



---

*Subcommittee on Human Rights*

---

**DROI\_PV(2018)1119\_1**

**MINUTES**

Meeting of 19 November 2018, 15.00-18.30,  
and 20 November 2018, 09.00-12.30 and 14.30-19.00  
BRUSSELS

The meeting opened at 15.07 on Monday, 19 November 2018, with Pier Antonio Panzeri (Chair) presiding.

**1. Adoption of agenda**

DROI\_OJ(2018)1119\_1

The agenda was adopted in the form of these minutes.

**2. Chair's announcements**

- Urgency resolutions: Vietnam, notably the situation of political prisoners; the human rights situation in Cuba; the human rights situation in Bangladesh
- Announcement of the occasion of the Human Rights Week

**3. Enlarged Bureau – in camera**

**4. Approval of minutes of meetings**

- 4 June 2018 PV - PE623.630v01-00
- 6 September 2018 PV - PE627.668v01-00
- 10-11 October 2018 PV - PE628.690v01-00

**5. Exchange of views on the EU human rights policy towards Saudi Arabia**

Speakers: Pier Antonio Panzeri, Chair; Madawi Al Rasheed, Professor of social anthropology, Visiting Professor at the Middle East Centre at the London School of Economics; Omaima Al Najjar, Saudi activist and blogger from the Shia minority group; Ensaf Haidar, President of the Raif Badawi Foundation of Freedom and wife of 2015 Sakharov Prize Laureate Raif Badawi; Hana Al-Khamri, journalist and researcher on women's rights; Dana Ahmed, Amnesty International Researcher (by videoconference); Barbara Lochbihler; Marie-Christine Vergiat; Marco Morettini,

Deputy Head of Division “Arabian Peninsula, Iraq and Regional Policies”, EEAS.

**6. Exchange of views on sports and human rights in the context of large sporting events**

Speakers: Pier Antonio Panzeri, Chair; Federico Adiecchi, Head of Sustainability and Diversity at FIFA; Andrzej Kraśnicki, President of the Polish national Olympic Committee, on behalf of the European Olympic Committee; Alison Biscoe, Project Coordinator, Centre for Sport and Human Rights; Minky Worden, Director of Global Initiatives, Human Rights Watch; Beate Andrees, Chief of the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Branch of the ILO Governance and Tripartism Department.; Santiago Fisas Ayxelà; Barbara Lochbihler; Sophie Kammerer, Policy Officer “Human Rights” EEAS.

*In association with the Delegation to the EU-Ukraine Parliamentary Association Committee*

**7. Exchange of views with Professor Dr. Tove Hansen Malloy, Director of the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI) on the new education law in Ukraine**

Speakers: Pier Antonio Panzeri; Dariusz Rosati, Chair of the EU-Ukraine Parliamentary Association Committee (PAC); Professor Dr. Tove Hansen Malloy, Director of the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI); Michael Gahler; Andrea Bocskor; Rebecca Harms; Dirk Lorenz, Deputy Head of Division for “Eastern Partnership bilateral” EEAS; Alexandre Irkhin, Deputy Head of Mission of Ukraine to the EU.

**20 November 2018, 9.00 - 12.30**

The meeting opened at 09.11 with Pier Antonio Panzeri, Chair, presiding.

\*\*\*\*\*

*Interparliamentary Committee Meeting (ICM)*

**8. Human rights and the external actions of the EU and Member States**

**Speakers Panel 1:** Pier Antonio Panzeri; Stavros Lambrinidis, European Union Special Representative for Human Rights; Petras Auštrevičius; Maureen O’Sullivan, Member, Ireland; Simone Susskind, Member Belgium; Cristian Dan Preda; Wajid Khan; Barbara Lochbihler; Gyde Jensen, Member, Germany; László Tőkés; Jordi Solé.

