



2016/0230(COD)

6.4.2017

AMENDMENTS

235 - 292

Draft report

Norbert Lins

(PE599.777v01-00)

on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on the inclusion of greenhouse gas emissions and removals from land use, land use change and forestry into the 2030 climate and energy framework and amending Regulation No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and the Council on a mechanism for monitoring and reporting greenhouse gas emissions and other information relevant to climate change

Proposal for a regulation

(COM(2016)0479 – C8-0330/2016 – 2016/0230(COD))

Amendment 235

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Article 9 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

In accounts pursuant to Article 6(1) and 8(1) relating to harvested wood products, Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Amendment

Member States shall account for emissions and removals resulting from the changes in the pool of harvested wood products, ***as the total of emissions and removals for each of the years in the periods from 2021 to 2025 and from 2026 to 2030.***

Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Or. en

Amendment 236

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation

Article 9 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

In accounts pursuant to Article 6(1) and 8(1) relating to harvested wood products, Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Amendment

Member States shall account for emissions and removals resulting from the changes in the pool of harvested wood products, ***as the total of emissions and removals for each of the years in the periods from 2021 to 2025 and from 2026 to 2030.*** Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default

half-life values specified in Annex V:

Or. en

Justification

As long as forest management is accounted on a net-net basis, it makes sense to create a separate account for harvested wood products, to incentivise long lived uses of wood.

Amendment 237

Nils Torvalds, Ulrike Müller, Gesine Meissner, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation

Article 9 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

In accounts pursuant to Article 6(1) and 8(1) relating to harvested wood products, Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Amendment

Member States shall account for emissions and removals resulting from harvested wood products as the total of emissions and removals for each of the years in the periods 2021 to 2025 and 2026 to 2030.

Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Or. en

Justification

Harvested wood products are a result of human-induced/anthropogenic activity and are therefore proposed to be included as a separate category.

Amendment 238

Daciana Octavia Sârbu

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

Text proposed by the Commission

In accounts pursuant to Article **6(1) and 8(1)** relating to harvested wood products, Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Amendment

In accounts pursuant to Article **2 (1 e a)** relating to harvested wood products, Member States shall reflect emissions and removals resulting from changes in the pool of harvested wood products falling within the following categories using the first order decay function, the methodologies and the default half-life values specified in Annex V:

Or. en

Amendment 239

Nils Torvalds, Fredrick Federley, Gesine Meissner, Ulrike Müller, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Merja Kyllönen, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The Commission shall, by 31 December 2019, adopt a delegated act in accordance with Article 14 in order to update the categories in the pool of harvested wood products with additional products that have a positive substitution effect. The delegated act shall also update the default half-life values specified in Annex V.

Or. en

Amendment 240
Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation
Article 9 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 14 to add product categories on the basis of IPCC Guidelines and to ensure that the accounting for harvested wood products does not undermine environmental integrity of the Union LULUCF accounting.

Or. en

Amendment 241

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 9 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 9 a

The Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 14 to amend Annex V for the purpose of adapting the technical progress made and including new classes of harvested wood products for which half-life values over 10 years are known and confirmed.

Or. en

Justification

The amendment considers new developments in the field of use of wood. However, for the purpose of this legislation the development of products of short half-life is not relevant.

Amendment 242

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation

Article 10

Article 10

deleted

Accounting for natural disturbances

1. At the end of the periods from 2021 to 2025 and from 2026 to 2030, Member States may exclude from their accounts for afforested land and managed forest land greenhouse gas emissions resulting from natural disturbances exceeding the average emissions caused by natural disturbances in the period 2001-2020, excluding statistical outliers ('background level') calculated in accordance with this Article and Annex VI.

2. Where a Member State applies paragraph 1, it shall submit to the Commission information on the background level for each land accounting category determined in paragraph 1 and on the data and methodologies used in accordance with Annex VI.

3. Where a Member State applies paragraph 1, it shall exclude from accounting until 2030 all subsequent removals on the land affected by natural disturbances.

4. The Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 14 to revise the methodology and information requirements in Annex VI in order to reflect changes in the IPCC Guidelines.

