

Brussels, 8 March 2019

SB/fm

**Draft opinion by Julie WARD**

**on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council preventing the dissemination of terrorist content online (2018/0331(COD))**

**Documents:** **CULT draft opinion:** PA\1172153 - PE632.087v01-00 (Am.1-52)  
**CULT amendments:** AM\1176247- PE634.733v01-00 (Am. 53-173)  
 AM\1176668 - PE634.778v01-00 (Am. 174-415)

**VOTING LIST v03**

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Title 1	COMP 1	Rapporteur	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 53 falls</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 2</b>	
	53	Yana Toom	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 1	<b>COMP 2<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 16, Am. 177, Am. 174, Am. 175, Am. 176, Am. 178, Am. 181, Am. 180, Am. 179, Am. 182, Am. 183, Am. 17, Am. 184, Am. 185, Am. 186, Am. 187, Am. 188, Am. 189, Am. 190 and Am. 191 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>COMP 3</b></p>	
Article 1 – paragraph 1 introductory part	16	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
	177	Yana Toom	-		
	174	Helga Trüpel	+		
	175	Dominique Bilde	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 176 falls</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 178</p>	
	176	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
Article 1 – paragraph 1 point a	178	Dominique Bilde	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 181 and Am. 180 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 179</p>	
	181	Yana Toom	-		
	180	Francis Zammit Dimech	-		
	179	Helga Trüpel	+		

<sup>1</sup> The terms 'other than material used for educational, research, journalistic and other editorial purposes provided that it does not incite the commission of violence,' in Am. 202, Am. 203 and Am. 205, and the terms 'other than material used for educational, research, journalistic and other editorial purposes,' of Am. 204 are incompatible with COMP 2. If COMP 2 is adopted, those terms will fall.

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 1 – paragraph 1 point b	182	Dominique Bilde	-		
	183	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		
	17	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 184 and Am. 185 fall</i>  ► <b>Go to Am. 186</b>	
	184	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano	+	<i>identical</i>	
	185	Helga Trüpel			
	186	Yana Toom	-		
Article 1 – paragraph 1 subparagraph 1 (new)	187	Francis Zammit Dimech	-		
Article 1 – paragraph 2	188	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 189 falls</i>  ► <b>Go to Am. 190</b>	
	189	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+		
Article 1 – paragraph 2 a (new)	190	Emma McClarkin	-		
Article 1 a (new)	191	Helga Trüpel	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 1	<b>COMP 3<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 18, Am. 194, Am. 195 and Am. 196 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 4</b>	
	18	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 194, Am. 195, and Am. 196 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 4</b>	
	194	Yana Toom	-		
	195	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
	196	Sabine Verheyen	+		
	193	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

<sup>2</sup> Am. 192 is incompatible with COMP 3. If COMP 3 is adopted, Am. 192 falls.

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 2a new	<b>COMP 4</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 240, Am. 241, and Am. 242 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 197</b>	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 9 a (new)	240	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 241 and Am. 242 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 197	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 9 a (new)	241	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 9 a (new)	242	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 2	<b>197</b>	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 198 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 199	
	198	Sabine Verheyen	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 3 – introductory part	199	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 3 – point b	200	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 4	19	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5	COMP 5	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 201, Am. 202, Am. 204, Am. 20, Am. 205, Am. 206, Am. 207, Am. 208, Am. 209, Am. 210, Am. 211, Am. 21, Am. 212, Am. 213, Am. 214, Am. 22, Am. 215, Am. 216, Am. 217, Am. 218, Am. 23, Am. 219, Am. 220, Am. 221, Am. 222, Am. 223, Am. 224, Am. 225, Am. 226, Am. 227 and Am. 228 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>COMP 6</b></p>	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – introductory part	201	Marlene Mizzi	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 202, Am. 204, Am. 20 and Am. 205 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 206</p>	
	202 <sup>3</sup>	Helga Trüpel	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 204, Am. 20 and Am. 205 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 206</p>	
	204 <sup>2</sup>	Martina Michels	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 20 and Am. 205 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 206</p>	
	20	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 205 falls</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 206</p>	
	205 <sup>4</sup>	Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
	203	Sabine Verheyen	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

<sup>3</sup> The terms 'other than material used for educational, research, journalistic and other editorial purposes provided that it does not incite the commission of violence,' in Am. 202, Am. 203 and Am. 205, and the terms 'other than material used for educational,

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – introductory part	206	Yana Toom	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – point a	207	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 208, Am. 209, Am. 210, Am. 211, and Am. 21 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 212	
	208	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 209, Am. 210, Am. 211 and Am. 21 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 212	
	209	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 210, Am. 211 and Am. 21 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 212	
	210	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 211 and Am. 21 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 212	
	211	Giorgos Grammatikakis Silvia Costa	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 21 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 212	
	21	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		

*research, journalistic and other editorial purposes,' of Am. 204 are incompatible with COMP 2. If COMP 2 is adopted, those terms will fall.*

<sup>4</sup> *The terms 'other than material used for educational, research, journalistic and other editorial purposes provided that it does not incite the commission of violence,' in Am. 202, Am. 203 and Am. 205, and the terms 'other than material used for educational, research, journalistic and other editorial purposes,' of Am. 204 are incompatible with COMP 2. If COMP 2 is adopted, those terms will fall.*

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – point b	212	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 213, Am. 214, Am. 22, Am. 215, and Am. 216 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 217	
	213	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 214, Am. 22, Am. 215 and Am. 216 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 217	
	214	Dominique Bilde	-		
	22	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 215 and Am. 216 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 217	
	215	Sabine Verheyen	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 216 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 217	
	216	Giorgos Grammatikakis Silvia Costa	+		



Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – point c	217	Yana Toom	-	<i>identical</i>	
	218	Marlene Mizzi		<i>deletion</i>	
				<i>If adopted, Am. 23, Am. 219, Am. 220, Am. 221, Am. 222 and Am. 223 fall</i>	
				► Go to Am. 224	
	23	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
	219	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>	
	220	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			
	221	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – point d	222	Sabine Verheyen	-		
	223	Giorgos Grammatikakis Silvia Costa	+		
	224	Yana Toom	-	<i>identical</i>	
	225	Marlene Mizzi		<i>deletion</i>	
				<i>If adopted, Am. 226 and Am. 228 fall</i>	
				► Go to <b>COMP 6</b>	
	226	Dominique Bilde	-		
	227	Sabine Verheyen		<i>Does not concern the EN version</i>	
	228	Giorgos Grammatikakis Silvia Costa	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 2 - paragraph 1 New subparagraph	<b>COMP 6</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 231, Am. 229, And Am. 230 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 24</b>	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 a (new)	231	Francis Zammit Dimech	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 229 and Am. 230 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 24	
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 – point d a (new)	229	Helga Trüpel	+		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 5 a (new)	230	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 6	<b>24</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 232, Am. 234, and Am. 235 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 233</b>	
	232	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 234 and Am. 235 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 233	
	234	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>	
	235	Helga Trüpel			
	<b>233</b>	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 8	236	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 237 and Am. 238 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 239	
	237	Dominique Bilde	-		
	238	Sabine Verheyen	+		
Article 2 – paragraph 1 point 9	239	Dominique Bilde	-		
	25	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 3	COMP 7	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 26, Am. 245, Am. 246, Am. 243, Am. 244, Am. 247, Am. 27, Am. 248, Am. 249, Am. 250, and Am. 28 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>Am. 251</b></p>	
Article 3 – paragraph 1	26	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 245 and Am. 246 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 243</p>	
	245	Helga Trüpel	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 246 falls</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 243</p>	
	246	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
	243	Dominique Bilde	-		
	244	Yana Toom	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 3 – paragraph 2	247	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 27, Am. 248, Am. 249 and Am. 250 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 28	
	27	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 248, Am. 249 and Am. 250 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 28	
	248	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 249 and Am. 250 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 28	
	249	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 250 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 28	
	250	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		
Article 3 – paragraph 2 a (new)	28	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
Article 4 – paragraph 1	251	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 252 and Am. 253 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 254	
	252	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 253 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 254	
	253	Francis Zammit Dimech	+		
	29	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 4 – paragraph 1 a (new)	254	Marlene Mizzi	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 4 – paragraph 2	COMP 8	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 258, Am. 257, Am. 30, Am. 260, Am. 259, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>Am 262</b></p>	
Article 4 – paragraph 2	258	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 257, Am. 30, Am. 260, Am. 259, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	
	257	Marlene Mizzi	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 30, Am. 260, Am. 259, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	
	30	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 260, Am. 259, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	
	260	Martina Michels	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 259, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	
	259	Sabine Verheyen	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 261, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	
	261	Francis Zammit Dimech	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 255 and Am. 256 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 262</p>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
	255	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>	
	256	Helga Trüpel			
Article 4 – paragraph 3 point a	262	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 3 point b	263	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 264, Am. 265 and Am. 266 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 268	
	264	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 265 and Am. 266 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 268	
	265	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+		
	266	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
	267	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 4 – paragraph 3 point c	268	Helga Trüpel	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 4 – paragraph 3 point f	271	Yana Toom	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 270, Am. 272, Am. 273 and Am. 269 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 274</b>	
	270	Marlene Mizzi	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 272, Am. 273 and Am. 269 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 274	
	272	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 269 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 274	
	273	Helga Trüpel			
	269	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 3 point g	<b>274</b>	Yana Toom	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 4	275	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 276 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 277	
	276	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 4 a (new)	277	Marlene Mizzi	+		
Article 4 – paragraph 5	278	Dominique Bilde	-		
	279	Yana Toom	+		
	280	Marlene Mizzi	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 6	281	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 4 – paragraph 7	31	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 282 falls</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 283</b>	
	282	Helga Trüpel	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 283 falls</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 284</b>	
	283	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 7 a (new)	<b>284</b>	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
Article 4 – paragraph 8	32	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 286 falls</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 285</b>	
	286	Francis Zammit Dimech	-		
	<b>285</b>	Yana Toom	-		
	287	Dominique Bilde	-		
	288	Helga Trüpel	+	<b>identical</b>	
	289	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			



Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 4 – paragraph 9	292	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 290, Am. 291 and Am. 293 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 34	
	290	Francis Zammit Dimech	-	<i>identical</i>	
	291	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik		<i>If adopted, Am. 293 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 34	
	293	Marlene Mizzi	-		
	33	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 4 – paragraph 9 a (new)	34	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
<b>Article 4 a (new)</b>	<b>COMP 9</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 294, Am. 35, and Am. 295 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 296</b>	
Article 4 a (new)	294	Yana Toom	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 35 and Am. 295 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 296	
Article 4 a (new)	35	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 295 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 296	
Article 4 a (new)	295	Helga Trüpel	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 5	296	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted,  Am. 297, Am. 298,  Am. 299, Am. 300,  Am. 301 and Am. 302  fall</i>  <b>► Go to COMP 10</b>	
Article 5 – paragraph 2	297	Martina Michels	-		
Article 5 – paragraph 4	298	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>If adopted,  Am. 299 falls</i>  <b>► Go to Am. 300</b>	
	299	Francis Zammit Dimech	+		
Article 5 – paragraph 5	300	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 5 – paragraph 6	301	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 5 – paragraph 7	302	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 6	COMP 10	Rapporteur	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 303, Am. 304, Am. 305, Am. 306, Am. 307, Am. 308, Am. 309, Am. 310, Am. 311, Am. 312, Am. 313, Am. 314, Am. 315 and Am. 316 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 317</b>	
Article 6	303	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 304, Am. 305, Am. 306, Am. 307, Am. 308, Am. 309, Am. 310, Am. 311, Am. 312, Am. 313, Am. 314, Am. 315 and Am. 316 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 317	
	36	Rapporteur	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 6 – paragraph 1	304	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	+		
	305	Sabine Verheyen	-		
	306	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>identical</i>	
	307	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen			
Article 6 – paragraph 2 subparagraph 1 – point a	308	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 309 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 310	
	309	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 6 – paragraph 2 subparagraph 1 – point b	310	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
Article 6 – paragraph 3	311	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 312 and Am. 313 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 314	
	312	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>identical</i>	
	313	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			
Article 6 – paragraph 4	314	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 315 and Am. 316 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 317	
	315	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>identical</i>	
	316	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			
Article 6 – paragraph 5 a (new)	317	Helga Trüpel	+		
Article 7 – paragraph 1 point a	318	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 7 – paragraph 1 point b	319	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 7 – paragraph 1 point b a (new)	320	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	-	<i>identical</i>	
Article 7 – paragraph 1 point b a (new)	321	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 7 – paragraph 2	322	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 323 and Am. 324 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 11</b>	
	324	Emma McClarkin	-		
	323	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
	325	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 8	<b>COMP 11</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>If adopted,</i>  Am. 328, Am. 326,  Am. 327, Am. 329,  Am. 331, Am. 330,  Am. 332, Am. 333,  Am. 334, Am. 335,  Am. 336, Am. 337,  Am. 338, Am. 339,  Am. 342, Am. 341,  Am. 340, Am. 343,  and Am. 344 fall</p> <p>► Go to <b>Am. 345</b></p>	
Article 8 – paragraph 1	328	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted,</i>  Am. 326 falls</p> <p>► Go to Am. 327</p>	
	326	Dominique Bilde	-		
	327	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
	37	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 8 – paragraph 2	329	Francis Zammit Dimech	-	<p><i>If adopted,</i>  Am. 331 and Am. 330  fall</p> <p>► Go to Am. 332</p>	
	331	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted,</i>  Am. 330 falls</p> <p>► Go to Am. 332</p>	
	330	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
	332	Helga Trüpel	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 8 – paragraph 3 introductory part	333	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>identical</i>	
	334	Francis Zammit Dimech			
Article 8 – paragraph 3 point a	335	Dominique Bilde	-		
	336	Yana Toom	-		
Article 8 – paragraph 3 point b	337	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 338 and Am. 339 fall</i>  ► <i>Go to Am. 342</i>	
	338	Dominique Bilde	-		
	339	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
	38	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	
	342	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 341 falls</i>  ► <i>Go to Am. 340</i>	
Article 8 – paragraph 3 point c	341	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		
	340	Dominique Bilde	-		
	39	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 8 – paragraph 3 point d	343	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>identical</i>	
	344	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 8 – paragraph 3 subparagraph 1 (new)	345	Francis Zammit Dimech	-		
Article 9	COMP 12	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 346, Am. 347, Am. 348, Am. 349, Am. 350, Am. 353, Am. 351, Am. 352, and Am. 354 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>COMP 13</b></p>	
Article 9 – title	346	Yana Toom	-		
Article 9 – paragraph 1	347	Dominique Bilde	-		
	348	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>identical</i>	
	349	Helga Trüpel			
	350	Yana Toom	-		
Article 9 – paragraph 2	353	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 351, Am. 352 and Am. 354 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>COMP 13</b></p>	
	351	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>identical</i>	
	352	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			
	354	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 9	40	Rapporteur	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	



Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 10	<b>COMP 13</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 355, Am. 356, Am. 358, Am. 360, Am. 359, Am. 357, Am. 361, Am. 362, Am. 363 and Am. 364 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 365</b>	
Article 10 – title	355	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>identical</i>	
	356	Helga Trüpel			
Article 10 – paragraph 1	358	Yana Toom	-		
	360	Dominique Bilde	-		
	359	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
	357	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 361 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 362	
	361	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 362 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 363	
	362	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	-		
	41	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 10 – paragraph 2	363	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 10 – paragraph 2 a (new)	364	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 11 – paragraph 1	365	Dominique Bilde	-		
	366	Yana Toom	-		
	367	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	-		
Article 11 – paragraph 2	369	Yana Toom	-	<i>identical</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 368 falls</i>  <b>► Go to Am. 371</b>	
	370	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			
	368	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 12 – paragraph 1	371	Martina Michels	-		
	42	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<b>w</b>	<b>withdrawn</b>	
Article 12 a (new)	372	Helga Trüpel	+		
Article 13 – paragraph 1	373	Dominique Bilde	-		
	374	Yana Toom	-		
Article 13 – paragraph 3 point b	375	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>	
Article 13 – paragraph 3 point c	376	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>	
Article 13 – paragraph 4	377	Dominique Bilde	-		
	379	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	+		
	378	Francis Zammit Dimech	<b>w</b>	<b>withdrawn</b>	
Article 14 – paragraph 1	380	Dominique Bilde	-		
	381	Yana Toom	-		
Article 14 – paragraph 2	382	Dominique Bilde	-		
	383	Yana Toom	-		
Article 15 – paragraph 1	384	Emma McClarkin	-		
Article 16 – paragraph 4	385	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 17 – paragraph 1 introductory part	386	Yana Toom	-		
	387	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-	<i>identical</i>	
	388	Francis Zammit Dimech			
Article 17 – paragraph 1 point b	389	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>	
Article 17 – paragraph 1 point c	390	Dominique Bilde	-		
	392	Yana Toom	-		
	391	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
	43	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 17 – paragraph 1 subparagraph 1 (new)	393	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 17 – paragraph 1 a (new)	394	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 17 – paragraph 1 a (new)	395	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
<b>Article 18</b>	<b>COMP 14</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 44, Am. 396, Am. 397, Am. 398, Am. 399, Am. 400, Am. 401, Am. 402, Am. 403, Am. 404, Am. 405, Am. 47, and Am. 407 fall</i>  <b>► Go to Am. 48</b>	
Article 18 – paragraph 1 introductory part	44	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
Article 18 – paragraph 1 point c	396	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>	
Article 18 – paragraph 1 point d	397	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 398 falls</i>  <b>► Go to Am. 399</b>	
	398	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+		
	45	<b>Rapporteur</b>	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 18 – paragraph 1 point g	399	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+		
	46	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 18 – paragraph 3 introductory part	400	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		
	401	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	+	<i>identical</i>	
	402	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			
Article 18 – paragraph 3 point d	403	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 18 – paragraph 3 point e a (new)	404	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano	+	<i>identical</i>	
Article 18 – paragraph 3 point e a (new)	405	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 18 – paragraph 4	47	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 407 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 48	
	407	Emma McClarkin	-		
	406	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Article 19	48	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 408 and Am. 409 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 49	
Article 19 – paragraph 1	408	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
Article 19 – paragraph 2	409	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	-		
Article 20	49	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 410 and Am. 411 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 412	
Article 20 – paragraph 1	410	Dominique Bilde	-		
Article 20 – paragraph 2	411	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik Sabine Verheyen	+		
Article 21 – paragraph 1 introductory part	412	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Article 21 – paragraph 1 point a	413	Yana Toom	-		
Article 21 – paragraph 1 point b	415	Yana Toom	-		
	414	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	
	50	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Annex III – section B point i – paragraph 3 indent 1 (new)	51	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
Annex III – section B point iii a (new)	52	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
Recital 1	54	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
	55	Marlene Mizzi	+		
	56	Yana Toom	-		
Recital 1 a (new)	57 <i>with Or. Am. 1</i>	Emma McClarkin	-	<i>Oral Amendment 1 by Emma McClarkin</i>	
Recital 2	58	Dominique Bilde	-		
	59	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		
	60	Yana Toom	-		
Recital 3	61	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
	62	Dominique Bilde	-		
	63	Yana Toom	-		
Recital 4	64	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 5	67	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 1, Am. 65, Am. 66 and Am. 68 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 69	
	1	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 65, Am. 66, and Am. 68 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 69	
	65	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>identical</i>	
	66	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen			
	68	Yana Toom	-		
Recital 6	69	Martina Michels	-		
Recital 6 a (new)	70	Helga Trüpel Sabine Verheyen	-		



Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 7	2 with <i>Or. Am. 2</i>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>Oral amendment 2 by Rapporteur</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 73, Am. 74, Am. 71, Am. 77 and Am. 72 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 76</b>	
	73	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 74, Am. 71, Am. 77 and Am. 72 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 76	
	74	Yana Toom	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 71, Am. 77 and Am. 72 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 76	
	71	Helga Trüpel	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 77 and Am. 72 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 76	
	77	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano	+		
	72	Dominique Bilde	-		
	<b>76</b>	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
	75	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 8	78	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 3, Am. 80, and Am. 79 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 81	
	3	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+		
	80	Dominique Bilde	-		
	79	Yana Toom	+		
	81	Martina Michels	+		
Recital 9	4 <i>with Or. Am. 3</i>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>Oral amendment 3 by Rapporteur</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 85, Am. 86, Am. 87, Am. 84, Am. 82, Am. 83, and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 90	
	85	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 86, Am. 87, Am. 84, Am. 82, Am. 83 and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 90	
	86	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 87, Am. 84, Am. 82, Am. 83, and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 90	
	87	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 84, Am. 82, Am. 83 and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 90	
	84	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 82, Am. 83, and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 90	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
	82	Helga Trüpel	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 83 and Am. 88 fall</i>  ► <i>Go to Am. 90</i>	
	83	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 88 falls</i>  ► <i>Go to Am. 90</i>	
	88	Giorgos Grammatikakis	+		
	89	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Recital 9 a (new)	90 <sup>5</sup>	Helga Trüpel	-		

<sup>5</sup> Note that Sabine Verheyen withdrew her name from this amendment.

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
<b>Recital 10</b>	<b>COMP 15</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 192, Am. 91, Am. 5, Am. 92, Am. 93 and Am. 94 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 95</b>	
Article 2, paragraph 1 point 1	192 <sup>6</sup>	Helga Trüpel	+		
Recital 10	91	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 5, Am. 92, Am. 93 and Am. 94 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 95	
	5	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 92, Am. 93 and Am. 94 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 95	
	92	Francis Zammit Dimech	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 93 and Am. 94 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 95	
	93	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 94 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 95	
	94	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+		
Recital 11	<b>95</b>	Dominique Bilde	-		

<sup>6</sup> If Am. 192 is adopted, Am. 193, Am. 18, Am. 194 and Am. 195 fall.

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 12	6	Rapporteur	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 101, Am. 96, Am. 97, Am. 98, Am. 99 and Am. 100 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>Am. 105</b></p>	
	101	Silvia Costa	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 97, Am. 98, and Am. 99 fall</i></p> <p>► <b>Whether adopted or rejected, Go to Am. 96</b></p>	
	96	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 97, Am. 98, and Am. 99 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>Am. 100</b></p> <p><i>If <u>NOT</u> adopted, and if:</i></p> <p><i>1. Am. 101 adopted, ► Go to <b>Am. 100</b></i></p> <p><i>2. Am. 101 <u>NOT</u> adopted, ► Go to <b>Am. 97</b></i></p>	
	97	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-		
	98	Helga Trüpel	+		
	99	Dominique Bilde	-		
	100	Yana Toom	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 13	<b>105</b>	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 7, Am. 108, Am. 110, Am. 104, Am. 102, Am. 103, Am. 109, Am. 106, and Am. 107 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 111	
	<b>7 with Or. Am. 4</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>Oral Amendment 4 by Rapporteur</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 108, Am. 110, Am. 104, Am. 102, Am. 103, Am. 109, Am. 106 and Am. 107 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 111	
	108	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 110, Am. 104, Am. 102, Am. 103, Am. 109, Am. 106 and Am. 107 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 111	
	110	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		
	104	Marlene Mizzi	-		
	102	Helga Trüpel	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 103 and Am. 109 fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 106	
	103	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 109 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 106	
	109	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		
	106	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
	107	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		
Recital 14	111	Marlene Mizzi	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 113 falls</i>  ► <i>Go to Am. 112</i>	
	113	Martina Michels	-		
	112	Dominique Bilde	-		
	8	<b>Rapporteur</b>	<i>w</i>	<i>withdrawn</i>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 15	114	Yana Toom	-	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 115 falls</i>  <b>► Go to COMP 16</b>	
	115	Dominique Bilde	-		



Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 16	<b>COMP 16</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 9, Am. 118, Am. 120, Am. 117, Am. 119, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>COMP 17</b></p>	
	9	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>deletion</i></p> <p><i>If adopted, Am. 118, Am. 120, Am. 117, Am. 119, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	118	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 120, Am. 117, Am. 119, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	120	Martina Michels	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 117, Am. 119, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	117	Dominique Bilde	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 119, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	119	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 116, Am. 121 and Am. 122 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	116	Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 121 falls</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 122</p>	
	121	Giorgos Grammatikakis	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 122 falls</i></p> <p>► Go to COMP 17</p>	
	122	Helga Trüpel	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 17	<b>COMP 17</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 10, Am. 124, Am. 123, Am. 125, Am. 126 and Am. 127 fall</i>  <b>► Go to <b>COMP 18</b></b>	
	10	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 124, Am. 123, Am. 125, Am. 126 and Am. 127 fall</i>  <b>► Go to COMP 18</b>	
	124	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 123, Am. 125, Am. 126 and Am. 127 fall</i>  <b>► Go to COMP 18</b>	
	123	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 125 and Am. 126 fall</i>  <b>► Go to Am. 127</b>	
	125	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+	<i>identical</i>	
	126	Helga Trüpel			
	127	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 18	<b>COMP 18</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 11, Am. 128, Am. 131, Am. 129, Am. 130 and Am. 132 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to <b>Am. 12</b></p>	
	11	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<p><i>deletion</i></p> <p><i>If adopted, Am. 128, Am. 131, Am. 129, Am. 130, and Am. 132 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 12</p>	
	128	Yana Toom	-	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 131, Am. 129, Am. 130 and Am. 132 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 12</p>	
	131	Dominique Bilde	-		
	129	Helga Trüpel	+	<p><i>If adopted, Am. 130 and Am. 132 fall</i></p> <p>► Go to Am. 12</p>	
	130	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik	+		
	132	Giorgos Grammatikakis Luigi Morgano Silvia Costa	+		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 19	<b>12</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>deletion</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 133, Am. 135, Am. 134, Am. 136 and Am. 137 fall</i>  ►Go to <b>Am. 138</b>	
	133	Yana Toom	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 135 falls</i>  ►Go to Am. 134	
	135	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		
	134	Dominique Bilde	-		
	136	Helga Trüpel	+	<i>identical</i>	
	137	Giorgos Grammatikakis Silvia Costa			
Recital 21	<b>138</b>	Yana Toom	-		
	139	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 22	140	Dominique Bilde	-		
	141	Emma McClarkin	-		
Recital 24	142	Yana Toom	-		
Recital 24 a (new)	143	Francis Zammit Dimech	<b>w</b>	<b><i>withdrawn</i></b>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 25	13	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 145, Am. 144 and Am. 146 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Or. Am. 5</b>	
	145	Dominique Bilde	-		
	144	Francis Zammit Dimech	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 146 falls</i>  ► Go to <i>Or. Am. 5</i>	
	146	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	+		
Recital 26	14 <i>with Or. Am. 5</i>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>Oral Amendment 5 by Rapporteur</i>  <i>If adopted, Am. 148 and Am. 147 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 149</b>	
	148	Yana Toom	-		
	147	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 27	149	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 28	151	Martina Michels	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 152 falls</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 153</b>	
	152	Dominique Bilde	-		
	150	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	
Recital 31	<b>153</b>	Dominique Bilde	-		
	154	Francis Zammit Dimech	w	<i>withdrawn</i>	

