REPORT

on a European Pillar of Social Rights
(2016/2095(INI))

Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

Rapporteur: Maria João Rodrigues
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Motion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>EXPLANATORY STATEMENT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>MINORITY OPINION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN’S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

on a European Pillar of Social Rights
(2016/2095(INI))

The European Parliament,

– having regard to the Treaty on European Union (TEU), the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) and the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union,

– having regard Article 9 of the TFEU, which requires the EU to promote a high level of employment, guarantee adequate social protection, fight against social exclusion and ensure a high level of education, training and protection of human health,

– having regard to Articles 151-156 of the TFEU,

– having regard to the Declaration of 9 May 1950, which called for ‘the equalisation and improvement of the living conditions of workers’,

– having regard to the European Social Charter, the Additional Protocol thereto and the revised version thereof, which entered into force on 1 July 1999, in particular Part I, Part II, and Articles 2, 4, 16 and 27 of the latter, on the right of workers with family responsibilities to equal opportunities and equal treatment,

– having regard to the European Convention on Human Rights,

– having regard to UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, ratified by the EU in 2010,

– having regard to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, which entered into force in 1990,

– having regard to the Community Charter of Fundamental Social Rights of Workers, adopted on 9 December 1989,

– having regard to the Sustainable Development Goals for 2030, which were adopted by the UN in 2015 and which apply to the whole world, including the EU,


– having regard to the conventions and recommendations of the International Labour Organisation (ILO),

– having regard to the Council of Europe’s European Code of Social Security and the Protocol thereto, a core European minimum harmonisation instrument for social security systems, providing minimum standards and permitting the contracting parties to

---

exceed these standards,

- having regard to the report of the Independent Expert on the enjoyment of all human rights by older persons,

- having regard to the existing EU legislation, policy coordination mechanisms and financial instruments in the fields of employment, social policy, economic and monetary policy, the internal market, the free movement of goods, persons, services and capital, the European Social Fund, and economic, social and territorial cohesion,


- having regard to the conclusions of the European Council of 14 December 2007 endorsing common principles of flexicurity and recognising the importance of a solid, integrated and balanced approach to the key challenges for the modernisation of labour markets,

- having regard to the Council recommendations and conclusions on Roma integration,

- having regard to the Commission recommendation of 3 October 2008 on the active inclusion of people excluded from the labour market (2008/867/EC),

- having regard to the Commission recommendation entitled ‘Investing in children: breaking the cycle of disadvantage’, of 2013,

- having regard to the Council conclusions of 7 December 2015 on ‘The promotion of the social economy as a key driver of economic and social development in Europe’,

- having regard to the Employment Equality Directive 1,


- having regard to the Written Statement Directive 2,

- having regard to the Fixed-Term Work Directive 3,

- having regard to the Temporary Work Agency Directive 4,

---

– having regard to the Part-Time Directive¹,
– having regard to the Racial Equality Directive²,
– having regard to the political guidelines for the Commission, entitled ‘A New Start for Europe: My Agenda for Jobs, Growth, Fairness and Democratic Change’ and presented by Jean-Claude Juncker on 15 July 2014,
– having regard to the report on completing Europe’s economic and monetary union (the ‘Five Presidents’ Report’) of 22 June 2015,
– having regard to the Commission communication of 8 March 2016 launching a consultation on a European Pillar of Social Rights (COM(2016)0127) and the annexes thereto,
– having regard to the Commission communication of 2 June 2016 entitled ‘A European agenda for the collaborative economy’ (COM(2016)0356),
– having regard to the Commission recommendation of 3 October 2008 on the active inclusion of people excluded from the labour market (2008/867/EC),
– having regard to the Commission communication of 4 October 2016 on the Youth Guarantee and Youth Employment Initiative three years on (COM(2016)0646),
– having regard to the Commission report on the application of Directive 2008/104/EC on temporary agency work of 21 March 2014,
– having regard to the EESC Opinion SOC 520 of September 2015 on ‘principles for effective and reliable welfare provision systems’,
– having regard to its resolution of 6 July 2016 on the strategic priorities for the Commission Work Programme 2017³,
– having regard to its resolution of 15 January 2013 with recommendations to the Commission on information and consultation of workers, anticipation and management of restructuring⁴,
– having regard to its resolution of 20 May 2015 on maternity leave⁵,

– having regard to its resolution of 16 January 2014 on an EU homelessness strategy\(^1\),
– having regard to its resolution of 9 June 2015 on the EU Strategy for equality between women and men post 2015\(^2\),
– having regard to its resolution of 8 October 2015 on the application of Directive 2006/54/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 July 2006 on the implementation of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation\(^3\),
– having regard to the European Commission’s Strategic Engagement for Gender Equality, 2016-2019,
– having regard to the European Pact for Gender Equality (2011-2020),
– having regard to its resolution of 23 October 2015 on reducing inequalities with a special focus on child poverty\(^4\),
– having regard to its resolution of 25 November 2015 on the EU Strategic Framework on Health and Safety at Work 2014-2020\(^5\),
– having regard to its resolution of 14 April 2016 on meeting the antipoverty target in the light of increasing household costs\(^6\),
– having regard to its resolution of 7 July 2016 on the implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, with special regard to the Concluding Observations of the UN CRPD Committee\(^7\),
– having regard to its resolution of 14 September 2016 on social dumping in the European Union\(^8\),
– having regard to its resolution of 13 September 2016 on creating labour market conditions favourable for work-life balance\(^9\),
– having regard to its resolution of 5 October 2016 on the need for a European reindustrialisation policy in light of the recent Caterpillar and Alstom cases\(^10\),
– having regard to its resolution of 10 September 2015 on creating a competitive EU labour market for the 21st century: matching skills and qualifications with demand and

---

\(^1\) Texts adopted, P7_TA(2014)0043.
\(^6\) Texts adopted, P8_TA(2016)0136.
\(^7\) Texts adopted, P8_TA(2016)0318.
\(^8\) Texts adopted, P8_TA(2016)0346.
job opportunities, as a way to recover from the crisis1,

– having regard to its resolution of 19 January 2016 on skills policies for fighting youth unemployment2,

– having regard to its resolution of 20 November 2012 on a Social Investment Pact as a response to the crisis3 and to the Commission’s Social Investment Package of 20 February 2013, including the Commission recommendation entitled ‘Investing in children: breaking the cycle of disadvantage’,

– having regard to its resolutions on Roma4,

– having regard to Eurofound’s European Industrial Relation Dictionary,

– having regard to the Eurofound report of 2014 on ‘Pay in Europe in the 21st century’5

– having regard to the Eurofound report of 2014 on ‘Access to healthcare in time of crisis’6,

– having regard to the Eurofound report of 2015 on ‘Access to social benefits: reducing non-take-up’7,

– having regard to the Eurofound report of 2015 on ‘New forms of employment’8,

– having regard to the Eurofound report of 2015 on ‘Inadequate housing in Europe: Costs and consequences’9,

– having regards to the forthcoming 2016 Eurofound Sixth European Working Conditions Survey overview report,

– having regard to the ILO study of 2016 on ‘Building a social pillar for European convergence’,

– having regard to the work carried out by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), and particularly to its surveys on migrants and minorities and reports on severe labour exploitation, child protection systems and the right to independent living for people with disabilities,

– having regard to the Court of Justice judgment in Case C-266/14 on the organisation of working time for workers who are not assigned a fixed or habitual place of work,