Or. en

Justification

If Member States take credit and account for removals from LULUCF sector they should also account for emissions from the sector, including debits from afforestation, whether they are natural or anthropogenic. It is also debateable to what extent natural disturbances are truly non-anthropogenic (and therefore avoidable) since poor management practices lead to forests having a lack of resilience.

Amendment 243

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation

Article 10 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. At the end of the periods from 2021 to 2025 and from 2026 to 2030, Member States may exclude from their accounts for ***afforested land and*** managed forest land greenhouse gas emissions resulting from natural disturbances exceeding the average emissions caused by natural disturbances in the period 2001-2020, excluding statistical outliers ('background level') calculated in accordance with this Article and Annex VI.

Amendment

1. At the end of the periods from 2021 to 2025 and from 2026 to 2030, Member States may exclude from their accounts for managed forest land greenhouse gas emissions resulting from natural disturbances exceeding the average emissions caused by natural disturbances in the period 2001-2020, excluding statistical outliers ('background level') calculated in accordance with this Article and Annex VI.

Or. en

Justification

Debits from afforestation should be counted, otherwise it will undermine the feasibility to reach the target of the ESR. Since LULUCF activities are inherently reversible and therefore more risky, countries must take this aspect into consideration when relying on this sector for offsets.

Amendment 244

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 10 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Emissions resulting from harvesting or salvage logging activities that took place on those lands following the occurrence of the natural disturbances shall not be excluded.

Or. en

Justification

Ad 1. is the exact reading of the Annex VI. Ad2 in case of natural disturbance (in the accounting category of afforested deforested land and category of managed forest land) that goes beyond established average disturbance occurring in 2001-2020, Member States do not have to account for the emissions (and consequently do not account for the removals for 20 years). This however doesn't support sustainable management. Unless it is proven that management was such to limit the damage and disruption of the system, such emissions should be accounted for.

Amendment 245

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 10 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1 b (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Furthermore, in order to incentivise management practices supporting resilience of the system, where the national scientific authority finds that a correlation exists between the management and the occurrence of the disaster, and that the management undertaken in the respective area did not prevent or limit the impact of the natural disturbance, it shall be considered to be human induced. In that case, the first sub-paragraph of this Article and Article 10(3) shall not be applied and Articles 6 and 8 apply.

Or. en

Justification

Ad 1. is the exact reading of the Annex VI. Ad2 in case of natural disturbance (in the accounting category of afforested deforested land and category of managed forest land) that goes beyond established average disturbance occurring in 2001-2020, Member States do not have to account for the emissions (and consequently do not account for the removals for 20 years). This however doesn't support sustainable management. Unless it is proven that management was such to limit the damage and disruption of the system, such emissions should be accounted for.

Amendment 246

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Article 10 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

4. The Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 14 to revise the methodology and information requirements in Annex VI in order to reflect changes in the IPCC Guidelines.

Amendment

4. The Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated acts in accordance with Article 14 to revise the methodology and information requirements in Annex VI in order to reflect changes in the IPCC Guidelines, ***as adopted by bodies of the UNFCCC or of the Paris Agreement.***

Or. en

Amendment 247

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

1. Where total emissions exceed removals in a Member State and that Member State has ***deleted*** annual emission allocations under Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 this quantity shall be taken into account for the Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Amendment

1. Where total emissions exceed removals in a Member State and that Member State has ***chosen to delete*** annual emission allocations under Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030, ***as one of the flexibility options,*** this quantity shall be taken into account for the Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Or. en

Justification

Member States should not be compelled to use this option.