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 33	155	Dominique Bilde	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 156 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 157	
	156	Marlene Mizzi	+		
Recital 34	157	Dominique Bilde	-		
	158	Francis Zammit Dimech	+	<i>identical</i>	
	159	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik			

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 37	160	Martina Michels	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 163, Am. 165, Am. 161, Am. 162, and Am. 164 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 19</b>	
	163	Francis Zammit Dimech	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 165, Am. 161, Am. 162 and Am. 164 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 19</b>	
	165	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 161 and Am. 162 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>COMP 19</b>	
	161	Helga Trüpel	-	<i>identical</i>	
	162	Marc Joulaud Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Milan Zver Bogusław Sonik			
	164	Dominique Bilde	-		

Concerned text	AM	Tabled by	Rapp.	Remarks	Vote
Recital 38	<b>COMP 19</b>	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 15, Am. 168, Am. 167, Am. 166, and Am. 169 fall</i>  ► Go to <b>Am. 170</b>	
	15	<b>Rapporteur</b>	+	<i>If adopted, Am. 168, Am. 167, Am. 166 and Am. 169, fall</i>  ► Go to Am. 170	
	168	Yana Toom	+		
	167	Silvia Costa Giorgos Grammatikakis	-	<i>If adopted, Am. 166 falls</i>  ► Go to Am. 169	
	166	Dominique Bilde	-		
	169	Svetoslav Hristov Malinov Andrea Bocskor Marc Joulaud Bogusław Sonik	-		
Recital 39	<b>170</b>	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 40	171	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 41	172	Dominique Bilde	-		
Recital 42	173	Dominique Bilde	-		

Final vote on the draft legislative opinion <u>as a whole</u> (rcv)		
for	against	abstentions

\*



## I. Compromises

### COMP 1 by Rapporteur on Title 1

#### Proposal for a regulation Title 1

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

Proposal for a  
REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN  
PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL  
on **preventing** the dissemination of terrorist  
content online  
A contribution from the European  
Commission to the Leaders' meeting in  
Salzburg on 19-20 September 2018

##### *Amendment*

Proposal for a  
REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN  
PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL  
on **tackling** the dissemination of terrorist  
content online  
A contribution from the European  
Commission to the Leaders' meeting in  
Salzburg on 19-20 September 2018

COMP 2 by Rapporteur on Article 1 covering Am. 16 (Rapporteur), Am. 17 (Rapporteur), Am. 174 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 179 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 183 (Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa), Am. 184 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano), Am. 185 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 188 (Helga Trüpel) and Am. 191 (Helga Trüpel) Am. 202 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 203 (Sabine Verheyen), Am. 204 (Martina Michels), Am. 205 (Giorgos Grammatikakis)

#### Proposal for a regulation Article 1 – paragraph 1 – introductory part

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

##### *Article 1 Subject matter and scope*

1. This Regulation lays down uniform rules to prevent the misuse of hosting services for the dissemination of terrorist content online. It lays down in particular:

##### *Amendment*

##### *Article 1 Subject matter and scope*

1. ***Without prejudice to the obligation to respect fundamental rights and fundamental legal principles as enshrined in Article 6 TEU***, this Regulation lays down uniform rules to prevent the misuse of hosting services for the dissemination ***to the public*** of terrorist content online. It lays down in particular:

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point a

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(a) rules on duties of care to be applied by hosting service providers in order to **prevent** the dissemination of terrorist content through their services and ensure, where necessary, its swift removal;

#### *Amendment*

(a) rules on duties of care to be applied by hosting service providers in order to **tackle** the dissemination of terrorist content **online to the public** through their services and ensure, where necessary, its swift removal;

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 1 – paragraph 1 – point b

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(b) a set of measures to be put in place by Member States to identify terrorist content, to enable its swift removal by hosting service providers and to facilitate cooperation with the competent authorities in other Member States, hosting service providers and where appropriate relevant Union bodies.

#### *Amendment*

(b) a set of measures to be put in place by Member States to identify terrorist content, to enable its swift removal by hosting service providers and to facilitate cooperation with the **relevant** competent authorities, **and where applicable, judicial authorities** in other Member States, hosting service providers and where appropriate relevant Union bodies.

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 1 – paragraph 1 – subparagraph 1a (new)

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

#### *Amendment*

***This Regulation shall not apply to content disseminated for educational, artistic, journalistic or research purposes and other editorial purposes, provided that it does not incite the commission of violence, or for awareness raising purposes against terrorist activities.***

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 1 – paragraph 2

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

2. This Regulation shall apply to hosting service providers offering services in the Union, irrespective of their place of main establishment.

#### *Amendment*

2. This Regulation shall apply to hosting service providers offering services **to the public** in the Union, irrespective of their place of main establishment.

**COMP 3** by Rapporteur on Article 2, paragraph 1, point 1 covering Am. 18 (Rapporteur), Am. 195 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 196 (Sabine Verheyen), Am. 197 (Helga Trüpel)

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(1) 'hosting service provider' means a provider of information society services consisting in the storage of ***information*** provided by and at the request of the content provider and in making the information stored available to ***third parties***;

*Amendment*

(1) 'hosting service provider' means a provider of information society services consisting in the storage of **online content** provided by and at the request of the content provider and in making the information stored available to ***the public***;

**COMP 4** by Rapporteur on Article 2, paragraph 1, point 2a (new) covering Am. 241 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 242 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen)

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 2 a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

(2a) '***competent authority***' means a single designated national judicial authority in the Member State, or an **independent administrative authority, with the relevant expertise**;

**COMP 5** by Rapporteur on Article 2, paragraph 1, point 5 covering Am. 20 (Rapporteur), Am. 21 (Rapporteur), Am. 22 (Rapporteur), Am. 23 (Rapporteur), Am. 202 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 203 (Sabine Verheyen), Am. 205 (Giorgos Grammatikakis), Am. 219 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 220 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen)

#### **Proposal for a regulation**

##### **Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – introductory part**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(5) 'terrorist content' means ***one or more of the following information:***

*Amendment*

(5) 'terrorist content' means ***online content which may contribute to the commission of intentional acts, which constitute offences under national and Union law, as listed in Article 3(1)(a) to (i) of Directive 2017/541/EU, by***

#### **Proposal for a regulation**

##### **Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point a**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(a) inciting or advocating, including by glorifying, the commission of terrorist offences, thereby causing a danger that such acts be committed;

*Amendment*

(a) inciting or advocating, including by glorifying, the commission of terrorist offences, thereby causing a danger that such acts be committed;

#### **Proposal for a regulation**

##### **Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point b**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(b) ***encouraging the contribution*** to terrorist offences;

*Amendment*

(b) ***soliciting persons or a group of persons to contribute*** to terrorist offences;

#### **Proposal for a regulation**

##### **Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point c**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(c) promoting the activities of a terrorist group, in particular by ***encouraging the participation in*** or support ***to*** a terrorist group within the meaning of Article 2(3) of Directive (EU) 2017/541;

*Amendment*

(c) promoting the activities of a terrorist group, in particular by ***soliciting persons or a group of persons to participate in, meeting with, communicate with*** or support ***the criminal activities of*** a terrorist group within the meaning of Article 2(3) of Directive (EU) 2017/541, ***or by encouraging the dissemination of terrorist content;***

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – point d**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(d) instructing on methods or techniques for the purpose of committing terrorist offences.

*Amendment*

(d) instructing on methods or techniques for the purpose of committing terrorist offences.

**COMP 6 by Rapporteur on Article 2, paragraph 1, point 5, subparagraph 1 (new) covering Am. 229 (Helga Trüpel)**

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 5 – subparagraph 1 a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***The expression of radical, polemic or controversial views in the public debate on sensitive political questions as well as content aiming at providing information or denouncing terrorist content shall not be considered terrorist content.***

**COMP 7** by Rapporteur on Article 3 covering Am. 26 (Rapporteur), Am. 27 (Rapporteur), Am. 28 (Rapporteur), Am. 245 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 246 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 248 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 249 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 250 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa)

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 3 – paragraph 1

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

1. Hosting service providers shall take appropriate, reasonable and proportionate actions in accordance with this Regulation, against the dissemination of terrorist content and to protect users from terrorist content. In doing so, they shall act in a diligent, proportionate and non-discriminatory manner, **and** with due **regard to the** fundamental rights of the users **and take into account the fundamental importance of the** freedom of expression and information **in an open and democratic society**.

#### *Amendment*

1. Hosting service providers shall take appropriate, reasonable and proportionate actions in accordance with this Regulation, against the dissemination of terrorist content **to the public** and to protect users from terrorist content. In doing so, they shall act in a diligent, proportionate and non-discriminatory manner, with due **respect to** fundamental rights of the users, **in particular** freedom of expression and information.

