

2009 - 2014

Session document

A7-0042/2010

17.3.2010

REPORT

on the nomination of Louis Galea as a Member of the Court of Auditors (C7-0020/2010 - 2010/0808(NLE))

Committee on Budgetary Control

Rapporteur: Inés Ayala Sender

 $RR \ 439062 EN. doc$

CONTENTS

Page

PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION	3
ANNEX 1: CURRICULUM VITAE OF LOUIS GALEA	4
ANNEX 2: ANSWERS BY LOUIS GALEA TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE	4
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE	4

EN

PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION

on the nomination of Louis Galea as a Member of the Court of Auditors (C7-0020/2010 – 2010/0808(NLE))

(Consultation)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to Article 286(2) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the EU, pursuant to which the Council consulted Parliament (C7-0020/2010),
- having regard to the fact that, at its meeting of 15 March 2010, the Committee on Budgetary Control heard the Council's nominee for membership of the Court of Auditors,
- having regard to Rule 108 of its Rules of Procedure,
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control (A7-0042/2010),
- A. whereas Louis Galea fulfils the conditions laid down in Article 286(1) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the EU,
- 1. Delivers a favourable opinion on the nomination of Louis Galea as a Member of the Court of Auditors;
- 2. Instructs its President to forward this decision to the Council and, for information, the Court of Auditors, the other institutions of the European Union and the audit institutions of the Member States.

ANNEX 1: CURRICULUM VITAE OF LOUIS GALEA

PERSONAL INFORMATION

Name	LOUIS GALEA
Nationality	Maltese
Date of birth	2 January 1948

POLITICAL CAREER

2008 – present • Main activities and responsibilities

SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

Unanimously elected Speaker of Malta's unicameral Parliament in May 2008. The Speaker's duties include presiding over the House of Representatives with an impartial and independent mindset and fostering a proper atmosphere for a positive dialogue between the Government and the Opposition.

The Speaker ensures that Parliament is able to scrutinize and hold the Government accountable for the financial management and use made of public funds. To achieve this objective the Speaker liaises with and supports different Parliamentary Committees, including the Public Accounts Committee, and officers of the House of Representatives, including the Auditor General, who heads the National Audit Office, and the Ombudsman.

1987 – 1996, 1998 – 2008 • Main activities and

responsibilities

CABINET MINISTER

A member of the Cabinets led by Prime Minister Edward Fenech Adami between 1987 and 1996 and between 1998 and 2004 as well as those of Prime Minister Lawrence Gonzi between 2004 and 2008. Also a member of various Cabinet Committees including those responsible for EU Accession, the Public Service Reform, the Pensions Reform (chairperson) and Budget Planning and Priorities.

Strategic, organisational, marketing, management and communication skills with emphasis on culture change, transformation and restructuring of public organisations and human resources development. Worked to introduce performance management cultures, quality management and accountability systems, relationship management models, customer care, marketing and business planning.

Over the years as Minister he was actively committed to and involved in Malta's public service and public sector reforms guaranteeing a better quality administration. Due to the portfolios held, he oversaw the implementation of a substantial percentage of the national budget. In line with Government policies, and together with the heads of departments, offices and agencies falling within his various portfolios, he worked to strengthen the relative mechanisms of powers of control to ensure that the programmes were implemented and the allocated budget spent in a lawful and regular manner and according to sound financial management.

Substantial experience of communicating and negotiating with trade unions, constituted bodies, public authorities and agencies, voluntary organizations and civil society at large.

2003 - 2008

 Main activities and responsibilities
 His Mi Relation

MINISTER OF EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT

His Ministerial portfolio included Education, Employment and Industrial Relations, Libraries and Archives, Youth and Sport.

The reform of the public school structure saw the establishment of colleges linking together the primary, secondary and upper secondary education of students into one continuous chain. Further restructuring took place through the Education Act (2006), the National Archives Act (2005), the Sport Act (2003) and the Maltese Language Act (2003).

During 2004 and 2005 he was appointed by the Prime Minister to steer, together with the Minister responsible for social security, a fundamental, far-reaching structural and financial reform of the pensions system which came into effect in 2007.

