

Directorate-General for Internal Policies of the Union Directorate for Structural and Cohesion Policies Secretariat of the Committee on Culture and Education

Brussels, 24 September 2018

FP/kp

Draft opinion by Andrea BOCSKOR

on the "Minimum standards for minorities" (2018/2036(INI))

Documents: CULT draft opinion: PA/1153674 PE 622.179 v01-00

CULT amendments: AM/1157016 PE 623.877 v01-00 (1-137)

FINAL VOTING LIST

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 1	COMP 1	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 1, AM 2, AM 3, AM 6, AM 4, AM 5, AM 8 and <u>AM 38 (first</u> <u>part) fall</u> ► Go to AM 9	
	1	Liadh Ní Riada	+	If adopted, AM 2, AM 3 and AM 6 fall ► Go to AM 4	
	2	Dominique Bilde	-		
	3	Angel Dzhambazki	+		
	6	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
	4	Petra Kammerevert	+		
	5	Andrea Bocskor, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 1 a (new)	8	Jill Evans, Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 4	38	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 1 a (new)	9	Angel Dzhambazki	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 1 a (new)	10	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 2	13	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
	14	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 2 a (new)	15	Dominique Bilde	-		
Paragraph 3	COMP 2	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 16, AM 17, AM 21, AM 19, AM 18 and AM 20 fall ► Go to AM 23	
	16	Dominique Bilde	-	If adopted, AM 17 and AM 21 fall ▶ Go to AM 19	
	17	Angel Dzhambazki	-	y Go to IIII I	
	21	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
	19 ¹	Silvia Costa	+		
	18	María Teresa Giménez Barbat	+		
	20	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 3 a (new)	23	María Teresa Giménez Barbat	+		
Paragraph 3 a (new)	24	Jill Evans, Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 3 a (new)	26^{2}	Liliana Rodrigues	-		
Paragraph 3 b (new)	28	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 c (new)	29	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 d (new)	30	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 e (new)	31	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 f (new)	32	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 i (new)	35	Liliana Rodrigues	+		

¹ If AM 16 adopted, the second part of the AM « calls on the Member States to incorporate...discriminated against » falls. If AM 17 adopted, the vote is only on the first part of the AM: "welcomes...Linguistic Rights of National Minorities".

² Please note that the English text should read: « ...; stresses that women and LGTBI groups belonging to minority

groups suffer various forms of discrimination..."

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 4	COMP 3	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 39, AM 36, AM 37, AM 41 and AM 40 fall	
	39	Dominique Bilde	-	► Go to COMP 9 If adopted, AM 36, AM 37, AM 41 and AM 40 fall	
	36	Petra Kammerevert	+	► Go to COMP 9 If adopted, AM 37 and AM 41 fall	
	37	María Teresa Giménez Barbat	-	► Go to AM 40 If adopted, AM 41 falls	
	41	Jill Evans	+	► Go to AM 40	
	40	Silvia Costa	+		
Paragraph 4 a (new)	COMP 9	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 11, AM 25, AM 58, AM 120, AM 79, AM 80, AM 84, AM 116, AM 119, AM 122 and AM 135 fall ► Go to AM 42	
Paragraph 1 a (new)	11	Silvia Costa	+	V 00 to 2111 42	
Paragraph 3 a (new)	25	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 5 c (new)	58	Petra Kammerevert	+	If adopted, AM 120 falls ► Go to AM 79	
Paragraph 8 x (new)	120	Liadh Ní Riada	+	GO to AM 79	
Paragraph 7 b (new)	79 ³	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 c (new)	80	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 g (new)	84	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 8 t (new)	116	Liadh Ní Riada	+		

 $^{^3}$ Please note that the text should read « ...play an active role in the integration of minorities... »