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 3 – paragraph 2

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

2. Hosting service providers shall include in their terms and conditions, **and apply, provisions** to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content.

#### *Amendment*

2. **Without prejudice to Articles 14 and 15 of Directive 2000/31/EC**, hosting service providers shall include in their terms and conditions **that they shall take appropriate, effective and proportionate measures to tackle the dissemination of terrorist content on their services**.

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 3 – paragraph 2 a (new)

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

#### *Amendment*

**2a. Hosting service providers as referred to Article 1(1) who meet the criteria of the definition of video-sharing platforms providers shall take appropriate measures to tackle the dissemination of terrorist content in accordance with Article 28b, paragraph 1(c) and paragraph 3 of Directive (EU) 2018/1808.**

**COMP 8** by Rapporteur on Article 4, paragraph 2 covering Am. 29 (Rapporteur), Am. 255 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Boguslaw Sonik) and Am. 256 (Helga Trüpel)

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 4 – paragraph 2**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

2. Hosting service providers shall remove terrorist content or disable access to it ***within one hour from*** receipt of the removal order.

*Amendment*

2. ***Without prejudice to Articles 14 and 15 of Directive 2000/31/EC***, hosting service providers shall remove terrorist content or disable access to it ***without undue delay following the*** receipt of the removal order. ***Member States may provide that where a terrorist content is manifestly harmful or constitutes an immediate threat to the public order, hosting service providers shall remove or disable access to the terrorist content from the moment of receipt of a duly justified removal order.***

**COMP 9** by Rapporteur on Article 4a (new) covering Am. 35 (Rapporteur), Am. 294 (Yana Toom) and Am. 295 (Helga Trüpel)

**Article 4 a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***Article 4a***

***Cross-border cooperation***

1. ***The competent authority issuing the removal order to the hosting service provider shall submit immediately a copy of that removal order to the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(a) of the Member State in which the main establishment of the hosting service provider or its designated representative is located.***

2. ***In cases where the competent authority of the Member State in which the main establishment of the hosting service provider, its designated representative or the content provider is located has reasonable grounds to believe that the removal order may affect fundamental rights of the individual, it shall inform the requesting competent authority.***

3. *The requesting competent authority shall take those circumstances into account and shall, where necessary, withdraw or adapt the removal request.*

**COMP 10** by Rapporteur on Article 6 covering Am. 36 (Rapporteur), Am. 304 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 306 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 307 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 308 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa), Am. 309 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 312 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 313 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 315 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen), and Am. 316 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik)

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 6 – paragraph 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

1. Hosting service providers shall, *where appropriate*, take proactive measures to protect their services against the dissemination of terrorist content. The measures shall be effective and proportionate, taking into account the risk and level of exposure to terrorist content, the fundamental rights of the users, *and the fundamental importance of the* freedom of expression and information *in an open and democratic society*.

*Amendment*

1. *Without prejudice to Directive (EU) 2018/1808 and Directive 2000/31/EC*, hosting service providers shall, *depending on the risk and level of exposure to terrorist content*, take proactive measures to protect their services against the dissemination of terrorist content. The measures shall be effective, *targeted* and proportionate, taking into account the risk and level of exposure to terrorist content, *and with due respect to* the fundamental rights of the users, *in particular* freedom of expression and information.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 6 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 1 – introductory part**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

Where it has been informed according to Article 4(9), the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) shall request the hosting service provider to submit a report, within three months after receipt of the request and thereafter at least on an annual basis, on the specific proactive measures it has taken, including by using automated tools, with a view to:

*Amendment*

Where it has been informed according to Article 4(9), the *relevant* competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) shall request the hosting service provider to submit a report, within three months after receipt of the request and thereafter at least on an annual basis, on the specific proactive measures it has taken, including by using automated tools, with a view to:



**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 6 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 1 – point a**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

- (a) ***preventing the re-upload*** of content which has previously been removed or to which access has been disabled because it is considered to be terrorist content;

*Amendment*

- (a) ***effectively address the reappearance*** of content which has previously been removed or to which access has been disabled because it is considered to be terrorist content;

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 6 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 1 – point b**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

- (b) detecting, identifying and expeditiously removing or disabling access to terrorist content.

*Amendment*

- (b) detecting, identifying and expeditiously removing or disabling access to terrorist content.

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 6 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 2**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

Such a request shall be sent to the main establishment of the hosting service provider or to the legal representative designated by the service provider.

*Amendment*

Such a request shall be sent to the main establishment of the hosting service provider or to the legal representative designated by the service provider.

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 6 – paragraph 2 – subparagraph 3**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

The reports shall include all relevant information allowing the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) to assess whether the proactive measures are effective and proportionate, including to evaluate the functioning of any automated tools used as well as the human oversight and verification mechanisms employed.

*Amendment*

The reports shall include all relevant information allowing the ***relevant*** competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) to assess whether the proactive measures are effective and proportionate, including to evaluate the functioning of any automated tools used as well as the human oversight and verification mechanisms employed.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 6 – paragraph 3**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

3. Where *the* competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) considers that the proactive measures taken and reported under paragraph 2 are *insufficient* in mitigating and managing the risk and level of exposure, it may request the hosting service provider *to take specific additional proactive* measures. For that purpose, the hosting service provider shall cooperate with the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) with a view to identifying the specific measures that the hosting service provider shall put in place, establishing key objectives and benchmarks as well as timelines for their implementation.

*Amendment*

3. Where *the relevant competent authority* referred to in Article 17(1)(c) considers that the proactive measures taken and reported under paragraph 2 are *disproportionate or* insufficient in mitigating and managing the risk and level of exposure, it may request the hosting service provider *to adapt the measures already taken or* to take specific additional proactive measures. For that purpose, the hosting service provider shall cooperate with *the relevant competent authority* referred to in Article 17(1)(c) with a view to identifying *the changes or* the specific measures that the hosting service provider shall put in place, establishing key objectives and benchmarks as well as timelines for their implementation.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 6 – paragraph 4**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

4. Where no agreement can be reached within the three months from the request pursuant to paragraph 3, the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) may issue a decision imposing specific additional necessary and proportionate proactive measures. The decision shall take into account, in particular, the economic capacity of the hosting service provider and the effect of such measures on the fundamental rights of the users *and the fundamental importance of the* freedom of expression and information. Such a decision shall be sent to the main establishment of the hosting service provider or to the legal representative designated by the service provider. The hosting service provider shall regularly report on the implementation of such measures as specified by the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c).

*Amendment*

4. Where no agreement can be reached within the three months from the request pursuant to paragraph 3, *the relevant competent authority* referred to in Article 17(1)(c) may issue a decision imposing specific additional necessary and proportionate proactive measures. The decision shall take into account, in particular, *the type of content hosted on the service, the technical feasibility of the measures*, the economic capacity of the hosting service provider and the effect of such measures on the fundamental rights of the users, *in particular* freedom of expression and information. Such a decision shall be sent to the main establishment of the hosting service provider or to the legal representative designated by the service provider. The hosting service provider shall regularly report on the implementation of such measures as specified by the *relevant competent authority* referred to in Article 17(1)(c).

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 6 – paragraph 5**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

5. A hosting service provider may, at any time, request the competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) a review and, where appropriate, to revoke a request or decision pursuant to paragraphs 2, 3, and 4 respectively. The competent authority shall provide a reasoned decision within a reasonable period of time after receiving the request by the hosting service provider.

*Amendment*

5. A hosting service provider may, at any time, request the **relevant** competent authority referred to in Article 17(1)(c) a review and, where appropriate, to revoke a request or decision pursuant to paragraphs 2, 3, and 4 respectively. The **relevant** competent authority shall provide a reasoned decision within a reasonable period of time after receiving the request by the hosting service provider.

**COMP 11** by Rapporteur on Article 8 covering Am. 327 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 329 (Francis Zammit Dimech), Am. 330 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 332 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 333 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 334 (Francis Zammit Dimech), Am. 339 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 341 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 343 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa) and Am. 344 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen)

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 8 – paragraph 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

1. Hosting service providers shall set out in their terms and conditions their policy to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content, including, where appropriate, a meaningful explanation of the functioning of proactive measures including the use of automated tools.

*Amendment*

1. Hosting service providers shall ***clearly*** set out in their terms and conditions their policy to **tackle** the dissemination of terrorist content, including, where appropriate, a meaningful explanation of the functioning of proactive measures including the use of automated tools ***and to collaborate with the relevant competent authorities.***

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 8 – paragraph 2**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

2. Hosting service providers shall publish annual transparency reports on action taken against the dissemination of

*Amendment*

2. Hosting service providers, ***the relevant competent authorities and Union bodies*** shall publish annual transparency reports on action taken against the

terrorist content.

dissemination of terrorist content *to the public*.