At 10.30 László Tőkés, Vice-chair, took the chair

\*\*\*\*

**Speakers Panel 2:** László Tőkés; Makbule Sahan, Director of the Legal Department from the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC); Juan Andrés Cano, senior consultant in ethical business and sustainability, co-founder and business developer of

the PeaceStartup Foundation; Dominique Potier, Member of the Committee on Economic Affairs of the National Assembly, Assemblée Nationale, France; Senator Manuel Altava, Chair of the Justice Committee of the Senate, Cortes Generales, Spain; Isabel Albornoz, Charge d'Affaires, Mission of Ecuador to the EU; Pedro Bacelar de Vasconcelos, Member Portugal; Petre-Florin Manole, Member Romania; Rasmus Nordqvist, Member Denmark; Eleni Stamataki, Member Greece; Rosa Maria Aldea, Member Spain; Adriana Espinosa, Policy Officer, European Coalition for Corporate Justice (ECCS); Debbie Stothard, Coordinator Alternative ASEAN Network on Burma; FIDH; Alberto Airola, Member Italy.

At 11.50 Pier Antonio Panzeri took the chair

\*\*\*\*\*

**Speakers Panel 3:** Pier Antonio Panzeri; Ai Weiwei; Erika Benko, Member Romania; Angela Guerra, Member Portugal; Barbara Lochbihler; Simone Susskind, Member Belgium; Wajid Khan; Elena Stamataki, Member Greece; Maureen O'Sullivan, Member Ireland; Gyde Jensen, Member Germany; Hans-Olaf Henkel.

**20 November 2018, 14.30 - 19.00**

The meeting resumed in the *Paul-Henri Spaak (Hemicycle)*

## **9. 70th Anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights**

**Speakers Opening Speeches:** Antonio Tajani, President of the European Parliament; Federica Mogherini, Vice-President of the European Commission and High Representative for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy; Mr António Guterres, Secretary-General of the United Nations (video message)

**Speakers Panel I:** Pier Antonio Panzeri, Chair of the Subcommittee on Human Rights; Michelle Bachelet, United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights; Fatou Bensouda, Prosecutor, International Criminal Court; Stavros Lambrinidis, EU Special Representative on Human Rights; Emily O'Reilly, European Ombudsman; Patrick Gaspard, President of the Open Society Foundations; Claude Moraes

**Speakers Panel II:** David McAllister, Chair of the Committee on Foreign Affairs; Thorbjørn Jagland, Secretary-General of the Council of Europe (video message); Joel Hernández García, Commissioner of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights and vice-president of the Inter-American Juridical Committee; Prof. Rémy Ngoy Lumbu, Commissioner of the African Commission on Human and People's Rights; Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director of OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights; Prof. Beate Rudolf, Chair of the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions (GANHRI) and Member of the Board of the European Network of National Human Rights Institutions (ENNHRI); Prof. Pamela Palmater, Lawyer and Professor at Ryerson University

## **10. Any other business**

**11. Next meetings**

- 3 December 2018, 15.00 - 18.30 (Brussels)

**ПРИСЪСТВЕН ЛИСТ/LISTA DE ASISTENCIA/PREZENČNÍ LISTINA/DELTAGERLISTE/  
ANWESENHEITSLISTE/KOHALOLIJATE NIMEKIRI/KATAΣΤΑΣΗ ΠΑΡΟΝΤΩΝ/RECORD OF ATTENDANCE/  
LISTE DE PRÉSENCE/POPIS NAZOČNIH/ELENCO DI PRESENZA/APMEKLĒJUMU REĢISTRŠ/DALYVIŲ SAŖAŠAS/  
JELENĹTI İV/REGİSTRU TA' ATTENDENZA/PRESENTIELIJST/LISTA OBECNOŠCI/LISTA DE PRESENÇAS/  
LISTĀ DE PREZENŢĀ/PREZENČNĀ LISTINA/SEZNAM NAVZOČIH/LĀSNĀOLOLISTA/DELTAGARLISTA**