In these years he also chaired the national industrial round of negotiations with all public service trade unions which led to the successful conclusion of the 2005-2010 Public Service Collective Agreement.

Between 2004 and 2008 he was also a member of the EU's Council of Ministers in the following two configurations: the Education, Youth and Culture Council and the Employment, Social Policy, Health and Consumer Affairs Council.

1998 – 2004 CO-CHAIRPERSON, MALTA-EU JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE (JPC)

During Malta's EU accession negotiations he was Co-Chairperson of the Malta-EU Joint Parliamentary Committee (JPC). He worked with Members of Parliament from both sides of Malta's House of Representatives as well as with all the Members and *rapporteurs* of the European Parliament sitting on the JPC to ensure that both the Maltese Government and the European Commission got a clear understanding of the concerns of the members of the JPC and the constituents they represent.

The JPC was instrumental in providing a parliamentary dimension to Malta's EU accession process and it established the first formal link between Malta's Parliament and the European Parliament.

1998 - 2003

· Main activities and

responsibilities

• Main activities and responsibilities His Ministerial portfolio included Education, Libraries and Archives, Heritage, Culture and the Arts, Youth and Sport, and the Public Broadcasting Service.

MINISTER OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE

The raft of reforms that took place during this period included a new National Curriculum, and the establishment of the Malta College of Arts, Science and Technology (MCAST) to provide universally accessible vocational and professional education and training, the Malta Qualifications Council, the Malta Centre for Restoration (now Conservation Centre and Institute), the Centre for the Arts and Creativity and the Maltese Language Council. He also put in place two new cultural and heritage public agencies having piloted through Parliament the Malta Council for Culture and the Arts Act (2002) and the Cultural Heritage Act (2002).

1996 – 1998 SHADOW MINISTER FOR EDUCATION

Main activities and His Ministerial portfolio included Education, Libraries and Archives,

RR\439062EN.doc

responsibilities	Heritage, Culture and the Arts, Youth and Sport, and the Public Broadcasting Service. Entrusted by the PN and Opposition Leader to critically monitor the national education and culture portfolio and to scrutinize government performance and spending in this area.
	Formulated the vision, strategy and programme in this field as the Party's alternative government programme.
1992 – 1996 • Main activities and responsibilities	MINISTER FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT AND HOME AFFAIRS His Ministerial portfolio included Home Affairs, Police, Security and the Prisons, as well as Health and the Elderly, Social Security, Social Welfare, Children, and Women.
	In the fields of Home Affairs, Police, Security and Prisons he steered a reorganisation exercise for the Malta Police Force, ushered in modern concepts of civil protection and initiated a process of reform of the Prisons Department to turn it into a modern Correctional Services Department.
	In the health sector, projects and programmes included the setting up of a specialized geriatric hospital, the upgrading of Malta's oncology centre and the launching of the construction of a new general hospital (now Mater Dei Hospital). Mental health care and psychiatric facilities and services were given a root-and-branch reform. Modern strategies were adopted in upgrading the network of family and community based health and social services, whilst much importance was given to health promotion.
	Founded the National Commission Persons with Disability, the National Commission for the Equality of Women with Men, the Foundation for Medical Services, SEDQA (the national agency for the prevention and rehabilitation of alcohol and drug abuse programmes), jointly with CARITAS established the San Blas drugs rehabilitation centre, and with the Richmond Foundation opened Villa Chelsea half-way home for mentally ill persons.
1987 – 1992 • Main activities and responsibilities	MINISTER FOR SOCIAL POLICY His Ministerial portfolio included Health and the Elderly, Employment and Industrial Relations, Social Security, Social Welfare, Children, Women, and Housing.
	In the social policy sector major reforms and restructuring were ushered in. Piloted several laws refining and reforming Malta's social security and social welfare legislation. He negotiated and concluded social security bilateral agreements with Australia, Canada, Libya and the United Kingdom. In 1990 the Employment and Training Corporation was set up by law.
1977 – 1987 • Main activities and responsibilities	SECRETARY GENERAL OF THE PARTIT NAZZJONALISTA (PN) He joined the PN in 1969. He was entrusted with leadership positions in the youth movement, and in 1977 he was elected the Secretary General of the party, a position he held until 1987 when he became a Minister. He was a protagonist in the structural reform and re-engineering process that turned the PN, founded in 1880, into a hugely successful national popular movement based on liberty, democracy and social justice.
1976 – 1987 • Main activities and	SHADOW MINISTER FOR LABOUR AND SOCIAL POLICY Entrusted by the PN and Opposition Leader to critically monitor the national employment and social policy portfolio and to scrutinize