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Article 8 – paragraph 3 – introductory part

*Text proposed by the Commission*

3. Transparency reports shall include at least the following information:

*Amendment*

3. Transparency reports *of the hosting service providers* shall include at least the following information:

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Article 8 – paragraph 3 – point a

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(a) information about the hosting service provider's measures in relation to the detection, identification and removal of terrorist content;

*Amendment*

(a) information about the hosting service provider's measures in relation to the detection, identification and removal of terrorist content;

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Article 8 – paragraph 3 – point b

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(b) information about the hosting service provider's measures to *prevent the re-upload* of content which has previously been removed or to which access has been disabled because it is considered to be terrorist content;

*Amendment*

(b) *detailed* information about the hosting service provider's measures to address the reappearance of content which has previously been removed or to which access has been disabled because it is considered to be terrorist content;

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Article 8 – paragraph 3 – point c

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(c) number of pieces of terrorist content removed or to which access has been disabled, following removal orders, referrals, or proactive measures, respectively;

*Amendment*

(c) number of pieces of terrorist content removed or to which access has been disabled, following removal orders, referrals, or proactive measures, respectively;

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 8 – paragraph 3 – point d

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(d) overview and *outcome of* complaint *procedures*.

#### *Amendment*

(d) overview and *assessment of the effectiveness of the* complaint *and redress mechanisms*.

**COMP 12 by Rapporteur on Article 9 covering Am. 348 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa), Am. 349 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 351 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 352 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen)**

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 9 – paragraph 1

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

##### *Article 9*

*Safeguards regarding the use and implementation of proactive measures*

1. Where hosting service providers use automated tools pursuant to this Regulation in respect of content that they store, they shall provide effective and appropriate safeguards to ensure that decisions taken concerning that content, in particular decisions to remove or disable content considered to be terrorist content, are accurate and well-founded.

#### *Amendment*

##### *Article 9*

*Safeguards regarding the use and implementation of proactive measures*

1. Where hosting service providers use automated tools pursuant to this Regulation in respect of content that they store, they shall provide effective and appropriate safeguards to ensure that decisions taken concerning that content, in particular decisions to remove or disable *access to* content considered to be terrorist content, are accurate and well-founded.

## Proposal for a regulation

### Article 9 – paragraph 2

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

2. Safeguards shall consist, in particular, of human oversight and verifications *where appropriate and, in any event*, where a detailed assessment of the relevant context is required in order to determine whether or not the content is to be considered terrorist content.

#### *Amendment*

2. Safeguards shall consist, in particular, of human oversight and verifications *of the appropriateness of the decision to remove or deny access to content, in particular with regard to the right to freedom of expression and information. Human oversight shall be required* where a detailed assessment of the relevant context is required in order to determine whether or not the content is to be considered terrorist content.

**COMP 13** by Rapporteur on Article 10 covering Am. 355 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa), Am. 356 (Helga Trüpel), Am. 357 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Bogusław Sonik), Am. 361 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen) and Am. 362 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa)

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 10 – title**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

Complaint mechanisms

*Amendment*

Complaint **and redress** mechanisms

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 10 – paragraph 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

1. Hosting service providers shall establish effective and accessible mechanisms allowing content providers whose content has been removed or access to it disabled as a result of a referral pursuant to Article 5 or of proactive measures pursuant to Article 6, to submit a complaint against the action of the hosting service provider requesting reinstatement of the content.

*Amendment*

1. ***Without prejudice to the judicial remedies available to content providers under national law***, hosting service providers shall establish ***expeditious***, effective and accessible ***complaints and redress*** mechanisms allowing content providers whose content has been removed or access to it disabled as a result of a referral pursuant to Article 5 or of proactive measures pursuant to Article 6, to submit a ***substantiated*** complaint against the action of the hosting service provider requesting reinstatement of the content.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 10 – paragraph 2**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

2. Hosting service providers shall promptly examine every complaint that they receive and reinstate the content without undue delay where the removal or disabling of access was unjustified. They shall inform the complainant about the outcome of the examination.

*Amendment*

2. Hosting service providers shall promptly examine every complaint that they receive and reinstate the content without undue delay where the removal or disabling of access was unjustified. They shall inform the complainant about the outcome of the examination.

**COMP 14** by Rapporteur on Article 18 covering Am. 44 (Rapporteur), Am. 398 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Boguslaw Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 399 (Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Andrea Bocskor, Marc Joulaud, Boguslaw Sonik, Sabine Verheyen), Am. 402 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Boguslaw Sonik), Am. 404 (Giorgos Grammatikakis, Luigi Morgano) and Am. 405 (Helga Trüpel, Sabine Verheyen)

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – introductory part**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

*Article 18*  
*Penalties*

*Article 18*  
*Penalties*

1. Member States shall ***lay down the rules on*** penalties ***applicable to*** breaches of the obligations by hosting service providers under this Regulation and shall take all necessary measures to ensure that they are implemented. Such penalties shall be limited to infringement of the obligations pursuant to:

1. Member States shall ***establish*** penalties ***for*** breaches of the obligations by hosting service providers under this Regulation and shall take all necessary measures to ensure that they are implemented. Such penalties shall be limited to infringement of the obligations pursuant to:

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point a**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

(a) Article 3(2) (hosting service providers' terms and conditions);

(a) Article 3(2) (hosting service providers' terms and conditions);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point b**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

(b) Article 4(2) and (6) (implementation of and feedback on removal orders);

(b) Article 4(2) and (6) (implementation of and feedback on removal orders);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point c**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

(c) Article 5(5) and (6) (assessment of and feedback on referrals);

(c) Article 5(5) and (6) (assessment of and feedback on referrals);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point d**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(d) Article 6(2) and (4) (reports on proactive measures and the adoption of measures following a decision imposing specific proactive measures);

*Amendment*

(d) Article 6(2) and (4) (reports on proactive measures and the adoption of ***such*** measures following a decision imposing specific proactive measures);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point e**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(e) Article 7 (preservation of data);

*Amendment*

(e) Article 7 (preservation of data);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point f**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(f) Article 8 (transparency);

*Amendment*

(f) Article 8 (transparency);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point g**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(g) Article 9 (safeguards ***in relation to*** proactive measures);

*Amendment*

(g) Article 9 (safeguards ***with regard to the use and implementation of*** proactive measures);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point h**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(h) Article 10 (complaint procedures);

*Amendment*

(h) Article 10 (complaint procedures);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point i**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(i) Article 11 (information to content providers);

*Amendment*

(i) Article 11 (information to content providers);



**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point j**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(j) Article 13 (4) (information on evidence of terrorist offences);

*Amendment*

(j) Article 13 (4) (information on evidence of terrorist offences);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point k**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(k) Article 14 (1) (points of contact);

*Amendment*

(k) Article 14 (1) (points of contact);

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 1 – point l**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(l) Article 16 (designation of a legal representative).

*Amendment*

(l) Article 16 (designation of a legal representative).

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 2**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

2. The penalties provided for shall be effective, proportionate and dissuasive. Member States shall, by [within six months from the entry into force of this Regulation] at the latest, notify the Commission of those rules and of those measures and shall notify it, without delay, of any subsequent amendment affecting them.

*Amendment*

2. The penalties provided for shall be effective, proportionate and dissuasive. Member States shall, by [within six months from the entry into force of this Regulation] at the latest, notify the Commission of those rules and of those measures and shall notify it, without delay, of any subsequent amendment affecting them.

**Proposal for a regulation**

**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – introductory part**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

3. Member States shall ensure that, when determining the type and level of penalties, the competent authorities take into account all relevant circumstances, including:

*Amendment*

3. Member States shall ensure that, when determining the type and level of penalties, the ***relevant*** competent authorities take into account all relevant circumstances, including:

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point a**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(a) the nature, gravity, and duration of the breach;

*Amendment*

(a) the nature, gravity, and duration of the breach;

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point b**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(b) the intentional or negligent character of the breach;

*Amendment*

(b) the intentional or negligent character of the breach;

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point c**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(c) previous breaches by the legal person held responsible;

*Amendment*

(c) previous breaches by the legal person held responsible;

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point d**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(d) the financial strength of the legal person held liable;

*Amendment*

(d) the financial strength of the legal person held liable;

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point e**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(e) the level of cooperation of the hosting service provider with the competent authorities.

*Amendment*

(e) the level of cooperation of the hosting service provider with the **relevant** competent authorities.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 3 – point e a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***(ea) the nature and size of the hosting service providers, in particular microenterprises or small-sized enterprises, within the meaning of the Commission recommendation 2003/361/EC.***

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 18 – paragraph 4**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

4. Member States shall ensure that a systematic failure to comply with obligations pursuant to Article 4(2) is subject to financial penalties of up to **4%** of the hosting service provider's global turnover of the last business year.

*Amendment*

4. Member States shall ensure that a systematic failure to comply with obligations pursuant to Article 4(2) is subject to financial penalties of up to **2%** of the hosting service provider's global turnover of the last business year.