7 Eurofound (2015), Access to social benefits: Reducing non-take-up.
8 Eurofound (2015), New forms of employment.
9 Eurofound (2016) Inadequate housing in Europe: Costs and consequences.
having regard to the Court of Justice judgment in Joined Cases C 8/15 P to C 10/15 P (Ledra Advertising and others) of 20 September 2016, which strengthens the fundamental rights of citizens vis-à-vis the Commission and the European Central Bank in connection with the adoption of Memoranda of Understanding on behalf of the ESM,

having regard to the joint analyses by the European social partners BusinessEurope, CEEP, ETUC and UEAPME of October 2007 entitled ‘Key challenges facing European labour markets’ and of July 2015 entitled ‘In-depth employment analysis by the European social partners’,

having regard to the joint opinion of the Employment Committee and Social Protection Committee on the European Pillar of Social Rights, endorsed by the Council on 13 October 2016,

having regard to Rule 52 of its Rules of Procedure,

having regard to the report of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs and the opinion of the Committee on Women’s Rights and Gender Equality (A8-0391/2016),

A. whereas the EU must respond swiftly and visibly to increasing frustration and worry among many people about uncertain life prospects, unemployment, growing inequalities and lack of opportunities, in particular for young people; whereas the public consultation on the European Pillar of Social Rights conducted by the Commission until December 2016, has developed into a thorough reflection on the existing social acquis and a wide-ranging discussion among social partners, national governments and parliaments, civil society and the EU institutions on the future and structure of a European social model for the future; whereas this debate can help to draw attention to the EU’s basic values and the fact that Europe has, in a worldwide comparison, advanced labour and social standards and social protection systems; whereas the debate on the European Pillar of Social Rights and the necessary steps to be taken in the follow-up thereto can also help to place the European project on stronger foundations and improve people’s sense of ownership over the process of European integration;

B. whereas the EU needs to develop further a European social model which is embedded in a social market economy, empowers people and enables sustainable prosperity and high productivity based on solidarity, social justice and equal opportunities, a fair distribution of wealth, intergenerational solidarity, the rule of law, non-discrimination, gender equality, universal and high-quality education systems, quality employment and sustainable job-rich and inclusive growth over the long term, in line with worldwide Sustainable Development Goals – a model that is genuinely aimed at full employment, ensures adequate social protection and quality essential services for all, combats economic inequality, empowers people in vulnerable situations, fights poverty and social exclusion, enhances participation in civil and political life, and improves living standards for all people in the EU, delivering on the objectives and rights set out in the EU Treaties, the Charter of Fundamental Rights and the European Social Charter;

C. whereas the Commission has committed itself to achieving a ‘social AAA rating’ for the EU and is expected to come forward in the spring of 2017 with a proposal for a European Pillar of Social Rights that will promote well-functioning and inclusive labour markets and welfare systems in participating Member States and serve as a compass for
renewed upward convergence by (i) updating existing EU legislation, (ii) improving the EU's framework for economic and social policy coordination, inter alia through social benchmarking of national reform efforts without establishing inefficient parallel structures and (iii) ensuring relevant financial support at national and European levels; whereas Parliament, elected directly by European citizens, has a fundamental responsibility and a role to play in defining and adopting the European Pillar of Social Rights;

D. whereas economic and social policies are meant to serve people, including by promoting sustainable and socially responsible economic activities on a level playing field, and whereas people are also the most important factor for the competitiveness of a company and the proper functioning of the entire economy;

E. whereas social dialogue can contribute positively to growth, employment and competitiveness; whereas the Union is obliged to recognise and promote the role of the social partners, facilitate dialogue between them and respect their autonomy, including as regards wage-setting, the right to negotiate, conclude and enforce collective agreements and the right to take collective action in accordance with national law and practices; whereas the European Pillar of Social Rights should encourage social partners and Member States to establish standards higher than those agreed at European level; whereas the Commission consults the social partners on the possible direction of Union action in the social policy field; whereas continuous support is needed for social dialogue at all levels;

F. whereas it is crucial that companies behave in a socially responsible way, with real regard for sustainability and the interests of society; whereas it is valuable to involve workers in decision making; whereas social economy enterprises, such as cooperatives, provide a good example in terms of creating quality employment, supporting social inclusion and promoting a participatory economy;

G. whereas fundamental social rights apply to all people in the EU and the existing body of Union legislation regulating labour, product and service markets applies to all Member States; whereas economic integration makes Member States interdependent in terms of their capacity to ensure decent working conditions and maintain social cohesion; whereas a functioning single market requires a solid core of social rights for workers to prevent competition on the basis of labour conditions; whereas the principle of subsidiarity as defined in the Treaties justifies action at Union level by reason of the scale or effects of the proposed action; whereas the achievement of the EU's social objectives also depends on national legislation and on well-developed national social systems; whereas regional differences between wage levels and social security systems are to some extent unavoidable but care should be taken to ensure that they do not create downward pressure on working and living conditions; whereas upward social and economic convergence is very important for the proper functioning of the Union; whereas the Union does not harmonise national social security systems but coordinates them, promotes their development and facilitates efficient social security protection of people exercising their right to free movement; whereas regulatory developments need to keep pace with technological and other innovation in order to provide legal certainty and promote economic development through fair competition; whereas the implementation of the European Pillar of Social Rights will require multi-level action,
cross-sectoral approaches and full involvement of stakeholders; whereas provisions on workers' rest time should take into account, where applicable, a common weekly day of rest recognised by tradition and custom in the country or region;

H. whereas European welfare states need to be updated and strengthened to support upward transitions into and within the labour market and to maintain economic security throughout people's lives; whereas, with the labour market becoming more complex, it is natural that the welfare state also needs to adapt its mechanisms and instruments in order to manage correctly the various social risks arising; whereas this updating process should also improve people's access to and interaction with the welfare state and facilitate the application of relevant rules, including for SMEs; whereas, however, the role of welfare states is broader than what concerns the labour market; it includes inter alia also the operation of social security systems, the fight against poverty and social exclusion and investment in education, childcare, healthcare, social services and other essential services; whereas 'social investments' that support people's development from early childhood until old age have a crucial role in enabling people to participate fully in a 21st century society and economy; whereas a major effort will be needed to reach the poverty reduction and social inclusion target of the Europe 2020 Strategy; whereas housing is a pressing issue in many Member States and many households are spending a high proportion of their disposable income on housing and energy costs;

I. whereas ILO Recommendation No 202 provides that social protection floors should comprise at least the following basic social protection guarantees: a) access to a nationally defined set of goods and services, in particular essential health care, including maternity care, that meets the criteria of availability, accessibility, acceptability and quality; b) basic income security for children, at least at a nationally defined minimum level, providing access to nutrition, education, care and any other necessary goods and services; c) basic income security, at least at a nationally defined minimum level, for persons in active age who are unable to earn sufficient income, in particular in cases of sickness, unemployment, maternity and disability; and d) basic income security, at least at a nationally defined minimum level, for older persons; whereas the European Pillar of Social Rights should take this definition into account and seek to ensure that such basics of social protection are fully achieved and preferably exceeded in all Member States; whereas the European Economic and Social Committee has made a useful contribution in this respect by agreeing on principles for effective and reliable welfare systems;

J. whereas all EU Member States face certain employment and social challenges; whereas the realisation of social rights also depends on policies and instruments supporting territorial cohesion, particularly in regions with serious and permanent natural, demographic or structural economic disadvantages, including regions with low population density and dispersed population or outermost regions; whereas greater strategic investment and support for cohesion is needed in disadvantaged regions with a view to making them more competitive, improving their socio-economic structure and preventing further demographic decline; whereas, with its present macroeconomic framework, the euro area faces specific challenges to the achievement of the employment and social objectives set out in the Treaties, notably in the sense that euro area membership reduces possibilities for the use of macroeconomic policy instruments at national level and creates pressure for swifter internal adjustment; whereas restoring
adequate socio-economic security to offset this increased internal flexibility may require considering specific social targets, standards and/or financial instruments at the euro area level;