responsibilities	government performance and spending in this area.	
	Formulated the vision, strategy and programme in this field as part of the Party's alternative government programme.	
1976 – 2008	NATIONAL PARLIAMENT He was elected to Parliament during the general elections held in 1976, 1981, 1987, 1992, 1996, 1998 and 2003. In 2008 he was elected by the House of Representatives to be its Speaker.	

OTHER WORK EXPERIENCE

1993 – present	LECTURER
• Name and address of employer	Department of Public Law, Faculty of Law, University of Malta
Main responsibilities	Lectures on social and labour law in the Department of Public Law of the University of Malta.
1996 – 1998	Advocate
 Name and address of employer 	Ganado Sammut, Valletta, Malta
 Main responsibilities 	Practised law with Ganado Sammut, a Valletta law firm.
1975 – 1977	Advocate
• Name and address of employer	Self-employed
 Main responsibilities 	Practised law.
1969 – 1974	TEACHER
• Name and address of employer	Education Department, Ministry of Education
	De La Salle College, Cottonera
 Main responsibilities 	Taught History and English to upper forms at secondary school level.

EDUCATION AND TRAINING

• Dates (from - to)	1970 – 1975
• Institution	University of Malta
• Title of qualification awarded	Doctor of Law
• Thesis	'Collective Bargaining and the Law in Malta'
• Dates (from – to)	1970 – 1974
• Institution	University of Malta
• Title of qualification awarded	Notary Public Diploma
• Dates (from – to)	1966 – 1969
• Institution	University of Malta
• Title of qualification awarded	Legal Procurator Diploma
 Dates (from – to) Institution Subjects Title of qualification awarded 	1965 – 1969 University of Malta History, English, Economics Bachelor of Arts

RR\439062EN.doc

LANGUAGES

MOTHER TONGUE

OTHER LANGUAGES

• Reading skills

- Writing skills
- Verbal skills

ENGLISH Excellent

MALTESE

Excellent

Excellent

ITALIAN Excellent

Very good Excellent

PE439.062v03-00

EN

ANNEX 2: ANSWERS BY LOUIS GALEA TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE

Professional experience

1. Please highlight the main aspects of your professional experience in public finance, management or management auditing.

My experience in public finance and management derives from the years served as Speaker of the House of Representatives and as a Minister and member of Cabinet over a period of over 24 years in Malta. From 1987 to 2008 I served as Minister for Social Policy (1987-1992), Minister for Social Development and Home Affairs (1992-1996), Minister of Education and Culture (1998-2003) and Minister for Education and Employment (2003-2008).

The portfolios covered by these various Ministries included Health and the Elderly, Employment and Industrial Relations, Social Security, Social Welfare, Children, Women, Housing, Home Affairs, Police, Security and the Prisons, Education, Culture, Heritage and the Arts, Libraries and Archives, Youth and Sport, and Public Broadcasting Services. During this same period I served as a member of various Cabinet Committees including those responsible for EU Accession, the Public Service Reform, the Pensions Reform (chairperson) and Budget Planning and Priorities.

Many of these Ministerial posts involved the evolution of an entire legislative process and decisions concerning large-scale projects financed through substantial public funds, as well as maintaining control over the management of both projects and funds. My responsibilities included ensuring financial control, the formulation of business plans and budgets for the various Ministry portfolios and departments under my charge, and the presentation of accounts for debate in Parliament. As Cabinet Minister, I was also involved in the reform of the Maltese public service and public sector. I also did my best to improve the procedures that better guarantee that government programmes were properly implemented and that the allotted budgets were implemented in a lawful and regular manner according to sound financial management.