**COMP 15 by Rapporteur on Recital 10 covering Am. 5 (Rapporteur), Am. 91 (Helga Trüpel) and Am. 192 (Helga Trüpel)**

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Recital 10**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(10) In order to cover those online hosting services where terrorist content is disseminated, this Regulation should apply to information society services which store information provided by a recipient of the service at his or her request and ***in making the information stored*** available to ***third parties, irrespective of whether this activity is of a mere technical, automatic and passive nature***. By way of example such providers ***of information society services*** include social media platforms, ***video*** streaming services, ***video***, image and audio sharing services, file sharing and other cloud services to the extent they make the ***information*** available to ***third parties and websites*** where ***users can make comments or post reviews***. The Regulation should also apply to hosting service providers established outside the Union but offering services within the Union, since a significant proportion of hosting service providers exposed to terrorist content on their services are established in third countries. This should ensure that all companies operating in the Digital Single Market comply with the same requirements, irrespective of their country of establishment. The determination as to whether a service provider offers services in the Union

*Amendment*

(10) In order to cover those online hosting services where terrorist content is disseminated, this Regulation should ***only*** apply to information society services which store information provided by a recipient of the service at his or her request and ***make such content*** available to ***the public, which means that the content providers do not predetermine the scope of potential users of the content***. By way of example such providers include ***video-sharing platforms***, social media platforms, streaming services, image and audio sharing services, file sharing ***services, and other cloud and storage services, with the exception of business-to-business cloud hosting service providers***, to the extent they make the ***content*** available to ***the public. For the purpose of this Regulation, web hosting service providers that provide the technical infrastructure to website operators, mere conduits and other electronic communication services, caching services, cloud IT infrastructure services, protection services, other services provided in other layers of the Internet infrastructure, such as registries and registrars, domain name systems (DNS), adjacent services, such as payment services, distributed denial of service (DDoS), protection services, interpersonal***

requires an assessment whether the service provider enables legal or natural persons in one or more Member States to use its services. However, the mere accessibility of a service provider's website or of an email address and of other contact details in one or more Member States taken in isolation should not be a sufficient condition for the application of this Regulation.

***communication services that enable direct interpersonal and interactive exchange of information between a finite number of persons, whereby the persons initiating or participating in the communication determine its recipient(s) should be therefore excluded from its scope. 'Cloud infrastructure services' which consist in the provision of on demand physical or virtual resources that provide computing and storage infrastructure capabilities on which the service provider has no contractual rights as to what content is stored or how it is processed or made publicly available by its customers or by the end-users of such customers, and where the service provider has no technical capability to remove specific content stored by their customers or the end-users of their customers, should also be excluded from the scope of this Regulation.*** The Regulation should also apply to hosting service providers established outside the Union but offering services within the Union, since a significant proportion of hosting service providers exposed to terrorist content on their services are established in third countries. This should ensure that all companies operating in the Digital Single Market comply with the same requirements, irrespective of their country of establishment. The determination as to whether a service provider offers services in the Union requires an assessment whether the service provider enables legal or natural persons in one or more Member States to use its services. However, the mere accessibility of a service provider's website or of an email address and of other contact details in one or more Member States taken in isolation should not be a sufficient condition for the application of this Regulation.

**COMP 16** by Rapporteur on Recital 16 covering Am. 9 (Rapporteur), Am. 116 (Luigi Morgano, Silvia Costa), Am. 119 (Marc Joulaud, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Milan Zver, Boguslaw Sonik), Am. 121 (Giorgos Grammatikakis), Am. 122 (Helga Trüpel)

## Proposal for a regulation

### Recital 16

#### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(16) Given the scale and speed necessary for effectively identifying and removing terrorist content, proportionate proactive measures, including by using automated means in certain cases, are an essential element in tackling terrorist content online. With a view to reducing the accessibility of terrorist content on their services, hosting service providers should assess whether it is appropriate to take proactive measures depending on the risks and level of exposure to terrorist content as well as to the effects on the rights of third parties and the public interest of information. Consequently, hosting service providers should determine what appropriate, effective and proportionate proactive measure should be put in place. This requirement should not imply a general monitoring obligation. In the context of this assessment, the absence of removal orders and referrals addressed to a hosting provider, is an indication of a low level of exposure to terrorist content.

#### *Amendment*

(16) Given the scale and speed necessary for effectively identifying and removing terrorist content, proportionate proactive measures, including by using automated means in certain cases, are an essential element in tackling terrorist content online. With a view to reducing the accessibility of terrorist content on their services, hosting service providers should assess whether it is appropriate, ***effective and proportionate*** to take ***targeted*** proactive measures depending on the risks and level of exposure to terrorist content as well as to the effects on the rights of third parties and the public interest of information. Consequently, hosting service providers should determine what appropriate, effective and proportionate proactive measure should be put in place. This requirement should not imply a general monitoring obligation ***in accordance with Article 15 of Directive 2000/31/EC. This should also be without prejudice to Directive (EU) 2018/1808, which requires video-sharing platforms (VSP) to take measures to protect the general public from content the dissemination of which constitutes an activity which is a criminal offence under Union law.*** In the context of this assessment, the absence of removal orders and referrals addressed to a hosting provider, is an indication of a low level of exposure to terrorist content.

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Recital 17**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(17) When putting in place proactive measures, hosting service providers should ensure that users' right to freedom of expression and information - including to freely receive and impart information - is preserved. In addition to any requirement laid down in the law, including the legislation on protection of personal data, hosting service providers should act with due diligence and implement safeguards, including notably human oversight and verifications, where appropriate, to avoid any unintended and erroneous decision leading to removal of content that is not terrorist content. This is of particular relevance when hosting service providers use automated means to detect terrorist content. Any decision to use automated means, whether taken by the hosting service provider itself or pursuant to a request by the competent authority, should be assessed with regard to the reliability of the underlying technology and the ensuing impact on fundamental rights.

*Amendment*

(17) When putting in place proactive measures, hosting service providers should ensure that users' right to freedom of expression and information - including to freely receive and impart information - is preserved. In addition to any requirement laid down in the law, including the legislation on protection of personal data, hosting service providers should act with due diligence and implement safeguards, including notably human oversight and verifications, where appropriate, to avoid any unintended and erroneous decision leading to removal of content that is not terrorist content. This is of particular relevance when hosting service providers use automated means to detect terrorist content. Any decision to use automated means, whether taken by the hosting service provider itself or pursuant to a request by the The **relevant competent authority** should be assessed with regard to the reliability of the underlying technology and the ensuing impact on fundamental rights. ***Hosting service providers should put in place effective and expeditious complaints and redress mechanisms to address cases of unjustified removals of content.***

**Proposal for a regulation  
Recital 18**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(18) In order to ensure that hosting service providers exposed to terrorist content take appropriate measures to prevent the misuse of their services, the competent authorities should request hosting service providers having received a removal order, which has become final, to report on the proactive measures taken. These could consist of measures to ***prevent the re-upload*** of terrorist content, removed or access ***to it*** disabled as a result of a removal order or referrals they received, checking against publicly or privately-held tools containing known terrorist content. They may also employ the use of reliable technical tools to identify new terrorist content, either using those available on the market or those developed by the hosting service provider. The service provider should report on the specific proactive measures in place in order to allow the competent authority to judge whether the measures are effective and proportionate and whether, if automated means are used, the hosting service provider has the necessary abilities for human oversight and verification. In assessing the effectiveness and proportionality of the measures, competent authorities should take into account relevant parameters including the number of removal orders and referrals issued to the provider, their economic capacity and the impact of its service in disseminating terrorist content (for example, taking into account the number of users in the Union).

*Amendment*

(18) In order to ensure that hosting service providers exposed to terrorist content take appropriate measures to prevent the misuse of their services, the competent authorities should request hosting service providers having received a removal order, which has become final, to report on the proactive measures taken, ***as well as on the functioning of the complaints and redress mechanisms.*** These could consist of measures to **address the reappearance** of terrorist content, **which has been already** removed or **the access of which has been already disabled** as a result of a removal order or referrals they received, checking against publicly or privately-held tools containing known terrorist content. They may also employ the use of reliable technical tools to identify new ***terrorist content, for instance where it uses in part or whole terrorist content that is already subjected to a definitive removal order or where it is uploaded by users who already uploaded*** terrorist content, either using those available on the market or those developed by the hosting service provider. The service provider should report on the specific proactive measures in place in order to allow the competent authority to judge whether the measures are effective and proportionate and whether, if automated means are used, the hosting service provider has the necessary abilities for human oversight and verification. In assessing the effectiveness and proportionality of the measures, competent authorities should take into account relevant parameters including the number of removal orders and referrals issued to the provider, their economic capacity and the impact of its service in disseminating terrorist content (for example, taking into account the number of users in the Union).

**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Recital 38**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(38) Penalties ***are necessary*** to ensure the effective implementation by hosting service providers of the obligations pursuant to this Regulation. Member States should adopt rules on penalties, ***including, where appropriate, fining guidelines.*** ***Particularly*** severe penalties ***shall*** be ascertained in the event that the hosting service provider systematically fails to remove terrorist content or disable access to it ***within one hour from receipt of a removal order.*** Non-compliance in individual cases could be sanctioned while respecting the principles of ne bis in idem and of proportionality and ensuring that such sanctions take account of systematic failure. In order to ensure legal certainty, the regulation should set out to what extent the relevant obligations can be subject to penalties. Penalties for non-compliance with Article 6 should only be adopted in relation to obligations arising from a request to report pursuant to Article 6(2) or a decision imposing additional proactive measures pursuant to Article 6(4). When determining whether or not financial penalties should be imposed, due account should be taken of the financial resources of the provider. Member States shall ensure that penalties do not encourage the removal of content which is not terrorist content.

