The use of tax frauds - including VAT or carousel fraud - to finance terrorism

FRUNZA Marius Cristian
Schwarzthal Kapital

European Parliament, 28th of June 2018
The use of tax frauds - including VAT or carousel fraud - to finance terrorism

Schwarzthal Kapital
Uber-terrorism: A new form of decentralized, distributed, non-hierarchical and low-cost terrorism

"Classic" terrorist organizations had a defined hierarchy and an effective chain of commands. ISIS changed the modus operandi of terrorism.

- The organization of terrorist groups like ISIS is decentralized, due to the fact it would be impossible to coordinate operations at a global level. Al-Qaeda and the Emirate of Caucasus attempted to run like a para-military organization, with limited success.

- The hierarchy is not clearly defined and the operations are managed locally.

- The hierarchy is replaced with a "terrorist social network" that can facilitate the interaction of followers and the organization of a terrorist actions. Uber-terrorism is no longer a centralized structure which ensures the financing, organization and preparation of a terrorist group. It seeks to link its followers and transmit technical expertise, thereby strengthening the potential terrorists locally.

- The advantage of uber-terrorism is that one local group is dismantled, it will not threaten the existence of another group.
Uber-terrorism: A new form of decentralized, distributed, non-hierarchical and low-cost terrorism

Financing terrorist activities relied on massive long-term funding involving overseas money transfers. Modern terrorism changed the paradigm and understood that the main resources are not the financial ones but the human ones.

- To finance and to organize a global extremist network, managed by a centralized chain of commands has become a difficult task.
- Uber-terrorism focuses on actions organized by local groups managed in a decentralized manner requiring minimal funding (Paris attacks were budgeted at $\approx 50,000\,€$).
- The amounts are below the thresholds of processes and systems designed to tackle the CFT.
- Uber-terrorism’s vision of terrorism focuses on low-cost actions and strong media impact.
- Uber-terrorism aims to a lesser extent for complex actions such as the September 11, 2001 attacks, but targets actions with a higher frequency and lower severity.
- The financing of this new form of terrorism encompasses: tax fraud, benefit fraud, application fraud, crypto-currencies mining, sanctions breaching, business and personal loans...
## Terrorism: Old vs New

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>Classic Terrorism</th>
<th>Uber-terrorism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Examples</strong></td>
<td><em>Breton Revolutionary Army</em></td>
<td><em>ISIS aka Daech</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strategy</strong></td>
<td>Focus on financial resources</td>
<td>Focus on human resources management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization</strong></td>
<td>Centralized/ hierarchical</td>
<td>Decentralized/ Non-nested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actions</strong></td>
<td>High severity</td>
<td>High media impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Budgets</strong></td>
<td>Big amounts of money</td>
<td>Low-cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financing</strong></td>
<td>Donors and violent crimes</td>
<td>Tax evasion, benefits fraud, applic-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>tion fraud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recruitment</strong></td>
<td>Targets the induction of new adepts</td>
<td>Establishes a social network of ter-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>mor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recruitment pool</strong></td>
<td>Ethnically and religiously homogenous back-</td>
<td>Multi-national : Equal opportu-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ground</td>
<td>nity recruiter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender distributions</strong></td>
<td>Mainly men dominated</td>
<td>Women have a growing influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Horizon</strong></td>
<td>Long term</td>
<td>Short term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geography</strong></td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>Global</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relation with organ-</strong></td>
<td>Terrorists are involved in organized crime</td>
<td>Organized crime is involved with ter-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ized crime</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>orrists</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


*Schwarzthal Kapital*
Figure: Evolution of total VAT receipts in European Union since 1999. The total VAT amount is expressed as a percentage of the total tax receipts and in Billion euros. (Source: Eurostat).
VAT Fraud and terrorism funding

Why VAT fraud?

- VAT fraud is particularly easy to implement, requires relatively little seed-funding and can be leveraged across markets and countries.

- The terrorist organizations engaged in the economic side of terror are generally directors of small and medium enterprises, sole traders or merchants.

- Their business turnovers do not account more than a few million euros and this makes them less visible to the banking systems that are focused on the detection of large financial flows.

- The networks of VAT fraud existed for several years and have probably largely supported the recent terrorist actions in Europe and worldwide.

- A macro-estimation indicates that each year 420 million euros of defrauded VAT could finance uber-terrorism.
VAT Fraud and terrorism funding: Features

How is implemented?

- Terrorist groups recruit individuals with from North African, Asian and Middle Eastern communities which have a long tradition in overseas trading.

- Training sessions are organized for inducing beginners in the VAT fraud ring. "New blood" is crucial as many veterans of the VAT scams became banned from directorship.

- VAT fraudsters have significant research "departments", which analyze markets and countries for finding the favorable ground for implementing the fraud.

- VAT fraud boot-camps are organized for training and exchanging best-practices.

- Some extremist religious leaders encourage young entrepreneur to engage in VAT fraud schemes as part of an economic war. For example, the role of Zakat[^1] in the terrorism financing was pointed by [Chugani(2008)]. Not paying VAT (not compulsory in Sharia) and diverting the funds towards the Zakat is a realistic scenario.

- Transnational organized crime and terrorist groups do intersect in the VAT fraud arena. This is also a particularity of uber-terrorism, whereas criminal with no ideological binding into the terrorist propaganda, join or work closely with terrorist group in order to develop their criminal enterprises. Uber-terrorism created a safe haven for criminals.

[^1]: Zakat is an obligation upon Muslims to pay two and one-half percent of their wealth if and when it exceeds a minimum level, or nisab.
Which actions could serve as closing this specific VAT fraud for funding terrorism?

VAT fraud as a tool of terrorist financing needs a paradigm shift in the way it is dealt with. Countering uber-terrorism is solving a puzzle spread over many countries and involving different strata of society. Therefore, a single investigative body from one country would not be able to tackle this phenomena. Distinguishing between fighting terrorism and fighting VAT fraud that financing it is a major flaw.

Uber-terrorism and the underlying tax evasion should be addressed in holistic way. Therefore, the investigation teams should encompass people from various walks of life and with a multi-disciplinary background, including:

- Governmental intelligence agencies and private intelligence firms
- Financial Intelligence units in banks
- Police officers and serious organized crime agencies
- Custom and Tax officers

Tax evasion for uber-terrorism funding is a global phenomena and represents a global threat. Only a transnational cooperation can address this issue in an efficient way. Few measures would facilitate this effort including:

1. Creation of European Intelligence Office, that would reunite crucial intelligence from all Member States.
2. Cooperation between the big countries affected by terrorism: the United Kingdom, the United States, European Union and Eurasian Union
3. Cooperation between law enforcements investigating organized crime and counter-terrorism intelligence agencies