EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2004



2009

Session document

A6-0107/2009

26.2.2009

REPORT

on Active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Committee on Culture and Education

Rapporteur: Gyula Hegyi

Rapporteur for opinion(*): Sylvia-Yvonne Kaufmann, Committee on Constitutional Affairs

(*) Associated committee - Rule 47 of the Rules of Procedure

CONTENTS

Page

MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION	3
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT	11
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS (*)	13
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS	16
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE INTERNAL MARKET AND CONSUMER PROTECTION	19
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT	22
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY.2	25
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS	28
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE	31
(*) Associated committee - Rule 47 of the Rules of Procedure	

MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

on Active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Joint Declaration of the European Parliament, the Council and the Commission entitled "Communicating Europe in Partnership" signed on 22 October 2008,
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 2 April 2008 entitled 'Debate Europe – building on the experience of Plan D for Democracy, Dialogue and Debate' (Plan D) (COM(2008)0158),
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 24 April 2008 entitled 'Communicating Europe through audiovisual media' (SEC(2008)0506),
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 21 December 2007 entitled 'Communicating about Europe via the Internet – Engaging the citizens' (SEC(2007)1742),
- having regard to the Commission working document of 3 October 2007 entitled 'Proposal for an Inter-Institutional agreement on Communicating Europe in Partnership' (COM(2007)0569),
- having regard to Decision No 1904/2006/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 December 2006 establishing for the period 2007 to 2013 the programme 'Europe for Citizens' to promote active European citizenship¹,
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 1 February 2006 entitled' White Paper on a European Communication Policy' (COM(2006)0035),
- having regard to the Commission Communication of 13 October 2005 entitled' The Commission's contribution to the period of reflection and beyond: Plan-D for Democracy, Dialogue and Debate' (COM(2005)0494),
- having regard to its resolution of 16 November 2006 on the White Paper on a European communication policy²,
- having regard to its resolution of 12 May 2005 on the implementation of the European Union's information and communication strategy³,
- having regard to Rule 45 of its Rules of Procedure,

¹ OJ L 378, 27.12.2006, p.32.

² OJ C 314 E, 21.12.2006, p.369.

³ OJ C 92 E, 20.4.2006, p.403.

- having regard to the report of the Committee on Culture and Education and the opinions of the Committee on Constitutional Affairs, the Committee on Foreign Affairs, the Committee on the Internal Market and Consumer Protection, the Committee on Regional Development, the Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality and the Committee on Petitions (A6-0107/2009)
- A. whereas a democratic and transparent European Union will require an enhanced dialogue between citizens and the European institutions, including Parliament, but also an ongoing debate on Europe at European, national and local level,
- B. whereas after the rejection of the Constitutional Treaty in France and the Netherlands, 53.4% of the Irish people voted in a referendum against ratification of the Treaty of Lisbon and whereas people with an inadequate understanding of European Union policies or of the Treaties are more likely to oppose them,
- C. whereas the Eurobarometer 69 survey showed that 52% of Union citizens believe that their home country's membership of the EU is a good thing, a mere 14% believing the contrary,
- D. whereas knowledge of the European Union and its policies and functioning, but also of the rights enshrined in the Treaties, will be the foundation for restoring citizens' confidence in the European institutions,
- E. whereas a separate Commissioner for communication strategy was appointed for the first time in 2004, although no communication policy as such has yet been adopted due to the lack of a proper legal basis in the Treaties,

Public Opinion

- 1. Recalls that surveys show that the less educated and less affluent a Union citizen is, the more likely he or she will be to oppose further European integration, which indicates that the European idea, in spite of all previous efforts, mainly reaches the well-educated, wealthy segment of European society; regards active dialogue between the European Union and its citizens as essential so as to realise the principles and values of the EU project, but recognises that the communication has not so far been very successful;
- 2. Regrets the fact that, in spite of the Commission's efforts and good ideas, the success achieved in increasing the European citizens' level of knowledge and interest in European issues has been very limited, something which was, regrettably, evidenced by the Irish referendum;
- 3. Stresses the particular importance of creating cohesive communication links with targeted content both between the EU and the regions with particular characteristics and between the EU and particular social groups;
- 4. Notes that, according to recent polls, a large majority of Europeans are in favour of the European Union speaking with one voice on matters of foreign policy; highlights the fact that a statement to that effect was included at the request of European citizens in the open letter/recommendations from the participants at the concluding conference of the six Plan D citizens' projects on 9 December 2007; emphasises that the 27 recommendations set out

in this open letter also include a call on the Union to take more effective action in the area of social policy and social cohesion, in particular with a view to reducing wage disparities and fostering equality between women and men, and, more generally, to pay specific attention to equality-related issues, which are often neglected; suggests that it is therefore also important to look at what is being communicated by actions and to compare how this is at variance with the message the EU wants to give to its citizens;

5. Points out that a majority of women voted 'no' in the most recent referendums on the European Union: 56% in France (Eurobarometer Flash 171), 63% in the Netherlands (Eurobarometer Flash 172) and 56% in Ireland (Eurobarometer Flash 245); believes that one of the factors behind the 'no' vote was the lack of involvement on the part of European institutions in the policies which directly affect women and which underlie the ongoing lack of equal opportunities for men and women, such as policies on reconciling work and family life or dependency support;