Amendment 248

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State **and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030**, that Member State may transfer **the remaining quantity** to another Member State. The transferred quantity shall be taken into account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Amendment

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State, that Member State may transfer **up to 50% of the exceedance** to another Member State. The transferred quantity shall be taken into account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Or. en

Justification

Counting credits from LULUCF for the compliance of Member States of ES targets is too risky

Amendment 249

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State **and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030**, that Member State may transfer the remaining quantity to another Member State. The transferred quantity shall be taken into

Amendment

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State that Member State may transfer the remaining quantity to another Member State **subject to a discount factor of 25%**. The transferred quantity shall be taken into account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Or. en

Justification

The LULUCF credits should not be used for compliance under Effort Sharing Regulation. Transferrable or tradable LULUCF overachievement should be subject to a discount rate to reflect the impact of growth due to CO₂ fertilization. Due to increased levels of concentrations of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere, forests are growing more than the natural increment rate. It would be perverse to credit Member States for an activity that is artificially stimulated by climate change itself. The proposed 25% discount rate represents an average of the estimated fertilisation effect.

Amendment 250

Annie Schreijer-Pierik

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030, that Member State may transfer the remaining quantity to another Member State. The transferred quantity shall be taken into account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Amendment

2. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030, that Member State may transfer the ***whole of the*** remaining quantity to another Member State. The transferred quantity shall be taken into account when assessing the receiving Member State's compliance with its commitment pursuant to Article 4.

Or. nl

Amendment 251

Luke Ming Flanagan, Lynn Boylan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Amendment

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030 **up to a limit of 5%**.

Or. en

Justification

This is to avoid a big build up of credits and no action being taken in the final years, and also means the EU is less exposed to risks due to miscalculation of credits. The negative impacts of this can be seen from the initial phases of the ETS and prevented the mechanism from functioning as it should and this perverse result should be avoided at all costs.

Amendment 252

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance

**Proposal for a regulation
Article 11 – paragraph 3**

Text proposed by the Commission

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Amendment

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030 **up to a limit of 5%**.

Or. en

Justification

This is to avoid a big build up of credits and no action being taken in the final years. If there is such a potential in the LULUCF sector, then the goal could have been stronger than ‘no debit’. If credits from 2021-2025 beyond ‘no debit’ are to be instead transferred to 2026-2030, this could significantly limit the efforts in 2026-2030. Provision of limiting the transfer of credits from one accounting period to the other maintains the efforts and makes it more consistent with the ambitious goals of Paris Agreement.

Amendment 253

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity *taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030* or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Amendment

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank **25% of** the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Or. en

Amendment 254

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 3

Text proposed by the Commission

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken *into account under Article 7 of Regulation []*

Amendment

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken transferred to another Member State

on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030 ***up to 50% of the exceedance.***

Or. en

Justification

This is necessary to avoid building up of credits without actions being taken in the final years reducing the risk miscalculation of the credits.

Amendment 255 **Annie Schreijer-Pierik**

Proposal for a regulation **Article 11 – paragraph 3**

Text proposed by the Commission

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Amendment

3. To the extent that total removals exceed emissions in a Member State in the period from 2021 to 2025, and after subtraction of any quantity taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 or transferred to another Member State pursuant to paragraph 2, that Member State may bank the ***whole of the*** remaining quantity to the period 2026-2030.

Or. nl

Amendment 256 **Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano**

Proposal for a regulation **Article 11 – paragraph 4**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. *In order to avoid double counting, the quantity of net removals taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 shall be subtracted from that Member State's quantity available for transfer to another Member State or banking pursuant to paragraphs 2-3.* **deleted**

Or. en

Amendment 257

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation

Article 11 – paragraph 4

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. *In order to avoid double counting, the quantity of net removals taken into account under Article 7 of Regulation [] on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 shall be subtracted from that Member State's quantity available for transfer to another Member State or banking pursuant to paragraphs 2-3.* **deleted**

Or. en

Justification

In line with removing LULUCF flexibility from Effort Sharing Regulation.

Amendment 258

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation
Article 11 – paragraph 5

Text proposed by the Commission

5. If a Member State is not in compliance with the monitoring requirements laid down in Article 7(1) da) of Regulation (EU) No 525/2013, the Central Administrator designated under Article 20 of Directive 2003/87/EC shall **temporarily** prohibit that Member State from transferring or banking pursuant to paragraphs 2-3.