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 8 w (new)	119	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 z (new)	122	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph null (new)	135	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 4 a (new)	42	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 4 a (new)	43	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 4 a (new)	44	Jill Evans	-		
Paragraph 4 b (new)	45	Jill Evans	+		
Paragraph 4 b (new)	46	Andrea Bocskor, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+		
Paragraph 4 b (new)	COMP 4	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 27, AM 33, AM 34, AM 47 and AM 48 fall ► Go to AM 49	
Paragraph 3 a (new)	27	Andrea Bocskor, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà, Milan Zver, Marc Joulaud	+		
Paragraph 3 g (new)	33	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 3 h (new)	34	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 4 c (new)	47	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 4 a (new)	48	Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+		
Paragraph 4 d (new)	<mark>49</mark>	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 5	COMP 5	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 50, AM 51, AM 52, AM 53 and AM 54 fall ► Go to AM 55	
	50	Dominique Bilde	-	If adopted, AM 51, AM 52, AM 53 and AM 54 fall ► Go to AM 55	
	51	Angel Dzhambazki	-	If adopted, AM 52, AM 53 and AM 54 fall ► Go to AM 55	
	52	Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+	If adopted, AM 53 falls	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
				► Go to AM 54	
	53	María Teresa Giménez Barbat	+		
	54	Silvia Costa	+		
Paragraph 5 a (new)	<mark>55</mark>	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 5 a (new)	56	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà, Jill Evans	+		
Paragraph 6	COMP 6	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 59, AM 60, AM 61 and AM 62 fall ► Go to COMP 8	
	59	Jill Evans	+	If adopted, AM 60 falls ► Go to AM 61	
	60	Angel Dzhambazki	-	7 00 10 11111 01	
	61	Dominique Bilde	-		
	62	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 6 a (new)	COMP 8	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 7 AM 118 and AM 12 fall	
Paragraph 1 a (new)	7	Petra Kammerevert	+	► Go to AM 96 If adopted AM 118 falls ► Go to AM 12	
Paragraph 8 v (new)	118	Liadh Ní Riada	+	7 00 10 1111 12	
Paragraph 1 b (new)	12	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 8 a (new)	96 ⁴	Angel Dzhambazki	+		
Paragraph 6 a (new)	63	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 6 a (new)	64	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà, Marc Joulaud	+		

_

⁴ If COMP 8 adopted, the vote is only on the second part of the AM, starting with "...is of the view that Member States...community".

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 6 b (new)	65	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 6 c (new)	66	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 6 d (new)	67	Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud	+	If adopted, AM 94 falls	
				► Go to AM <mark>68</mark>	
Paragraph 8 a (new)	94	Herbert Dorfmann, Andrea Bocskor, József Nagy	+		
Paragraph 6 e (new)	68	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+		
Paragraph 6 f (new)	69	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver, Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+		
Paragraph 6 g (new)	70	Andrea Bocskor, Milan Zver	+		
Paragraph 6 h (new)	COMP 10	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 57, AM 22 and AM 38 (second part) fall	
				► Go to AM 126	
Paragraph 5 b (new)	57	Petra Kammerevert	+		
Paragraph 3 a (new)	22	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 4	38	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph null (new)	126 ⁵	Liadh Ní Riada	-		

 $^{^{5}}$ If COMP 10 is adopted, the vote is only on the first part ("condemns the instances... experienced by Roma people;" and on the third part ("recalls...ethnic origin") of the text.

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 7	COMP 7	Rapporteur	+	If adopted, AM 71, AM 73, AM 72, AM 74, AM 75 and AM 76 fall ► Go to AM 77	
	71	Angel Dzhambazki	-	If adopted, AM 73, AM 72, AM 74, AM 75 and AM 76 fall ► Go to AM 77	
	73	Dominique Bilde	-	If adopted, AM 72, AM 74, AM 75 and AM 76 fall	
	72	María Teresa Giménez Barbat	+	If adopted, AM 74 and AM 75 fall ► Go to AM 76	
	74	Silvia Costa	+		
	75	Petra Kammerevert	+		
	76	Jill Evans	+		
Paragraph 7 a (new)	<mark>77</mark>	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 a (new)	78	Angel Dzhambazki	+		
Paragraph 7 d (new)	81	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 e (new)	82 ⁶	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 f (new)	83	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 h (new)	85	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 i (new)	86	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 j (new)	87	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 7 k (new)	88 ⁷	Liliana Rodrigues	+		
Paragraph 71 (new)	89	Liliana Rodrigues	+		

