



EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2009 - 2014

Plenary sitting

A7-0017/2012

26.1.2012

RECOMMENDATION

on the draft Council decision on the conclusion of the Protocol agreed between the European Union and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau setting out the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the two parties currently in force (15178/2011 – C7-0003/2012 – 2011/0257(NLE))

Committee on Fisheries

Rapporteur: Carl Haglund

Symbols for procedures

- * Consultation procedure
- *** Consent procedure
- ***I Ordinary legislative procedure (first reading)
- ***II Ordinary legislative procedure (second reading)
- ***III Ordinary legislative procedure (third reading)

(The type of procedure depends on the legal basis proposed by the draft act.)

CONTENTS

	Page
DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION	5
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT	6
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON DEVELOPMENT	11
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON BUDGETS	16
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE	19

DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION

on the draft Council decision on the conclusion of the Protocol agreed between the European Union and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau setting out the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the two parties currently in force (15178/2011 – C7-0003/2012 – 2011/0257(NLE))

(Consent)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the draft Council decision (15178/2011),
 - having regard to the draft Protocol agreed between the European Union and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau setting out the fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the two parties currently in force (15179/2011),
 - having regard to the request for consent submitted by the Council, in accordance with Article 43(2) and Article 218(6), second subparagraph, point (a), of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (C7-0003/2012),
 - having regard to Rules 81 and 90(7) of its Rules of Procedure,
 - having regard to the recommendation of the Committee on Fisheries and the opinions of the Committee on Development and the Committee on Budgets (A7-0017/2012),
1. Consents to the conclusion of the Protocol to the Agreement;
 2. Calls on the Commission to forward to Parliament the minutes and the conclusions of the meetings of the Joint Committee provided for in Article 10 of the Agreement, as well as the annual programming provided for in Articles 3 and 9 of the new Protocol and the corresponding annual report; calls on the Commission to facilitate the participation of representatives of Parliament as observers in the meetings of the Joint Committee; calls on the Commission to submit to Parliament and to the Council, before the expiry of the new Protocol, an evaluation report on its implementation, without imposing unnecessary restrictions on access to that document;
 3. Calls on the Commission and the Council, in the context of their respective competences, to keep Parliament immediately and fully informed, at all stages of the procedures related to the new Protocol and its renewal, pursuant to Article 13(2) of the Treaty on European Union and Article 218(10) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union;
 4. Instructs its President to forward its position to the Council, the Commission, and the governments and parliaments of the Member States and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau.

EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

Introduction

On 17 March 2008 the Council adopted Regulation (EC) No 241/2008¹ on the conclusion of the Fisheries Partnership Agreement (FPA) between the European Community and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau, applicable for a period of 4 years, tacitly renewable, unless either party terminates it. The FPA was accompanied by a protocol setting out the fishing opportunities and the financial compensation for the period from 16 June 2007 to 15 June 2011.

The negotiations of a new protocol were delayed by the consultations which took place in 2011 between the EU and Guinea-Bissau under Article 96 of the Cotonou Agreement. As very limited time remained for concluding a new protocol before the expiry of the previous one, the two parties decided to conclude a protocol for one year to give both parties time to assess the prospect of a future protocol of a longer duration.

Consequently, a new Protocol was initialled on 15 June 2011, covering a period of one year from 16 June 2011. Its conclusion by the Council is subject to the prior consent of the EP under Articles 43(2) and 218(6) (a) TFEU.

This procedure was initiated in parallel with the procedures relating to the Council Decision on the signing on behalf of the Union and on the provisional application of the Protocol itself, and to the Council Regulation concerning the allocation of fishing opportunities between the Member States of the EU².

In order to allow EU vessels to carry out fishing activities pending the completion of the procedures for its conclusion, Article 14 of the new Protocol provides for it to be applied on a provisional basis as from 16 June 2011. According to Article 14 (3), the Parties shall attempt to conclude negotiations for a future Protocol no later than 15 March 2012.

The new Protocol was signed by both Parties on 20 December 2011 and the request for consent was received by the EP on 5 January 2012.

Content of the new Protocol

The table below summarizes the main elements of the new protocol, as well as the allocation of fishing opportunities between the Member States concerned, which is the subject of a specific Council Regulation. The terms of the expired Protocol for the period 2007-2011 are renewed and remain basically unchanged.