Amendment

5. If a Member State is not in compliance with the monitoring requirements laid down in Article 7(1) da) of Regulation (EU) No 525/2013, the Central Administrator designated under Article 20 of Directive 2003/87/EC shall prohibit that Member State from transferring or banking pursuant to paragraphs 2-3.

Or. en

Amendment 259
Merja Kyllönen

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – paragraph 3 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3a. To ensure the compliance with the Union's commitments in accordance with articles 3, 4 and 14 of the Paris Agreement, the Commission shall report, on the basis of an independent report from the European Environmental Agency, to the European Parliament and to the Council the impacts of this regulation on climate change mitigation on one hand and on forests, other wooded land and biodiversity on the other, and on the need to review this regulation or to submit other legislative proposals in order to guarantee the Union's climate action.

Or. en

Amendment 260
Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Jo Leinen

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 – paragraph 3 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3a. *If the greenhouse gas emissions of a Member State in either the period from 2021 to 2025 or the period from 2026 to 2030 under this Regulation exceed its greenhouse gas removals, as determined in accordance with this Article, there shall be a deduction from that Member State's annual emission allocations equal to the amount in tonnes of CO₂ equivalent of those excess greenhouse gas emissions for the relevant years.*

Or. en

Amendment 261
Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation
Article 12 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 12 a

The Commission shall report in 2027 and 2032 on the cumulative balance of emissions and removals from managed forest land in the Union in reference to average emissions and removals in the period from 1990 to 2009. If the cumulative balance is negative, the Commission shall make a proposal to compensate and remove the corresponding amount from Member States emission allocations under Regulation .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council^{1a}.

^{1a} *Regulation .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council of ... on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to*

2030 for a resilient Energy Union and to meet commitments under the Paris Agreement and amending Regulation No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and the Council on a mechanism for monitoring and reporting greenhouse gas emissions and other information relevant to climate change (OJ L ..., ..., p. ...).

Or. en

Amendment 262

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 14 – paragraph 2

Text proposed by the Commission

2. The power to adopt delegated acts referred to in Article 3, 5, 8, 10 and 13 shall be conferred on the Commission for an indeterminate period of time from the [date of entry into force].

Amendment

2. The power to adopt delegated acts referred to in Article 3, 5, 8, **9**, 10 and 13 shall be conferred on the Commission for an indeterminate period of time from the [date of entry into force].

Or. en

Justification

To make compatible with amendment of Art. 9.

Amendment 263

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Article 14 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 14 a

Committee procedure

1. The Commission shall be assisted by the Climate Change Committee established by Regulation (EU) No

525/2013. That Committee shall be a committee within the meaning of Regulation (EU) No 182/2011.

2. Where reference is made to this paragraph, Article 5 of Regulation (EU) No 182/2011 shall apply.

Or. en

Amendment 264
Jo Leinen

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and *may make proposals if appropriate.*

Amendment

Once an EU mid-century, long-term low greenhouse gas emission development strategy is adopted, as requested by the Paris Agreement, the Commission shall reassess the adequacy of the obligations laid down in this Regulation in meeting the EU long-term climate targets as well as the goals of the Paris Agreement. The Commission shall make legislative proposals to adjust the contributions of Member States laid down in Regulation [ESR] and [LULUCF] accordingly. The assessment and proposals shall be informed by the Facilitative Dialogue under the UNFCCC in 2018.

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target, *the EU long-term targets between 2031 and 2050* and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and *shall make legislative proposals to adjust this Regulation accordingly.*

Or. en

Amendment 265
Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation
Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall **report** to the European Parliament and to the Council **by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.**

Amendment

Within six months of the facilitative dialogue to be convened under the UNFCCC in 2018 to take stock of the collective efforts of Parties in relation to progress towards the global long-term goal, as well as within six months of the global stocktake in 2023 and subsequent global stocktakes thereafter, the Commission shall submit reports to the European Parliament and to the Council assessing the need to update and enhance the combined ambition of this Regulation, Regulation .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council^{1a} and Directive .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council^{1b}. Those reports shall assess the need to enhance the Union's 2030 and 2050 greenhouse gas emissions targets, including LULUCF, to ensure coherence with achieving the Paris Agreement's long-term goals, i.e. to hold the increase in global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5 °C, and to achieve a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century. Those reports shall be accompanied by legislative proposals, as appropriate.