Бюро/Mesa/Předsednictvo/Formandskabet/Vorstand/Juhatus/Προεδρείο/Bureau/Predsjetništvo/Ufficio di presidenza/Prezidijs/ Biuras/Elnökség/Prezydium/Birou/Predsedníctvo/Predsedstvo/Puheenjohtajisto/Presidiet (*)
President of the European Parliament Antonio Tajani (2)  DROI: Pier Antonio Panzeri, (P) (1,2); Cristian Dan Preda, (1VP) (2); László Tőkés, (3VP) (2); Barbara Lochbihler, (4VP) (1,2) AFET: David McAllister (P) (2); LIBE; Claude Moraes (P) (2) D-UA: Dariusz Rosati (P) (1)
Членове/Diputados/Poslanci/Medlemmer/Mitglieder/Parlamendiliikmed/Μέλη/Members/Députés/Zastupnici/Deputati/Deputāti/Nariai/ Képviselek/Membri/Leden/Posłowie/Deputados/Deputați/Jäsenet/Ledamöter
Petras Auštrevičius (2), Klaus Buchner (1), Hans-Olaf Henkel (2); Rikke-Louise Karlsson (2), Wajid Khan (2), Soraya Post (2), Marie-Christine Vergiat (1,2),  D-UA: Andrea Bocskor (1), Mark Demesmaecker (1), Rebecca Harms (1)
Заместници/Suplentes/Náhradníci/Stedfortrædere/Stellvertreter/Asendusliikmed/Αναπληρωτές/Substitutes/Suppléants/Zamjenici/ Supplenti/Aizstājēji/Pavaduojantysnariai/Póttagok/Sostituti/Plaatsvervangers/Zastępcy/Membros suplentes/Supleantı/Náhradníci/ Namestniki/Varajäsenet/Suppleanter
Jordi Solé (2), Željana Zovko (1)

200 (2)
206 (3)
Santiago Fisas Ayxelà (1), Michael Gahler (1)
53 (8) (Точка от дневния ред/Punto del orden del día/Bod pořadu jednání (OJ)/Punkt på dagsordenen/Tagesordnungspunkt/ Päevakorra punkt/Ημερήσια Διάταξη Σημείο/Agenda item/Point OJ/Τοčka dnevnoĝ reda/Punto all'ordine del giorno/Darba kārtības punkts/Darbotvarkēs punktās/Napirendi pont/Punt Agenda/Agendapunt/Punkt porzādku dziennego/Ponto OD/Punct de pe ordinea de zi/Bod programu schódze/Τοčka UL/Esityslistan kohta/Föredragningslista punkt)

Присъствал на/Presente el/Přítomný dne/Til stede den/Anwesend am/Viibis(id) kohal/Παρόν στις/Present on/Présent le/Nazočni  
dana/Presente il/Piedalījās/ Dalyvauja/Jelen volt/Preženti fi/Aanwezig op/Obecny dnia/Presente em/Přítomný dňa/Navzoči  
dne/Läsnä/Närvarande den:

- (1) 19.11.2018  
(2) 20.11.2018

Наблюдатели/Observadores/Pozorovatelé/Observatører/Beobachter/Vaatlejad/Παρατηρητές/Observers/Observateurs/Promatrači/Osservatori/Novērotāji/Stebėtojai/Megfigyelők/Osservatori/Waarnemers/Observatorzy/Observadores/Observatori/Pozorovatelia/Opazovalci/Tarkkailijat/Observatörer

По покана на председателя/Por invitación del presidente/Na pozvání předsedy/Efter indbydelse fra formanden/Auf Einladung des Vorsitzenden/Εσίμεηε κηtsel/Με πρόσκληση του Προέδρου/At the invitation of the Chair(wo)man/Sur l'invitation du président/Na poziv predsjednika/Su invito del presidente/Pēc priekšsēdētāja uzaicinājuma/Pirmininkui pakvietus/Az elnök meghívására/Fuq stedina taç-'Chairman'/Op uitnodiging van de voorzitter/Na zaproszenie Przewodniczącego/A convite do Presidente/La invitația președintelui/Na pozvanie predsedu/Na povabilo predsednika/Puheenjohtajan kutsusta/På ordförandens inbjudan