 $^{^6}$ Please note that the text should read « **Believes that educational activities are fundamental for the integration of minorities...** »

⁷ Please note that the text should read « ...statistical information regarding the integration of minorities... »

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 8	90	Dominique Bilde	-	If adopted, AM 91, AM 93 and AM 92 fall	
	Oral AM 1 91	Santiago Fisas Ayxelà	+	► Go to AM 95 Oral AM by the Rapporteur	
				If adopted, AM 93 falls	
				► Go to AM 92	
	93	Silvia Costa	+		
	92	Angel Dzhambazki	+		
Paragraph 8 a (new)	95	Jill Evans	-	If adopted, AM 98 falls	
				► Go to AM <mark>97</mark>	
Paragraph 8 b (new)	98	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 a (new)	<mark>97</mark>	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 c (new)	99	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 d (new)	100	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 e (new)	101	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 f (new)	102	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 g (new)	103	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 h (new)	104	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 i (new)	105	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 j (new)	106	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 k (new)	107	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 81 (new)	108	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 m (new)	109	Liadh Ní Riada		Inadmissible	
Paragraph 8 n (new)	110	Liadh Ní Riada		Inadmissible	
Paragraph 8 o (new)	111	Liadh Ní Riada		Inadmissible	
Paragraph 8 p (new)	112	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 q (new)	113	Liadh Ní Riada	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Paragraph 8 r (new)	114	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 s (new)	115	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 u (new)	117	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 y (new)	121	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 aa (new)	123	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph null (new)	124	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph null (new)	125	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph null (new)	127	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph null (new)	128	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph null (new)	129	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph null (new)	130	Liadh Ní Riada	+		
Paragraph 8 ai (new)	131	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 aj (new)	1328	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 ak (new)	133	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph null (new)	134	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph null (new)	136	Liadh Ní Riada	-		
Paragraph 8 ao (new)	137	Liadh Ní Riada	-		

against	abstentions
-	
	against

 $^{^{8}}$ Please note that the words « teaching material » are missing at the end of the sentence, which should read "....high-quality teaching material ».

COMPROMISE AMENDMENTS

<u>COMPROMISE 1 on paragraph 1: AM 4 (Kammerevert), AM 5 (Bocskor, Fisas Ayxela, Zver), AM 8 (Evans, Ni Riada), AM 38 (Rodrigues)</u>

Original Proposal Changes 1. Recalls that the EU has a special duty to protect 1. Regrets that the EU has no explicit competence regarding minority issues, but and guarantee the rights of more than 50 million recalls that minority rights are guaranteed under people belonging to national or regional the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the minorities who live on its territory and who speak European Union; one of the 60 minority and regional languages that are in serious danger of extinction; recalls that minority rights protection is guaranteed under the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union; notes in this connection that minority issues are not placed sufficiently high on the EU agenda and that there is not at present a comprehensive EU approach on how to address issues in minority protection policy; supports therefore an integrated approach to equality and non-discrimination in order to ensure that Member States deal adequately with the diversity of people in their societies;

COMPROMISE 2 on paragraph 3: AM 18 (Gimenez Barbat), AM 19 (Costa), AM 20 (Kammerevert)

Original Proposal	Changes
3. Welcomes the development of	3. Welcomes the development of international
international standards for resolving national	standards for <i>addressing</i> national and regional
and regional minority issues through a	minority issues through a number of international
number of legal instruments, such as the	legal-instruments - such as the Council of Europe
Council of Europe Framework Convention	Framework Convention for the Protection of
for the Protection of National Minorities and	National Minorities and the European Charter for
the European Charter for Regional or	Regional or Minority Languages, which are the two
Minority Languages; calls on the Member	key treaties of the Council of Europe on minority's
States to incorporate these standards into	rights -, but also the development of soft law, such
their legal systems and to guarantee that	as the OSCE's Hague Recommendations regarding
persons belonging to a national or regional	the Education Rights of National Minorities and
minority are not discriminated against;	the OSCE's Oslo Recommendations regarding the
	Linguistic Rights of National Minorities; calls on
	the Member States to incorporate these standards
	and indications into their legal systems and to

