

Public hearing on the recognition of parenthood in the European Union

COMMITTEE ON LEGAL AFFAIRS, 14 JUNE 2022











# APPROACH OF (LEGAL PARENTHOOD): BIOLOGICAL REALITY VERSUS FUNCTIONAL REALITY WHO IS THE LEGAL "PARENT"?

IN MOST OF THE CASES THE PERSON WHO GIVES BIRTH (BIOLOGIGAL REALITY) – THE "MOTHER" ("MATER SEMPER CERTA EST")

THE "**FATHER**" WHO IS MARRIED TO THE "MOTHER" (FUNCTIONAL/BIOLOGICAL PRESUMPTION),

THE "FATHER" WHO
ACKNOWLEDGES
PARENTHOOD
(FUNCTIONAL/BIOLOGICAL
PRESUMPTION)

THE "FATHER" THROUGH A
COURT DECISION
(FUNCTIONAL/BIOLOGICAL
PROOF)

(JOINT)/STEP-CHILD Adoption (Functional Reality)

#### DIFFERENT PROVISIONS...

#### CONCERNING LEGAL PARENHOOD



THE TERMS "MOTHER" AND "FATHER" ARE SOMETIMES LINKED TO A SPECIFIC GENDER ASSIGNMENT ("MOTHER" IS A WOMAN, "FATHER" IS A MAN)



SOME COUNTRIES KNOW COMOTHERHOOD (THE FEMALE PARTNER
OF THE BIOLOGICAL MOTHER HAS THE
POSSIBILITY TO BE (AUTOMATICALLY) A
LEGAL PARENT (THROUGH MARRIAGE
[PARENTAL PRESUMPTION],
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT [MEDICAL
TREATMENT IN A CLINIC, HOME
INSEMINATION], STEP-CHILD ADOPTION]



SOME COUNTRIES PROVIDE FOR (JOINT) SAME-SEX ADOPTION (POSSIBILITIES FOR CO-MOTHERHOOD OR CO-FATHERHOOD), ONE **PRE-CONDITION** IS OFTEN THAT THE INTENDED PARENTS ARE **MARRIED** TO EACH OTHER



IN ALL EU MEMBER STATES, LEGAL PARENTHOOD IS **RESERVED FOR TWO PEOPLE**. THIS MIGHT CHANGE IN THE FUTURE (**GERMANY?**, **FRANCE?**)











#### BIRTH CERTIFICATES...

#### FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF A CHILD



An official document issued to record a person's birth and identify them by name, place, date of birth, and parentage (identity and origins of the [legal] parents). It proves that birth registration has occurred (legal identity).

It provides for **general protection** (from
violence, trafficking
etc.), access to social
services, health care,
justice.

It is an official identification for basic transactions: opening a bank account, registering to vote, getting a passport, entering the formal job market etc.

It helps to ensure that children's rights are upheld (identity, name, registration, maintaining contacts to both of its "parents" etc.)













#### CROSS-BORDER HURDLES (IN THEORY AND PRAXIS)



#### **FATHER – MOTHER**

In most of the cases, such a birth certificate will be accepted because it simply reflects the basic (inter)national (joint) conditions



## MOTHER – MOTHER PARENT ONE - TWO

In a lot of countries, such a birth certificate will be an invalid document because of national provisions (public order...)



### MOTHER – MOTHER PARENT ONE - TWO

Even in countries, where co-motherhood is known, the pre-conditions might not match (specific rules on ART, laws of descent)



## FATHER – FATHER PARENT ONE - TWO

In a lot of countries, such a birth certificate can't be recognised (legal adoption provisions, prohibition of surrogacy)

## CASE ONE





ACQUISTION
OF
CITIZENSHIP
FOR A CHILD
(FOREIGNERS)



A birth
certificate will
be presented
to the
countries of
origin of the
parents (i.e.
embassy)



Indicated (legal) comotherhood might be not accepted



The rejection of an "invalid" document might stop the procedure



RESULT: The child remains stateless, at least for a while (BABY SARA)

#### COMMON SCENARIOS...

#### **CASE TWC**





REGISTRATION
OF A FAMILY IN
A HOST
MEMBER STATE
(incl.
CITIZENSHIP)



A birth
certificate
(adoption
document) will
be presented
(i.e. embassy,
national
authorties)



Indicated
(legal) comotherhood or
co-fatherhood
might be not
accepted



The "invalid"
document
might stop the
procedure.
Possibly, there
will be a partial
recognition.