¹ OJ L 75, 18.3.2008,p.49

² See COM (2011) 602 and 604

However, the new Protocol contains additional clauses concerning the suspension and revision of the financial compensation and the suspension of its implementation in case of breach of the essential and fundamental elements of **human rights and democratic principles** as provided for in Art. 9 of the Cotonou Agreement (see Arts 7 and 11(1)).

Duration of the Protocol:	1 year (16.6.2011-15.6.2012)
Initialisation:	15 June 2011
Nature of the FPA:	Mixed Agreement
Financial contribution:	7 000 000 €/year out of which 2 450 000 € (35%) has been earmarked for the support of the Guinean Bissau sectoral fisheries policy in order to promote sustainability in its waters. In addition, 500 000 € will be provided to improve sanitary conditions for fishery products.
Fee for ship owners:	Pole and line tuna vessels: 25 € per tonne caught Seiners and longliners vessels : 35 € par tonne caught Shrimps trawlers : 307 €/t/year (increase if biannual or quarterly licences) Fin- fish and cephalopods trawlers : 229 €/t/year (increase if biannual or quarterly licences)
Advances:	- Pole and line: 500 € per year (ref catches: 20t) - Longliners and seiners: 3 150 € per year (ref catches: 90 t)

Fishing opportunities				
Member State	Tuna seiners and surface longliners vessels	Pole and line tuna vessels	Freezer, fin-fish and cephalopod trawlers (GRT)	Shrimps trawlers (GRT)
Spain	10	10	3143	1421
France	9	4	0	0
Italy	0	0	786	1776
Greece	0	0	471	137
Portugal	4	0	0	1066
TOTAL No of Vessels/tonnage	23	14	4400	4400

Rapporteur's comments and conclusions

Guinea Bissau is a tropical West African country with limited natural resources and a population estimated at around 1.6 million. It is one of the least developed and poorest countries in the world. The economy is largely agricultural, with a high dependency on the export of a single crop, cashew. The country is highly dependent on donor support, which provided 31% of national income in 2008. The EU is the major donor, providing about one third of the international donor assistance (of about EUR 100 million) in 2008. Potentially beneficial trade with the EU in fishery products is prevented due to non-compliance with EU sanitary measures.

Guinea Bissau has many fishery resources, both coastal and oceanic species. Around 10-12,000 artisanal fishers operate in the coastal regions. Catches from the artisanal sector have recently been estimated to be in the range of 30-50,000 tonnes/year, much higher than previously thought, and food dependency on fisheries is probably very high given the lack of alternative sources of animal protein.

According to the evaluation report by external experts¹, during 2007 to 2008 about 124 industrial fishing vessels each year have operated in the Guinea Bissau zone. In addition to the EU, Guinea Bissau has bilateral fisheries agreements with Senegal and China, both of which were renewed in 2010.

The production from the overall industrial fishery (including that of the EU) was estimated at 53,000 tonnes in 2008. Overall, about half of the production is small pelagic fish, such as mackerel, horse mackerel and sardinellas. About 40% is demersal fish, represented by a large number of species, including breams, sweetlips, croakers, catfishes and soles. Cephalopods account for about 5% of the catch, mainly in the form of cuttlefish and octopus. Tuna species account for 5% and shrimp and crabs account for just 2%.

During the course of the previous Protocol, 4 Joint Committees were held (July 2008, March 2010, March and June 2011). An active dialogue between the parties also took place through regular monitoring missions and during the negotiation rounds for the renewal of the Protocol, held in October 2010 and June 2011. The implementation process of the agreed policy matrix was impaired by the political and financial instability of the Guinean Government and the structural difficulties of the fisheries administration. The Joint Scientific Committee mentioned in Article 4 (1) of the Agreement only met for the first time in September 2010. However, despite the only partial achievement of the objectives within the time frame established by the parties, important progress has been made on agreed strategic objectives, most notably in relation to strengthened fisheries monitoring control and surveillance, and sanitary inspection capacity. Guinea Bissau's participation in regional fisheries bodies (especially the Subregional Fisheries Commission - CSRP) has also been strengthened. There have been positive steps in the drafting and approval of new legislation, fisheries statistics and resource management, in particular during the latest months, taking into account the minutes of the Joint Committee meetings held in March, June and September 2011.