K. whereas European labour markets are more often evolving towards 'atypical' or 'non-standard' forms of employment, such as temporary work, involuntary part-time work, casual work, seasonal work, on-demand work, dependent self-employment or work intermediated by digital platforms; whereas demand for labour is becoming more diversified than in the past; whereas in some cases this can be beneficial for productivity, work-life balance, transitions into the labour market and second career opportunities for those who need them; whereas, however, some non-standard forms of employment involve prolonged economic insecurity and bad working conditions, notably in terms of lower and less certain incomes, lack of possibilities to defend one's rights, lack of social and health insurance, lack of a professional identity, lack of career prospects, and difficulties in reconciling on-demand work with private and family life; whereas a dynamic labour market should ensure that everyone has the chance to use his or her skills and abilities in their working life, based inter alia on healthy and safe working conditions, active labour market policies and on updating competences over the course of a life through regular and lifelong learning; whereas relevant CJEU case law clarifies the concepts 'employment relationship' and 'worker' for the purpose of applying EU law, without prejudice to national definitions of a 'worker' that are established for the purposes of national law in line with the principle of subsidiarity;

L. whereas active labour market policies, individual responsibility and participation in lifelong learning are important for labour market inclusion, even though unemployment results in most cases from a lack of open job vacancies or other circumstances beyond a person's control;

M. whereas people finding themselves in vulnerable situations or suffering more often from discrimination such as women, ethnic minorities, the long-term unemployed, senior citizens and people with disabilities may require additional measures to foster their participation in the labour market and to ensure decent living standards throughout their lives; whereas the EU has committed itself to building a barrier-free Europe for the estimated 80 million people with disabilities in the EU and the EU's poverty reduction and employment targets will not be reached if people with disabilities are not fully integrated into the economy and society; whereas the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) has been ratified by the EU and its principles should therefore be mainstreamed within the Pillar of Social Rights; whereas the negative impact of the crisis on access to healthcare has often come with a delay, and many people have found themselves unable to access healthcare even if services are formally covered, in particular because they cannot afford co-payments or experience waiting lists;

N. whereas women still face many forms of discrimination in the EU and are still underrepresented in all areas of decision making;

O. whereas gender equality is enshrined in the EU Treaties and in the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and is a core EU value; whereas, nevertheless, women remain underrepresented in the labour market as a whole, with the employment rate for men
standing at 75.6 % compared with 64.5 % for women, and overrepresented in part-time work and the lowest-paid sectors, in addition to receiving lower hourly wages, leading to a gender pay gap of 16 % and contributing to a pension gap of 39 %, with significant differences between Member States; whereas gender-based discrimination continues to prevail in recruitment procedures in the Member States, despite women surpassing men in educational attainment;

P. whereas social rights, services and adequate income are gendered issues, as more women are in low-income jobs, at higher risk of poverty, and more dependent on social services, both public and private, and hold the traditional role of caregiver for both children and older members of the family and the primary responsibility for household needs, resulting overall in lower pensions for women;

Q. whereas the 2002 Barcelona targets are far from being reached, while the Charter of Fundamental Rights states that children have a right to protection and care, and whereas this has a dramatic impact on female labour market participation, gender equality, work-life balance and female poverty;

R. whereas Europe can go much further in developing a cluster of sectors focused on supporting people’s health, knowledge and ability to participate in the economy; whereas people-focused services such as education, healthcare, childcare, other care services as well as sport contain an important job creation potential and should not be viewed as a cost to the economy but rather as enabling factors of sustainable prosperity;

S. whereas a strategic approach is needed to the challenges posed by the ageing and shrinking of the EU’s working-age population, notably as regards future skills shortages and mismatches in the EU labour market and projected evolution of economic dependence ratios, taking into account also third country nationals legally residing in the EU; whereas it is important to promote opportunities for professional mobility, in particular among young people, including those following vocational training through apprenticeships;

1. Calls on the Commission to build on the review of the social acquis and of EU employment and social policies as well as on the outcomes of the 2016 public consultation by making proposals for a solid European Pillar of Social Rights (EPSR) that is not limited to a declaration of principles or good intentions but reinforces social rights through concrete and specific tools (legislation, policy-making mechanisms and financial instruments), delivering a positive impact on people’s lives in the short and medium term and enabling support for European construction in the 21st century by effectively upholding the Treaties’ social objectives, supporting national welfare states, strengthening cohesion, solidity and upward convergence in economic and social outcomes, ensuring adequate social protection, reducing inequality, achieving long overdue progress in reducing poverty and social exclusion, facilitating national reform efforts through benchmarking and helping to improve the functioning of the EMU and of the EU’s single market;

2. Considers that the European Pillar of Social Rights should also help to ensure proper application of international labour standards and help to update the social acquis; is of the view that standards to be articulated by the European Pillar of Social Rights should apply to all countries participating in the single market in order to maintain a level
playing field and that legislation, governance mechanisms and financial instruments relevant for their achievement should apply to all EU Member States; underlines that the Pillar of Social Rights should be taken into account in EU economic policies; finds that the specific constraints of euro area membership call for additional specific social targets and standards to be established and relevant financial support to be considered at the euro area level while remaining open to non-euro area Member States on a voluntary basis; points to the possibility of using the enhanced cooperation mechanism under Article 20 of the TEU if necessary to build a solid European Pillar of Social Rights;

3. Emphasises that the EPSR should equip people living in the EU with stronger means of keeping control over their lives, enabling them to live a dignified life and realise their aspirations by mitigating various social risks arising over the course of their entire life and empowering people to participate fully in society and be able to adapt to frequent technological and economic changes, including through up-skilling and support for entrepreneurship; underlines that the EPSR should make markets work for shared prosperity, wellbeing and sustainable development in the context of a highly competitive social market economy, aimed at full employment and social progress and making use also of an industrial policy at the EU level; considers that the Pillar should do so by promoting relevant social standards and by empowering national welfare states to maintain social cohesion and equality across the EU through adequate, accessible and financially sustainable social protection systems and social inclusion policies; emphasises that it should also facilitate free movement of workers in a deeper and fairer European labour market; highlights the fact that the EPSR should also contribute to upholding the principles of equal treatment, non-discrimination and equal opportunities through employment and social policies; recommends that the Pillar thus enable effective realisation of existing social rights and that it set out new rights where justified in view of new technological and socio-economic developments; believes that, in these ways, the Pillar will also enhance the legitimacy of the EU;

Updating existing labour and social standards

4. Calls on the social partners and the Commission to work together to present a proposal for a framework directive on decent working conditions in all forms of employment, extending existing minimum standards to new kinds of employment relationships, based on a thorough impact assessment; considers that this framework directive should improve enforcement of EU law, increase legal certainty across the single market and prevent discrimination by complementing existing EU law and ensuring for every worker a core set of enforceable rights, regardless of the type of contract or employment relationship, including equal treatment, health and safety protection, protection during maternity leave, provisions on working time and rest time, work-life balance, access to training, in-work support for people with disabilities, adequate information, consultation and participation rights, freedom of association and representation, collective bargaining and collective action; underlines that this framework directive should apply to employees and all workers in non-standard forms of employment, without necessarily amending already existing directives; recalls that existing labour rights are applied by Member States in accordance with national and EU law; calls also for more effective and efficient implementation and control of existing labour standards in order to improve the enforceability of rights and tackle undeclared work;
Working conditions