^{1a} ***Regulation .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council of ... on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 for a resilient Energy Union and to meet commitments under the Paris***

Agreement *and amending Regulation No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and the Council on a mechanism for monitoring and reporting greenhouse gas emissions and other information relevant to climate change* (OJ L ..., ..., p. ...).

^{1b} *Directive .../... of the European Parliament and of the Council of ... amending Directive 2003/87/EC to enhance cost-effective emission reductions and low-carbon investments* (OJ L ..., ..., p. ...).

Or. en

Amendment 266

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February **2024** and every *five* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and *may* make proposals *if appropriate*.

Amendment

In the light of the 2018 Facilitative Dialogue, the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February **2019** *on the adequacy of the level of ambition of this Regulation*.

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2023 and every *three* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and *shall* make proposals.

Or. en

Justification

As S&D amendment for the ESR. Further, as the EU will provide input to the scientific work which will be carried out by IPCC in 2018 and will participate in the first "facilitative dialogue", which will take place in 2018 to take stock of the collective ambition and progress in implementing commitments, reference to this milestone is added.

Amendment 267

Nils Torvalds, Fredrick Federley, Pavel Telička, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Merja Kyllönen, Anneli Jäätteenmäki

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall ensure coherence between this Regulation, Regulation [(EU) ... on binding annual greenhouse gas emission reductions by Member States from 2021 to 2030 for a resilient Energy Union and to meet commitments under the Paris Agreement and amending Regulation No 525/2013 of the European Parliament and the Council on a mechanism for monitoring and reporting greenhouse gas emissions and other information relevant to climate change], Directive [(EU)... to enhance cost-effective emission reductions and low-carbon investments] and the long-term goals of the Paris Agreement. To this end, the Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the **long-term** goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Or. en

Amendment 268

Nicola Caputo

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *five* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall ***review the ambition of this proposal after the 2018 facilitative dialogue. It shall*** report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *two* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the ***long-term*** goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.^{1a}

Or. en

Justification

The proposed Regulation is unambitious and must be strengthened in several ways in order to ensure the LULUCF sectors sufficiently contribute to the objectives of the Paris Agreement to keep temperature rises to well below 2°C and pursuing efforts to limit it to 1.5°C. It should be reviewed in line with more ambition. A regular review mechanism allows the EU to participate proactively in the periodic global stocktake and ramping up of ambition required by Article 14 of the Paris Agreement.

Amendment 269

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *five* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may

Amendment

The Commission shall ***review the ambition of this proposal after the 2018 facilitative dialogue. It shall*** report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *two* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission

make proposals if appropriate.

reduction target and its contribution to the **long-term** goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Or. en

Amendment 270

Luke Ming Flanagan, Lynn Boylan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every **five** years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall **review the ambition of this proposal after the 2018 facilitative dialogue. It shall** report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every **two** years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the **long-term** goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Or. en

Justification

The proposed Regulation is unambitious and must be strengthened in several ways in order to ensure the LULUCF sectors sufficiently contribute to the objectives of the Paris Agreement to keep temperature rises to well below 2°C and pursuing efforts to limit it to 1.5°C. It should be reviewed in line with more ambition. A regular review mechanism allows the EU to participate proactively in the periodic global stocktake and ramping up of ambition required by Article 14 of the Paris Agreement.

Amendment 271

Sirpa Pietikäinen

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *five* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall ***review the ambition of this proposal after the 2018 facilitative review. It shall*** report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every *two* years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Or. en

Amendment 272

Jytte Guteland

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council ***by 28 February 2024*** and every five years thereafter on the ***operation*** of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and ***may make proposals*** if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council ***within six months of the facilitative dialogue under the UNFCCC in 2018*** and every five years thereafter on the ***provisions*** of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and ***shall propose necessary amendments*** if appropriate.

Or. en

Amendment 273

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1

Text proposed by the Commission

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, and may make proposals if appropriate.