During the period 2007-2009, the rate of available licences drawn was 45% for the freezer finfish and cephalopod opportunities, 36% for shrimp, 76% for tuna pole and line and 83% for

¹ Ex-post evaluation of the 2007-2011 Protocol and analysis of the impact of the future protocol, September 2010.

tuna purse seiners (no surface longline licences were drawn), with the demersal fishing opportunities in particular being poorly utilised. The report concludes that the Agreement has had a modest positive costs to benefit ratio of 2.2 for the EU (with an annual cost to the EU of EUR 6.6 million, compared to an annual benefit estimated to be EUR 14.5 million).

None of the tuna catches by EU vessels under the FPA account for more than 1% of the total exploitation of the species concerned. Yellowfin and skipjack bigeye tunas are considered by ICCAT to be exploited within sustainable limits, although the assessment for bigeye tuna is subject to a degree of uncertainty due to concerns regarding undeclared catches. The Agreement accounts for almost 100% of deepwater shrimp catch, 75% of other shrimp, 50-70% of the cephalopods and about 10% of the industrial demersal fish catches. Data for crustaceans, which consist mostly of shallow-water and deep-water shrimp, indicate a relatively stable (or even improving) condition. For fish and cephalopods, whilst the overall situation appears to be stable, there is insufficient quantity and quality of data to perform accurate species based stock assessments. Some concerns regarding the wider ecosystem impacts of the fisheries involved and the possible effects of bycatch and discarding are also mentioned. However, the report concludes that the Agreement may be considered to have had a significant positive impact on the sustainability of fisheries in the Guinea-Bissau exclusive economic zone, while stressing that more efforts are needed to improve the available information with a view to better risk management.

The FPA has provided access to fishing opportunities for EU fleet segments from highly fishery dependent areas, supported their regional presence in West Africa, created employment, and generated additional supplies for the EU market. It is estimated to support the employment of 470 EU nationals. The FPA accounts for about one quarter of all transfers from the EU to Guinea Bissau, and represents therefore an important additional pillar of support. It has started to deliver important developmental outcomes in terms of reduced IUU fishing, as well as increased trade prospects in fishery products. There are specific synergies with a number of European Development Fund regional development programmes. The EU - Guinea Bissau FPA is also relevant in the framework of a regionally integrated approach in line with the EU's integrated maritime policy and the applications of this policy to the Atlantic region.

The FPA has also proved to be relevant to the needs of **Guinea Bissau**, both as a major contribution to macroeconomic and budgetary stability and in terms of national fisheries policy, since it provides financial means for the implementation of important measures to support economic development and sustainability of the sector (according to the evaluation report it provided an average of about 7.3% of the annual government revenues and around 88% of budgeted fisheries expenditure). It has had a particular impact on reducing IUU fishing and bringing the sector closer to meeting EU sanitary conditions for trade in fishery products, both important conditions for development of a national fisheries sector. The FPA provides an important vehicle for sustaining the development agenda during periods of economic and budgetary instability. It has also allowed the EU and the Guinea Bissau authorities to maintain a policy dialogue, with a view to promoting responsible fishing.

It appears that it is in the interest of both parties to conclude a new protocol between Guinea Bissau and the European Union. For this reason, the rapporteur recommends the EP to consent to its conclusion.

The rapporteur underlines the need for a close monitoring of the implementation of measures set out in the Council Decision of 18 July 2011¹ concerning the conclusions of consultations with the Government of Guinea-Bissau under article 96 of the Cotonou Partnership Agreement. The rapporteur is also adamant that Art. 9 of the Cotonou Agreement be followed up, and the human rights situation in Guinea Bissau needs to be monitored. Because of the great importance of this FPA for Guinea Bissau, the local authorities have a clear incentive not to engage in breaches of human rights and democratic principles. If breaches were to happen however, the Commission needs to immediately suspend the payment of financial compensation and revise the protocol.

The rapporteur is concerned with the fact the Commission, on multiple occasions, have allowed the process of seeking consent from the European Parliament for a Protocol to a FPA to be delayed so that the Parliament is not able to take a decision before half of the duration of the Protocol has passed. This shows a concerning lack of respect for the Parliaments role in the process.

