on Arctic issues. Mr GIREEK asked why the EC allocated only 38 million euro to Russian scientific and technology programme and whether the Baltic Sea research has also been included in the project. Mr PETERLE asked why the culture and research negotiating group had reached little progress recently and offered EP help in the negotiations. Mr TABAJDI asked whether the EC knows what Russia plans to do after the failure of the Copenhagen climate conference. Mr SEEBER asked what the main problems in the negotiations were, what the issue of nuclear safety is and which body decides which Russian projects are finally selected for funding.

Mr CARLSSON replied to all the questions, informing the Members that there are various fore to discuss Arctic issues with Russia, that the sum of 38 million euro does not cover the whole of research programme funding, that the Baltic Sea cooperation is included in the Nordic Dimension and that trade and investment provisions need more effort from both sides.

Moving to the next point of the agenda, the Chair informed the Members about the programme of the Working Group in Moscow, foreseen 31 March - 1 April 2010, and gave the floor to Mr PETERLE, who is the Chair of the Working Group. Mr PETERLE explained his understanding of the main issues for the Working Group based on his note, which was distributed to the Members.

Concerning point five of the agenda (exchange of views on topics to be discussed during meetings of the Delegation in 2010) Ms ZDANOKA raised the issue of six million people in the EU who have double identity, namely the Russian minorities in the EU countries. Mr MIGALSKI disagreed to this proposal. On the contrary Mr TABAJDI supported it.

Mr MIRSKY informed that the Russian problems with the opposition are an internal Russian issue and that the Delegation should not interfere. Mr MIGALSKI disagreed. Mr SCHULZ brought the attention of the Delegation that on 31 March there will be a Memorial demonstration in Moscow. He invited the Members of the Working Group to take part in the demonstration.

The Chair informed the Members that one of the topics for future discussion raised by Mr REMEK is EU space policy.

Mr MIGALSKI, taking the floor again, asked about possible workshops and seminars organised by the Delegation. He volunteered to organise two workshops: one on the civil society in Russia, the other on the media freedom in Russia.

Closing the meeting, the Chair informed the Members that the next meeting of the Delegation will take place 4 May 2010 in Brussels and wished all the participants of the Working Group in Moscow success in their work.

## **Wednesday 31 March 2010**

### **Meetings in the European Union Delegation in Moscow**

The visit to Moscow started with a briefing by H.E. Mr Fernando VALENZUELA, Head of EU Delegation, and his collaborators (inter alia) Mr BURGER, Science Councillor and Mr CLAYÉ, Head of Operations.

The Delegation was informed about the lack of substantial progress in the economic and trade relations with Russia and the need to base the future partnership on a more balanced basis, taking into account issues of common interest. Relations with Russia

are strategic for the EU and needs to be developed on many aspects outside trade, such as crisis management and cooperation in combating international terrorism. In the fields of scientific cooperation, however, Russia is a supportive and proactive partner and welcomes higher participation of EU in research and development projects. Until now, the cooperation is project-based and on an equal footing with Russia. Since 1991, the EU has financed this cooperation with 3 billion Euros from the TACIS programme. The same good cooperation applies to academic issues and the programme of student exchanges "Erasmus Mundus" is endowed with 20 million Euros per year from the EU side. There is also the new European Studies Institute, founded by the EU Commission jointly with the Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs with links also to the College of Europe in Bruges, which is designed for Russian civil servants. The cultural cooperation as well as the cooperation with the civil society on social issues is an equally a great success with many projects being co-financed on basis of proposals submitted yearly.

The delegation then had an exchange of views with prof. Vera ZABOTKINA, Vice-Rector, Moscow State Linguistics University, dr. Irina KOBRINSKAYA, Foundation for Prospective Studies and Initiatives, Institute of World Economy and International Relations, of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Mr Alexandr IGNATENKO, President of the Institute of Religion and Policy, Ms Olga Yurevna MALINOVA, Moscow State Institute for International Relations and Ms Friederike BEHR, Researcher at Amnesty International. During the meeting a variety of subjects were evoked, as the meaning of national identity, the political influences of the Islam and the undue influence of the Russian church in artistic expression as shown in a recent court case.

### **Meeting with Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs**

The EU-Russia PCC Working Group also engaged in an exchange of views with Mr GRUSHKO, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs on the state of EU-Russia relations, in particular on how to maintain their dynamism in view of the economic and financial crisis. The upcoming Rostov Summit between the EU and Russia (under the new provisions for the EU external relations of the Lisbon Treaty) should stay within the traditional agenda. From the Russian side, three issues are of importance:

- Partnership in technology, energy and education as they are areas of common importance;
- Visa-free regime, on which many EU Heads of State have declared full support, as it is the real test for strategic partnership and would promote joint investments, civil society, common research and other common issues;
- Cooperation in external security, which can be very effective if based on equal footing (joint cooperation in Central Africa or in Bosnia Herzegovina are good examples).