Amendment

The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council by 28 February 2024 and every five years thereafter on the operation of this Regulation, its contribution to the EU's overall 2030 greenhouse gas emission reduction target and its contribution to the goals of the Paris Agreement, ***with a view of keeping this Regulation in line with relevant decisions adopted by bodies of the UNFCCC or of the Paris Agreement,*** and may make proposals if appropriate.

Or. en

Amendment 274

Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Member States' experts together with the Commission shall check consistency between this Regulation and agricultural policy in 2019 and thereafter in sequences relevant for the reform of agricultural policy. The European Commission shall report on synergies and potential conflicts between this Regulation and the Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) by 2020. This report shall feed into the process of the CAP reform to ensure consistency of the CAP with climate objectives. This shall, every 10 years, become part of the Integrated National Energy and Climate Plans.

Or. en

Justification

In Annex I of the Regulation on Governance of the Energy Union it reads that the general

framework for the Integrated National Energy and Climate Plan shall in the sphere LULUCF and ESR look into policies and measures covering all the key emitting sectors, which is also agriculture. It is therefore considered that checking consistency of the CAP with the climate objectives is to be a part of the Integrated Energy and Climate Plans.

Amendment 275

Luke Ming Flanagan, Lynn Boylan

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The Commission with assistance from the EEA shall review the combined ambition of the Regulations [ESR] [LULUCF] and [ETS] after the 2018 UNFCCC facilitative dialogue has taken place. The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council within a year of the facilitative dialogue, proposing changes to the EU's 2030 and 2050 greenhouse gas emissions targets, including LULUCF, to ensure coherence with achieving the Paris Agreement's long-term goals. These goals are to hold the increase in global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5 °C, and to achieve a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century

Or. en

Justification

The proposed Regulation is unambitious and must be strengthened in several ways in order to ensure the LULUCF sectors sufficiently contribute to the objectives of the Paris Agreement to keep temperature rises to well below 2°C and pursuing efforts to limit it to 1.5°C. It should be reviewed to increase the ambition. This allows the EU to participate in the periodic global stocktake and ramping up of ambition required by Article 14 of the Paris Agreement.

Amendment 276

Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation

Article 15 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The Commission with assistance from the EEA shall review the combined ambition of the Regulations [ESR] [LULUCF] and [ETS] after the 2018 UNFCCC facilitative dialogue has taken place. The Commission shall report to the European Parliament and to the Council within a year of the facilitative dialogue, proposing changes to the EU's 2030 and 2050 greenhouse gas emissions targets, including LULUCF, to ensure coherence with achieving the Paris Agreement's long-term goals. These goals are to hold the increase in global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and pursue efforts to limit the temperature increase to 1.5 °C, and to achieve a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century

Or. en

Amendment 277

Nils Torvalds, Gesine Meissner, Ulrike Müller, Pavel Telička, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation

Annex I – point B – point f

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(f) *for* afforested land and managed forest land: ***harvested wood products***.

(f) ***harvested wood products from*** afforested land and managed forest land

Or. en

Justification

Harvested wood products are a result of human-induced/anthropogenic activity and are therefore proposed to be included as a separate category.

Amendment 278

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Annex II – table 2

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

***Member State forest reference levels
including harvested wood products*** ***deleted***

***Member State Gg carbon dioxide (CO₂)
equivalents per year***

Belgium –2 499

Bulgaria –7 950

Croatia –6 289

Czech Republic –4 686

Denmark 409

Germany –22 418

Estonia –2 741

Ireland –142

Greece –1 830

Spain –23 100

France –67 410

Italy –22 166

Cyprus –157

Latvia –16 302

Lithuania –4 552

Luxembourg –418

Hungary –1 000

Malta –49

Netherlands –1 425

Austria –6 516

Poland –27 133
Portugal –6 830
Romania –15 793
Slovenia –3 171
Slovakia –1 084
Finland –20 466
Sweden –41 336
United Kingdom –8 268''

Or. en

Justification

There is no need for using forest management reference levels for the years 2013-2020 as a FRL for the period 2021-2025 and beyond.