Съвет/Consejo/Rada/Rådet/Rat/Nōukogu/Συμβούλιο/Council/Conseil/Vijeće/Consiglio/Padome/Taryba/Tanács/Kunsill/Raad/Conselho/Consiliu/Svet/Neuvosto/Rådet (*)
EEAS: Kammerer, Lorenz, Morettini, Spanier
Комисия/Comisión/Komise/Kommissionen/Kommission/Euroopa Komisjon/Επιτροπή/Commission/Komisija/Commissione/Bizottság/Kummissjoni/Commissie/Komisja/Comissão/Comisie/Komisja/Komissio/Kommissionen (*)
Други институции/Otras instituciones/Ostatní orgány a instituce/Andre institutioner/Andere Organe/Muud institutsioonid/Άλλα θεσμικά όργανα/Other institutions/Autres institutions/Druge institucije/Altre istituzioni/Citas iestādes/Kitos institucijos/Más intézmények/Istituzjonijet ohra/Andere instellingen/Inne instytucje/Outras Instituições/Alte instituții/Iné inštitúcie/Muut toimielimet/Andra institutioner/organ
Lambrinidis, Nowak

Други учасници/Otros participantes/Ostatni učastníci/Endvidere deltog/Andere Teilnehmer/Muud osalejad/Επίσης Παρόντες/Other participants/Autres participants/Drugi sudionici/Altri partecipanti/Citi klātesošie/Kiti dalyviai/Más résztvevők/Partecipanti ohra/Andere aanwezigen/Inni uczestnicy/Outros participantes/Alți participanți/Ini učastníci/Drugi udeleženci/Muut osallistujat/Övriga deltagare

Pt. 5: Madawi Al Rasheed, Professor of social anthropology, Visiting Professor at the Middle East Centre at the London School of Economics; Omaima Al Najjar, Saudi activist and blogger from the Shia minority group; Ensaf Haidar, President of the Raif Badawi Foundation of Freedom and wife of 2015 Sakharov Prize Laureate Raif Badawi; Hana Al-Khamri, journalist and researcher on women's rights; Dana Ahmed, Amnesty International Researcher (by videoconference);

Pt. 6: Federico Adiecchi, Head of Sustainability and Diversity at FIFA; Andrzej Kraśnicki, President of the Polish national Olympic Committee, on behalf of the European Olympic Committee; Alison Biscoe, Project Coordinator, Centre for Sport and Human Rights; Minky Worden, Director of Global Initiatives, Human Rights Watch; Beate Andrees, Chief of the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Branch of the ILO Governance and Tripartism Department.; Santiago Fisas Aixelà;

Pt. 7: Dariusz Rosati, Chair of the EU-Ukraine Parliamentary Association Committee (PAC); Professor Dr. Tove Hansen Malloy, Director of the European Centre for Minority Issues (ECMI); Alexandre Irkhin, Deputy Head of Mission of Ukraine to the EU.

Pt. 8: Maureen O'Sullivan, Member, Ireland; Simone Susskind, Member Belgium; Gyde Jensen, Member, Germany; Makbule Sahan, Director of the Legal Department from the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC); Juan Andrés Cano, senior consultant in ethical business and sustainability, co-founder and business developer of the PeaceStartup Foundation; Dominique Potier, Member of the Committee on Economic Affairs of the National Assembly, Assemblée Nationale, France; Senator Manuel Altava, Chair of the Justice Committee of the Senate, Cortes Generales, Spain; Isabel Albornoz, Charge d'Affaires, Mission of Ecuador to the EU; Pedro Bacelar de Vasconcelos, Member Portugal; Petre-Florin Manole, Member Romania; Rasmus Nordqvist, Member Denmark; Eleni Stamataki, Member Greece; Rosa Maria Aldea, Member Spain; Adriana Espinosa, Policy Officer, European Coalition for Corporate Justice (ECCS); Debbie Stothard, Coordinator Alternative ASEAN Network on Burma; FIDH; Alberto Airola, Member Italy; Ai Weiwei; Erika Benko, Member Romania; Angela Guerra, Member Portugal; Simone Susskind, Member Belgium; Elena Stamataki, Member Greece; Maureen O'Sullivan, Member Ireland; Gyde Jensen, Member Germany