In essence, the Russian side centres on issues which are not controversial; membership of WTO is not on this year's agenda, but it can be discussed with the EU. Russia will continue to have close relations with the EU which is Russia's natural trade partner. Answering a question on climate change, Mr GRUSHKO reiterated that Russia's position is very close to the EU and the results of Copenhagen were disappointing. Efforts must be deployed by all countries but special provisions should be made for the developing a world where the need to combat poverty has to be taken

into account as well. He also mentioned the need for EU to keep its commitments concerning the granting of citizenship to all inhabitants within its territory irrespective of the fact that they belong to a minority. In the end of this exchange of views, Mr GRUSHKO took the opportunity of this year celebrating the 65th anniversary of the end of the Second World War to remind that the role Russia played must not be neglected, as this can have a negative impact on the EU-Russia cooperation.

### **Meeting with the Association of European Business**

The Delegation had an information meeting with representatives of European Business installed in Russia. The discussions concerned the circumstances of doing business in Russia, dealing with different procedures and know how. The speakers mentioned that the efforts are well received by Russian business and public and they should be supported as good means of promoting the EU-Russia relations. The subjects of promotion of innovation and collaboration between scientists as well as various EU and Russian businesses were the central point of these discussions.

### **Exchange of views with the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation**

In the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation the EP Delegation was welcomed by the Chairman of the Commission on civil society development, Mr DISKIN who presented the other participants to this meeting as well as the mission of the Civic Chamber, which is to form and develop an active civic society and protect the interests and needs of the citizens. The Members of the Delegation were informed on the activities of this relatively new forum, established in 2005, and the links which it has developed both with the EU (with the Economic and Social Committee) and the USA, with which a joint commission was established to discuss common problems.

In the broad discussion which followed, the issues of culture, identity, the role of civil society, the need of modernisation of the Russian society, the question of humanitarian issues versus individuality were debated.

The question of what is an identity was discussed widely. It was agreed that this is a very interesting and important question, not only from a theoretical point of view, as the political identity defines the way to work together. On this issue Mr PETERLE raised the subject of what the "Russian idea" is today and how it can combine with the "European idea" which is being formed in the EU. Ms ZDANOKA drew attention on the need for Russia to overcome the negative views that it often seems to evoke in the EU and Mr TABAJDI asked how the Russians perceive themselves in our times, which is a determining factor for good relations and cooperation between Russia and the EU. Commonality of problems imposes a commonality of responses and thus a closer cooperation is the indicated way forward.

In conclusion, the participants agreed that this kind of meetings are essential and both Mr FLECKENSTEIN and Mr DISKIN agreed that the dialogue must continue; there is need to build more confidence and a better mutual understanding as there are more common interests than dividing issues.

The programme of the day ended with an official dinner hosted by the Russian Duma.

## **THURSDAY 1 APRIL 2010**

### **Meeting with the Members of the Federation Council and the State Duma**

The meeting with the Members of the Federation Council and the State Duma was chaired by Ms DEMENTIEVA, Member of the Federation Council and Mr FLECKENSTEIN, co-chair of the EU-Russia PCC. Mr PETERLE, co-chair of the Working Group, summarised the previous day's discussions on the cultural identity and introduced the present exchange of views which focused more on the political side of this issue. However, the question of identity is an open one; it cannot be defined once and for ever. The certainty is that in the future we will still share the same values and principles as identity means partnership and we are now in the midst of negotiations for the new partnership agreement. The areas of research, education and culture are considered by both sides as fundamental parts of this agreement. The delegation did not encounter any problematic aspects in the talks in Moscow. The message received was clear: there is need to broaden this cooperation. For Mr ZHELEZNYAK, Member of the State Duma and co-chair of the Working Group, Russian culture was always part of the European culture despite some circles' efforts to present things differently. He proposed to create a joint parliamentary forum to oversee the cultural exchanges providing thus a political feeling. He also raised the subjects of balance between globalisations and national culture and the need for exchanging practices to build a better balanced multi-cultural, multi-religion and multi-ethnic world.

In the following exchange of views took part Mr TABADJI, Mr OLEINIK, from the Federation Council, Mr PETERLE, Ms DEMETIEVA from the Federation Council, Mr KUPTSOV, from the State Duma, Mr KOZLIK, Mr GIREEK, Ms ZDANOKA and Mr GLUHIH, from the Federation Council. The subjects raised were the importance of cultural identity and specifically its role in the less developed countries, the role that parliamentarians could and should play in cultural issues, the problems of indigenous peoples and the safeguarding of their cultures and the importance that cultural aspects play in politics.