Constitutional and interinstitutional aspects

- 6. Stresses the need to complete the ratification process of the Treaty of Lisbon, which will further increase the transparency of the EU and the involvement of citizens in decision-making processes; recalls in this context the new opportunities for participatory democracy that the Treaty of Lisbon would provide, especially the citizens' initiative;
- 7. Stresses the need for coordinated efforts and joint action by all EU institutions and Member States to communicate with EU citizens on European issues; welcomes and takes note of the above-mentioned Joint Declaration of 22 October 2008, which sets out clear objectives for the improvement of EU communication on the part of the European Parliament, the Council, Commission and the Member States; is of the opinion that it could be more ambitious, as Parliament had asked for an Interinstitutional agreement on communication policy between all the institutions;
- 8. Believes that the EU institutions should initiate further discussions on Europe, and immediately put into practice the concepts laid down in the above-mentioned Joint Declaration, in the Commission Communication of 1 February 2006 and in the Commission Working Document of 3 October 2007;
- 9. Shares the Commission's view that participatory democracy can usefully supplement representative democracy; stresses, however, that participatory democracy means not only listening to the citizens, but giving them real opportunities to influence European policy; Points out that, in order to achieve these aims, the institutions have to become much more open and adopt the approaches required to enable citizens and their organisations to participate effectively at every stage when EU issues are debated; also notes that public access to documents produced by the institutions needs to be granted on as broad a basis as possible, this being a sine qua non for the purposes of exerting influence;
- 10. Stresses the importance and value of the consultation process as an effective tool in empowering citizens by enabling them to input directly into the policy process at EU level; calls on the Commission to take further steps to disseminate information in time on future EU consultations via the media and other appropriate forums at national, regional

and local levels, to widen the range of stakeholders' views heard during consultations on EU legislation and to publicise more widely the Internet consultations on EU policies and initiatives so as to ensure that all stakeholders, especially small and medium-sized enterprises and local non-governmental organisations (NGOs) are involved in the debate; emphasises the importance of representatives of civil society, such as networks of professionals and consumers, at all levels from transnational to local, which provide platforms for an informed exchange of views on EU policies, thus contributing to better quality EU legislation; recognises the problems in the implementation and enforcement of legislation and encourages consumers and businesses to exercise their rights and to report existing problems to the EU institutions;

- 11. Believes that the EU institutions and the Members States should coordinate their communication efforts and build a partnership with civil society in order to exploit the possible synergies; stresses the need for coordination between the institutions and the desirability of forging links between the Commission and Parliament television channels; calls on the Commission to improve the cooperation and coordination between its representations in the Member States and the Parliament's information offices; calls on the Commission and Parliament representations in Member States to improve cooperation when it comes to consulting citizens, sharing information, knowledge and ideas about the EU with citizens, and providing opportunities for voters to meet MEPs elected in different countries and EU officials;
- 12. Welcomes the fact that the Commission supports the role of Parliament and the European political parties, and recognises the need to bridge the gap between national and European politics, especially during the European election campaigns;
- 13. Calls on the three main institutions to consider the possibility of holding joint open debates that would supplement the Parliament's open debates, addressing topics that concern consumers and their daily lives and thereby strengthening their confidence in the internal market and consumer protection; points out that the Parliament intergroups are playing their full part as a citizens' intermediary, an instrument which genuinely links the political sphere and civil society.
- 14. Notes with satisfaction that the Commission has taken into account many of the ideas that Parliament has previously put forward, such as citizens' forums on both a European and national level, a more prominent role for civil society organisations and innovative use of new media;

Going Local

15. Calls on the Commission to extend its dialogue to all levels by adapting its message to different target groups according to their social backgrounds; therefore proposes that the dialogue between the European Union and its citizens should be strengthened by providing the same information, tailored to individual target groups, to everyone and facilitating debate with and among informed citizens; considers that the EU institutions should incorporate the conclusions of local debates organised under the aegis of the Plan

D into their policies and take into consideration the expectations that citizens have of the EU when deciding on new legislation;

- 16. Calls on the Member States to launch effective EU communication campaigns at all levels, national, regional and local; calls on the Commission to disseminate the best practices identified from such campaigns and proposes the creation of a permanent, interactive communication system between the EU institutions and citizens, with regular campaigns of a local and regional nature by the EU, the assistance of the regional media and the active participation of civil society, NGOs, chambers of commerce, trade unions and professional organisations;
- 17. Stresses that the EU's cohesion policy is a basis of European integration and social solidarity; considers, therefore, that citizens should be made aware of the endeavours and specific effects of EU policies on their daily lives, highlighting the contribution of the EU and the benefits of the common European project; calls in this context for local authorities to provide better information about aid received from the European Union; stresses also that commitment on the part of local and regional elected representatives is essential for developing information provision and training; welcomes in this regard the creation of an Erasmus programme for local and regional elected representatives;
- 18. Underlines that the involvement of partners in the preparation and implementation of operational programmes, according to Article 11 of the General Regulation on Structural Funds (ESF) 2007-2013, contributes significantly to promoting EU cohesion policy and bringing it closer to the citizens; stresses that these partners have a unique opportunity to see on a first hand basis the real issues that are of core concern to citizens; calls, therefore, on the Commission to ensure that the partnership principle is correctly implemented at national, regional and local level; highlights the importance for national and regional authorities of making use of the existing financial possibilities provided by the ESF, in order to improve the skills of these partners, especially as regards training; notes the significant role structural funds have played in fostering cross border cooperation through community projects and programmes, which has encouraged the development of active citizenship and participatory democracy; calls on the Commission to continue to support and work in partnership with such projects and programmes;
- 19. Stresses the need, in the context of the forthcoming European elections, for information at local and regional level for citizens, and particularly for young people and first-time voters; in a more general context, stresses the importance of the involvement of MEPs, in cooperation with local and regional elected officials, in the consultation process with citizens in their regions, given that they are the voice of the public in the EU; supports the efforts of the Committee of the Regions to strengthen consultation at regional level and to include regional networks and key local and regional players in that process in order to encourage debate at grass-roots level that takes into account their opinions and interests;
- 20. Stresses the need for its Members to be more closely involved in communication with EU citizens and for changes to be made to the organisation of Parliament's work so as to enable Members to engage in dialogue with citizens at the most local level possible; hopes that in parallel with the political party campaigns, MEPs will be closely involved on the ground in the European elections campaign;

21. Calls on the Commission to launch local, small-scale communication campaigns with the involvement of local actors, and to promote activities enabling citizens to be better informed about immigrants' countries of origin and, equally, to better inform immigrants of the rights and duties attached to EU citizenship, as the most effective and meaningful ways of achieving these communication goals, and also to continue with the efforts made in the context of the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue 2008.