RESULT: The child loses legal ties (to the non-biological parent with all consequences)

#### FURTHER EXPERIENCES...

LEGAL PARENTS
OF CHILDREN
ARE FORCED TO
SIGN
DOCUMENTS TO
ACCEPT THE
LOSS OF
FAMILIAL TIES

LEGAL PARENTS
NEED TO ADOPT
THEIR OWN
CHILDREN
AGAIN (IF
POSSIBLE) – EVEN
IF THEY WERE
ALREADY A
FAMILY FOR
YEARS

LEGAL PARENTS
PAY ALIMONY
BUT CAN'T SEE
THEIR CHILDREN
(COUNTRIES
ISSUE BIRTH
CERTIFICATES
WITH DIFFERENT
CONTENT)

LEGAL PARENTS
DON'T HAVE
ACCESS TO
PARENTAL
LEAVE, TAX
CREDITS... BUT
MIGHT LOSE AT
THE SAME TIME
LEGAL
OBLIGATIONS

LEGAL PARENTS
CAN'T ACT
ANYMORE AS
PARENTS IN
DAILY LIFE
(Signatures for
SCHOOL,
DOCTOR)

CHILDREN'S
RIGHTS AND
BENEFITS ARE AT
RISK (RELATED TO
THE STATUS OF
THEIR PARENTS)







# Where we stand?









I will [...] push for mutual recognition of family relations in the EU. If you are a parent in one country, of course, you are a parent in every country.

URSULA VON DER LEYEN – PRESIDENT OF THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION



<u>State of the European Union 2020</u>: "Building the world we want to live in: A Union of vitality in a world of fragility" (16 September 2020). Follow-up in the new LGBTIQ Equality strategy: <a href="https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip 20 2068">https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip 20 2068</a>

If you have a parent in one country, you should have a parent in every country...

"

QUOTE FROM A DIGITAL CONFERENCE IN LAUSANNE, MAY 2022

CHANGE OF THE PERSPECTIVE...













## OPTION ONE...

MEMBER STATES HARMONISE
THEIR LAWS CONCERNING LEGAL
PARENTHOOD, LGBTIQ\* POLICIES
AND ACCESS TO ASSISTED
REPRODUCTIVE TECHNIQUES.

## OPTION TWO...

THE EU elaborates an instrument to enable the mutual recognition of parenthood/filiation... without changing national provisions!





## LGBTI Equality Strategy 2020-2025

published on 12th of November 2020

Due to differences in national legislations across Member States, family ties may not always be recognised when rainbow families cross the EU's internal borders. The Commission will bring forward a legislative initiative on the mutual recognition of parenthood and explore possible measures to support the mutual recognition of same-gender partnership between Member States

PILLAR THREE OF THE LGBTI EQUALITY STRATEGY:

PROTECTING RIGHTS OF RAINBOW FAMILIES

#### **NELFA'S SUPPORT....**

1. SUCH AN EU-WIDE VALID
INSTRUMENT WILL HELP TO AVOID
THE NON-RECOGNICTION OF BIRTH
CERTIFICATES (LEGAL
PARENTHOOD/FILIATION) PER SE

5. WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT CHILDREN'S RIGHTS AND THEIR BEST INTERESTS ALWAYS WILL BE CONSIDERED IN THE FIRST PLACE (BEFORE LGBTIQ\* ISSUES AND POSSIBLE PREJUDICES...)

2. IT ENABLES CIVIL SERVANTS TO REGISTER CHILDREN (I.E. FOR THE PURPOSE OF OBTAINING CITIZENSHIP OR ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE BEYOND OTHER QUESTIONS)

4. WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT SUCH AN INSTRUMENT WILL BE NOT ONLY FOR "TRAVEL DOCUMENTS/RESIDENCE" BUT FOR ALL OTHER LEGAL PURPOSES AS WELL. FOR US, FREE MOVEMENT IS ABOUT THE RECOGNITION OF A FAMILY AS SUCH.

3. WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE AN IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ECJ JUGDMENTS (BABY SARA - BULGARIA NEEDS TO ISSUE A BIRTH CERTIFICATE WITH TWO MOTHERS. AND COMAN!)

## Thank you for your attention!



#### **NELFA**

... IS THE EUROPEAN PLATFORM OF LGBTIQ\* FAMILIES ASSOCIATIONS, BRINGING TOGETHER LGBTIQ\* PARENTS AND PARENTS-TO-BE FROM ALL OVER EUROPE. NELFA CURRENTLY REPRESENTS 43 ORGANISATIONS IN 33 EUROPEAN COUNTRIES WITH MORE THAN 20,000 MEMBERS. NELFA IS A MEMBER OF ILGA-EUROPE, TRANSGENDER EUROPE AND COFACE FAMILIES EUROPE. WEBSITE: <a href="http://www.nelfa.org">http://www.nelfa.org</a>. Leaflet: <a href="https://bit.ly/2pst8kp">https://bit.ly/2pst8kp</a>. NEWSLETTER: <a href="http://bit.ly/2fcn5c5">https://bit.ly/2pst8kp</a>. NEWSLETTER: <a href="http://bit.ly/2fcn5c5">http://bit.ly/2fcn5c5</a>.

#### MAKE A DONATION

SUPPORT NELFA AND LGBTIQ\* FAMILIES IN EUROPE BY MAKING A DONATION.

BANK: CRELAN, BELGIUM IBAN: BE18 8601 1595 2465 BIC: NICABEBB