The issue of differences in perceptions prevailing in the EU and in Russia and the need to overcome them in order to build a good platform for cooperation was a main point raised by almost all the speakers. The common understanding was that joint meetings, frequent exchanges of views and a continuous dialogue in all fora is the way to overcome these obstacles in building a common understanding.

### **Conclusions**

This visit of the Working Group on Science, Education and Culture to Moscow can be reviewed as constructive and useful, since it allowed a franc and genuine exchange of views with the Russian side and not only the parliamentary one. The Working Group heard the views of the civil society and the academia as well as the European business active in Russia. The delegation also took the opportunity to participate in the national mourning and express their condolences to the Russian people after the attacks in the Moscow metro which was greatly appreciated from the Russian side.

While the differences in opinions were not swept under the carpet and both sides were outspoken and sometimes critical, this was a constructive criticism, nurtured in the spirit of building bridges more than pointing fingers and pronouncing condemnations. The wish for this dialogue to continue, expressed from both sides and all milieus, is a clear indication of this visit's success.

As a result, the proposed continuation of this inter-parties and inter-cultural dialogue might take a more important place in the future and support the general efforts of the EU as well as the international community for peaceful cooperation in the scientific and cultural sectors.

# **ANNEXES**



# **ANNEXES**

# EU-RUSSIA PARLIAMENTARY COOPERATION COMMITTEE

**WORKING GROUP**  
**31 March - 1 April 2010**  
**MOSCOW**

## PROGRAMME

### Programme Coordination and Contacts:

<p><b><u>European Parliament</u></b></p> <p><b>Michal CZAPLICKI</b> ☎ +32-2 284 4886 <a href="mailto:michal.czapllicki@europarl.europa.eu">michal.czapllicki@europarl.europa.eu</a></p> <p><b>Claudia SIEGISMUND</b> ☎ +32-2 284 22 93 <a href="mailto:claudia.siegismund@europarl.europa.eu">claudia.siegismund@europarl.europa.eu</a> Fax : +32-2 284 68 30</p> <p><b>Mobile during mission:</b> +32 - 498 981369</p>	<p><b><u>Russian State Duma</u></b></p> <p><b>Gleb RESHETNIKOV</b> ☎ +7 495-692 2626 Fax +7 495-692-3513 <a href="mailto:gleb@duma.gov.ru">gleb@duma.gov.ru</a></p> <p><b><u>Federation Council</u></b></p> <p><b>Natalia REZNIK</b> ☎ +7 495-623 0446 Fax +7 495-692 5896 <a href="mailto:ReznikN@mail.ru">ReznikN@mail.ru</a></p>
---	---

**Tuesday, 30 March 2010**

**Individual Arrival** of Members and staff of the European Parliament delegation at Moscow Airport

**Individual transfer to**

**Hotel Metropol Moscow**  
Teatralny Proezd 1-4  
109012 Moscow,  
Tel. 7 499 501 7800 - Fax: 7 499 501 7838

19h00 Meeting of the Secretariat  
*venue:* Hotel Metropol

**Wednesday, 31 March 2010**

- 08.30 Departure from Hotel
- 09.00 **Briefing** by Mr Michael WEBB, Acting Head of EC Delegation,  
09:45 and H.E. Mr Juan Antonio March PUJOL, Ambassador of the Kingdom of Spain to Russia  
*venue*: Delegation of the European Union to Russia, Kadashevskaya nob.  
14/1
- 09.45 **Exchange of views with representatives of civil society**  
11:30 - Prof. Dr. Vera Zabotkina, Vice-Rector, Moscow State Linguistics University  
- Dr. Irina Kobrinskaya, Foundation for Prospective Studies and Initiatives (PSI Foundation), Institute of World Economy and International Relations (IMEMO) of the Russian Academy of Sciences  
- Mr Alexandr Ignatenko, President of the Institute of Religion and Policy  
- Ms Olga Yurevna Malinova, Moscow State Institute for International Relations  
- Ms Friederike Behr, Researcher at Amnesty International (tbc)  
- Mr Oleg Orlov, Chairman of the Memorial Human Rights Center (tbc)  
*venue*: Delegation of the European Union to Russia, Kadashevskaya nob.  
14/1
- 12:00 **Ministry of Foreign Affairs**  
12:45 Meeting with the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs Mr Alexander GRUSHKO  
*venue*: 32-34, Smolenskaya-Sennaya Sq
- 13.00 **Lunch** hosted by the Association of European Business  
15:00 *venue*: Novotel, Novoslobodskaya str. 23
- 16.00- **Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation**  
17.30 - Exchange with the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation  
*venue*: Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation, Miuskaya pl.d.7, str. 1
- 18.30 **Dinner** hosted by Mr Sergey ZHELEZNYAK, Deputy of head of the Russian Delegation  
*venue*: Restaurant "YERMAK", Nizhnie Mnevniky str. 41