Pt. 9: Federica Mogherini, Vice-President of the European Commission and High Representative for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy; Mr António Guterres, Secretary-General of the United Nations (video message); Michelle Bachelet, United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights; Fatou Bensouda, Prosecutor, International Criminal Court; Emily O'Reilly, European Ombudsman; Patrick Gaspard, President of the Open Society Foundations; Thorbjørn Jagland, Secretary-General of the Council of Europe (video message); Joel Hernández García, Commissioner of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights and vice-president of the Inter-American Juridical Committee; Prof. Rémy Ngoy Lumbu, Commissioner of the African Commission on Human and People's Rights ; Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director of OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights; Prof. Beate Rudolf, Chair of the Global Alliance of National Human Rights Institutions (GANHRI) and Member of the Board of the European Network of National Human Rights Institutions (ENNHRI); Prof. Pamela Palmatier, Lawyer and Professor at Ryerson University

Секретариат на политическите групи/Secretaría de los Grupos políticos/Sekretariát politických skupin/Gruppernes sekretariat/Sekretariat der Fraktionen/Fraktsioonide sekretariaat/Γραμματεία των Πολιτικών Ομάδων/Secretariats of political groups/Secrétariat des groupes politiques/Tajništva klubova zastupnika/Segreteria gruppi politici/Politisko grupu sekretariāts/Frakciju sekretariai/Képviseletcsoportok titkársága/Segretariat gruppi politici/Fractiesecretariaten/Sekretariat Grup Politycznych/Secr. dos grupos políticos/Secretariate grupuri politice/Sekretariát politických skupin/Sekretariat političnih skupin/Poliittisten ryhmién sihteeristöt/Gruppernas sekretariat

PPE	Virostkova
S&D	Bataille, Tua, Mamedou
ECR	Coolegem
ALDE	Munoa
Verts/ALE	Fisera
GUE/NGL	Balavoine
EFDD	Agnello
ENF	
NI	

Кабинет на председателя/Gabinete del Presidente/Kancelář předsedy/Formandens Kabinet/Kabinett des Präsidenten/Presidendi kantselai/Γραφείο Προέδρου/President's Office/Cabinet du Président/Ured predsednika/Gabinetto del Presidente/Priekšsēdētāja kabinets/Pirmininko kabinetas/Elnöki hivatal/Kabinett tal-President/Kabinet van de Voorzitter/Gabinet Przewodniczącego/Gabinete do Presidente/Cabinet Președinte/Kancelária predsedu/Urad predsednika/Puhemiehen kabinetti/Talmannens kansli

<p>Καбинет на генералния секретар/Gabinete del Secretario General/Kancelář generálního tajemníka/Generalsekretærens Kabinet/Kabinett des Generalsekretärs/Peasekretäri büroo/Γραφείο Γενικού Γραμματέα/Secretary-General's Office/Cabinet du Secrétaire général/Ured glavnog tajnika/Gabinetto del Segretario generale/Generalsekretära kabinets/Generalinio sekretoriaus kabinetas/Főtitkári hivatal/Kabinett tas-Segretarju Ġenerali/Kabinet van de secretaris-generaal/Gabinet Sekretarza Generalnego/Gabinete do Secretário-Geral/Cabinet Secretar General/Kancelária generálneho tajomníka/Urząd generalnego sekretarza/Pääsihteerin kabinetti/Generalsekreterarens kansli</p>	
<p>Генерална дирекция/Dirección General/Generální ředitelství/Generaldirektorat/Generaldirektion/Peadirektoraat/Γενική Διεύθυνση/Directorate-General/Direction générale/Glavna uprava/Direzione generale/Generāldirektorāts/Generalinis direktoratas/Főigazgatóság/Direttorat Ġenerali/Direktoraten-generaal/Dyrekcja Generalna/Direcção-Geral/Direcții Generale/Generálne riaditeľstvo/Generalni direktorat/Pääosasto/Generaldirektorat</p>	
<p>DG PRES DG IPOL DG EXPO DG EPRS DG COMM DG PERS DG INLO DG TRAD DG LINC DG FINS DG ITEC DG SAFE</p>	<p>Stutzmann, Popescu-Black, Krauss, Lerch, Massoulie, Mueller-Serten, Goinard, Srouer-Grandon, Balazs</p> <p>Almquist</p>

