EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2004 *2009*

Session document

A6-0086/2009

23.2.2009

REPORT

on the challenge of deterioration of agricultural land in the EU and in particular in southern Europe: the response through EU agricultural policy instruments (2008/2219(INI))

Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development

Rapporteur: Vincenzo Aita

Rapporteur (*): Inés Ayala Sender
Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety

(*) Associated committee – Rule 47 of the Rules of Procedure

PR_INI

CONTENTS

Page

MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

on the challenge of deterioration of agricultural land in the EU and in particular in southern Europe: the response through EU agricultural policy instruments (2008/2219(INI))

The European Parliament,

– having regard to the UN Convention to Combat Desertification and the UN Convention on Biological Diversity,

– having regard to its legislative resolution of 14 November 2007 on the proposal for a directive of the European Parliament and of the Council establishing a framework for the protection of soil and amending Directive 2004/35/EC[1],

– having regard to its resolution of 9 October 2008 on addressing the challenge of water scarcity and droughts in the European Union[2],

– having regard to Rule 45 of its Rules of Procedure,

– having regard to the report of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development and the opinion of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety (A6-0086/2009),

A. whereas farming is an economic sector that is heavily dependent on natural phenomena and, at the same time, offers extensive scope for intervention,

B. whereas agriculture is the best means of preventing soil deterioration, and whereas this calls for a reasoned strategy that will help maintain this activity,

C. having regard to the role of farmers in Europe in fighting desertification, to the key role of European producers in preserving surface vegetation in areas affected by persistent drought, and to the particular benefits afforded by permanent crops, meadows and woodlands for the capturing of water,

D. whereas, in particular, agricultural soils in southern Europe and other regions of the Union's Member States are at the centre of a process of environmental degradation brought about by negative interactions between human activity and climate events,

E. whereas over-intensive farming can contribute to soil erosion, rendering it non-productive,

F. whereas desertification is now considered to be one of the most significant threats in terms of land deterioration in the Mediterranean countries,

G. whereas soil is the basis for the production of human foodstuffs, fodder, textiles and fuels, and whereas it plays an important role in CO2 capture; whereas, however, soil is now

[1] OJ C 282, 6.11.2008, p. 281.
[2] *Texts adopted*, P6_TA(2008)0473.

more than ever at risk of irreversible damage caused by wind and laminar erosion, pollution, salinisation, sealing, depletion of organic substances and the loss of soil biodiversity,

H. whereas the adverse effects identified to date are disruption of the hydrogeological balance, the infiltration of seawater into coastal aquifers, soil salinisation, agricultural land loss, a reduction in biodiversity and greater vulnerability to fire, plant disease and animal disease,

I. whereas the above changes in the interaction between the natural/human environment and agricultural production are having a major impact on arable and livestock farming systems, agricultural land use and the supply of foodstuffs, with obvious repercussions for food security, and the social, cultural and economic structures of the areas concerned as a result of population exodus, as well as hydro-geological repercussions,

J. whereas irrigation also serves to maintain soil humidity and to recharge aquifers, and whereas these factors should be taken into account when shaping the common agricultural policy (CAP),

K. recalling that water shortages and drought result in even higher prices for agricultural raw materials, and aware of the need to ensure secure food supplies for the population,

L. whereas farming and forestry management provides opportunities for action to affect the overall carbon balance that can help to reduce greenhouse gas emissions,

M. recalling the existence of the United Nations Convention to combat desertification in countries experiencing serious drought and/or desertification, particularly in Africa, adopted in 1994, whose objective is to combat the deterioration of arable land and drought, and recalls Parliament's support for this convention,

N. recognising the role of the Water Framework Directive (Directive 2000/60/EC) as a regulatory framework and a basic instrument for soil protection, promoting interregional cooperation, the sustainable use of water and the protection of available water resources whilst at the same time helping to mitigate the effects of floods and drought,

O. whereas an integrated, multidisciplinary approach is required in order to avoid being forced to look for emergency solutions, which can generate further adverse impacts and damaging chain reactions,

P. whereas the situation needs to be monitored to identify changes in existing phenomena and the emergence of new risk situations, making specialised use of satellite readings and geological and biochemical models (mapping),

Q. whereas extreme weather conditions have become more common, with an alternation between periods of drought and extreme rainfall events, which speed up lithosphere degradation processes, in particular in areas where soils are structurally more vulnerable in both northern and southern Europe,