Education, Media and ICT, active Citizenship

- 22. Stresses the importance of introducing European politics and history into the school curricula of each Member State so as to strengthen European values, and of developing the European Studies departments within university programmes; calls on the Commission to provide financial support for the promotion of these projects; calls on the Member States to promote a school course on the history of European integration and the functioning of the EU, to form the basis of a common European knowledge;
- 23. Emphasises the particular role of civic education as an essential driving force of active citizenship; notes the need to support an active model of civic education that provides young people with the opportunity to engage directly with public life, with their political representatives at national level, at local level as well as at European level, with representatives of NGOs and with civic initiatives; suggests that the Commission support pilot projects promoting such a model of civic education in the Member States;
- 24. Recommends that programmes, such as Erasmus, Leonardo da Vinci, Grundtvig and Comenius be more effectively promoted, through more widespread communication, and organised so as to encourage as many people as possible to take part, to increase participation by less affluent citizens and to facilitate their mobility within the EU; draws attention to the fact that these programmes in particular are very popular with young people and make an important contribution to the success of European integration;
- 25. Welcomes the above-mentioned Commission Communication of 21 December 2007 which sets out clear objectives as to how the Europa website can be turned into a service-oriented web 2.0 site; urges the Commission to complete construction of the new site as early as 2009 and believes that the new website should provide a forum for citizens to share their opinions and participate in online polls, where all NGOs, public institutions and individuals may share their experiences of their EU communication projects; calls on the Commission to collect and publish on this webpage the experiences of beneficiaries of the activities funded under Plan D;
- 26. Welcomes the idea of EU Tube, as with almost 1,7 million viewers, it is a unique tool with which to communicate EU policies among Internet users; also calls on the Commission to prepare guidelines on efficient Internet campaigns and share them with other EU institutions;
- 27. Calls on the Commission to make better use of the audiovisual material available on Europe by Satellite by establishing links with local television channels and community media that are interested in obtaining such material for broadcasting, in order to reach wider audiences;

- 28. Considers the Europe Direct network an important tool for answering citizens' queries by mail or by free telephone call from anywhere in the EU, a tool which should be further publicised;
- 29. Considers the policy areas of consumer protection and the internal market to be of the utmost importance in communicating Europe to consumers and businesses; calls on Member States to increase efforts to communicate the benefits of the Single Market at national, regional and local level; calls on the Commission and Member States to promote and strengthen interactive communication and information in order to achieve effective dialogue between consumers, businesses and institutions by various electronic means of the latest technology and to contribute to the development of e-commerce;
- 30. Asks the Commission to strengthen its coordination efforts in the fields of consumer education and information on consumers' rights and obligations by increasing its financial and human resources; calls on Member States to boost the financial and human resources allocated to the European Consumer Centres Network in order to raise awareness and ensure the application of EU consumer rights and urges Member States, in view of the global financial crisis and rising levels of consumer indebtedness, to make efforts to improve the level of financial literacy of consumers in particular concerning their rights and obligations as well as their means of redress with regard to savings and loans;
- 31. Calls on Member States to increase the human and financial resources allocated to the SOLVIT network that makes it possible to resolve problems arising from the misapplication or non-application of Community legislation free of charge; asks the Commission to accelerate the streamlining of the different services providing information and advice regarding the single market; supports, therefore, the concept contained in the Commission's Communication of 20 November 2007 entitled 'A single market for 21st century Europe' (COM(2007)0724) of an integrated approach to the provision of Single Market Assistance Services through the creation of a single-entry webpage; notes the Commission's initiatives on the reduction of administrative burdens and better regulation; calls in particular for improvements to support small and medium-sized enterprises, which represent an important source of jobs in Europe;
- 32. Notes that a European Year on Volunteering would be an ideal opportunity for the EU institutions to connect with citizens; points out that there are over 100 million volunteers across the EU, and calls on the Commission to prepare the ground for 2011 to be declared as the European Year by submitting an appropriate legislative proposal to this effect as soon as possible;
- 33. Stresses the importance of considering citizens' opinions on Europe as a global player, taking into account in particular the increasingly prominent role of the European Parliament in this issue; therefore encourages the involvement of MEPs and members of the Council in the Plan D visits by Members of the Commission, as they play an important role in reaching out to national parliaments, civil society, business and union leaders and regional and local authorities in Member States;
- 34. Is pleased that the world at large is showing an ever greater interest in the European project, and that the EU and its citizens are also becoming more aware of the advantages

of sharing their supranational experience with other countries and regions, especially with the EU's neighbours; therefore calls on the Commission to develop, through its Delegations in third countries, ways of reaching out to those countries' citizens and informing them about opportunities in the European Union, for example with regard to media and other forms of culture, education, language learning and mobility or exchange programmes such as Erasmus Mundus;

- 35. Notes that, particularly in the context of the increase in the number of third-country nationals in the EU and the emergence of multicultural societies, to which they have also contributed, greater efforts should be made to provide for the integration of immigrants into the EU, giving them concrete access to information about what EU citizenship entails by, for example, strengthening partnerships between different levels of government (local, regional and national) and non-governmental actors (e.g. employers, civil society and migrants' associations, the media and NGOs supporting migrants); considers that successful integration will support the further development of a multicultural European consciousness based on tolerance, dialogue and equality;
- 36. Calls on the Commission to promote programmes and campaigns (such as "The world through women's eyes") for encouraging women's social, political, and cultural activeness, taking into account women's role in the dialogue between generations and society's sustainability and prosperity; calls therefore for girls and women to be given better information on the concept of European citizenship and the rights pertaining thereto, particularly in socially and geographically isolated regions; stresses that the aim of these information campaigns should be to improve women's participation in political life and the decision-making process; stresses the need to promote measures to overcome the gender digital divide so as to provide women with the tools to take part in the dialogue on Europe under equal conditions; congratulates the Commission on the choice of projects to be co-funded, under plan D, by its representations, which include many projects run by women's organisations and many projects involving women; stresses the need to encourage citizens' participation when it comes to issues such as gender violence or human trafficking, where the involvement of society is vital if progress is to be made in resolving the problem; acknowledges the problem-solving and conflict-resolution skills of women, and urges the Commission to include more women in task forces and working groups, engaged with the issues of family life, childcare, education etc.;
 - 0
- 37. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the European Council, the Commission, the Council, the Court of Justice, the Court of Auditors, the Committee of the Regions, the Economic and Social Committee and the governments and parliaments of the Member States.

EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

Europe is the Old Continent for those, whose ancestors left it for asylum or a better future in the past. Europe is the Continent of Hope for those who arrive here from poverty or tyranny. Europe is a Promise for those Europeans who live in the Balkans or in Eastern Europe, and who believe that the would-be accession to the European Union will bring them into the club of the privileged ones. And Europe is the European Union, the alliance of the twenty-seven Member States, whose citizens seldom share the optimistic illusions of the outsiders about the EU: they more often criticize or even deny the advantages of the Union. The professionals of the EU communication do their best to spread the fruits of European integration, but their efforts sometimes resemble more to a lecture than to a dialogue with the citizens. For that reason, your Rapporteur encourages the European Institutions to initiate active dialogue with citizens, in which they - the rank-and-file citizens, representatives of NGO-s, journalists and media workers - can tell us how they would communicate the advantages of European integration. Your Rapporteur organized conferences with representatives of NGOs, Green activists and journalists in Hungary, as well as collected their recommendations via e-mails. One of those conferences took place in Budapest with more than hundred active participants, the others were held in Miskolc and Békéscsaba. Your Rapporteur's timeframe and capacity did not allow to organise such conferences in other Member States, but it would be very useful to do so in the future.

Those who are involved in or study European issues, usually know and understand the meaning of European integration. However, Eurobarometer surveys show that the less educated and less affluent citizens are, the more likely they will oppose further European integration. The European idea mostly reaches the well-educated, wealthy segment of the European society. The less educated and less affluent citizens get little information on European policies, which, moreover, target mostly the students and the young professionals. That is the reason why your Rapporteur urges the Commission to extend its dialogue to new target groups by designing non-elite targeted communication plans, thus involving in EU affairs people living in small towns and villages, the working class and the retired. Having communication plans only for the elite and students is not enough: county people, blue collar workers and pensioners should be targeted as well.

Television is the one of the most important tools to reach ordinary, rank and file citizens. Therefore, your Rapporteur calls on the Commission to make available TV programmes on European issues to the public, through service contracts ensuring full editorial independence, in all 23 official languages. This would contribute to the increase of the proportion of EU-related news in the media, which is currently 10% in the Member States and falls even behind the proportion of USA–related news. As our journalists are not worse or less talented than the American ones, such television channel, which may be the Euronews, should reach the influence, the professional standard and the popularity of CNN. It is also unacceptable that Euronews - an EU co-financed project – does not broadcast in all official languages of the Member States. Commission should find financial sources for such purpose. Euronews should also realize - and show in its programmes - that Europe is not equal with some big Western European countries; Finland, Hungary or Bulgaria are also part of our common Europe.

Young and well educated people can, most of all, be reached by internet. The Communication on 'Communicating about Europe via the Internet - Engaging the citizens' sets out clear objectives on turning the Europa website into a service-oriented web2.0 site, which would give opportunity for feedback on the basis of the citizens' opinions and for active dialogue. The new site should be opened before the 2009 European Parliament elections to make it capable of effectively inform the citizens on European issues. EUtube is also an interesting project, however, it has less than 8000 subscribers and rather few visits comparing with Youtube programs, so it has to be improved to reach more viewers.

Europe has common history, but it is taught and understood in different ways in the Member States, which even differs in some regions. Thus, your Rapporteur proposes to work out a one-year common European curriculum on the history of Europe after 1945 to be used in secondary education, consensually developed by the experts of the Member States in the 23 official languages. It should also cover the history and the working mechanism of the European Union, including the rights of its citizens. This curriculum might be voluntarily adopted in the Member States to form the basis of a common European knowledge in secondary schools. Your Rapporteur also welcomes the idea of opening a Museum of the European History in Brussels, near to the building of the European Parliament. Your Rapporteur welcomes the idea of a Hungarian professor, and following his advice, proposes the foundation of a European Open University. This should be open and free for all European citizens, irrespective of their nationality, age and qualification. The comprehensive curriculum of the European Open University would cover the history, objectives, institutions, policies and the possible future of the European Union. The University could work in the buildings of existing educational institutions in co-operation with the Commission, and would be one of the means to put into practice the recent Joint Declaration on Communicating Europe in Partnership. However, it should also use the most developed technologies, such as various e-learning and webinar forms, to reach the largest possible public, and thus everyone, who is willing to, can attend the courses.

Few European citizens recognize the common goals and the different views of the European political parties. If the political differences among the European Parties are visible, it can help the citizens to identify themselves with various concepts on the future of Europe. Therefore, your Rapporteur proposes that all European Parties announce their manifesto for the 2009 European Parliament Elections in a longer and shorter form as well, to reach different segments of the society.

26.1.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS (*)

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur (*): Sylvia-Yvonne Kaufmann

(*) Associated committee – Rule 47 of the Rules of Procedure

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Constitutional Affairs calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- 1. Welcomes the Commission communication on building on the experience of Plan D, which stresses the importance of interactive communication with the citizens of Europe;
- 2. Calls on the Commission to involve large target groups in the dialogue by preparing communication plans capable of making the residents of small settlements and people of differing living standards and of different age groups party to European issues; proposes the adoption of a two-phased approach to strengthen the dialogue between the European Union and its citizens by providing information first and facilitating the debates with and among the informed citizens afterwards;
- 3. Notes with satisfaction that the Commission has taken into account many of the ideas that Parliament has previously put forward, such as citizens' forums on both a European and national level, a more prominent role for civil society organisations and innovative use of new media;
- 4. Regrets the fact that, in spite of the Commission's efforts and good ideas, the success achieved in increasing the European citizens' level of knowledge and interest in European issues has been very limited, something which was, regrettably, evidenced by the Irish referendum;
- 5. Shares the Commission's view that participatory democracy can usefully supplement

 $RR \ 771619 EN. doc$

13/31

PE415.281v02-00

representative democracy; stresses, however, that participatory democracy means not only listening to the citizens, but giving them real opportunities to influence European policy;