**Thursday, 1 April 2010**

08.50 Departure from Hotel

09.15 Arrival at the Council of Federation  
*venue:* Bolshaya Dmitrovka Str. 26 - Main Entrance

**Common European Identity, Cultural Space, Academic and Research Cooperation**

09.30 **Opening address** by  
Mrs Natalia DEMENTIEVA and Mr Knut FLECKENSTEIN

10.10 **1. Role of Parliamentarians in Intercultural Dialogue**

11.20 **2. Academic and Research Cooperation between EU and Russia  
Russia: From Economy based on Raw Materials to Economy of  
Knowledge and Innovations** - Exchange of views

Working Group chaired by  
Mr Alojz PETERLE and Mr Sergey ZHELEZNYAK

14.00 **Press point**

PM **Individual departures**

**The EP Security duty officer's number in case of emergency  
during the mission is**

**+ 32 2 284 35 05**

06.04.2010/cs

# EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

## EU-RUSSIA PCC WORKING GROUP

31 March - 1 April 2010  
Moscow

### FINAL List of Participants

#### Members :

<b>Mr Knut FLECKENSTEIN</b> <i>Chairman</i>	S&D, Germany
<b>Mr Alojz PETERLE</b> <i>2nd Vice-Chairman</i>	EPP, Slovenia
<del><b>Mr Antonello ANTINORO</b></del>	<del>EPP, Italy</del>
<b>Mr Adam GIEREK</b>	S&D, Poland
<b>Mr Sergej KOZLIK</b>	ALDE, Slovakia
<b>Mr Alexander MIRSKY</b>	S&D, Latvia
<b>Mr Slawomir Witold NITRAS</b>	EPP, Poland
<b>Mr Pavel POC</b>	S&D, Czech Republic
<b>Mr Dominique RIQUET</b>	EPP, France
<b>Mr Csaba TABAJDI</b>	S&D, Hungary
<b>Ms Tatjana ZDANOKA</b>	Greens/EFA, Latvia

#### Secretariat of the Delegation :

<b>Mr Michal CZAPLICKI</b> Delegation	Administrator, Responsible for the
<b>Ms Maria Elena EFTHYMIOU</b>	Administrator, Policy Department
<b>Ms Claudia SIEGISMUND</b>	Assistant, Delegation Secretariat

#### Secretariat of the Political Groups :

<b>Mr Kai WYNANDS</b>	Political Advisor, EPP
<b>Mr Ciprian MATEI</b>	Political Advisor, S&D
<b>Ms Isabelle CLEENEWERCK DE CRAYENCOUR</b>	Political Advisor, ALDE

**Accompanying persons :**

**Ms Julia WANNINGER**  
**Mr Dominik FRELIH**  
**Ms Antonia GOSPODINOVA**

Assistant to Mr Fleckenstein, MEP  
Assistant to Mr Peterle, MEP  
Assistant to Mr Antinoro, MEP

**Interpreters (EN/DE/RU):**

**German**

**Ms Annette STACHOWSKI, *Team leader***  
**Ms Raphaela MANNHEIM-DUBA**

**English**

**Mr Alasdair THOMSON**

**Russian**

**Mr Mikhail FARAFONOV**  
**Mr Alexey FOKIN**  
**Mr Juri LYSENKO**

**Abbreviations :**

EPP	European People's Party (Christian Democrats)	ECR	European Conservatives and Reformists
S&D	Progressive Alliance of Socialists and Democrats	EUL/NGL	European United Left/Nordic Green Left
ALDE	Alliance of Liberal and Democrats for Europe	EFD	Europe of Freedom and Democracy
Greens/EFA	Greens/European Free Alliance	NI	

**List of the State Duma participants**  
**(PCC EU-Russia WG, Council of Federation, 1 April 2010)**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Faction</b>	<b>Position</b>
1.	Ms Oksana DMITRIEVA	Fair Russia	Member of Committee on Budget and Taxes
3.	Mr Valentin KUPTSOV	Communist Party	Head of Committee on Nationalities Matters
4.	Ms Tat'yana VORONOVA	United Russia	Member of Committee on Constitutional Legislation and State Development
5.	Mr Sergey ZHELEZNYAK	United Russia	Member of Committee on Economic Policy and Enterprise