5. Recognises that a certain variety of employment contracts is useful for efficient matching of workers and employers; recalls, however, the risk of labour market dualism and the danger of people being trapped in insecure contracts without a tangible prospect of upward transitions; stresses the importance of open-ended employment contracts for socio-economic security and points to the benefits which such contracts provide to employers across numerous sectors; supports also promotion of social economy business models; calls on the Commission to broaden the Written Statement Directive (91/533/EEC) to cover all forms of employment and employment relationships; calls for the framework directive on decent working conditions also to include relevant existing minimum standards to be ensured in certain specific relationships, in particular:

(a) proper learning and training content and decent working conditions for internships, traineeships and apprenticeships in order to ensure that they serve as genuine stepping stones in the transition from education to professional life, as provided for in the Council Recommendation on a Quality Framework for Traineeships, and that they are limited in time and do not replace employment for young people; remuneration should be commensurate with the work provided, the skills and experience of the person and the need to enable interns, trainees and apprentices on the labour market outside educational curricula to make ends meet;

(b) for work intermediated by digital platforms and other instances of dependent self-employment, a clear distinction – for the purpose of EU law and without prejudice to national law – between those genuinely self-employed and those in an employment relationship, taking into account ILO Recommendation No 198, according to which the fulfilment of several indicators is sufficient to determine an employment relationship; the status and basic responsibilities of the platform, the client and the person performing the work should thus be clarified; minimum standards of collaboration rules should also be introduced with full and comprehensive information to the service provider on their rights and obligations, entitlements, associated level of social protection and the identity of employer; those employed as well as those genuinely self-employed who are engaged through online platforms should have analogous rights as in the rest of the economy and be protected through participation in social security and health insurance schemes; Member States should ensure proper surveillance of the terms and conditions of the employment relationship or service contract, preventing abuses of dominant positions by the platforms;

(c) limits regarding on-demand work: zero-hour contracts should not be allowed, in view of the extreme uncertainty which they involve;

6. Acknowledges the declining labour share of total income in Europe over the past decades; emphasises the need for renewed upward social convergence and the gender pay gap to be closed throughout the EU in order to boost demand, enable sustainable and inclusive growth and reduce inequalities; recognises that decent living wages are important as a means of avoiding in-work poverty; calls on the Commission to support actively wider coverage for collective agreements in line with Member States’ national traditions and practices and with due respect for the autonomy of social partners;
recommends the establishment of wage floors in the form of a national minimum wage, where applicable, with due respect for the practices of each Member State and after consulting the social partners, with the objective of attaining gradually at least 60% of the respective national median wage, if possible, and not below the living wage level of the region concerned; calls on the Commission to prepare a pilot version of a regional living wage calculation that would help to define living wages, serve as a reference tool for social partners and help to exchange best practices in this regard;

7. Recalls that the right to healthy and safe working conditions also involves protection against workplace risks as well as limitations on working time and provisions on minimum rest periods and annual leave; urges the Member States to fully implement the relevant legislation; awaits Commission proposals for concrete measures to uphold this right effectively for all workers, including seasonal and contract workers, and comprising also measures to prevent violence against women or harassment; notes that such measures should be based on an impact assessment, reflecting all current knowledge about health and safety risks and taking into account new ways of working associated with digitalisation and other technological developments;

8. Stresses the importance of the right of collective bargaining and action as a fundamental right enshrined in EU primary law; expects the Commission to step up concrete support for strengthening and respecting social dialogue at all levels and sectors, in particular where it is not sufficiently well developed, while taking into account different national practices; recognises the benefits of involving workers in company management, including in transnational companies, and of their information, consultation and participation, also with a view to making good use of new forms of work organisation, ensuring that work is meaningful and rewarding, and anticipating economic change; calls for monitoring of the application of European legislation on European Works Councils and the information and consultation of workers and for effective measures to ensure that company restructuring takes place in a socially responsible manner;

9. Emphasises the need for comprehensive, reliable and regularly updated data on the quality of work and employment which can be used for monitoring the quality of work and employment over time and provide evidence for policy making on the topic; calls on Eurofound to further develop its activities in monitoring job quality and working life throughout its European working conditions survey based on its concept of job quality as comprising earnings, prospects, physical environment, social environment, work intensity, skills use and discretion, working time quality; calls on Eurofound to further develop its research on policies, social partner agreements and companies practices which are supportive of better job quality and working lives;

Adequate and sustainable social protection

10. Points out that social protection rights are individual rights; supports more integrated provision of social protection benefits and quality social services as a way to make the welfare state more understandable and accessible while not weakening social protection; underlines the need for adequate social protection and social investment throughout people's lives, enabling everyone to participate fully in society and the economy and sustaining decent living standards; points to the importance of informing citizens about social rights and to the potential of accessible e-government solutions,
possibly including a European social security card, with strong data protection guarantees, which could improve EU social security coordination and individual awareness, and also help mobile workers clarify and safeguard their contributions and entitlements in home and host countries and facilitate the work of national labour inspectorates; highlights the importance of personalised, face-to-face support, in particular for excluded and vulnerable households;

11. Agrees with the importance of universal access to timely, good-quality and affordable preventative and curative health care and to medicines; considers this as a right that must be upheld, including in rural areas and cross-border regions; emphasises that all residents must be covered by health insurance; agrees that increased health prevention and disease prevention is an obvious social investment that pays for itself, also through healthier ageing;

12. Is aware that rising life expectancy and a shrinking workforce pose a challenge to the sustainability and adequacy of pension systems and to intergenerational solidarity; notes that closing the gender pension gap must also be a priority in this regard; reaffirms that the best response is to increase the overall employment rate through employment models linked to full pension insurance coverage and with particular attention being given to the younger generation and those most excluded from the labour market; considers that pensionable ages should reflect, besides life expectancy, other factors to be defined at national level, among them developments in productivity, the economic dependency ratio and differences in job arduousness; recalls the importance of investments in active ageing and of arrangements enabling people who have reached their pensionable age to have the option to continue working at their desired level of intensity while being able to draw partially on their pension if they work less than full-time;

13. Calls on the Commission to carry out a substantive analysis of the best practice to assist Member States in the calculation of minimum pensions;

14. Recommends that all workers should be covered by insurance against unemployment or involuntary part-time employment, coupled with job-search assistance and investment in (re)-training in line with the conditions laid down by each Member State in conjunction with the social partners; recalls that adequate unemployment benefits improve the matching process and are therefore useful for productivity, while at the same time playing a key role in preventing and reducing poverty; considers that the EPSR should recommend quality benchmarks for national unemployment insurance schemes, in particular regarding their coverage, activation requirements, a link between duration of support and the average national job-search period, and the quality of support provided by job centres;

15. Highlights the importance of an adequate income for maintaining human dignity as well as the role of social investments in enabling people to undertake training and/or look for work;

16. Insists that the rights of people with disabilities should be mainstreamed throughout the Social Pillar with a human rights-based approach in line with the EU’s and its Member States' obligations under the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD); considers that the provisions should include at least:
the right to decent and barrier-free work in fully inclusive, open and accessible work environments and labour markets;

services and basic income security adapted to specific individual needs, allowing a decent standard of living and social inclusion;

guaranteeing free movement and the transferability of services between EU Member States;

inclusive education and training, including provisions for adequate digital literacy;

specific provisions on protection from exploitation and forced labour of persons with disabilities, particularly among persons with intellectual and psychosocial disabilities or persons deprived of their legal capacity;

17. Notes with concern that availability and affordability of long-term care remain a major problem across Europe, trapping informal family carers at home and preventing them from pursuing their careers; deplores frequent abuses of carers employed through work agencies or on an informal basis; considers access to quality and affordable long-term care services, including home-based care and independent living schemes, to be a right that should be upheld with the support of adequately qualified professionals employed under decent conditions; believes that adequate public services and assistance should therefore be put in place for households, in particularly those living on low incomes, to avoid institutionalisation and the risk of poverty; repeats its call for legislation on carers' leave to limit the implications on remuneration and social protection entitlements when workers temporarily need to take care of relatives; calls on the Commission to set out a concrete action plan in this area, including targets on care for elderly persons, persons with disabilities and other dependants, similar to the Barcelona targets, with monitoring tools which should measure quality, accessibility and affordability; calls also for greater sharing and take-up of best practices in this area;