R. whereas there has been a worldwide increase in food demand and prices,

1. Considers that CAP guidelines and management methods should explicitly include principles and instruments for climate protection in general and reduction of damage resulting from soil degradation in particular;

2. Considers it necessary to strengthen the parameters for eco-conditionality and their application throughout the European Union, above all as regards biodiversity and organic matter in soils, and to extend them to cover water protection;

3. Stresses that Community funding for measures to adjust the agricultural sector to climate change must be based on a territorial approach which takes account of the level of vulnerability of the EU regions; points out that, according to reliable assessments at international and European level, the agricultural soils of southern Europe are more susceptible to climate change;

4. Regrets the short-sighted attitude of the heads of state and government in deciding to reduce funding for rural development; notes that the resources provided for under the second pillar are too limited for tackling the new challenges arising from climate change; suggests that the Commission consider the introduction of a specific fund for financing preventive actions which would benefit all economic sectors concerned, including agriculture;

5. Considers that the present problems, including food shortages, water scarcity, the rise of temperatures and evapotranspiration and the risk of soil degradation, require new, integral and scientific agricultural policies applicable to Mediterranean climatic conditions, and that, with the help of European Union and national institutions, these policies need to reflect research and development on crops locally adapted to the new environmental challenges, in areas including water saving, while giving enough revenue to farmers to maintain a European standard of living;

6. Takes the view that, within the context of soil conservation strategy, the 'good agricultural and environmental condition' principles established under the CAP should lay greater emphasis on measures to check and improve the operability and ecological sustainability of existing drainage systems by drawing up ecologically sustainable water management plans geared to local conditions and advising farmers in drought-threatened areas on the successful cultivation of water-saving crops suited to local conditions;

7. Believes that the EU should provide greater support for improving water management in respect of agricultural land; stresses that this will necessitate creating incentives for introducing more efficient irrigation systems adapted to different crops, promoting appropriate research, and encouraging ways of building on advances in biotechnology;

8. Considers that 'micro' reservoirs for irrigation (hill reservoirs) and for firefighting, to be managed by the relevant local agencies, should be build above areas requiring irrigation, thus enabling gravity to be used so as to keep operating costs to a minimum, with use being made, wherever possible, of urban waste water treated using plant-based and surface impoundment techniques;

9. Notes the importance of terraces in combating erosion and increasing the water storage capacity of soil and considers that measures should be taken to maintain, restore and build

them;

10. Takes the view that agricultural and forestry systems should include programmes for the forestation of marginal and/or polluted farm land, given that shrub roots can anchor the unstable upper layer to the stable underlying rock, which acts as a purifying substrate;

11. Advocates a Community forestry policy grounded primarily in the need to tackle climate change;

12. Believes it is also necessary to encourage agricultural measures aimed at ensuring the preservation of surface vegetation, so as to prevent salinisation of groundwaters arising from erosion;

13. Points out that many Mediterranean shrub species have good fire resistance properties and excellent vegetal recovery capacities and should therefore be promoted, particularly since their root systems are well-suited to the task of combating soil erosion;

14. Takes the view that, to this end, the aim should be to cultivate varieties which require less water or, in certain circumstances, to replace spring crops with winter crops, which not only require less irrigation but also effectively protect the soil by means of vegetative cover during the critical erosion period of winter;

15. Takes the view that local nurseries are able to produce ecotypes that are better suited to the local environment, and that specific measures should be taken to encourage them to do so;

16. Calls for the promotion of the preservation and planting of hedgerows, particularly in areas where these have been lost over recent years;

17. Acknowledges the important role which plant genetic resources can play in helping land management adjust to changing climatic conditions; calls on the Commission and the Member States, therefore, to draw up programmes to foster the conservation and further development of plant genetic resources by farmers and gardeners and by small- and medium-sized nurseries;

18. Points to the importance of set-aside areas for the recovery of agricultural land and for water retention; calls on the Commission and the Member States concerned to encourage agricultural systems that are adapted to the land in Mediterranean ecosystems;

19. Considers that, among the criteria for retaining organic matter in soil, the CAP ‘good agricultural and environmental condition’ principles should provide incentives for carbon absorption and fixation based on optimum use of dryland farming techniques (minimum tilling, crop rotation, genotypes suited to the local environment, evapotranspiration control, targeted fertilisation, integrated control, etc.);

20. Calls on the relevant bodies at territorial level to gear irrigation water management plans and usage techniques to the new environmental requirements and conditions, to ensure that targeted, quality-based, use is made of water resources and to take steps to ensure that irrigation water management bodies optimise the management of available water

resources, taking account of the need to reduce waste in water distribution systems;