Furthermore, the concerns and recommendations contained in the evaluation report should be duly taken into account during the ongoing negotiations for a new protocol, in particular with regard to the efficiency of the Agreement, the rate of implementation of the partnership component and the need for improved monitoring of resources using the best available scientific advice, including by accelerating the programme of work of the Joint Scientific Committee.

¹ Council Decision 2011/492/EU, OJ L 203 of 6.08.2011

06.12.2011

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON DEVELOPMENT

for the Committee on Fisheries

on the proposal for a Council decision on the conclusion of the Protocol agreed between the European Union and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau setting out fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the two parties currently in force (COM(2011)0603 – C7-0000/2011 – 2011/0257(NLE))

Rapporteur: Isabella Lövin

PA_Leg_Consent

SHORT JUSTIFICATION

Guinea-Bissau is one of the least developed countries, with about two-thirds of households living below the poverty line. It is also a highly indebted developing country, highly dependent on donor support, which provides around 31% of national income.

However, Guinea-Bissau is extremely rich in fishery resources. Commercial stocks include demersal fish species, small pelagic fish, migratory large pelagic fish, shrimp and cephalopods. Around 12.000 artisanal fishermen, many of them of foreign origin, operate in the coastal regions; subsistence fishing is carried out by many more, and food dependency on fisheries is high given the lack of alternative sources of animal protein.

The Protocol to the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the European Community and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau expired on 15 June 2011. The new Protocol covers a period of one year from 16 June 2011 and has been applied on a provisional basis since that date.

In accordance with Article 43, paragraph 2 and Article 218, paragraph 6(a) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union the European Parliament can either consent or decline to consent to the conclusion of this Protocol.

The new Protocol does not modify the fishing opportunities provided for in the previous Protocol and the financial contribution is also maintained at the same level.

The financial contribution amounts to € 7 500 000 over the one year duration of this Protocol. This amount corresponds to:

- € 4 550 000 equivalent to a maximum of 37 authorisations for tuna vessels and an annual reference tonnage of 8 800 gross registered tonnage (GRT) for trawlers;
- € 2 450 000, corresponding to the additional envelop paid by the EU to support the sectoral fisheries policy of the Republic of Guinea-Bissau; and
- € 500 000, dedicated to the introduction of a health and plant health system for fishery products. However, the two parties may decide to allocate part of this specific contribution to strengthening, monitoring, control and surveillance in Guinea-Bissau fishing zones.

The amount allocated to the implementation of Guinea-Bissau's sectoral fisheries policy represents 35% of the overall financial contribution provided for in the Protocol. Guinea-Bissau shall be responsible for the management of this amount, based on the identification by the two Parties of the objectives to be achieved and the annual and multiannual programming to attain them, in particular as regards the sound management of fisheries resources, strengthening scientific research and the monitoring capacity of the competent Guinea-Bissau's authorities, and improving production conditions for fishery products.

The Protocol includes measures aiming at promoting the economic integration of EU operators in the Guinea-Bissau fisheries sector, notably by means of joint ventures between EU operators and Guinea-Bissau operators.

The ex-post assessment of the Fisheries Partnership Agreement acknowledges that, for the EU, the Agreement has had a modestly positive cost: benefit ratio of 2.2 (annual cost to the Commission plus the EU fleet of 6.6 million, compared to an annual benefit of EUR 14.5 million). However, the global financial contributions under this Agreement have provided an annual average of about 7,3% of the state budget of Guinea Bissau, and the sectoral support element has contributed some 88% of budgeted fisheries expenditure, thus making an important contribution to the economic stability of the country.

Traditional problems, such as illegal, unregulated and unreported fishing due to insufficient monitoring, control and surveillance, persist. There are also concerns regarding increasing levels of discards of undersized species covered by the Agreement and of non-commercial species, although data on discarding are not collected by observers. Moreover, there are problems concerning non-compliance with reporting conditions imposed on EU vessels which need to be addressed. Also, potentially beneficial trade with the EU in fishery products is prevented due to non-compliance with EU sanitary rules, there are no landings and only limited vessel visits. The Agreement has facilitated the employment of only 148 Guinea-Bissau crew onboard EU vessels.