COMPROMISE 3 on paragraph 4: AM 36 (Kammerevert), AM 40 (Costa), AM 41 (Evans)

Original Proposal	Changes
4. Recalls that mother-tongue education is essential for upholding language rights; encourages the Member States, therefore, to ensure that persons belonging to regional ethnic minorities have adequate opportunities to learn their languages and even to receive education in these languages at all levels of education in the territories in which they live;	4. Recalls that education in the mother-tongue is essential for upholding language rights and strengthening the value of European Citizenship; encourages the Member States, therefore, to ensure that persons belonging to regional, ethnic and linguistic minorities, whether they be of school age or adults, have adequate opportunities to learn their own language, history and culture and even to receive education in these languages at all levels of education in the region in which they live; stresses, however, that people belonging to minorities should also learn the language, history and culture of the majority population, and that pupils – and the general public – belonging to the majority population should be acquainted with the history and culture of minorities and given the opportunity to learn the minority languages;

<u>COMPROMISE 4 on paragraph 4 b (new) on minority languages: AM 27 (Bocskor, Fisas Ayxela, Zver, Joulaud), AM 33 (Rodrigues), AM 34 (Rodrigues), AM 47 (Bocskor, Zver), AM 48 (Fisas Ayxela)</u>

Original Proposal	Changes
	New. Is convinced that mother-tongue is a central element of cultural and individual identity and is an essential part of minority cultures, ensuring the expression, dissemination and transmission thereof; considers that Member States should provide opportunities for all those interested to learn minority languages; encourages the Member States to ensure that
	those who speak a regional or minority language

as their mother tongue have the opportunity to learn the official language sufficiently;

COMPROMISE 5 on paragraph 5: AM 52 (Fisas), AM 53 (Gimenez Barbat), AM 54 (Costa)

Original Proposal	Changes
5. Calls on the Member States to provide funding for the development of special curricula, methodologies and textbooks to ensure effective teaching in minority languages and of special teaching methodologies for official languages for children with minority-language backgrounds;	5. Calls on the Member States to provide funding for teacher training and the development of special curricula (including for lifelong learning), methodologies and textbooks to ensure effective teaching both in minority languages - in those regions with a recognised national or linguistic minority - and in the official languages, for children with minority-language backgrounds; calls on Member States furthermore to promote stable cross-border relations, including through the tools of cultural, artistic and educational cooperation, especially in those areas where linguistic minorities are most strongly represented;

COMPROMISE 6 on paragraph 6: AM 59 (Evans), AM 62 (Kammerevert)

Original Proposal	Changes
6. Recalls that the media should reflect the plurality of the population and respect the principle of non-discrimination and that state regulation of broadcast media should in no way restrict minority rights;	6. Highlights the fact that the media plays a central role with regard to cultural and linguistic rights; recalls that the media should reflect the plurality of the population and respect the principle of non-discrimination and that state regulation of broadcast media should in no way restrict minority rights; calls on the Member States and the Commission to promote the presence of minority languages in public and private media, as well as on online interfaces, social media and language technologies; is also of the opinion that the media should report accurately and in a balanced manner on incidents relevant to minorities;

COMPROMISE 7 on paragraph 7: AM 74 (Costa), AM 75 (Kammerevert), AM 76 (Evans)

Original Proposal	Changes
7. Calls on the Commission to present a legislative proposal or an EU recommendation on the protection and promotion of cultural and linguistic diversity;	7. Considers it necessary to improve the EU's legislative framework to protect the rights of persons belonging to minorities in a comprehensive manner; calls, therefore, on the Commission to present a legislative proposal or an EU recommendation on the protection and promotion of cultural and linguistic diversity, and also to promote research into education, language learning and models of education in multilingual contexts, and to support programmes focusing on exchanges of experience and best practices relating to regional and minority languages in Europe; calls further on the Commission to allocate the area of 'multilingualism and language technology' to the portfolio of a Commissioner; considers that the Commissioner responsible should be tasked with promoting linguistic diversity and equality at EU level, given the importance of protecting European minority languages in the digital age;