- 6. Points out that, to achieve the above aims, the institutions have to become much more open and adopt the approaches required to enable citizens and their organisations to participate effectively at every stage when EU issues are debated; also notes that public access to documents produced by the institutions needs to be granted on as broad a basis as possible, this being a sine qua non for the purposes of exerting influence;
- 7. Recalls the new opportunities for participatory democracy that the Treaty of Lisbon would provide, especially the citizens' initiative;
- 8. Welcomes the fact that the Commission supports the role of Parliament and the European political parties, and recognises the need to bridge the gap between national and European politics, especially during the European election campaigns;
- 9. Stresses the need for coordinated efforts and joint action by all EU institutions and Member States to communicate with the citizens of Europe on European issues; welcomes the joint political declaration on communication adopted in October; recalls, however, that Parliament has asked for an Interinstitutional agreement on communication policy between all the institutions;
- 10. Emphasises the particular role of civic education as an essential driving force of active citizenship; notes the need to support an active model of civic education that provides young people with the opportunity to engage directly with public life, with their political representatives at national level, at local level as well as at European level, with representatives of NGOs and with civic initiatives; suggests that the Commission support pilot projects promoting such a model of civic education in the Member States;
- 11. Calls on the Commission to improve the cooperation and coordination between its representations in the Member States and the European Parliament's information offices.

Date adopted	22.1.2009
Result of final vote	$\begin{array}{cccc} +: & 17 \\ -: & 3 \\ 0: & 1 \end{array}$
Members present for the final vote	Enrique Barón Crespo, Richard Corbett, Jean-Luc Dehaene, Andrew Duff, Anneli Jäätteenmäki, Aurelio Juri, Sylvia-Yvonne Kaufmann, Timothy Kirkhope, Jo Leinen, Íñigo Méndez de Vigo, Ashley Mote, Adrian Severin, József Szájer, Riccardo Ventre, Andrzej Wielowieyski
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Costas Botopoulos, Panayiotis Demetriou, Roger Helmer, Klaus- Heiner Lehne, Gérard Onesta, Sirpa Pietikäinen, Kathy Sinnott, Mauro Zani

12.2.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur: Maria Badia i Cutchet

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Foreign Affairs calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- 1. Welcomes the Joint Declaration entitled "Communicating Europe in Partnership", signed on 22 October 2008, with its clear objectives for reaching out to the citizens of Europe through an improvement of EU communication on the part of the European Parliament, the Council, the Commission and the Member States;
- 2. Notes that, according to recent polls, a large majority of Europeans are in favour of Europe speaking with one voice on matters of foreign policy; highlights the fact that a statement to that effect was included at the request of European citizens in the open letter/recommendations from the participants at the concluding conference of the six "Plan D" citizens' projects on 9 December 2007¹;
- 3. Stresses the importance of considering citizens' opinions on Europe as a global player, taking into account in particular the increasingly prominent role of the European Parliament in this issue; therefore encourages the involvement of MEPs and members of the Council in the "Plan D" visits by Members of the Commission, as they play an important role in reaching out to national parliaments, civil society, business and union leaders and regional and local authorities in Member States; calls on the Commission and European Parliament representations in Member States to improve cooperation when it comes to consulting citizens, sharing information, knowledge and ideas about the EU,

¹ See Point 17: "In a global world, it makes sense for the EU to take greater responsibility than today in the fields of **military action, foreign aid and diplomatic relations**. The EU should be able to speak with one voice on a global level to defend its values."

and providing opportunities for voters to meet MEPs elected in different countries and EU officials;

- 4. Encourages the Commission, therefore to examine the possibility of introducing, within a time-frame of four to six years, a mechanism for the general consultation of EU citizens, organised on a regular basis, on essential issues pertaining to the EU's activities, as a way of bringing Europe closer to its citizens;
- 5. Is pleased that the world at large is showing an ever greater interest in the European project, and that the EU and its citizens are also becoming more aware of the advantages of sharing their supranational experience with other countries and regions, especially with the EU's neighbours; therefore calls on the Commission to develop, through its Delegations in third countries, ways of reaching out to those countries' citizens and informing them about opportunities in the European Union, e.g. about media and other forms of culture, education, language learning and mobility or exchange programmes such as Erasmus Mundus;
- 6. Stresses the importance of introducing European politics and history into the school curricula of each Member State so as to strengthen European values, and of developing the European Studies departments within university programmes; calls on the Commission to provide financial support for the promotion of these projects;
- Calls on the Commission to provide financial support for projects aimed at the promotion of EU ideas; considers that these programmes should be tailored towards students in secondary and tertiary education who can engage local communities (villages and municipalities) and increase locals' familiarity with the values of the European Communities;
- 8. Notes that, particularly in the context of the increase in the number of third-country nationals in the EU and the emergence of multicultural societies, to which they have also contributed, greater efforts should be made to provide for the integration of immigrants into the EU, giving them concrete access to information about what EU citizenship entails by, for example, strengthening partnerships between different levels of government (local, regional and national) and non-governmental actors (e.g. employers, civil society, migrants' associations, the media and non-governmental organisations supporting migrants); considers that successful integration will support the further development of a multicultural European consciousness based on tolerance, dialogue and equality;
- 9. Calls on the Commission to launch local, small-scale communication campaigns with the involvement of local actors, and to promote activities enabling citizens to be better informed about immigrants' countries of origin and, equally, to better inform immigrants of their rights and duties as European citizens, as the most effective and meaningful ways of achieving these communication goals, and also to continue with the efforts made in the context of the European Year of Intercultural Dialogue 2008.