Despite these limitations, accentuated by an unstable political and financial environment and by the structural difficulties of the fisheries administration, the ex-post assessment of the Fisheries Partnership Agreement shows notable improvements on agreed strategic objectives such as strengthened fisheries monitoring control and surveillance capacity and sanitary inspection capacity, and there have been positive steps in drafting of new legislation, fisheries statistics and resource management. Budgetary support from the Fisheries Partnership Agreement with the EU has played an important role in these improvements. In addition, the

Agreement is coherent with the EU's national and regional development approaches as it has specific synergies with a number of EDF regional development programmes. The Agreement has also allowed the EU and Guinea-Bissau authorities to maintain a political dialogue.

Your rapporteur considers that the Protocol can contribute to a better management and conservation of fisheries resources through financial support for the implementation of the programmes adopted at national level by Guinea-Bissau.

Your rapporteur welcomes the fact that this Protocol introduces new provisions whereby the payment of the financial contribution can be suspended in cases of violation of human rights and democratic principles. The Protocol may also be suspended if Guinea-Bissau fails to work towards responsible and sustainable fishing.

As a conclusion, your rapporteur takes the view that it is in the interest of both parties to conclude a new Protocol that would prolong the partnership between Guinea-Bissau and the EU.

The Committee on Development calls on the Committee on Fisheries, as the committee responsible, to propose that Parliament consents to the conclusion of the Protocol.

The Committee on Development considers that the Commission should duly take into account the following points during the implementation of the Agreement:

- (a) the transparency of the procedures for identifying and reporting the total catches should be improved along with the measures to prevent illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing, in particular by improving the infrastructure for the monitoring and control of fishing activities in the Republic of Guinea-Bissau Exclusive Economic Zone, thereby ensuring that fishing is responsible and sustainable;
- (b) access by EU vessels to the surplus of fisheries resources should be limited in accordance with the maximum sustainable yield after the nutrition needs of the local populations have been met;
- (c) the problem of increasing numbers of discards of undersized skipjack tunas, uncommercial species, sharks and rays and collateral catches of turtles should be addressed, and the very large quantities of bycatch and discards in shrimp trawling should be immediately stopped, through the use of selective gear which prevents bycatches;
- (d) the Joint Committee provided for in the Protocol should ensure that the integrity of the entire mechanism of the Agreement, as regards corruption problems, is beyond doubt;
- (e) the Joint Committee should also strive to take measures to promote more landings in Guinea-Bissau and to enhance local employment and other economic activities and partnerships in the fisheries sector;
- (f) the accountability of the local government should be reinforced, in particular so that it guarantees the improvement of living conditions for local fishermen, the development of local, sustainable, artisanal fisheries and fish-processing industries and compliance with

health and environmental standards;

- (g) both the spirit and letter of the exclusivity clause should be complied with; EU vessels which change flag to elude their obligations or to obtain additional fishing opportunities should not be allowed to return to the EU fleet register;
- (h) a report on the implementation of the Protocol - and in particular on the annual guidelines and objectives provided for in Article 9 thereof - should be drawn up and sent to Parliament and to the Council in order to promote transparency and to ensure that the budget envelop supporting the sectoral fisheries policy is in fact used for that purpose.

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	5.12.2011
Result of final vote	+: 20 -: 0 0: 0
Members present for the final vote	Véronique De Keyser, Leonidas Donskis, Charles Goerens, Catherine Grèze, Eva Joly, Filip Kaczmarek, Miguel Angel Martínez Martínez, Norbert Neuser, Maurice Ponga, Michèle Striffler, Alf Svensson, Anna Záborská, Iva Zanicchi, Gabriele Zimmer
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Fiona Hall, Eduard Kukan, Krzysztof Lisek, Linda McAvan, Judith Sargentini
Substitute(s) under Rule 187(2) present for the final vote	Vittorio Prodi

6.12.2011

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON BUDGETS

for the Committee on Fisheries

on the proposal for a Council decision on the conclusion of the Protocol agreed between the European Union and the Republic of Guinea-Bissau setting out fishing opportunities and the financial contribution provided for in the Fisheries Partnership Agreement between the two parties currently in force
(COM(2011)0603 – 2011/0257(NLE))

Rapporteur: François Alfonsi

PA_Leg_Consent

SHORT JUSTIFICATION

The new Protocol covers a period of one year from 16 June 2011. It renews the terms of the previous Protocol and contains an additional clause allowing its suspension if human rights and democratic principles are not respected.