<u>COMPROMISE 8 on paragraph 6 a (new) on discrimination: AM 7 (Kammerevert), AM 12 (Rodrigues)</u>

(Original Proposal	Changes
7	
7.	New. Deeply regrets the increase in racism, religious fanaticism, anti-Semitism, Islamophobia, anti-Gypsyism and xenophobia in many EU Member-States; is concerned by the fact that persons belonging to minorities still encounter obstacles in ensuring respect for their fundamental rights and continue to be victims of discrimination, hate speech and hate crimes and offences; stresses that the encouragement of inter-cultural dialogue and inter-ethnic tolerance pursuant to Article 6 of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities is an important public commitment; supports anti-discrimination measures and programmes aimed at raising awareness, protecting and promoting cultural diversity; urges Member States, in accordance with the principles

of subsidiarity and proportionality, to ensure that their legal systems protect minority groups from discrimination and to bring specific protection measures into line with applicable international standards;

COMPROMISE 9 on paragraph 4 a (new) on cultural diversity (sign languages): AM 11 (Costa), AM 25 (Kammerevert), AM 58 (Kammerevert), AM 79 (Rodrigues), AM 80 (Rodrigues), AM 84 (Rodrigues), AM 116 (Ni Riada), AM 122 (Ni Riada), AM 135 (Ni Riada)

Original Proposal	Changes
	New. Recalls that multilingualism, including the various sign languages, constitutes one of the greatest assets of cultural diversity in Europe; emphasises the role of the EU institutions and the Member States in raising awareness of the issues related to the protection of minorities, and in lending encouragement and support to the Member States in the promotion of cultural diversity and tolerance, especially through education, cultural cooperation, sports and cross-border mobility opportunities; recalls that the protection and strengthening of cultural heritage related to minorities in the Member States – a key component of the cultural identity of communities, groups and individuals – plays a crucial role in social cohesion; stresses in this connection that the development of any cultural heritage policy should be inclusive, citizencentred and participatory, including consultation and dialogue with the minority communities concerned; draws attention to the positive value of promoting cultural diversity and raising awareness, especially at local and regional level; urges the Member States and the Commission to exchange information and examples of good practice in this area and to provide the local and regional authorities with adequate financial and other own resources to formulate and implement the strategies they deem best for the protection of minorities; encourages the Member States to ensure that the right to use a minority language is upheld and to protect linguistic diversity within the Union in accordance with the EU Treaties;

<u>COMPROMISE 10 on paragraph 6 h (new) on Roma: AM 57 (Kammerevert), AM 22 (Ni Riada), AM 38 (Rodrigues)</u>

Original Proposal	Changes
	New. Stresses the continuing need for urgent action as regards the social situation of the Roma which can only be described as desolate, given that in large parts of the EU their position remains precarious, notably in terms of access to the labour and housing markets as well as educational and health facilities; calls, therefore, on the Member States to take corrective action in the event of discriminatory practices against members of the Roma community, in particular where public bodies are involved; expresses concern over the fact that multiple forms of discrimination and the segregation of Roma children in education remain a structural and deep-rooted phenomenon in several Member States; recalls that the issue of Roma segregation has been subject of a number of recommendations from the Commission and therefore calls on the governments to follow those recommendations and implement effective measures; calls on the Member States to develop a concerted strategy for the integration of "nonterritorial languages";

ORAL AMENDMENT

Oral amendment 1 by Rapporteur on AM 91 (Santiago Fisas Ayxelà)

8. Calls the Commission to monitor the implementation of the Convention on the Protection of National Minorities and the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages in the Member states, to provide them recommendations and to draw up reports based on country visits and report them regularly back to the European Parliament.