18. Considers child poverty to be a major issue on which Europe should 'act big'; stresses the right to universal education, health and social security systems as basic conditions for combating poverty, in particular among children; bearing in mind this objective, calls on the Commission and the Member States to ensure the swift implementation of the 2013 recommendation on ‘Investing in children – breaking the cycle of disadvantage’, and for concrete steps to be taken towards a child guarantee in all Member States, so that every child now living at risk of poverty has access to free healthcare, free education, free childcare, decent housing and proper nutrition; points to the necessary connection with programmes offering support and opportunities for parents to come out of social exclusion situations and to integrate the labour market; recognises that these policies require adequate financing at national level and support from the European Structural and Investment Funds;

19. Calls on the Member States to deliver on the right to adequate housing by ensuring access to quality and affordable housing of adequate size for all, and to prevent and reduce homelessness with a view to its gradual elimination; urges them to enact legislation and/or other measures as needed in order to ensure that access to social housing or adequate housing benefits are provided for those in need, obviously
including homeless people and families, and that vulnerable people and poor households are protected against eviction or that adequate alternative housing is provided to them; calls for provision of housing to be combined with relevant social services supporting social and economic inclusion; calls for effective measures to be taken to help young people on low incomes set up their own households; highlights investments in energy-efficient social housing as a win-win for jobs, the environment, reduction of energy poverty and realisation of social rights; calls for greater use of relevant European financial instruments to support urban renewal and affordable, accessible and energy-efficient housing provision and to promote the development of social housing in regions where it is underdeveloped; calls for all forms of criminalisation of poverty, such as measures unfairly sanctioning homelessness or other forms of material deprivation, to be abolished;

20. Calls for adequate measures, including legislative improvements if necessary upon evaluation, to ensure availability and access for all to good-quality and affordable social services of general interest and other services of general interest or essential services such as water supply, waste management, education, healthcare, e-communications and high-speed broadband, energy, public transport and financial services; highlights the important role of well-equipped and well-staffed public sector providers and of social enterprises and not-for-profit organisations in this context, given that their primary objective is a positive social impact; points also to the important role of social economy enterprises in providing these services and making the labour market more inclusive; calls for the elimination of existing legal uncertainties experienced by public authorities when it comes to financing social services of general interest; supports the use of social criteria in public procurement; recalls that rural areas in particular need continued support in order to modernise their infrastructure and maintain economic dynamism; points also to the importance of financial education that helps to prevent household over-indebtedness and legal aid and other mechanisms that protect and support debtors against predatory practices and provide them with a second chance;

Equal opportunities and access to the labour market

21. Considers that, in our increasingly digitalised world, low-qualified people not only have diminished employment opportunities, but are also more vulnerable to long-term unemployment and experience greater difficulties in gaining access to services and participating fully in society, a situation which is not only detrimental to the individual but is also highly costly to the economy and society as a whole: supports therefore a Skills Guarantee as a new right for everyone, at every stage of life, to acquire fundamental skills for the 21st century, including literacy, numeracy, digital and media literacy, critical thinking, social skills and relevant skills needed for the green and circular economy, taking into account emerging industries and key growth sectors and ensuring full outreach to people in disadvantaged situations, including those with disabilities, asylum-seekers, long-term unemployed people and underrepresented groups; stresses that education systems should be inclusive, providing good-quality education to the whole population, enabling people to be active European citizens, preparing them to be able to learn and adapt throughout their lives and responding to societal and labour market needs; considers that completion of secondary education should be obligatory in 21st-century Europe and that relevant programmes must be available to give all young people who have dropped out from primary or secondary school a new chance;
considers that the Skills Guarantee should involve individualised assessment of learning needs, a quality learning offer and systematic validation of the skills and competences acquired, enabling their easy recognition on the labour market; points to the need to ensure widespread access to broadband in order to enable digital literacy; highlights the Skills Guarantee as an important social investment, requiring proper implementation and adequate financing, also with support from the European Structural and Investment Funds;

22. Is worried at the spread of socio-economic uncertainty and the deterioration of working conditions for many workers; recognises that many workers in non-standard forms of employment have difficulties in exercising their rights at work or gaining access to social security benefits and that women and migrants are disproportionately affected by this problem; calls on the Commission to monitor closely the implementation and enforcement of the Fixed-Term Work Directive, the Part-Time Work Directive and the Temporary Agency Work Directive; calls on the Commission and the Member States to take steps to improve the portability of social rights acquired in different activities; stresses the importance of ensuring sufficient capacities to provide adequate social protection at Member State level for people in all forms of employment, standard and non-standard employment relationships as well as self-employment; calls on the Commission to propose a recommendation in this regard; considers in particular that:

(a) Member States should organise social security schemes in such a way as to enable all people in all employment forms, employment relationships and self-employment to accumulate entitlements providing income security in situations such as unemployment, involuntary part-time work, health problems, older age or career breaks for child-raising, other care or training reasons;

(b) starting from their first entry into the labour market, all people in all employment forms, employment relationships and self-employment should have a personal activity account, easily accessible through personal contact and electronic means, duly taking into account the needs of persons with disabilities, where they could consult their accumulated social entitlements and other social rights, including to lifelong learning, and where they could learn about their portability across countries if applicable; such personal activity accounts should be made available in a cost-effective way and adequate data protection should be ensured;

(c) digital platforms and other intermediaries should have an obligation to report all work undertaken through them to the competent authorities for the purpose of ensuring adequate contributions and protection through social and health insurance for all workers;

23. Points out that professional transitions require adequate investment, both in the institutional capacity of public employment services and to assist individual job-search and upskilling at the earliest stage possible; believes proactive employment policies such as training and placement assistance to be worthwhile tools for the reintegration of the unemployed into the labour market, regardless of age; recalls the useful role of the European Social Fund in supporting active labour market policies throughout Europe and of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund, which supports re-skilling and a return to employment in case of regional economic shocks and large-scale lay-offs;
recalls, furthermore, the important role of social security schemes in supporting secure transitions; emphasises that the preservation and portability of social entitlements accumulated during the career and life-cycle should be ensured to facilitate job and professional transitions;

24. Emphasises that a proactive employment policy implies public support for developing sectors with important employment potential and in many countries also a need to expand the role of public employment services and ensure that they have adequate capacity for direct contact with business, so that re-training and other assistance to jobseekers is provided in line with the profile of the jobseeker and the needs of the local economy; calls for full implementation of the Youth Guarantee for all people under 30, with an emphasis on quality offers and effective outreach to all NEETs, and of the Council recommendation on the long-term unemployed, including through the development of the additional measures required to ensure accessibility of these policies for persons with support needs; stresses the need to take into account the needs of older workers and job seekers and to promote cooperation between younger and older workers; highlights these policies as important structural reforms and social investments that are in need of adequate financing from both European and national levels, including from the European Social Fund, the Youth Employment Initiative and/or other instruments;

25. Recalls that women are more likely to be subject to uncertain and low-paid employment and to interruptions in their career, and that this has repercussions for their entire lives; considers that decisive progress is urgently needed in the area of gender equality and work-life balance in order to eliminate persisting discrimination; awaits Commission proposals in this area as announced in its 2017 work programme, in particular as regards the following:

(a) existing mechanisms to ensure equal treatment between men and women should be strengthened, persisting gender gaps in pay and pensions should be closed, and occupational segregation should be reduced; to this end, implementation and enforcement of Directive 2006/54/EC should be monitored and the directive should be revised if necessary; the European Pact for gender equality for 2011-2020 and the Strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019 should continue to be pursued, also through annual gender equality reports;

(b) there is a need for new effective measures at both European and national levels for the reconciliation of professional, private and family life, including legislative proposals as regards maternity leave, paternity leave, parental leave, carers' leave, access to quality care services and flexible working time arrangements; equal take-up of leave arrangements by men and women across all categories of workers should be encouraged in order to improve women's access to and position within the labour market, strengthen the role of fathers in bringing up their children and facilitate work-life balance; the Commission should also support Member States in sharing and adopting good practices in this area;

26. Recalls that the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU prohibits any discrimination on grounds such as sex, race, colour, ethnic or social origin, genetic features, language, religion or belief, political or any other opinion, membership of a national minority,
property, birth, disability, age or sexual orientation; emphasises that all people should enjoy equal opportunities throughout their lives, including when looking for work and at work; highlights the need for proper implementation of the Employment Equality Directive 2000/78/EC and the Racial Equality Directive 2000/43/EC; urges the Member States to step up implementation and the Commission to evaluate the enforcement of existing measures to ensure non-discrimination and equal opportunities and to enhance labour market participation and social integration of under-represented groups; calls on the Commission to propose new concrete recommendations or other measures in this regard if needed; recalls that the Equal Treatment Directive proposed in 2008 and not yet adopted represents a missing element in the legislative framework concerning non-discrimination; draws attention to European and national case law indicating that a duty of reasonable accommodation for all grounds of discrimination should be laid down in EU and national law, provided that this does not impose a disproportionate burden on employers or service providers; calls on the Commission to monitor the legal frameworks and policies of Member States in line with applicable EU legislation to ensure integration, equal treatment and decent working conditions are guaranteed to all people with refugee status; stresses that access to justice and protection should be ensured to all victims of exploitation and discrimination;

Labour mobility

27. Emphasises that free movement of people is one of the greatest achievements of the EU and that free movement of workers is a cornerstone of the internal market, which plays an important role in enhancing convergence and integration among Member States; underlines that mobility within the EU is an opportunity and a fundamental right whose exercise must be supported, including through a smoothly functioning system of social security coordination; calls for proper implementation and enforcement of EU rules regarding mobility of workers and cross-border provision of services; calls, moreover, for support to be provided for labour mobility through adequate language training at all levels of education, improved comparability of education systems and recognition of professional qualifications, readily available information on the rights and duties of mobile workers, and measures ensuring decent working conditions and effective cooperation among public employment services across Europe; notes that mobility should not be the result of inadequate employment opportunities or inadequate social protection in workers' home regions as prolonged workforce outflows may hinder economic convergence; points therefore to the importance of cohesion policy and other instruments for territorially balanced economic development; considers that labour mobility should not be abused to undermine host countries' social standards through fraud or circumvention of law; highlights the fact that mobile workers are usually net contributors to host countries' public budgets; calls for adequate investments in public services in areas experiencing population increases and points to the support which the European Social Fund can provide in this respect;

28. Calls for the EU and the Member States to take into account the social impact of mobility on the increasing number of transnational families, e.g. by providing leave opportunities to care for a family member in another country and ensuring the transferability and comparability of education systems in terms of the mobility of school-age children;
29. Calls on the Member States to make it mandatory for employers to provide an employment contract in a language known by EU mobile citizens, in order to make the labour contract understandable for workers;

**Building up the means to achieve results in practice**

30. Calls on the Commission to build on the outcomes of the public consultation and on the EU institutions’ views by putting forward a clear roadmap of concrete measures for full practical implementation of the European Pillar of Social Rights and full pursuit of the Treaties’ social objectives; highlights the fact that, in order to protect fundamental social rights, provisions such as Articles 8, 9 and 10 of the TFEU should be properly applied, in EU policy making and all actions of the EU institutions, including through social impact assessments;

31. Calls on the Member States to sign and ratify the revised European Social Charter and the European Convention on Social Security (ETS No 78); encourages the Commission to examine the steps required for accession of the European Union to the revised Charter and to propose a time-line for this objective;

32. Calls on the Commission to include gender mainstreaming as an integral part of the EPSR and to include systematic gender impact assessments as part of the fundamental rights compliance assessment;

33. Is concerned at the persisting negative impact of the prolonged economic crisis which Europe underwent in the first half of this decade and which impacted some countries and regions more than others; considers that the objective of upward economic and social convergence should be underpinned by a set of targets, building on the Europe 2020 strategy and the Sustainable Development Goals, serving to guide the coordination of economic, employment and social policies in the EU and providing a compass for the euro area where special attention to upward economic and social convergence is needed;

34. Draws attention to the two-way link between social conditions and economic performance; calls for the Europe 2020 targets, the existing scoreboard of key employment and social indicators in the Joint Employment Report and the potential new Convergence Code to be directly and transparently taken into account in formulating country-specific recommendations and the euro area recommendation, as well as in the utilisation of EU instruments; considers that the instruments of the European Employment Strategy and social open method of coordination should also be reinforced to this end; urges a stronger role for the macroeconomic dialogue with social partners in the formulation of the economic policy mix at European level; considers macro-social surveillance to be of great importance in ensuring that economic imbalances are not reduced at the expense of the employment and social situation and preventing a race to the bottom in terms of social standards in the EU; reiterates its call for a European agenda of reforms and investments aimed at strengthening growth potential based on quality jobs and productivity to promote fair, robust, efficient and sustainable welfare systems, and to foster a sustainable transition of Member States’ economies towards greater resource efficiency;

35. Considers that promoting women’s participation in the labour market and their economic independence is crucial for the purpose of meeting the Europe 2020 target of
36. Notes that women and girls are disproportionately affected by poverty and social exclusion, and calls for a renewed political impetus for an ambitious European anti-poverty strategy and a fresh commitment to meet the European 2020 anti-poverty targets; urges the Member States to outline detailed anti-poverty national strategy plans, and the Commission to emphasise poverty reduction within the European Semester;

37. Calls on the Member States and the Commission to work towards ensuring an appropriate level of social investments which are essential for the cohesion of society and have a clear positive impact on economic growth in the short and long term (e.g. childcare, education, the Youth Guarantee and the Skills Guarantee); considers that the assessment of the quality of public spending should also reflect this concern;

38. Reiterates its call for joint meetings to be held between the EPSCO and ECOFIN Council formations with a view to promoting better coordinated socio-economic policies, as well as for regular meetings of euro area labour and social affairs ministers serving to improve policy coordination within the Eurozone and properly address social imbalances;

39. Highlights the fact that current-day phenomena of capital-intensive production and the important contribution of intangible assets to the creation of added value on the one hand, and high rates of inequality, unemployment, the continuing rise in 'atypical' work and the declining labour share of total income on the other hand imply a need to broaden the financial base for welfare systems, with fiscal neutrality, in order to provide adequate social protection and quality services for all; considers that this should be done in particular by shifting towards new sources of tax revenue; urges the Member States to evaluate their needs in this respect; recalls that accumulation of social security entitlements through work is an important aspect of decent work and contributes significantly to economic and social stability; points out, however, that the current tax wedge on labour can be reduced while ensuring the sustainability and adequacy of national social security schemes; highlights also the fact that combating tax evasion and avoidance is crucially important for ensuring an adequate level of public investment and the sustainability of welfare systems;