Amendment 279

Nils Torvalds, Gesine Meissner, Ulrike Müller, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation
Annex II – table 2 – row 1

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Member State forest reference levels
including harvested wood products

Member State forest reference levels

Or. en

Justification

Harvested wood products included as separate accounting category and therefore excluded from the forest reference level.

Amendment 280

Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A

A. Criteria for determining forest reference levels **deleted**

Member State forest reference levels shall be determined in accordance with the following criteria:

- (a) Reference levels shall be consistent with the goal of achieving a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century;**
- (b) Reference levels shall ensure that the mere presence of carbon stocks is excluded from accounting;**
- (c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that emissions and removals resulting from biomass use are properly accounted for;**
- (d) Reference levels shall include the carbon pool of harvested wood products, providing a comparison between assuming instantaneous oxidation and applying the first-order decay function and half-life values;**
- (e) Reference levels should take into account the objective of contributing to the conservation of biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources, as set out in the EU Forest Strategy, Member States' national forest policies, and the EU Biodiversity Strategy;**
- (f) Reference levels shall be consistent with the national projections of anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions by sources and removals by sinks reported under Regulation (EU) No 525/2013;**
- (g) Reference levels shall be consistent with greenhouse gas inventories and relevant historical data and shall be based on transparent, complete, consistent, comparable and**

accurate information. In particular, the model used to construct the reference level shall be able to reproduce historical data from the national greenhouse gas inventory.

Or. en

(Linked to an amendment to Article 8(1).)

Justification

Linked to amendment to Article 8 (1) to change to accounting based on a reference period instead of projected forest reference levels.

Amendment 281
Christofer Fjellner

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point a

Text proposed by the Commission

(a) Reference levels shall be consistent with the goal of achieving a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century;

Amendment

(a) Reference levels shall be consistent with ***national forest legislation and forest harvesting should not exceed the long-term production capacity of Member States forests, having in mind*** the goal of achieving a balance between anthropogenic emissions by sources and removals by sinks of greenhouse gases in the second half of this century;

Or. en

Justification

Natural and ecological circumstances of a particular country or region and may differ, resulting in different conditions for forest management, which is also reflected in national forest legislations. As such national legislation is conditioned to continuously adhere to increased knowledge and changing conditions which needs to be reflected in the forest reference levels.

Amendment 282
Eleonora Evi, Piernicola Pedicini, Marco Zullo, Dario Tamburrano

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that emissions and removals resulting from biomass use are properly accounted for;

Amendment

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting **that excludes the impact of policies on the development of the forest sink**, to guarantee that emissions and removals resulting from biomass use are properly accounted for;

Or. en

Justification

The international accounting framework for bioenergy relies on emissions from harvesting being properly accounted for in the LULUCF accounting framework.

Amendment 283

Elisabeth Köstinger, Henna Virkkunen, György Hölvényi, Norbert Erdős, Albert Deß, Fredrick Federley, Hannu Takkula, Michel Dantin, Françoise Grossetête, Angélique Delahaye, Ulrike Müller

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that emissions and removals **resulting from biomass** use are properly accounted for;

Amendment

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that emissions and removals **from managed forest land** use are properly accounted for **and that emissions are balanced against removals**;

Or. en

Amendment 284
Christofer Fjellner

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point c

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that ***emissions and removals resulting from biomass use are*** properly accounted for;

(c) Reference levels should ensure a robust and credible accounting, to guarantee that ***forest management is*** properly accounted for;

Or. en

Amendment 285

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point d

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(d) ***Reference levels shall include the carbon pool of harvested wood products, providing a comparison between assuming instantaneous oxidation and applying the first-order decay function and half-life values;***

deleted

Or. en

Amendment 286

Nils Torvalds, Gesine Meissner, Ulrike Müller, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point d

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(d) ***Reference levels shall include the carbon pool of harvested wood products, providing a comparison between assuming instantaneous oxidation and applying the first-order decay function and half-life values;***

deleted

Or. en

Justification

Harvested wood products are a result of human-induced/anthropogenic activity and are therefore proposed to be included as a separate category.