Date adopted	11.2.2009
Result of final vote	+: 64 -: 7 0: 0
Members present for the final vote	Sir Robert Atkins, Angelika Beer, Bastiaan Belder, André Brie, Colm Burke, Véronique De Keyser, Giorgos Dimitrakopoulos, Michael Gahler, Jas Gawronski, Georgios Georgiou, Alfred Gomolka, Richard Howitt, Jana Hybášková, Anna Ibrisagic, Ioannis Kasoulides, Metin Kazak, Maria Eleni Koppa, Helmut Kuhne, Joost Lagendijk, Willy Meyer Pleite, Francisco José Millán Mon, Pasqualina Napoletano, Annemie Neyts-Uyttebroeck, Raimon Obiols i Germà, Vural Öger, Janusz Onyszkiewicz, Ria Oomen-Ruijten, Ioan Mircea Paşcu, João de Deus Pinheiro, Hubert Pirker, Samuli Pohjamo, Pierre Pribetich, Raül Romeva i Rueda, Libor Rouček, Christian Rovsing, Flaviu Călin Rus, José Ignacio Salafranca Sánchez-Neyra, Jacek Saryusz-Wolski, György Schöpflin, Marek Siwiec, Hannes Swoboda, Konrad Szymański, Charles Tannock, Inese Vaidere, Kristian Vigenin, Andrzej Wielowieyski, Jan Marinus Wiersma, Zbigniew Zaleski, Josef Zieleniec
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Alexandra Dobolyi, Árpád Duka-Zólyomi, James Elles, Martí Grau i Segú, Milan Horáček, Aurelio Juri, Evgeni Kirilov, Alexander Graf Lambsdorff, Marios Matsakis, Yiannakis Matsis, Erik Meijer, Nickolay Mladenov, Alexandru Nazare, Doris Pack, Athanasios Pafilis, Rihards Pīks, Jean Spautz
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Emine Bozkurt, Ioannis Gklavakis, José Albino Silva Peneda, Antonios Trakatellis, Nikolaos Vakalis

23.1.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE INTERNAL MARKET AND CONSUMER PROTECTION

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur: Magor Imre Csibi

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on the Internal Market and Consumer Protection calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- 1. Considers the policy areas of consumer protection and the internal market to be of the utmost importance in communicating Europe to consumers and businesses; calls on Member States to increase efforts to communicate the benefits of the Single Market at national, regional and local level; calls on the Commission and Member States to promote and strengthen interactive communication and information for an effective dialogue between consumers, businesses and institutions by various electronic means of the latest technology and to contribute to the development of e-commerce;
- 2. Welcomes the Commission's Communication of 2 April 2008 entitled 'Debate Europe building on the experience of Plan D for Democracy, Dialogue and Debate' (COM(2008)0158) as a useful initiative to restore public confidence in the common European project after the negative results of the recent referenda; calls for an effective framework for communication between civil society and the European Union that will enable citizens to play an active part in European affairs; considers it essential that Members of the European Parliament, Members of the Commission and the staff of the European institutions are able to travel across the European Union in order to engage in dialogue with citizens from all the Member States, better understand their situation and explain the ongoing legislative work;
- 3. Calls on the Commission to widen the range of stakeholders' views heard during consultations on EU legislation; emphasises in this context the importance of representatives of civil society, such as networks of professionals and consumers, at all levels from transnational to local, which provide platforms for an informed exchange of views on EU policies, thus contributing to an improved quality of EU legislation;

recognises the problems in the implementation and enforcement of legislation and encourages consumers and businesses to exercise their rights and to report existing problems to the EU institutions;

- 4. Calls on Member States to increase the human and financial resources allocated to the SOLVIT network that makes it possible to resolve problems arising from the misapplication or non-application of Community legislation free of charge; asks the Commission to accelerate the streamlining of the different services providing information and advice regarding the Single Market; supports, therefore, the concept contained in the Commission's Communication of 20 November 2007 entitled 'A single market for 21st century Europe' (COM(2007)0724) of an integrated approach to the provision of Single Market Assistance Services through the creation of a single-entry webpage;
- 5. Asks the Commission to strengthen its coordination efforts in the fields of consumer education and information on consumers' rights and obligations by increasing its financial and human resources; calls on Member States to boost the financial and human resources allocated to the European Consumer Centres Network in order to raise awareness and ensure the application of EU consumer rights;
- 6. Urges Member States, in view of the global financial crisis and rising levels of consumer indebtedness, to make efforts to improve the level of financial literacy of consumers in particular concerning their rights and obligations as well as their means of redress with regard to savings and loans;
- 7. Calls on the three main institutions to consider the possibility of holding joint open debates that would supplement the European Parliament's open debates, addressing topics that concern consumers and their daily lives and thereby strengthening their confidence in the internal market and consumer protection;
- 8. Notes the Commission's initiatives on the reduction of administrative burdens and better regulation; calls in particular for improvements to support small and medium-sized enterprises, which represent an important source of jobs in Europe.

Date adopted	22.1.2009
Result of final vote	+: 30 -: 0 0: 0
Members present for the final vote	Cristian Silviu Buşoi, Charlotte Cederschiöld, Janelly Fourtou, Evelyne Gebhardt, Martí Grau i Segú, Malcolm Harbour, Iliana Malinova Iotova, Kurt Lechner, Toine Manders, Nickolay Mladenov, Catherine Neris, Zita Pleštinská, Karin Riis-Jørgensen, Zuzana Roithová, Heide Rühle, Leopold Józef Rutowicz, Christel Schaldemose, Andreas Schwab, Eva-Britt Svensson, Marianne Thyssen, Bernadette Vergnaud, Barbara Weiler
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Emmanouil Angelakas, Wolfgang Bulfon, Colm Burke, Giovanna Corda, Joel Hasse Ferreira, Olle Schmidt
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Jean-Pierre Audy, Michel Teychenné

13.2.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur: Emmanouil Angelakas

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Regional Development calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- 1. Considers the regions to be the most appropriate centres for promoting the European ideal and local and regional authorities to be the most competent bodies for promoting dialogue with citizens since they observe their daily lives at close range; expresses its satisfaction in that regard that the EU has taken measures to decentralise communication policy;
- 2. Calls for local authorities to provide better information about aid received from the European Union; stresses also that commitment on the part of local and regional elected representatives is essential for developing information provision and training; welcomes in this regard the creation of an Erasmus programme for local and regional elected representatives;
- 3. Stresses that the EU's cohesion policy is a basis of European integration and social solidarity; considers, therefore, that citizens should be made aware of the endeavours and specific effects of Community policy on their daily lives, highlighting the contribution of the EU and the benefits of the common European project;
- 4. Underlines that the involvement of partners in the preparation and implementation of operational programmes, according to Article 11 of the General Regulation on Structural Funds 2007-2013, contributes significantly to promoting EU cohesion policy and bringing it closer to the citizens; stresses that these partners have a unique opportunity to see on a first hand basis the real issues that are of core concern to citizens; calls, therefore, on the Commission to ensure that the partnership principle is correctly implemented at a national, regional and local level; highlights the importance for national and regional authorities to make use of the existing financial possibilities provided by the ESF, in order to improve the skills of these partners, especially as regards training;