Under Articles 43(2) and 218(6)(a) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, the European Parliament can either consent or decline to consent.

The new Protocol is in keeping with the two Parties' concern to strengthen partnership and cooperation in the fisheries sector using all the financial instruments available. To this end, it is recalled that there is a need to create a framework which is favourable to the development of investment.

The overall financial contribution of the Protocol of EUR 7 500 000 over the whole period is based on: (a) a maximum of 27 authorisations for tuna vessels and 8 800 GRT for trawlers, for a financial contribution of EUR 4 550 000 and (b) support for the development of the sectoral fisheries policy of the Republic of Guinea-Bissau amounting to EUR 2 950 000. This support meets the objectives of the national fisheries policy.

In terms of content, the Agreement's characteristics are as follows:

Type of expenditure	2011	2012	TOTAL
Preservation and management of natural resources	EUR 7 500 000		EUR 7 500 000
Administrative expenditure	EUR 79 900	EUR 79 900	EUR 159 800
TOTAL	EUR 7 579 900	EUR 79 900	EUR 7 659 800

Following a joint assessment of the state of stocks, opportunities to readjust the fishing quotas may be granted, on certain conditions.

The EU contribution will consist of the following elements:

- an annual amount of EUR 4 550 000 for fishing rights applicable to 70 000 tonnes per year (EUR 65 per tonne);
- an annual amount of EUR 2 950 000 for support and implementation of the sectoral fisheries policy in the Republic of Guinea-Bissau;

making a total of EUR 7 500 000 per year, not including administrative expenditure.

Including administrative expenditure, it comes to a total of EUR 7 659 800 in respect of the Protocol in its entirety.

The BUDG Committee therefore believes the following issues should be taken into account when implementing the agreement:

- an evaluation should be made each year to establish whether Member States whose vessels operate under the Protocol to the agreement have complied with catch reporting requirements; where the provisions are not complied with the Commission should refuse applications for fishing authorisation submitted by those countries for the following year;
- a report should be submitted each year to Parliament and the Council on the results of the multiannual sectoral programme described in Article 7 of the Protocol and on compliance by the Member States with the requirement to declare catches;
- an ex post evaluation of the Protocol, including a cost-benefit analysis, should be submitted to Parliament and the Council before the Protocol expires or before negotiations for its possible replacement begin.

The Committee on Budgets calls on the Committee on Fisheries, as the committee responsible, to propose that Parliament give its consent.

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	5.12.2011
Result of final vote	+: 22 -: 1 0: 0
Members present for the final vote	Isabelle Durant, Göran Färm, Eider Gardiazábal Rubial, Salvador Garriga Polledo, Ivars Godmanis, Carl Haglund, Lucas Hartong, Jutta Haug, Anne E. Jensen, Ivailo Kalfin, Sergej Kozlík, Jan Kozłowski, Alain Lamassoure, Giovanni La Via, Vladimír Maňka, László Surján, Helga Trüpel, Derek Vaughan, Angelika Werthmann, Jacek Włosowicz
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Edit Herczog, Jan Mulder, Georgios Stavrakakis

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

Date adopted	24.1.2012
Result of final vote	+: 19 -: 0 0: 3
Members present for the final vote	Kriton Arsenis, Alain Cadec, João Ferreira, Carmen Fraga Estévez, Pat the Cope Gallagher, Dolores García-Hierro Caraballo, Marek Józef Gróbarczyk, Carl Haglund, Ian Hudghton, Iliana Malinova Iotova, Werner Kuhn, Isabella Lövin, Gabriel Mato Adrover, Guido Milana, Maria do Céu Patrão Neves, Ulrike Rodust, Struan Stevenson, Catherine Trautmann
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Julie Girling, Ana Miranda, Ioannis A. Tsoukalas
Substitute(s) under Rule 187(2) present for the final vote	Bogdan Kazimierz Marcinkiewicz