Amendment 287

Elisabeth Köstinger, Albert Deß, Fredrick Federley, Hannu Takkula, Michel Dantin, Françoise Grossetête, Angélique Delahaye, Ulrike Müller, Annie Schreijer-Pierik

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point e

Text proposed by the Commission

(e) Reference levels should take into account the objective of contributing to the conservation of biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources, as set out in the EU Forest Strategy, Member States' national forest policies, and the *EU* Biodiversity Strategy;

Amendment

(e) Reference levels should take into account the objective of contributing to the conservation of biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources *for production of both energy and other fossil-based material substitution purposes*, as set out in the EU Forest Strategy, Member States' national forest *programmes and* policies, and the *Union's Bioeconomy and* Biodiversity Strategy;

Or. en

Justification

The main challenge to combat climate change is to stop fossil CO₂ emissions. The positive effects of using biomass for a low-carbon economy needs to be reflected accordingly in the LULUCF policy.

Amendment 288

Christofer Fjellner

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point e

Text proposed by the Commission

(e) Reference levels should take into account the objective of *contributing to the conservation of* biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources, as set out in the EU Forest Strategy, Member

Amendment

(e) Reference levels should take into account the objective of biodiversity and the sustainable use of natural resources *as substitution for fossil-based energy and material*, as set out in the EU Forest

States' national forest policies, and the EU **Biodiversity** Strategy;

Strategy, Member States' national forest policies, and the EU **Bioeconomy** Strategy;

Or. en

Justification

The bioeconomy and biomass has a pivotal part in combatting climate change and the transition to a low-carbon economy and society. Biomass as a substitution for fossil-based energy and material thus needs to be accurately reflected in LULUCF.

Amendment 289

Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Bolesław G. Piecha, Urszula Krupa

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point g

Text proposed by the Commission

(g) Reference levels shall be consistent with greenhouse gas inventories and relevant historical data and shall be based on transparent, complete, consistent, comparable and accurate information. In particular, the model used to construct the reference level shall be able to reproduce historical data from the national greenhouse gas inventory.

Amendment

(g) Reference levels shall be consistent with greenhouse gas inventories and relevant historical data and shall be based on transparent, complete, consistent, comparable and accurate information. ***Greenhouse gas inventories shall be aligned with relevant decisions adopted by bodies of the UNFCCC or of the Paris Agreement.*** In particular, the model used to construct the reference level shall be able to reproduce historical data from the national greenhouse gas inventory.

Or. en

Amendment 290

Nils Torvalds, Fredrick Federley, Liisa Jaakonsaari, Petri Sarvamaa, Ulrike Müller, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Hannu Takkula

Proposal for a regulation

Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 – point g a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ga) Member States shall provide confirmation that the construction of the

forest reference level neither includes assumptions or estimations about domestic policies nor assumptions or estimations about future changes to these.

Or. en

Amendment 291
Paul Brannen, Seb Dance, Biljana Borzan

Proposal for a regulation
Annex IV – part A – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

1a. When setting the forest reference levels, Member States shall discount the effect of nitrogen deposition and of CO₂ fertilisation on timber growth and on the emissions and removals in the period 2021-2025 and 2026-2030.

Or. en

Justification

CO₂ and N-deposition are responsible for greenhouse effect. They also increase timber growth. In previous considerations for accounting under Kyoto it read ‘‘...to factor out ... emissions by sources and removals by sinks due to indirect human-induced and natural effects (such as those from CO₂ fertilization and nitrogen deposition)’. The potential removals resulting from elevated carbon dioxide concentrations above their pre-industrial level and from indirect nitrogen deposition are therefore to be factored out.

Amendment 292
Benedek Jávor

Proposal for a regulation
Annex V – indent 3

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

- Imported harvested wood products, irrespective of their origin, are **not** accounted for by the importing Member State ("**production** approach").

- Imported harvested wood products, irrespective of their origin, are accounted for by the importing Member State ("**consumption** approach").

Justification

The account should be established at the point of consumption, in order to create incentives throughout the EU not just the producing Member States.