21. Advocates the creation of a Community drought monitoring centre and the reinforcement of the Union's coordinated reaction capacity in facing forest fires, given that both phenomena are major causes of desertification and the deterioration of agricultural land, especially in the Mediterranean regions;

22. Keenly awaits the creation of the European observatory and early warning system on drought and underlines the need to improve the effectiveness of information supplied by Member States and the coordination between them;

23. Recommends the development of a rapid alert and continuous surveillance system for soil conditions so that timely action can be taken to combat erosion, the depletion of organic matter resulting in greenhouse gas emissions and the loss of arable land and biodiversity;

24. Calls on the Commission, in connection with the proposal for a new definition of mountain areas and other areas with natural handicaps it is to submit in 2009, to include among the priority evaluation criteria the level of risk of soil degradation and desertification in the areas subject to monitoring;

25. Considers it necessary to strengthen research, development and innovation, paying particular attention to the areas most affected by water scarcity and drought and taking account of biotechnological progress;

26. Calls on the Commission to look into, during the mid-term review of the Seventh Framework Programme scheduled for 2009, the provision of greater incentives to support research and development programmes conducted by more than one Member State and aimed at improving knowledge with a view to ensuring more sustainable management of soils and areas affected by degradation;

27. Asks the Commission to consider the need to create a financial instrument to combat the causes and effects of climatic change, in particular soil deterioration.

28. Considers that appropriate training and refresher programmes should be provided for both those working in the sector and the general public, with the dual aim of seeking specific solutions and raising user awareness of the shared responsibility for environmental resource use;

29. Calls on the Union to implement information and training measures aimed in particular at young farmers with a view to promoting the introduction of agricultural techniques favourable to soil conservation, especially regarding the impact of climate change and the role played by farming in climate;

30. Recalls, in line with its resolution of 5 June 2008 on the future for young farmers under the ongoing reform of the CAP[1], that priority should be given, in the allocation of project funding, to activities that can encourage young people to set up in farming;

[1] *Texts adopted,* P6_TA(2008)0258.

31. Considers that the Union should strengthen and improve feed and food autonomy and self-sufficiency, including by ensuring better protection for agricultural soils and their productivity; and, in particular, by fostering the sustainable use of grassland for stock farming (by means of free-range meat programmes, premiums to reward grazing practices consistent with nature conservation, etc.) in order to achieve a greater degree of feed autonomy; takes the view that, with a view to contributing to food security and sustainability throughout the world, agricultural policy must seek to strike a balance between plant production, animal production and energy production in the EU farming industry;

32. Calls, in the framework of a global CO_2 market, for the promotion of the preservation and regeneration of forests and reafforestation using mixed species, primarily in Member States which have lost their natural forest heritage, and underlines the need to launch an integrated, sustainable forest management system in the European Union;

33. Underlines the role of forests in the water cycle and the importance of a balanced mix of forests, grassland, pasture and crop land for sustainable water management; highlights, in particular, the role of soils with high organic content and adapted crop rotation; warns that the increasing exploitation of land is a threat to agriculture, food security and sustainable water management;

34. Calls, with reference to farming activities relating to the maintenance of fields, permanent grazing land and wooded areas, for it to be made possible for the issue of green certificates to be tied to the production of public goods (carbon dioxide storage, biodiversity, soil conservation);

35. Calls on the Member States to use the second pillar of the CAP in order to award premiums for farming activities relating to the maintenance of fields, permanent grazing land and wooded areas and, in this way, to contribute to the production of public goods (carbon dioxide storage, biodiversity, soil conservation); calls on the Commission to treat the maintenance of grassland as a priority;

36. Urges the Council to adopt a common position on the proposal (COM(2006)0232) for a framework directive on soil protection so that a Community instrument can be introduced which will enable these dangers to be combated;

37. Calls on the Council and Commission to explore strategies for the recovery of damaged soil on the basis of incentive measures to limit soil deterioration;

38. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council, the Commission and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

Introduction

Agricultural soil is defined as that part of the lithosphere given over to growing or rearing activities conducted primarily for food production purposes. In addition to enabling food to be produced, agricultural soils perform a variety of important functions,

- creating a link between the atmosphere, water resources and geological systems,
- filtering substances of various kinds dissolved in water, and accumulating particles deposited by the atmosphere,
- acting as carbon sinks, owing to the capacity of crops to fix atmospheric CO2 by means of chlorophyll photosynthesis and to store it in the rhizosphere,
- regulating rainfall,
- interacting with the climate to determine what types of crop may be grown,
- influencing landscape forms and features,
- supporting various habitats and biological diversity by supplying water and nutrients,
- providing the environment required for the conservation of seeds and the survival of micro- and macro-organisms,
- and playing an important social and cultural role.

