European Parliament

2019-2024



Committee on Culture and Education

2023/2112(INI)

20.11.2023

Compromise Amendments

on European historical consciousness (2023/2112(INI))

Committee on Culture and Education

Rapporteur: Niyazi Kizilyürek

CA on citations

CA 35 (horizontal CA covering all citations):

Comprises AMs 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 13

- having regard to Article 165 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to its resolution of 19 September 2019 on the importance of European remembrance for the future of Europe¹,
- having regard to its resolution of 2 April 2009 on European conscience and totalitarianism²,
- having regard to Regulation (EU) 2021/692 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 28 April 2021 establishing the Citizens, Equality, Rights and Values Programme and repealing Regulation (EU) No 1381/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council and Council Regulation (EU) No 390/2014³,
- having regard to its resolution of 11 November 2021 on the European Education Area: a shared holistic approach $(2020/2243(INI))^4$,
- having regard to its resolution of 8 March 2022 on the role of culture, education, media and sport in the fight against racism (2021/2057(INI))⁵,
- having regard to its resolution of 6 April 2022 on the implementation of citizenship education actions $(2021/2008(INI))^6$,
- having regard to its resolution of 14 December 2022 on the implementation of the New European Agenda for Culture and the EU Strategy for International Cultural Relations $(2022/2047(INI))^7$,
- having regard to its resolution of 21 January 2021 on the EU Strategy for Gender Equality (2019/2169(INI))⁸,
- having regard to the Commission communication of 18 September 2020 entitled 'A Union of equality: EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025' (COM(2020)0565),

¹ OJ C 171, 6.5.2021, p. 25.

² OJ C 137 E, 27.5.2010, p. 25.

³ OJ L 156, 5.5.2021, p. 1.

⁴ OJ C 205, 20.5.2022, p. 17.

⁵ OJ C 347, 9.9.2022, p. 15.

⁶ OJ C 434, 15.11.2022, p. 31.

⁷ OJ C 177, 17.5.2023, p. 78.

⁸ OJ C 456, 10.11.2021, p. 208.

- having regard to the Commission communication of 14 June 2016 entitled 'Supporting the prevention of radicalisation leading to violent extremism' $(COM(2016)0379)^9$,
- having regard to the European Cultural Convention of 19 December 1954 10 ,
- having regard to the study conducted for its Committee on Culture and Education entitled 'European Historical Memory: Policies, Challenges and Perspectives'¹¹
- having regard to the study conducted for its Committee on Culture and Education entitled 'European Identity' 12,
- having regard to Rule 54 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Culture and Education (A9-0000/2023),

CAs on recitals

CA 28:

Comprises AM 25

A. whereas Europe's complex, conflict-ridden and contested past poses both a challenge and an opportunity for European integration, acknowledging that a well-informed historical consciousness fosters mutual understanding and tolerance;

CA 29:

Comprises AMs 34, 60, 76

B. whereas gender-, belief- and ethnicity-based injustices have been embedded in European history over many centuries, including in the form of antisemitism and antigypsyism, having consequences for Europe and the rest of the world;

whereas mindful engagement with history and such injustices helps addressing different forms of intolerance and inequality, and building more inclusive societies;

_

⁹ COM(2016) 379 final

¹⁰ https://rm.coe.int/168006457e

¹¹ Study – 'European Historical Memory: Policies, Challenges and Perspectives' (second edition), European Parliament, Directorate-General for Internal Policies of the Union, Policy Department B – Structural and Cohesion Policies, April 2015.

¹² Study – 'European Identity', European Parliament, Directorate-General for Internal Policies of the Union, Policy Department B – Structural and Cohesion Policies, April 2017.

C. whereas history must never be relativised, distorted or falsified for political purposes;

CA 30:

Comprises AM 42

D. whereas historical negationism *and other forms of biased interpretations of history* represent a major threat that kindles distrust and conflict between peoples and nations and undermines efforts to nurture historical justice and reconciliation;

CA 31:

Comprises AM 45

- E. whereas dealing with the past requires utmost impartiality and objectivity and dispassion both in historical scholarship and the political realm;
- F. whereas historical memory incorporates a distinct degree of subjectivity, given that the choice of what to remember and how the past is interpreted necessarily involves value judgements;

CA 32:

Comprises AMs 49, 55, 62, 63, 51

G. whereas while there are 'historical facts' grounded in professional historical work, including research, teaching and the preservation of sources and historical sites, there is no single monolithic, indisputable and everlasting 'historical truth' that one specific group or nation can monopolise and exclusively claim for itself, or use to negate the existence of other peoples, nations or states;

whereas interdisciplinary approaches and contextualisation are essential elements for history education, which needs to be associated with European citizenship education as well as exchange and mobility programmes;

CA 33:

Comprises AMs 58, 59

H. whereas fostering a critical historical consciousness across borders by educational and other means is central for Europeans to be able to *understand* and come to terms with their past, confidently deal with the present and work towards a common future;

CA 34:

Comprises AMs 44, 71

I. whereas European historical consciousness is understood as an individual as well as collective ability and skill to understand, *(self-)* critically assess and *reflectively* learn from history, which facilitates the recognition of the inextricable connection and interdependency between past, present and future;

CAs on paragraphs

CA 1:

Comprises AMs 81, 82, 86, 88

Dealing with Europe's past as a risk and an opportunity

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 1

1. Acknowledges that the diverse and often conflicting histories of European nations and states make any effort to deal with history at a **supranational** political level a difficult and potentially dangerous endeavour, and that attempts to **steer** how to commemorate and interpret the past always prove to be challenging;

CA 2:

Comprises AMs 95, 96

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 2

2. Emphasises the potential of the principle of *historia magistra vitae* and considers especially the *tragic periods and* dark elements of Europe's history not only to be a vigorous reminder of past mistakes whose repetition is to be avoided, but also as a call to work jointly towards democratic and inclusive societies in the Union and globally;

CA 3:

Comprises AMs 99, 100, 101

Motion for a resolution Paragraph 3

3. Considers a responsible, evidence-based and critical *approach to* history, *focussing on common European values*, a *sine qua non* for any democratic body politic, in order to sensitise current and future generations for achievements and aberrations of the past alike, strengthen a self-*reflective* public discourse and foster understanding and reconciliation within and among particular social groups, nations and states;

Politics of the past in the European Union – a critical assessment

CA 4:

Comprises AM 107

Motion for a resolution Paragraph 4

4. Stresses the need for an honest assessment of the EU's 'politics of the past', through which it has striven to add legitimacy to the European project, and strengthen a European sense of belonging and foster the peaceful coexistence of the continent's peoples, by equally acknowledging achievements and existing shortcomings, and of the ways in which citizens have been encouraged to engage with the past;

CA 5:

Comprises AM 110

Motion for a resolution Paragraph 5

5. Acknowledges the array of past and present initiatives at European level to foster a common European historical memory, including the Holocaust Remembrance Day, the European Day of Remembrance for Victims of all Totalitarian and Authoritarian Regimes, the establishment of a dedicated remembrance strand in the former Europe for Citizens and current Citizenship, Equality, Rights and Values (CERV) programmes, and various Parliament resolutions such as the ones of *2 April 2009 on European conscience and totalitarianism and* 19 September 2019 on the importance of European remembrance for the future of Europe;

CA 6:

Comprises AMs 32, 40, 114, 116, 117, 118, 119, 120, 128, 129, 130, 132

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 6

6. Expresses its concern that there continues to be a latent competition and partial incompatibility between different memory frames and remembrance cultures in Europe, including between Western and Eastern Europe, but also between countries and nations within certain parts of the continent; stresses that all European countries have concurring and diverging experiences alike that belong to a shared European history; acknowledges the crimes committed by Nazi, fascist and communist totalitarian regimes as well as under colonialism, and the role these crimes have played in shaping historical perceptions in Europe; emphasises the need to bridge existing regional and ideological divides in historical awareness among European countries and peoples with a view to build a common ground for dialogue as well as mutual understanding and respect;

CA 7:

Comprises AMs 24, 46, 84, 103, 124, 131

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 7

7. Recognises that the horrors of the past serve as a 'negative foundation myth' and provide a strong sense of purpose for the European peace project;

Acknowledges that the Union's concern mainly with narrating a story about itself ex negativo bears the risk of nurturing a teleological and simplistic black-and-white scheme of history which potentially hampers a fully informed understanding of Europe's intricate past and reduces incentives to challenge stereotypes and sacred cows of national histories;

Towards an informed historical consciousness in Europe

CA 8:

Comprises AMs 133, 134, 135, 136

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 8

8. Recognises the need for a broader and more holistic understanding of European history for a critical and self-reflective European historical consciousness to emerge, in particular by widening the focus of current European remembrance initiatives, taking into due account also groups that have been underrepresented so far, and by promoting innovative ways of teaching history;