40. Considers that the European Pillar of Social Rights can only be credible if accompanied by adequate financing at national and European level, ensuring that Member States are able to achieve the commonly agreed objectives; reiterates its call for accelerated implementation of relevant operational programmes and revision of the MFF 2014-20 where needed in order to cope with the increased needs; calls, in particular, for further strengthening of the Youth Employment Initiative and further steps to ensure easier access to and full use of the European Social Fund, the EGF and the FEAD; considers that these financial instruments should remain available to all the Member States and be reinforced as needed, including as regards education and training, the Skills Guarantee, child poverty and unforeseen new challenges such as labour market integration of
refugees; believes that the rule allocating 20% of national ESF envelopes for the fight against poverty and social exclusion must be upheld;

41. Calls for further EU support to be provided for institutional capacity-building, e.g. as regards social dialogue, the European network of public employment services, the Electronic Exchange of Social Security Information and the platform against undeclared work, which could evolve in the longer term towards a European system of labour inspectorates; points, in this context, to the importance of the Programme for Employment and Social Innovation (EaSI) and ESF support for relevant capacity-building at national level;

42. Calls on the Commission and the EIB Group to develop further the Investment Plan for Europe in order to strengthen investment in economic recovery, quality job creation, sustainable development and social investment in people's current and future capacities to engage in the labour market;

43. Considers that the social impact of economic adjustment within the euro area could be alleviated and upward economic and social convergence strengthened through adequate financing so as to avoid a further deterioration as regards inequalities and the growth potential of Member States and to cope with severe macroeconomic shocks while increasing the competitiveness and stability of Member States' economies; invites the Commission, the Council and other relevant bodies, therefore, to address this issue in further discussions;

44. Calls on the Commission to put forward its proposals on the European Pillar of Social Rights on the occasion of the issuing of its announced White Paper on the future of the EU and EMU;

45. Calls on the Commission, the European External Action Service and the Member States to pursue external action coherent with the European Pillar of Social Rights, in particular by promoting the implementation of the UN conventions and Sustainable Development Goals, the ILO conventions, the relevant G20 conclusions, the relevant Council of Europe conventions and the EU's trade agreements and strategic partnerships;

46. Considers that the EPSR should be adopted in 2017 as an agreement between Parliament, the Commission and the European Council, involving the social partners and civil society at the highest level, and should contain a clear roadmap for implementation; invites the Commission to propose mechanisms for adequate involvement of all the relevant stakeholders at all relevant levels in the implementation of the EPSR;

47. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council and the Commission and to the parliaments of the Member States.
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

Europe has developed since the 19th century, and especially after World War II, the most advanced social model in world history, achieving decent working conditions, comprehensive social protection and reasonably good public services for a large part of the population. The European Social Model has in turn contributed to important productivity gains and to Europe’s competitiveness, based on a healthy and skilled workforce with a decent purchasing power to sustain a sophisticated internal market.

Successive enlargements of the EU have enabled an upgrading of the acceding Member States’ social standards and supported gradual upward economic convergence, also thanks to EU structural and cohesion funds. All in all, the European Social Model has been an important factor for the success story of European integration, which has brought peace, security and broadly-shared prosperity for several decades. Welfare state institutions and social dialogue have also helped Europe to deal with the global financial crisis that erupted in 2007-8.

However, the social dimension of European integration has suffered a heavy blow with the protracted Eurozone crisis since 2010. Nearly €2 trillion of taxpayers’ money was used in state aid to the financial sector in 2008-14, triggering a sovereign debt crisis for several Member States. At the same time, many Member States were forced to implement harsh fiscal consolidation and internal devaluation measures, largely due to the lack of common stabilisation mechanisms within Europe’s incomplete Economic and Monetary Union. These policies resulted in severe social hardship which is still acute in many countries.

Through the Eurozone crisis, the EU itself has come to be seen by many citizens as a machine for divergence, inequalities and social injustice. A project associated for decades with convergence, prosperity and progress is now being blamed for downgrading of welfare systems and seen a threat to people’s well-being.

At the same time, Europe is facing a number of well-known structural trends and challenges such as globalisation, demographic changes (incl. ageing, feminisation, low birth rates, migration), climate change and natural resource constraints. It is also witnessing a new phase of the digital revolution, deeply affecting labour markets’ functioning.

In your rapporteur’s view, this is the basic challenge to be addressed in defining a ‘European Pillar of Social Rights’ (EPSR) and seeking to update the European Social Model for the 21st century. We need our welfare state structures to catch up with demographic change, technology, globalisation and a significant recent increase in social inequalities. At the same time we need to overcome the damage wrought by the long economic crisis. We need to strengthen decisively ‘Social Europe’ as well as improve economic policy-making and EMU design.

To meet this challenge and respond to citizens’ expectations, it is vital to recognise and appreciate (again) that the state has an indispensable role to play in shaping markets and managing social risks. The state does so inter alia through regulation, income redistribution and provision of (or support to) collective social insurance schemes, social assistance programmes, public services and services of general interest. The EU must once again

1 European Commission, State Aid Scoreboard 2015, http://europa.eu/!vp68mB.
become a supportive force in this respect, strengthening its Member States and helping them to promote the European Social Model in a global context. It must also become (again) a supportive force for greater social dialogue between companies and workers, helping to ensure fair sharing of incomes and risks even in markets shaped by digitalisation and global competition.

The European Social Model has, of course, many national variations and each country has its specific arrangements, in line with historical developments and the principle of subsidiarity. However, in the face of globalisation and technological change, EU Member States are highly interdependent (also given the bond of a common currency) and they can only deliver broadly-shared prosperity to their citizens by working together. Without a common European framework, Member States are bound to be trapped in a destructive competition based on a race-to-the-bottom in social standards. The European Social Model is therefore a shared project, whose central objective is upward social convergence: a sustained improvement in well-being for all people in all EU countries, based on sustainable and inclusive economic growth and on measures ensuring that no individual and no country are left behind and everybody can participate in the society and the economy.

Upward social convergence can only be achieved by Member States’ collective action. The EU has already enacted to this end a body of legislation regulating labour, product and service markets and put in place policy coordination mechanisms and relevant financial instruments. The acquis applies to all Member States and fundamental social rights apply to all people in the EU; therefore the process of updating social standards through the EPSR should also involve all EU Member States.

That said, it is clear that the euro area (€A) faces, with its present macroeconomic framework, specific challenges to the achievement of the employment and social objectives set out in the Treaties. The loss of several national economic instruments through €A membership has proven to create pressure for tougher and swifter internal adjustment, such as through wages, working conditions, unemployment and scaling back of social expenditure. Restoring adequate socio-economic security to compensate for this increased internal flexibility within the €A therefore requires introducing specific social targets, standards and/or financial instruments at the €A level.

What are the key aspirations and expectations of European citizens when it comes to updating the European Social Model? Citizens certainly want to keep the European way of life and want to be able to have confidence in Europe’s sustainable development, enabling well-being for present and future generations. This means that the EU and its Member States need to:

- prepare and empower people in terms of knowledge, skills, time and space for meaningful economic participation;
- conduct an economic policy that helps to create good-quality jobs and enables people to achieve economic security and self-fulfilment in decent working conditions;
- protect people against social risks arising over the life course;
- reduce the current high level of social inequalities; and
- encourage citizens’ active participation: the welfare state needs to be understandable and accessible, enabling people to feel a sense of ownership and offering sufficiently open structures of social dialogue and democratic politics.
Young people’s ideas and energy will be particularly important for updating and innovating welfare state structures and ensuring broadly-shared prosperity. The ‘millenial’ are on average probably the best-educated generation Europe has ever had, but they face much longer and more precarious transitions from school to work than previous generations, which is destroying part of their great potential. We need to prevent this big social loss by organising better their economic, social and political inclusion.

All these challenges and aspirations require a number of changes in the toolbox underpinning the European Social Model.