It is clear that the interaction between agricultural soils, water and air determines the operation of a unique system, the primary aim of which must be the development of a sustainable form of agriculture capable of reducing pollution and environmental degradation and providing environmental services and goods, while at the same time maintaining its production capacity. While agriculture is affected by other production systems, it is also responsible for the sound management of this important and non-renewable natural resource.

Current situation

The data collected at various levels show that agricultural soils are being subjects to ever increasing environmental pressure. The adverse effects identified to date include: disruption of the hydrogeological balance; rising sea levels and the resulting salinisation of soils; agricultural land loss; and a greater incidence of damage caused by fire, plant disease and animal disease. These changes are having a major impact on soil use and productivity, which are of particular relevance to food security. Although soil protection provisions exist in the Community *acquis*, at present there is no specific Community legislation on soil protection that meets the new requirements in this area. Given the broad scope of the objectives, the wide variety of spheres of application and the fact that strategies for action in the agricultural

sector often cover other environmental sectors as well, the current legislative framework and provisions need to improve the range and nature of measures available, which must be cross-border in scope. For example, should soil degradation in a given area have repercussions in placed far removed from that area, the cost of remedying the damage could be borne by a country other than the country that caused it. There is therefore a need for an integrated, multidisciplinary approach based on the broadest possible programme for monitoring and assessing the progress of degradation processes, using satellite sensing and mapping systems.

Purpose of report

An assessment of the current situation has been conducted, with special attention being paid to farm land in southern Europe, where a number of soil degradation processes are already clearly apparent. In the light of this situation, the scope for action within the agricultural sector to combat the degradation of agricultural soil and ensure its recovery and, at the same time, sustainable use and management of the lithosphere, was explored. Against this background, Parliament held a public hearing to foster dialogue on the various issues at hand, which enabled the rapporteur to draw on the various proposals put forward. The aim of this report is to set out pointers, ideas and practical proposals for consideration in due course with a view to formulating a common strategy for the recovery, conservation and improvement of agricultural soils. It is clear, furthermore, that one of the priorities must be to draw up a common action plan, including a schedule for action to prevent degradation and protect agricultural soils. The morphological and pedological features of soils in southern Europe provide a foretaste of what could occur in various farming environments in northern Europe in future. Southern areas could be affected by gradual desertification, while rainfall could decline significantly in northern areas, which will require appropriate adjustments to be made to the hydrogeological system that has been developed over the course of centuries.

Scope for action

The way in which agricultural soils are used and managed can clearly play a vital role in, among other things, our response to the ‘new challenges" (climate change, renewable energies, water shortages, biodiversity, etc.). The legal instruments available and the scope for action within the agricultural sector therefore need to be looked at from a new angle within the CAP guidelines and management methods.

In this connection, Parliament has already demonstrated its willingness to address food security issues. The rapporteur considers that account should also be taken of the concept of production autonomy, requiring the availability of a number of productive inputs enabling business decisions to be made with a greater degree of freedom.

Approaches to combating soil degradation must include a strategy for soil conservation focusing greater attention on the hydraulic systems used in agriculture and the maintenance of those systems. It is interesting to note in particular that, in view of the above situation, the use of irrigation water collection and distribution systems will become increasingly costly. New and/or modified irrigation methods will accordingly need to be brought to bear to reduce irrigation volumes by optimising water extraction from aquifers. There is therefore a particularly urgent need to reduce water losses along irrigation lines.

As part of efforts to protect soil ecosystems and combat soil degradation, particular attention

will need to be paid to forestation programmes. In this connection, the use of Mediterranean shrub species in southern Europe can make an effective contribution in combating both erosion and fires. To this end, 'micro' irrigation water reservoirs need to be built and managed by the relevant local agencies for the dual purpose of collecting rainwater, which will enable fresh water to be used to put out fires, and collecting and recycling urban waste water using plant-based and surface impoundment techniques in inland areas where treatment plants are not always financially viable.