CA 9:

Comprises AMs 70, 92, 194

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 9

9. Stresses the importance to move away from a European 'remembrance culture' that is predominantly top-down and concerned with defining what Europeans should remember towards a bottom-up and citizens-driven 'culture of remembering' based on common European principles and values, concentrating on developing capacities for a critical reworking of the past at *local*, *regional*, national and European levels, *involving civil society organisations*;

CA 10:

Comprises AMs 31, 35, 36, 75, 147, 148, 149, 150

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 10

10. Acknowledges the crucial importance of approaching Europe's past on the foundation of European core values *enshrined in Article 2 TEU and on the ethical and philosophical traditions that underpin these values*, and of creating an open sphere of discussion that also makes it possible to address difficult elements of national histories and that provides for mutual understanding and reconciliation both within and between European nations, *as well as between European nations and the rest of the world*;

CA 11 (new: Freedom to teach, study and conduct research, including free access to archives and sources)

Comprises AMs 49, 66, 67, 69, 91, 115, 118, 151, 188, 200

Considers the freedom to teach, study and conduct research, including free access to archives and sources, alongside free artistic expression a prerequisite for the generation and dissemination of unbiased and evidence-based knowledge in democratic societies, and for a critical dealing with history in particular;

Asks the Commission and Member States to safeguard those freedoms that are currently at risk, especially due to cases of misappropriation of memory laws, including by means of the EU's rule of law mechanism;

CA 12:

Comprises AMs 160, 161

Motion for a resolution Paragraph 11

11. Stresses the vital role of education and calls on the Member States to update current curricula and teaching methodologies with a view to shifting focus from national towards European and global history and in order to allow for more emphasis on a supranational historical understanding, in particular by allowing for multiple perspectives on history and by fostering corresponding teaching styles that favour reflection and discussion over knowledge transfer and that are guided by the overall objective of making students learn 'how to think' rather than 'what to think';

CA 13 (new: Importance of learning about (the history of) the EU and European citizenship education / EU Manual / EEA)

Comprises AMs 6, 8, 9, 12, 28, 48, 52, 54, 60, 61, 62, 78, 85, 90, 94, 105, 152, 153, 162, 163, 164, 185, 187, 204

Underscores the vital importance of learning about European integration, the history, institutions and fundamental values of the Union, as well as European citizenship for a European sense of belonging to emerge, and asks for the teaching of European history and integration in a global context as well as for European citizenship education to become integral part of national education systems; acknowledges efforts made at EU level to improve knowledge about the Union and its history, including Jean Monnet Actions; calls on the Commission and Member States, including through the European Education Area's Working Group on Equality and Values, to work on deliverables that address specifically the development of European historical consciousness, and to develop jointly an 'EU manual' in curricular activities providing common guidelines as well as impartial facts and figures for the teaching of European history;

CA 14 (new: Chauvinism, gender-stereotypes, power-asymmetries and structural inequalities in history, and the need for a multi-cultural and gender-sensitive approach to history)

Comprises AMs 1, 2, 3, 34, 53, 55, 74, 147, 181

Considers chauvinism, gender-stereotypes, power-asymmetries and structural inequalities to be deeply rooted in European history, and regrets the lack of a sufficiently multi-cultural and gender-sensitive approach in the teaching of history; deems it vital to address the marginalisation of women and other underrepresented societal groups in history, and calls on the Member States to provide for a stronger corresponding focus in national curricula;

CA 15 (new: Innovative ways of teaching history and learning about the past)

Comprises AMs 55, 66, 102, 108, 111, 168, 134, 142, 156, 169, 173, 174, 185

Stresses the need for interdisciplinary and intersectional history teaching that applies innovative and learner-centred pedagogy such as interactive, storytelling and lessons-learned approaches for all generations, makes use of a comprehensive set of sources, technologies and learning materials, including cross-border and trans-national history textbooks and oral histories, and promotes analytical and critical thinking skills;

CA 16 (new: The role of teachers' training and professional development)

Comprises AMs 93, 167, 171, 174, 180, 185

Recognises the central role played by teachers in the generation and transmission of competencies required to understand and critically assess historical facts, and emphasises the importance of teachers to benefit not only from adequate training, but also continuous professional development, including peer-learning activities and the sharing of best practices both at national and trans-national level; underlines, in this context, the added value of the Erasmus+ Teacher Academies:

CA 17:

Comprises AMs 169, 170

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 12

12. Calls on the Member States to provide tailor-made (history) teaching materials and training that enables teachers to better focus on transnational aspects and the multifacetedness of history, imparts adequate didactics and principles of modern teaching and is primarily concerned with forming self-reflective young people;

CA 18 (new: Collecting data and comparing as well as valorising methods and tools for teaching history)

Comprises AMs 67, 97, 145, 193

Emphasises that there is great value in collecting data and comparing as well as valorising methods and tools for teaching history, and welcomes the work of both specialised governmental and non-governmental organisations active in this area, including the Council of Europe's Observatory on History Teaching in Europe and EUROCLIO; recalls the need for the participation of more EU Member States in the Observatory;

CA 19 (new: House of European History)

Comprises AMs 68, 104, 106

Acknowledges the potential of museums critically addressing Europe's contested history as a tool for learning about the past and building historical awareness, in particular of the 'House of European History' as a flagship project for which sufficient resources should be made available in order to ensure a wider outreach to the European public;

CA 20 (new: The importance of preserving cultural heritage and memory sites)

Comprises AMs 18, 27, 29, 64, 65, 83, 141, 143, 144, 154, 182, 194

Stresses the importance of preserving Europe's rich cultural and historical heritage and of memorial sites in particular as a means serving the construction of a critical historical consciousness provided they are not abused for ideological purposes, and highlights the role that the European Heritage Label and independent institutions promoting European heritage both tangible and intangible can play in this regard;

Encourages Member States to step up efforts to defining and protecting places of democratic memory, especially those related to underrepresented groups;

Emphasises the potential of Europeana and its serving as Europe's digital library, archive, museum and education platform;

CA 21 (new: Digital media/digitalisation and the risks of misuse of historical narratives through digital channels, with a particular focus on Russia)

Comprises AMs 11, 21, 41, 43, 80, 93, 98, 121, 171

Acknowledges the potential of digital media and the rising level of digitalisation in education, while expressing its deep concern about digital channels being increasingly abused for political manipulation and the circulation of disinformation also concerning history, as highlighted by Russian historical revisionism accompanying its war of aggression against Ukraine;

Calls on the Commission and Member States to step up efforts to strengthen media and digital literacy and to endow both teachers and students with adequate skills and tools facilitating fact-based history teaching, and enabling them to identify, contextualise and analyse traditional as well as modern historical sources;

CA 22 (new: The role of European programmes and other mobility schemes to strengthen historical consciousness)

Comprises AMs 63, 112, 172, 175, 176, 180, 183, 184, 185, 186

Stresses that learning mobility opportunities across borders provided by European

programmes and other mobility schemes favour the exchange of ideas and promote transversal knowledge as well as inter-cultural understanding, helping to break down national barriers and providing a better understanding of past and present;

CA 23:

Comprises AMs 177, 178, 179

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 13

13. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to strengthen the tools currently available at European level in order to foster a critical *and self-reflective* European historical consciousness, in particular the Erasmus+ programme, which supports mobility and intercultural learning as key tools to increase understanding of other cultures and nations, and the CERV programme, which provides support for transnational historical remembrance projects and promotes civic engagement;

CA 24:

Comprises AMs 39, 43, 107, 189, 190, 191, 192

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 14

14. Requests that the European institutions, the Member States, candidate and prospective candidate countries, educational institutions and civil-society actors step up efforts to foster reconciliation and abstain from any attempt to instrumentalise history for political purposes and fight historical revisionism and denialism both in the European Union and beyond; recalls the importance of these aspects for future enlargements of the Union;

Outlook: the legacy of the past and the EU's future

15. Espouses the ideal of a 'culture of remembering' and historical consciousness based on shared European values and practices in approaching the past, yet at the same time avoiding any undue levelling or simplification of history;

CA 25:

Comprises AM 196

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 16

16. Expresses its hope that on the basis of critical self-reflection relating to history and historical responsibility at national level, a truly European reflective discourse on the

continent's past may emerge, with history not being abused for power-political purposes, and expresses its hope that a 'community of destiny' among European peoples will emerge from common historical work;

CA 26:

Comprises AM 203

Motion for a resolution

Paragraph 17

17. Envisions collective memories eventually contributing to and merging into a European public sphere, with *diverging* remembrance cultures complementing each other rather than being in competition, and dealings with history becoming an issue of civic rather than political action;

CA 27 (new: Horizontal CA deleting AMs referring to specific or unrelated examples)

Comprises AMs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 11, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 30, 31, 41, 83, 84, 92, 113, 133, 165, 186