PE415.281v02-00

- 5. Supports the efforts of the Committee of the Regions to strengthen consultation at regional level and to include regional networks and key local and regional players in that process in order to encourage debate at grass-roots level that takes into account their opinions and interests;
- 6. Proposes the creation of a permanent, interactive communication system between European institutions and citizens with frequent campaigns of a local and regional nature by the EU, with the assistance of the regional media and the active participation of civil society, NGOs, chambers of commerce, trade union and professional organisations;
- 7. Stresses the need, in the context of the forthcoming European elections, for information at local and regional level for citizens, and particularly for young people and first-time voters; in a more general context, stresses the importance of the involvement of MEPs, in cooperation with local and regional elected officials, in the consultation process with citizens in their regions, given that they are the voice of the public in the EU;
- 8. Stresses the importance and value of the consultation process as an effective tool in empowering citizens by enabling them to directly input into the policy process at EU level, calls on the Commission to take further steps to disseminate information in time on future EU consultations via the media and other appropriate forums at national, regional and local levels;
- 9. Hopes that in parallel with the political party campaigns, the MEPs will be closely involved on the ground in the Union's institutional campaign;
- 10. Stresses the particular importance of creating cohesive communication links with targeted content both between the EU and the regions with particular characteristics and between the EU and particular social groups;
- 11. Notes that a European Year on Volunteering would be an ideal opportunity for the EU Institutions to connect with citizens, points out that there are over 100 million volunteers across the EU, calls on the Commission to prepare the ground for 2011 to be declared as the European Year by submitting an appropriate legislative proposal to this effect as soon as possible;
- 12. Notes the significant role structural funds has played in fostering cross border cooperation through community projects and programmes, highlights that this has encouraged the development of active citizenship and participatory democracy, calls on the Commission to continue to support and work in partnership with such projects and programmes;
- 13. Endorses the idea of creating a European Open University (EOU), provided that it has strong ties with the regions of the Member States, with the aim of facilitating training for, and information, communication, interactivity and links between all citizens, particularly young people across the regions.
- 14. Points out that the European Parliament intergroups are playing their full part as a citizens' intermediary, an instrument which genuinely links the political sphere and civil society.

Date adopted	12.2.2009
Result of final vote	$\begin{array}{cccc} +: & 40 \\ -: & 0 \\ 0: & 4 \end{array}$
Members present for the final vote	Emmanouil Angelakas, Stavros Arnaoutakis, Elspeth Attwooll, Rolf Berend, Victor Boștinaru, Wolfgang Bulfon, Giorgio Carollo, Bairbre de Brún, Gerardo Galeote, Iratxe García Pérez, Monica Giuntini, Ambroise Guellec, Pedro Guerreiro, Gábor Harangozó, Mieczysław Edmund Janowski, Gisela Kallenbach, Evgeni Kirilov, Miloš Koterec, Constanze Angela Krehl, Florencio Luque Aguilar, Jamila Madeira, Iosif Matula, Miroslav Mikolášik, Lambert van Nistelrooij, Jan Olbrycht, Maria Petre, Markus Pieper, Giovanni Robusti, Wojciech Roszkowski, Bernard Soulage, Catherine Stihler, Margie Sudre, Oldřich Vlasák
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Emanuel Jardim Fernandes, Stanisław Jałowiecki, Zita Pleštinská, Samuli Pohjamo, Christa Prets, Flaviu Călin Rus, Richard Seeber, László Surján, Iuliu Winkler
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Sepp Kusstatscher, Toine Manders

20.1.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on an active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur: Claire Gibault

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- A. whereas, although citizens are increasingly well informed, they are still too often neglected by political institutions, in particular in connection with measures taken by and in the European Union,
- Points out that a majority of women voted 'no' in the most recent referendums on Europe: 56% in France (Eurobarometer Flash 171), 63% in the Netherlands (Eurobarometer Flash 172) and 56% in Ireland (Eurobarometer Flash 245); believes that one of the factors behind the 'no' vote was the lack of involvement on the part of European institutions in the policies which directly affect women and which underlie the ongoing lack of equal opportunities for men and women, such as policies on reconciling work and family life or dependency support;
- 2. Emphasises that the 27 recommendations set out in the open letter from the participants in the closing conference for the six citizens' projects under plan D, entitled 'The future of Europe A project for citizens', include a call on the Union to take more effective action in the area of social policy and social cohesion, in particular with a view to reducing wage disparities and fostering equality between women and men, and, more generally, to pay specific attention to equality-related issues, which are often neglected;
- 3. Calls for a comprehensive analysis of women's participation in the decision-making processes across Europe in order to identify and promote their role as a uniting factor in society;

- 4. Emphasises the role played by women in the Union and urges the European institutions to introduce, in cooperation with the Member States, long-term arrangements which take account of social relations and inequalities between men and women in all areas of public policy;
- 5. Calls for girls and women to be given better information on the concept of European citizenship and the rights pertaining thereto, particularly in socially and geographically isolated regions; stresses that the aim of these information campaigns should be to improve women's participation in political life and the decision-making process;
- 6. Congratulates the Commission on the choice of projects to be co-funded, under plan D, by its representations, which include many projects run by women's organisations and many projects involving women;
- 7. Calls on the European Commission to promote programmes and campaigns (such as "The world through women's eyes") for encouraging women's social, political, and cultural activeness, taking into account women's role for the dialogue between generations the sustainability and prosperity of society;
- 8. Encourages the European institutions to move on from communication and marketing campaigns and develop economic and social policies which meet the expectations and needs of the citizens of the Member States; in that connection, supports, for example, the Commission's proposals concerning parental leave, which seek to strengthen the principle of reconciling work and family life, thereby enabling Europeans to have as many children as they want and thus reduce the demographic deficit which is posing an economic and social threat to our continent.
- 9. Acknowledges the problem-solving and conflict-resolution skills of women, and urges the European Commission to include more women in task forces and working groups, engaged with the issues of family life, child care, education etc.;
- 10. Stresses the need to encourage citizens' participation when it comes to issues such as gender violence or human trafficking, where the involvement of society is vital if progress is to be made in resolving the problem;
- 11. Stresses the need to promote measures to overcome the gender digital divide so as to provide women with the tools to take part in the dialogue on Europe under equal conditions.