Dryland farming techniques are of particular importance and include minimum tilling, which can halt the rise of capillary water, crop rotation practised with a view to soil improvement and/or to combating plant diseases, the use of genotypes better suited to the local environment and not solely geared to meeting commercial requirements, and methods for controlling evapotranspiration (which can result in the loss of large volumes of soil water) involving the systematic use of improvement techniques (soil structure optimisation) or vegetation.

Geographical information systems (GIS) can be a useful means of assessing and monitoring soil developments. In this connection, it will be necessary to standardise the relevant data, the interpretation of which will involve the use and cross-checking of geological and biochemical models.

Accordingly, in its proposal for a new definition of mountain areas and areas with natural handicaps, the Commission should include among the priority parameters the state of conservation of soils and the related desertification risks. Similarly, during the mid-term review of the Seventh Framework Programme, greater encouragement should be given to research into means of combating soil degradation. The aim is to optimise production techniques in the light of the new requirements and to seek new solutions that make water savings a priority and can thus reduce the amount of energy required to produce foodstuffs.

It should be pointed out that training and refresher programmes must be aimed not only at those working in the sector but also at the general public, with the dual aim of seeking specific solutions and raising public awareness of the need for more sustainable use of natural resources and of the environment as a whole, whose present and future wellbeing is our shared responsibility.

In keeping with the principle of generational change within the farming community and the need for a more dynamic approach on farms, priority in the allocation of funding for projects for the recovery and sustainable management of agricultural soils should be given to undertakings run by young farmers.

In a situation where millions of people have been hit by the world food crisis, the immediate effect of which has been to make food production planning and management unworkable, it should be stressed that soil protection is a means of safeguarding our production potential, which is of political and strategic importance, of maintaining an import-export balance and of ensuring a degree of autonomy and negotiating leeway in multilateral forums.

Given that agricultural activities as a whole, and in particular those involving forests, fields and grazing land, are an area in which action can be taken to influence the functioning of an entire ecosystem, once it has been recognised that the agricultural sector as a whole produces goods of general public interest, green certificates could be issues in respect of agricultural

activities. This could have the threefold effect of fostering wider use of sustainable production methods, creating a market for green-certificate trading and not costing the taxpayer a penny.

28.1.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE ENVIRONMENT, PUBLIC HEALTH AND FOOD SAFETY

for the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development

on the challenge of deterioration of agricultural land in the EU and in particular in Southern Europe: the response through EU agricultural policy instruments
(2008/2219(INI))

Rapporteur (*): Inés Ayala Sender

(*) Associated committee - Rule 47 of the Rules of Procedure

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety calls on the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

1. whereas soil is the basis for the production of human foodstuffs, fodder, textiles and fuels, and whereas it plays an important role in CO_2 capture; whereas, however, soil is now more than ever at risk of irreversible damage caused by wind and laminar erosion, pollution, salinisation, sealing, depletion of organic substances and the loss of soil biodiversity,

2. Calls, as agriculture is the best means of preventing soil deterioration, for a reasoned strategy that will help maintain this activity;

3. Urges the Council to adopt its common position on the framework directive on soil protection so that a Community instrument can be introduced which will enable these dangers to be combated;

4. Calls, as irrigation also serves to maintain soil humidity and to recharge aquifers, for these factors to be taken into account when shaping the common agricultural policy;

5. Considers it necessary to improve the training of farmers, particularly young farmers, especially regarding the impact of climate change and the role played by farming in climate;

6. Advocates more European Union support for improving water management on agricultural land and livestock farms, providing incentives for water-efficient irrigation facilities and systems and the development of drought-resistant crops;

7. Considers that the present problems, including food shortages, water scarcity, the rise of temperatures and evapotranspiration and the risk of soil degradation, require new, integral and scientific agricultural policies applicable to Mediterranean climatic conditions, and that, with the help of EU and national institutions, these policies need to reflect research and development on crops locally adapted to the new environmental challenges, in areas including water saving, while giving enough revenue to farmers to maintain a European standard of living;

8. Takes the view that the integrated management of water resources in agriculture must include strategies for modernising and improving the use and management of water, and for rationalising and limiting water consumption;

9. Recommends the development of a rapid alert and continuous surveillance system for soil conditions so that timely action can be taken to combat erosion, the depletion of organic matter resulting in greenhouse gas emissions and the loss of arable land and biodiversity;

10. Considers it necessary to strengthen research, development and innovation, paying particular attention to the areas most affected by water scarcity and drought and taking account of biotechnological progress;