As Speaker I ensure that Parliament is, amongst other things, able to scrutinise and hold the Government accountable for the financial management and use of public funds. I work within different parliamentary committees, including the Public Accounts Committee, which is chaired by an Opposition MP. The Auditor General, who heads the National Audit Office, and the Ombudsman are Officers of the House. Malta's Constitution requires the Auditor General and the Ombudsman to be chosen by a parliamentary resolution supported by the vote of not less than two-thirds of the Members. I regularly follow and I am well versed with the work and findings of these offices whose task is to guarantee proper oversight, audit and the correct reporting of the financial and administrative management of the country by Government. The reports of these Committees are presented to Parliament through my office.

As Minister for Social Policy, some of my main tasks included the setting-up of a specialised geriatric hospital, the upgrading of Malta's oncology centre, the start of

```
RR\439062EN.doc
```

building work on a new general hospital (now *Mater Dei Hospital*), the reform of mental health care and psychiatric facilities and services, and the upgrading of the network of family- and community-based health and social services. During this term, a legislative reform process was carried out to modernise Malta's social security and social welfare system.

As Minister for Home Affairs, Police, Security and Prisons I carried out a reorganisation exercise for the Malta Police Force, launched the island's first professional intelligence service, ushered in modern concepts of civil protection and initiated a process of reform of the prisons, setting these up as a modern Correctional Services Department.

As Minister for Education, I was responsible for a root-and-branch reform of education in Malta. Changes included the launch of a new National Curriculum needed to address the quality requirements of education in schools and for the setting up of the Malta College of Arts, Science and Technology (MCAST). The Foundation for Tomorrow's Schools, the Foundation for Educational Services, the National Commission for Higher Education, the Malta Qualifications Council were four major agencies set up to professionalise sector operations and to strengthen policy development. Today these agencies are instrumental in the process of transformational change.

As Minister responsible for Culture, Heritage and Sport, I set up Heritage Malta, which is the agency that runs all government museums, the Malta Centre for Restoration (now Conservation Centre and Institute), the Malta Council for Culture and the Arts, the St James Centre for Creativity and the Maltese Language Council.

As Minister responsible for Employment, I set up the Employment and Training Corporation (Malta's employment agency) in 1990. I chaired the national industrial round of negotiations with all public service trade unions which led to the successful conclusion of the 2005-2010 Public Service Collective Agreement. Subsequently I was responsible for the development of Malta's National Action Plan for Employment and National Reform Programmes in relation to employment matters, and was later responsible for the joint steering of the Pensions Reform, a fundamental far reaching structural reform in Malta.

During Malta's EU accession negotiations I was Co-Chairperson of the Malta-EU Joint Parliamentary Committee (JPC). This Committee was instrumental in providing a parliamentary dimension to Malta's EU accession process and established the first formal link between Malta's Parliament and the European Parliament.

For the past 13 years I have lectured regularly at the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Economics, Management and Accountancy at the University of Malta, in public law particularly in social and labour legislation, my specialisation.

2. What are the three most important decisions to which you have been party in your professional life?

During my career in politics and public administration, I was party to several important

decisions and initiatives in areas for which I was directly responsible as well as in the broader government areas. These, I believe, were three areas where my personal input and commitment proved to be decisive:

- a) Throughout the Seventies and Eighties, the party of which I was general secretary and later a senior member of Cabinet worked untiringly to transform Malta into an open and dynamic economy, with substantial reforms being launched in the political, justice, economic and social systems. It was this calibre of primary reform that lead Malta towards becoming a Member State of the European Union, with all that the observance of the *acquis communautaire* implies, for each and every Maltese citizen in every sphere of human activity. I was honoured to be a protagonist, with others, in the success story of Malta's transformation, resilience and determination.
- b) Between 1987 and 1996, I led a wide-ranging social policy reform programme which was directed at shifting our welfare state from a culture of dependence to one where the individual is empowered to assume greater command of one's potential and where the State intervenes with more personalised measures.