<p>Правна служба/Servicio Jurídico/Právní služba/Juridisk Tjeneste/Juristischer Dienst/Öigusteenistus/Νομική Υπηρεσία/Legal Service/Service juridique/Pravna služba/Servizio giuridico/Juridiskais dienests/Teisės tarnyba/Jogi szolgálat/Servizz legali/Juridische Dienst/Wydział prawny/Servizo Jurídico/Serviciu Juridic/Právný servis/Oikeudellinen yksikkö/Rättstjänsten</p>	
<p>Секретариат на комисията/Secretaría de la comisión/Sekretariát výboru/Udvalgssekretariatet/Ausschusssekretariat/Komisjoni sekretariaat/Γραμματεία επιτροπής/Committee secretariat/Secrétariat de la commission/Tajništvo odbora/Segreteria della commissione/Komitejas sekretariāts/Komiteto sekretoriatas/A bizottság titkársága/Sekretarjat tal-kumitat/Commissiesecretariaat/Sekretariat komisji/Secretariado da comissão/Sekretariat comisie/Sekretariat odbora/Valiokunnan sihteeristö/Utskottssekretariatet</p>	
<p>Rieu, Csaszai, Falk, Walelign, Wenske, Maissonny, Shore, Rounio, Lacher, Alrutz</p>	
<p>Сътрудник/Asistente/Asistent/Assistent/Assistenz/Βοηθός/Assistant/Assistente/Palīgs/Padējējas/Asszisztens/Asyistent/Pomočnik/Avustajja/Assistenten</p>	
<p>Nyary-Banlaki</p>	

- \* (P) = Председател/Presidente/Předseda/Formand/Vorsitzender/Esimees/Πρόεδρος/Chair(wo)man/Président/Predsjednik/Priekšsēdētājs/Pirmininkas/Elnök/Chairman/Voorzitter/Przewodniczący/Preşedinte/Predseda/Predsednik/Puheenjohtaja/Ordförande
- (VP) = Заместник-председател/Vicepresidente/Místopředseda/Næstformand/Stellvertretender Vorsitzender/Aseesimees/Αντιπρόεδρος/Vice-Chair(wo)man/Potpredsjednik/Vice-Président/Potpredsjednik/Priekšsēdētāja vietnieks/Pirmininko pavaduotojas/Alelnök/Víci 'Chairman'/Ondervoorzitter/Wiceprzewodniczący/Vice-Présidente/Vicepreşedinte/Podpredseda/Podpredsednik/Varapuheenjohtaja/Vice ordförande
- (M) = Член/Miembro/Člen/Medlem./Mitglied/Parlamendiliige/Μέλος/Member/Membre/Član/Membro/Deputāts/Narys/Képviseelő/Membru/Lid/Członek/Membro/Membru/Člen/Poslanec/Jäsen/Ledamot
- (F) = Длъжностно лице/Funcionario/Úředník/Tjenestemand/Beamter/Ametnik/Υπάλληλος/Official/Fonctionnaire/Dužnosnik/Funzionario/Ierēdnis/Pareigūnas/Tisztviselő/Ufficjal/Ambtenaar/Urządник/Funcionário/Funcionar/Úradník/Uradnik/Virkamies/Tjänsteman