11. Calls for the promotion of the preservation and planting of hedgerows, particularly in areas where these have been lost over recent years;

12. Points to the importance of set-aside areas for the recovery of agricultural land and for water retention; calls on the Commission and the Member States concerned to encourage agricultural systems that are adapted to the land in Mediterranean ecosystems and measures aimed at the efficient use of water;

13. Calls on the Council and Commission to explore strategies for the recovery of damaged soil on the basis of incentive measures to limit soil deterioration;

14. Keenly awaits the creation of the European observatory and early warning system on drought and underlines the need to improve the effectiveness of information supplied by Member States and the coordination between them;

15. Recalls the existence of the United Nations Convention to combat desertification in countries experiencing serious drought and/or desertification, particularly in Africa, adopted in 1994, whose objective is to combat the deterioration of arable land and drought, and recalls Parliament's support for this convention;

16. Recognises the role of the Water Framework Directive (Directive 2000/60/EC) as a regulatory framework and a basic instrument for soil protection, promoting interregional cooperation, the sustainable use of water and the protection of available water resources whilst at the same time helping to mitigate the effects of floods and drought;

17. Calls, in the framework of a global CO_2 market, for the promotion of the preservation and regeneration of forests and reafforestation using mixed species, primarily in Member States which have lost their natural forest heritage, and underlines the need to launch an integrated, sustainable forest management system in the European Union;

18. Considers it necessary to strengthen the parameters for eco-conditionality and their application throughout the European Union, above all as regards biodiversity and organic matter in soils, and to extend them to cover water protection;

19. Highlights the contribution made by European farmers to combating soil erosion and desertification and seeks recognition of the pivotal role played by European producers in preserving plant cover in regions affected by persistent drought or threatened by wind-blown sand; emphasises the specific benefits of permanent crops, orchards and vineyards, meadows, pasture and forestry for water collection;

20. Underlines the role of forests in the water cycle and the importance of a balanced mix of forests, grassland, pasture and crop land for sustainable water management; highlights, in particular, the role of soils with high organic content and adapted crop rotation; warns that the increasing exploitation of land is a threat to agriculture, food security and sustainable water management.

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	22.1.2009
Result of final vote	+: 42 –: 4 0: 1
Members present for the final vote	Adamos Adamou, Georgs Andrejevs, Liam Aylward, Maria Berger, John Bowis, Frieda Brepoels, Martin Callanan, Dorette Corbey, Magor Imre Csibi, Chris Davies, Avril Doyle, Mojca Drčar Murko, Edite Estrela, Jill Evans, Anne Ferreira, Karl-Heinz Florenz, Elisabetta Gardini, Cristina Gutiérrez-Cortines, Satu Hassi, Jens Holm, Marie Anne Isler Béguin, Caroline Jackson, Dan Jørgensen, Christa Klaß, Urszula Krupa, Marie-Noëlle Lienemann, Peter Liese, Jules Maaten, Linda McAvan, Riitta Myller, Miroslav Ouzký, Vladko Todorov Panayotov, Dimitrios Papadimoulis, Vittorio Prodi, Frédérique Ries, Guido Sacconi, Daciana Octavia Sârbu, Amalia Sartori, Richard Seeber, Bogusław Sonik, María Sornosa Martínez, Thomas Ulmer, Anja Weisgerber, Glenis Willmott
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Inés Ayala Sender, Iles Braghetto, Philip Bushill-Matthews

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	17.2.2009
Result of final vote	+: 23 –: 6 0: 3
Members present for the final vote	Niels Busk, Luis Manuel Capoulas Santos, Giovanna Corda, Albert Deß, Constantin Dumitriu, Michl Ebner, Carmen Fraga Estévez, Lutz Goepel, Friedrich-Wilhelm Graefe zu Baringdorf, Esther Herranz García, Lily Jacobs, Elisabeth Jeggle, Heinz Kindermann, Vincenzo Lavarra, Stéphane Le Foll, Véronique Mathieu, Mairead McGuinness, Rosa Miguélez Ramos, María Isabel Salinas García, Sebastiano Sanzarello, Agnes Schierhuber, Willem Schuth, Czesław Adam Siekierski, Alyn Smith, Petya Stavreva, Donato Tommaso Veraldi
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Béla Glattfelder, Wiesław Stefan Kuc, Astrid Lulling, Maria Petre, Markus Pieper, Struan Stevenson, Vladimír Železný
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Hélène Goudin, Ewa Tomaszewska, Peter Šťastný