This meant the adoption of new legislation and the setting up of new structures and programmes in the field of social security, welfare, health, the elderly, women and employment. Under my direction the Employment and Training Corporation was established, and the construction of a new general hospital was initiated. I was also a protagonist in Malta's recent Pension System Reform.

c) As Minister for Education, I undertook a radical reform of Malta's public education system, and launched a call 'For All Children to Succeed'. Priorities were reordered to overhaul the public school system, which was to develop from one that was fragmented to the rise of a College system made up of ten regional colleges which provide for a continuous and seamless progression for children, from kinder to primary through secondary levels, without hurdles and excessive streaming policies.

In 2001 I founded the Malta College of Arts, Science and Technology. This provided modern solutions, in the field of post-secondary vocational education and training. The Malta College of Arts Science and Technology will provide the basis for a knowledge-based Malta in the coming years, and I am proud to have been at the forefront in making this facility a reality.

Independence

3. The Treaty stipulates that the Members of the Court of Auditors shall be 'completely independent' in the performance of their duties. How would you apply this obligation to your prospective duties?

The treaty stipulates that the Members of the Court of Auditors shall be 'completely independent in the performance of their duties'. Subsequent articles of the same treaty

RR\439062EN.doc

also stress that the Members' 'independence must be beyond doubt' on a personal level and that 'in the performance of these duties, the Members shall neither seek nor take instructions from government or from any other body'.

In the light of these various references to independence I believe that Members of the Court require the ability to reflect and act without bias, in as much as an objective manner as possible, free from conflict of interest, and with as much impartial expert advice as possible.

I would ensure that, in any of the audits under my responsibility, there would be no legal barriers to the undertaking of audits, resources to undertake audits would be adequate, there would be no interference from other bodies in the conduct of such audits, full access of information required for such audits is submitted, audit findings are fairly reported upon, and duties are carried out in a transparent way.

In this respect, I will ensure that the independence provisions in the INTOSAI Lima Declaration of Auditing Precepts, the additional principles of the Mexico Declaration on Independence, as well as the Treaty on the Functioning of the EU provisions on the Court's independence are adhered to.

I also firmly believe that, without prejudice to open dialogue and active listening and understanding of all other bodies of the Union, Members of the Court require the necessary environment to reflect and reach impartial and objective opinions, and to be able to demonstrate in their interactions, a balanced distance from all parties that may have an interest in the Court's findings.

If I am appointed I would, from that point forward, be free from any other occupation, both gainful and not. I believe it is important to retain this status to ensure complete independence and avoid any potential conflict of interest. As Speaker of the House of Representatives I am already am well-versed in ensuring that a fully autonomous and independent stance is kept without exception or fail.

The sentence quoted in the question ends with an affirmation that independence of the Court is 'in the Union's general interest'. I firmly believe that a Court of Auditors which acts independently and with integrity to its functions promotes the interest of all parties.

4. Have you received a discharge for the management duties you carried out previously, if such a procedure applies?

The procedure of discharge referred to herein does not apply in my case.

Under the present circumstances, if I am appointed, I shall vacate the office of Speaker by announcing my resignation to the House of Representatives and in writing to the Clerk of the House.

5. Do you have any business or financial holdings or any other commitments, which

might conflict with your prospective duties? Are you prepared to disclose all your financial interests and other commitments to the President of the Court and make them public? In case you are involved in any current legal proceedings, would you please give details?

I do not have any business, financial interest or any other commitment that might conflict with my duties as a Member of the Court. For years I have complied with the requirements of the current Ethics Code for Maltese Ministers and Members of Parliament to publicly disclose any such interests, holdings or commitments. I will willingly disclose all such interests and commitments to the President of the Court and will have no difficulty with their publication according to the Court's rules. I am not a party to any legal proceedings that could in any way conflict with my duties as a Member of the Court.

6. Are you prepared to step down from any elected office or give up any active function with responsibilities in a political party after your appointment as Court Member?