*Amendment*

(38) ***Member States should establish*** penalties to ensure the effective implementation by hosting service providers of the obligations pursuant to this Regulation. Member States should adopt rules on ***such*** penalties, ***which should be proportionate and practicable, taking into account the size and the nature of the hosting services provider concerned.*** Severe penalties ***should*** be ascertained in the event that the hosting service provider systematically fails to remove terrorist content or disable access to it ***without undue delay. Where a terrorist content is manifestly harmful or constitutes an immediate threat to public order, hosting service providers should remove or disable access to the terrorist content upon receiving of the receipt of a duly justified removal order.*** Non-compliance in individual cases could be sanctioned while respecting the principles of ne bis in idem and of proportionality and ensuring that such sanctions take account of systematic failure, ***but do not encourage the arbitrary removal of content, which is not terrorist content.*** In order to ensure legal certainty, the Regulation should set out to what extent the relevant obligations can be subject to penalties. Penalties for non-compliance with Article 6 should only be adopted in relation to obligations arising from a request to report pursuant to Article 6(2) or a decision imposing additional proactive measures pursuant to Article 6(4). When determining whether or not financial penalties should be imposed, due account should be taken of the financial resources of the provider. Member States shall ensure that penalties do not encourage the removal of content which is not terrorist content.



## II. Oral amendments

### Oral amendment 1 by Emma McClarkin on Am. 57 (Emma McClarkin)

#### Proposal for a regulation

##### Recital 1 a (new)

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

*(1a) Terrorist content is part of a broader problem of illegal content online, which includes other forms of content such as child sexual exploitation, illegal commercial practises and breaches of intellectual property. Trafficking in illegal content is often undertaken by terrorist and other criminal organisations to launder and raise seed money to finance their operations. This problem requires a combination of legislative, non-legislative and voluntary measures based on collaboration between authorities and providers, in the full respect for fundamental rights. Though the threat of illegal content has been mitigated by successful initiatives such as the industry-led Code of Conduct on Hate Speech and the WEePROTECT Global Alliance to end child sexual abuse online, it is necessary to establish a legislative framework for cross-border cooperation between national regulatory authorities to take down illegal content.*

### Oral amendment 2 by Rapporteur on Am. 2 (Rapporteur)

#### Proposal for a regulation

##### Recital 7

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

(7) This Regulation contributes to the protection of public security *while establishing appropriate and robust safeguards to ensure* protection of the fundamental rights at stake. This includes the rights to respect for private life and to the protection of personal data, the right to effective judicial protection, the right to freedom of expression, including the freedom to receive and impart information,

(7) This Regulation contributes to the protection of public security *whilst ensuring* protection of the fundamental rights at stake. This includes the rights to respect for private life and to the protection of personal data, the right to effective judicial protection, the right to freedom of expression, including the freedom to receive and impart information, the freedom to conduct a business, and the

the freedom to conduct a business, and the principle of non-discrimination. Competent authorities and hosting service providers should only adopt measures which are necessary, appropriate and proportionate within a democratic society, ***taking into account the particular importance accorded to the freedom of expression and information, which constitutes one of the essential foundations of a pluralist, democratic society, and is one of the values on which the Union is founded.***

***Measures constituting interference in the freedom of expression and information should be strictly targeted, in the sense that they must serve to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content, but without thereby affecting the right to lawfully receive and impart information, taking into account the central role of hosting service providers in facilitating public debate and the distribution and receipt of facts, opinions and ideas in accordance with the law.***

principle of non-discrimination. Competent ~~judicial~~ authorities and hosting service providers should only adopt measures which are necessary, appropriate and proportionate within a democratic society, ***with due respect for the freedom of expression, the right to share information, as well as media pluralism, which are amongst the essential foundations of a pluralist, democratic society, and the values on which the Union is founded.***

### Oral amendment 3 by Rapporteur on Am. 4 (Rapporteur)

#### Proposal for a regulation

#### Recital 9

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(9) In order to provide clarity about the actions that both hosting service providers and competent authorities should take to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content online, this Regulation should establish a definition of terrorist content ***for preventative purposes*** drawing on the definition of terrorist offences under Directive (EU) 2017/541 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>9</sup>. ***Given the need to address the most harmful terrorist propaganda online, the definition should capture material and information that incites, encourages or advocates the commission or contribution to terrorist offences, provides instructions for the commission of such offences or promotes the participation in activities of a terrorist group. Such information includes in particular*** text, images, sound recordings

##### *Amendment*

(9) In order to provide clarity about the actions that both hosting service providers and competent ~~judicial~~ authorities should take to prevent the dissemination of terrorist content online, this Regulation should establish a definition of terrorist content drawing on the definition of terrorist offences under Directive (EU) 2017/541 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>9</sup>, ***and which*** should ***include*** text, images, sound recordings and videos. Content disseminated for educational, journalistic or research purposes should ***not however be considered as terrorist content, and should therefore be excluded from the scope of this Regulation.*** ***Equally,*** the expression of radical, polemic or controversial views in the public debate on sensitive political questions should not be considered terrorist content.

and videos. *When assessing whether content constitutes terrorist content within the meaning of this Regulation, competent authorities as well as hosting service providers should take into account factors such as the nature and wording of the statements, the context in which the statements were made and their potential to lead to harmful consequences, thereby affecting the security and safety of persons. The fact that the material was produced by, is attributable to or disseminated on behalf of an EU-listed terrorist organisation or person constitutes an important factor in the assessment.* Content disseminated for educational, journalistic or research purposes should *be adequately protected*. *Furthermore*, the expression of radical, polemic or controversial views in the public debate on sensitive political questions should not be considered terrorist content.

---

<sup>9</sup> Directive (EU) 2017/541 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 15 March 2017 on combating terrorism and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/475/JHA and amending Council Decision 2005/671/JHA (OJ L 88, 31.3.2017, p. 6).

---

<sup>9</sup> Directive (EU) 2017/541 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 15 March 2017 on combating terrorism and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/475/JHA and amending Council Decision 2005/671/JHA (OJ L 88, 31.3.2017, p. 6).

#### Oral amendment 4 by Rapporteur on Am. 7 (Rapporteur)

##### Proposal for a regulation Recital 13

###### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(13) *The procedure and obligations resulting from legal orders requesting* hosting service providers to remove *terrorist* content or disable access to it, *following an assessment by the competent authorities, should be harmonised. Member States should remain free as to the choice of the competent authorities allowing them to designate administrative, law enforcement or judicial authorities with that task.* Given the speed at which terrorist content is disseminated across online services, *this provision imposes*

###### *Amendment*

(13) *Competent ~~judicial~~ authorities of the Member States should assess whether content is terrorist content, and to issue a legal order to request* hosting service providers to *either* remove *such* content or *to* disable access to it. Given the speed at which terrorist content is disseminated across online services, hosting service providers *should* ensure that *such* terrorist content identified in the removal order is removed or access to it is disabled *without undue delay after having received* the removal order. It is for the hosting service

**obligations on** hosting service providers **to** ensure that terrorist content identified in the removal order is removed or access to it is disabled **within one hour from receiving** the removal order. It is for the hosting service providers to decide whether to remove the content in question or disable access to the content for users in the Union.

providers to decide whether to remove the content in question or disable access to the content for users in the Union.

## Oral amendment 5 by Rapporteur on Am. 14 (Rapporteur)

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Recital 26

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(26) Effective legal protection according to Article 19 TEU and Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union requires that persons are able to ascertain the reasons upon which the content uploaded by them has been removed or access to it disabled. For that purpose, the hosting service provider should make available to the content provider meaningful information enabling the content provider to contest the decision. **However, this does not necessarily require a notification to the content provider. Depending on the circumstances, hosting service providers may replace content which is considered terrorist content, with a message that it has been removed or disabled in accordance with this Regulation. Further information about the reasons as well as possibilities for the content provider to contest the decision should be given upon request.** Where competent authorities decide that for reasons of public security including in the context of an investigation, it is considered inappropriate or counter-productive to directly notify the content provider of the removal or disabling of content, they should inform the hosting service provider.

##### *Amendment*

(26) **More generally,** effective legal protection according to Article 19 TEU and Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union requires that persons are able to ascertain the reasons upon which the content uploaded by them has been removed or access to it disabled. For that purpose, the hosting service provider should make available to the content provider meaningful information enabling the content provider to contest the decision. Hosting service providers **should, where possible, inform content providers through any means available of any content the hosting service provider has removed. However,** where competent ~~judicial~~ authorities decide that for reasons of public security including in the context of an investigation, it is considered inappropriate or counter-productive to directly notify the content provider of the removal or disabling of content, they should inform the hosting service provider.