Date adopted	20.1.2009
Result of final vote	+: 16 -: 0 0: 1
Members present for the final vote	Edit Bauer, Emine Bozkurt, Hiltrud Breyer, Edite Estrela, Ilda Figueiredo, Claire Gibault, Lívia Járóka, Urszula Krupa, Roselyne Lefrançois, Siiri Oviir, Marie Panayotopoulos-Cassiotou, Eva-Britt Svensson, Anna Záborská
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Gabriela Crețu, Iratxe García Pérez, Anna Hedh, Maria Petre

11.2.2009

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS

for the Committee on Culture and Education

on active dialogue with citizens on Europe (2008/2224(INI))

Rapporteur: Kathy Sinnott

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Petitions calls on the Committee on Culture and Education, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- A. whereas knowledge of the European Union and its policies and functioning, but also of the rights enshrined in the Treaties, will be the foundation for restoring citizens' confidence in the European institutions,
- B. whereas a democratic and transparent European Union will require an enhanced dialogue between citizens and the European institutions, including Parliament, but also an ongoing debate on Europe at European, national and local level,
- 1. Regards active dialogue between the European Union and its citizens as essential so as to realise the principles and values of the EU project, but recognises that the communication has not so far been very successful;
- 2. Considers that the requirement for effective dialogue is to have a two-way communication system which means that the voices of citizens are heard and their concerns responded to in a genuine way;
- 3. Suggests that it is also important to look at what is being communicated by actions and to compare how this is at variance with the message the EU wants to give its citizens;
- 4. Given that, according to Eurobarometer, 85% of adults know they have a right to petition the European Commission, the European Ombudsman or the European Parliament in the 23 official languages, considers that petitions submitted by citizens and the work of the Committee on Petitions are key avenues of direct communication by the EU with its citizens; points out that this is reflected in the rapid growth in the number of petitions

PE415.281v02-00

submitted by citizens and believes that the importance and number of petitions will further increase in the future;

- 5. Points out that the right of petition is a vital democratic instrument offered by the European Union to its citizens so that they can defend their rights, and that ensuring its efficiency and encouraging its use must be among the priorities of any common communications policy;
- 6. Recalls that Parliament, through the Committee on Petitions, receives direct complaints from citizens concerning the violation by national authorities of rights deriving from the Treaties and secondary law; suggests, therefore, that the EU give a proactive message to its citizens by emphasising the importance of the work of the Committee on Petitions;
- 7. Proposes that, in order for this to be done, increased resources should be allocated to the already overworked Secretariat of the Committee on Petitions, so that the handling of petitions provides swift and tangible solutions so as to send a clear message about Europe and communication is optimised through action;
- 8. Welcomes the web-streaming of proceedings of the Committee on Petitions as a positive and responsive development which will enhance contact, understanding and transparency in communication and will increase citizens' participation in the EU project, as evidenced by the annual increase in the number of petitions; considers that this prospect further underpins the need to allocate additional human resources to the Committee on Petitions;
- 9. Recommends that the procedure for dealing with petitions be improved by strongly encouraging institutionalised cooperation with the official representatives of the Member States from the outset, when this is deemed necessary by the Committee on Petitions;
- 10. Recognises the great attention paid by the Committee on Petitions to all petitions, but recommends a more proactive response to valid petitions through the involvement of the Committee in all steps of the petition process until its conclusion; believes that such systematic and thorough follow-up would raise the profile of this communications avenue and increase communication through action;
- 11. Believes that special consideration should be given to the Citizens' Initiative; considers, however, that this new instrument of participation can only be regarded as democratic if the Commission is obliged to bring forward legislative proposals in response to initiatives signed by one million citizens; also believes that Citizens' Initiatives should as a rule be referred to the Committee on Petitions;
- 12. Stresses the need for Members of the European Parliament to be more closely involved in communication with EU citizens and for changes to be made to the organisation of Parliament's work so as to enable Members to engage in dialogue with citizens at the most local level possible.

Date adopted	11.2.2009
Result of final vote	$ \begin{array}{cccc} +: & 37 \\ -: & 0 \\ 0: & 0 \end{array} $
Members present for the final vote	Sir Robert Atkins, Margrete Auken, Alessandro Battilocchio, Victor Boştinaru, Simon Busuttil, Michael Cashman, Alexandra Dobolyi, Glyn Ford, Lidia Joanna Geringer de Oedenberg, Cristina Gutiérrez- Cortines, David Hammerstein, Carlos José Iturgaiz Angulo, Marcin Libicki, David Martin, Miguel Angel Martínez Martínez, Manolis Mavrommatis, Mairead McGuinness, Willy Meyer Pleite, Gay Mitchell, José Javier Pomés Ruiz, Nicolae Vlad Popa, Andreas Schwab, Richard Seeber, Kathy Sinnott, Rainer Wieland
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Alexander Alvaro, Thijs Berman, Daniel Caspary, Roger Helmer, Mieczysław Edmund Janowski, Henrik Lax, Juan Andrés Naranjo Escobar
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Vicente Miguel Garcés Ramón, Jules Maaten, Teresa Riera Madurell, Frédérique Ries, Ewa Tomaszewska

Date adopted	17.2.2009
Result of final vote	+: 17 -: 1 0: 11
Members present for the final vote	Maria Badia i Cutchet, Giovanni Berlinguer, Guy Bono, Nicodim Bulzesc, Marie-Hélène Descamps, Věra Flasarová, Milan Gal'a, Claire Gibault, Vasco Graça Moura, Lissy Gröner, Luis Herrero-Tejedor, Ruth Hieronymi, Ramona Nicole Mănescu, Adrian Manole, Manolis Mavrommatis, Ljudmila Novak, Doris Pack, Christa Prets, Karin Resetarits, Pál Schmitt, Hannu Takkula, Helga Trüpel
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Gyula Hegyi, Iosif Matula, Christel Schaldemose, Ewa Tomaszewska
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	Raül Romeva i Rueda, Salvador Domingo Sanz Palacio, Alejo Vidal- Quadras