On my appointment as Court Member I will step down from my post as Speaker of the House of Representatives. Since my election as Speaker I have already suspended all active functions and responsibilities in the political party to which I belong, and as a Court Member I would continue to refrain from any active political role.

7. How would you deal with a major irregularity or even fraud and/or corruption case involving actors in the Member State of your origin?

I would deal with any major case of irregularity/fraud/corruption in the same way for all cases (both those related to my country and those related to any other EU Member State). Should there be suspicion or prima facie circumstances of any major irregularity, fraud or corruption I will ensure the Court carries out a full investigation to establish all relevant information regarding the extent of irregularity/illegality and to identify the players that may be involved. In consultation with the Members of the Court, and on scrutiny of the findings, the case would then be referred to OLAF.

As a Member of the Court my first duty would be towards the Court of Auditors and its respective functions. I firmly believe that an impartial assessment of matters related to default situations involving my own country would still be in its best interests and I would therefore perform my function with due independence, impartiality, integrity, diligence and rigorous scrutiny as in cases involving any other Member State.

In my current capacity as Speaker of the House of Representatives in Malta, I am similarly expected to treat matters in an impartial objective manner. I do enjoy the respect of both sides of the House for the way I have discharged my role

Performance of duties

8. What should be the main features of a sound financial management culture in any public service?

 $RR \ 439062 EN. doc$

The three key features of sound financial management of public resources are the economical, efficient and effective use of funds and resources for achieving stated objectives.

An audit should ensure compliance with procurement regulations, and systems in place to guarantee the least costly operational options. Efficiency ensures cost-effectiveness of current operations and management decisions whereas effectiveness evaluates whether the entire cost and management system is successful in delivering the intended outcomes. Are outcomes clearly measured, and have the outcomes led to the desired impacts?

Sound financial management is also illustrated by the following:

- Competent and proper management structures, trained and adequate staff, and a sound knowledge of regulations in place;
- Adequate strategic planning, clearly defined objectives and tasks, clear delineation of staff responsibility, and clear information and communication throughout the organisation;
- Adequate information systems, timely and accurate records, availability of all third party vouching documents, audit trails and evidence of compliance with general procurement processes, and regular management evaluations of performance;
- Internal controls, risk assessments and having internal audit systems in place;
- Timely financial reporting for external stakeholders;
- Unqualified external audit reports and actioned management letters from external audits;
- Evidence of ongoing efforts to address shortcomings or recommendations identified through internal controls, internal and external audits and other review processes in place.

9. According to the Treaty, the Court shall assist Parliament in exercising its powers of control over the implementation of the budget. How would you describe your duties with regard to reporting to the European Parliament and its Committee on Budgetary Control, in particular?

The Court assists Parliament in exercising its powers of control over the implementation of the budget through the presentation of its audit reports of EU finances, in particular through the Committee on Budgetary Control.

The European Parliament monitors the implementation of the budget. The Court informs Parliament, with a Statement of Assurance, on the reliability of the accounts and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions. In doing so it safeguards and promotes 'the financial interests of the citizens of the Union'.

The European Parliament's Committee on Budgetary Control is the body that scrutinises EU expenditure. It discusses matters concerning the collection and spending of EU funds, and does so in the light of the Court's findings, its views on risks, mitigation and possible fund use improvements.

In its contacts with the Committee on Budgetary Control the Court receives valuable feedback on areas of potential concern or default in that these may help with the Court's own work-programme.

As a Member of the Court my duty would be to present to Parliament the findings of the Court in a spirit of open dialogue and collaboration, presenting audit methodology, results, appraisal and opinions regarding the level of risk that such findings will involve. This should serve to help Parliament better execute its functions in relation to the budget, and to generally refine the EU's regulatory framework. The increasing importance given by Parliament to the Court's findings is a key to future healthy exchanges of views and better appreciation of each other's function within the Union.

10. What do you think is the added value of performance audit and how should the findings be incorporated in the management?

Performance audits serve to evaluate the functioning of entities in terms of economy, efficiency and effectiveness, as identified earlier on. It addresses a basic question: given a set of policy objectives, are the right things being done in the right way?

This helps assess the economy of activities in accordance with sound administrative principles and practices; whether human, financial and other resources are being efficiently utilised; and the achievements of the audited entity including an evaluation of the actual impact compared to what was intended.

The lead benefit of performance audit is its mechanism which allows for present practice to be questioned and assessed in order to identify weaknesses or deficiencies, where these exist, so as to generate recommendations for possible improvements. Its principal merit is that it allows this search for improvement to be carried out in a structured and systematic manner.

The distinct insight provided by a performance audit should be of particular benefit to management which may be so much involved in the detailed execution of its task it may not be able to fully appreciate the potential to improve current practices. Management should exploit the findings of a performance audit by being open to adopt and incorporate the recommendations in its own agenda for change.

It is crucial to have follow-up mechanisms in place in order to determine if and to what extent recommendations have been adopted by management over time. Entities that received strong recommendations to improve aspects of their operations or management should report how recommendations have been implemented. Experience in public life teaches one that the value of recommendations lay only in their proper and timely implementation.

11. How could the cooperation improve between the Court of Auditors, the National Audit Institutions and the European Parliament (Committee on Budgetary Control) concerning the audit of the EU budget?

Cooperation can improve if a sense of common purpose is further advocated between these institutions, reinforcing the general framework of collaboration and work in terms of the overall purpose of securing the EU's financial interests.

A deep insight and understanding of the respective constitutions, powers, functions and limitations of different national audit systems is also crucial for effective collaboration.

Different jurisdictions require flexibility in collaboration, and mutual respect for their independence and legitimacy.

Such a development must be nurtured and promoted at various levels: at the political level to secure the required strategic convergence when identifying priorities; at an operational level to develop a 'common technical language' to facilitate effective and practical interaction

The importance of such collaboration must be a priority for the Court in the coming term, particularly on account of the fact that 'shared management' is an area which can benefit considerably through more effective primary controls within Member States, and national audit institutions could play a key role in such a process.

All opportunities to encourage greater cooperation should be actively explored by making the best use possible of mechanisms already in use (such as the Contact Committee of Supreme Audit Institutions) and ad-hoc initiatives (such as Inter-parliamentary conferences) that promote the benefit of enhanced cooperation.

I am aware that the Court is launching a pilot project on coordinated audits involving a number of national audit institutions. This promises to be an interesting development; it has the potential to provide a new avenue for enhanced cooperation between the ECA and the national audit institutions.

Other questions

12. Would you withdraw your candidacy if Parliament's opinion on your appointment as Member of the Court were unfavourable?

In principle I believe that all Court Members should command the trust of all stakeholders – particularly that of Parliament.

Although my nomination to the Court was submitted by the Malta Government, I would not wish to sustain my candidacy should Parliament form an unfavourable opinion of my appointment as a Member of the Court.

Without Parliament's confidence the necessary faith, trust and co-operation between the Court and Parliament would be endangered and the Court's position and reputation weakened. I have accepted the nomination precisely to contribute to the strengthening of the credibility and reputation of the Court in the general interests of the EU and its citizens.

I believe that I deserve Parliament's trust and will serve the Court's mission faithfully.

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	16.3.2010
Result of final vote	+: 21 -: 2 0: 1
Members present for the final vote	Marta Andreasen, Jean-Pierre Audy, Inés Ayala Sender, Zigmantas Balčytis, Jorgo Chatzimarkakis, Andrea Cozzolino, Luigi de Magistris, Tamás Deutsch, Martin Ehrenhauser, Jens Geier, Ingeborg Gräßle, Ville Itälä, Cătălin Sorin Ivan, Elisabeth Köstinger, Bogusław Liberadzki, Monica Luisa Macovei, Jan Olbrycht, Georgios Stavrakakis, Søren Bo Søndergaard
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Christofer Fjellner, Edit Herczog, Monika Hohlmeier, Sidonia Elżbieta Jędrzejewska, Markus Pieper