The concept of ‘social investment’ is helpful for guiding this evolution, based on the insight that prevention and early intervention are cheaper than ex-post cure to social ills. Social investment consists of public (support for the) provision of services that enable all people to participate in the economy and society over their entire lives, e.g. through good-quality childcare, education, lifelong learning, healthcare, active labour market policies, social insurance, minimum income schemes and action to eradicate digital illiteracy. Social investment is indispensable for sustainable growth and well-being in advanced economies. It is mainly the responsibility of the public sector, but it can also be effectively delivered by social economy enterprises and other actors in the ‘third sector’.

Europe will also need to adapt its labour laws and social insurance schemes in order to ensure decent and fair working conditions and social protection for all types of workers. Demand for labour is becoming and will likely remain more ‘fluid’ and diversified, which can be in some cases beneficial for productivity and work-life balance. However, ’atypical’ employment also often involves prolonged economic insecurity and precariousness, which the public sector needs to tackle.

Changes will also be needed on the revenue side of our welfare states, which currently rely on four main mechanisms for fair distribution of economic value:

- capital-labour negotiations on the distribution of gross income, including through collective bargaining, underpinned by minimum wages and other state-supported mechanisms;
- social insurance schemes, framed by legislation and built up with contributions from workers, employers and the state;
- taxation and public spending; and
- regulation of the international financial system and fight against tax avoidance.

All these four mechanisms are necessary for ensuring welfare state sustainability and an adequate level of public investment. However, it will be necessary in the future to rely less on labour-based contributions and more on general taxation, financial regulation and a forceful fight against tax avoidance. Accumulation of social insurance entitlements through work is an important aspect of decent work, motivating workers and contributing to longer-term economic and social stability more than means-tested benefits or unconditional basic income schemes can do. However, today’s high level of inequality, the rise of ‘atypical’ employment and the increasing capital-intensity of economic production suggest a need to reduce the tax wedge on labour (including social security contributions) and to co-finance social insurance schemes more from other tax revenue (e.g. capital gains, wealth or pollution) in order to provide a decent level of social protection for all.
European economic governance needs to be rebalanced further, with greater consideration of social indicators in economic policy-making. As for the euro area, a new virtuous cycle needs to be started, with higher investment leading to creation of quality jobs, giving people economic security and contributing to higher aggregate demand and further investment. Higher employment and greater social protection coverage would also increase the amount of revenue collected, improving welfare state sustainability. The euro should finally become an engine for upward convergence.

The EPSR should also envisage a better use of the EU’s external policies for the realisation of social rights in Europe and the achievement of the worldwide Sustainable Development Goals. Europe has a clear strategic interest in stronger social dialogue, implementation of ILO Conventions and Recommendations and improvements in social protection schemes and social services across the world. It should therefore pursue these interests through its trade agreements, strategic partnerships, development policies, neighbourhood policy and the European Agenda on Migration.

To conclude, the European Pillar of Social Rights is an important and urgent initiative, which the European Commission and European Parliament have rightly put on the top of their political priorities. But this project and the idea of ‘Social Europe’ cannot be confined to a small group of EU specialists. ‘Social Europe’ is lived by every person through the rights they have at work, the social services they can access, the social investments they receive, the policies which influence their economic prospects, and the social protection on which they can rely when something in life goes wrong.

‘Social Europe’ is and must be for everyone, bringing tangible improvements for people’s lives. The strength of the EPSR therefore needs to spread through the entire multi-level structure of the EU, including municipal, regional and national governments and their cooperation with companies, trade unions and civil society.
MINORITY OPINION

on a European Pillar of Social Rights (2016/2095(INI))

Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, Rapporteur: Maria João Rodrigues

Minority Opinion tabled by ENF Group

A. whereas in his 2015 speech Jean-Claude Juncker put forward the idea of a ‘social pillar’;

B. whereas it would seem that, in order to make that idea a reality, the EU will be required to ‘complete a paradigm shift to a strong European social model’;

C. whereas this undertaking will destroy 200 years of building towards a common European social model, one which has gradually and successfully been adapted by each State to its own needs, and replace that model with a ‘social’ Europe which will involve a devastating degree of harmonisation;

D. whereas the outcome, above all, will be European control over each State’s social protection system;

E. whereas this proposal is nothing more than a piece of propaganda designed to portray the EU as the only solution to the problems facing ordinary Europeans, whereas the euro is in fact the cause of those problems;

F. whereas the purpose of the ‘social pillar’ is not to help ordinary people, but rather to rescue the euro and eurozone project yet again;

1. The ENF Group distances itself from the work carried out by the other political groups on this report, which it regards as a flagrant attack on the sovereignty of the Member States and an example of unjustified interference in their internal affairs.
30.11.2016

OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN’S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY

for the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

on a European Pillar of Social Rights
(2016/2095(INI))

Rapporteur: Maria Arena

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Women’s Rights and Gender Equality calls on the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

A. whereas the Commission will present a proposal for a binding European Pillar of Social Rights (EPSR), which should deliver key social rights, in particular gender equality; whereas special attention should be paid to groups facing multiple forms of discrimination such as LGBTI people in matters of social insurance schemes, social assistance programmes and public services;

B. whereas social rights are part of human rights and are enshrined in the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU);

C. whereas compliance with fundamental rights is an essential part of a socially fair society;

D. whereas women still face many forms of discrimination in the EU and are still underrepresented in all areas of decision-making;

E. whereas the EU LGBT survey found that lesbians and bisexual and transgender women face a disproportionate risk of discrimination on the basis of their sexual orientation or gender identity;

F. whereas gender equality is enshrined in the Treaties of the European Union and in the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and is a core EU value; whereas, nevertheless, women remain underrepresented in the labour market as a whole, with the employment rate for men standing at 75.6 % compared with 64.5 % for women, and overrepresented in part-time work and the lowest-paid sectors, in addition to receiving lower hourly wages, leading to a gender pay gap of 16 % and contributing to a pension gap of 39 %, with significant differences between Member States; whereas gender-based discrimination continues to prevail in recruitment procedures in the Member States, despite women
surpassing men in educational attainment;

G. whereas the economic crises and austerity measures have disproportionately affected women, particularly young women and women suffering from multiple discrimination; whereas the feminisation of poverty, also due to low-income jobs, persists in the EU, and whereas the increasing risk of poverty and social exclusion of women, particularly single mothers and children living in poverty, is closely linked to budget cuts in public services such as healthcare, education, social services and welfare benefits;

H. whereas social rights, services and adequate income are gendered issues, as more women are in low-income jobs, at higher risk of poverty, and more dependent on social services, both public and private, and hold the traditional role of caregiver for both children and older members of the family and the primary responsibility for household needs, resulting overall in lower pensions for women;

I. whereas progress in achieving gender equality has been slow, and whereas closing the gender employment gap is dependent on the fulfilment of basic social rights and the provision of basic social services;

J. whereas Europe is faced with an ageing population, with women having a longer life expectancy but experiencing more ill-health than men, and older women encountering multiple discrimination, including on the basis of age, gender, state of health and disability;

K. whereas according to the International Labour Organisation, the majority of workers employed in the domestic work sector, including the care sector, are women;

L. whereas the 2002 Barcelona targets are far from being reached, while the Charter of Fundamental Rights states that children have the right to protection and care, which thus has a dramatic impact on female labour market participation, gender equality, work-life balance and female poverty;

M. whereas the struggle to balance one’s private and work life is particularly difficult for single parents, the majority of whom are women; whereas in the 28 Member States no fewer than 34% of single mothers are at risk of poverty, and whereas children from those families are at a disproportionately greater risk of intergenerational transmission of poverty;

N. whereas violence against women is a violation of fundamental rights which affects all levels of society, regardless of age, education, income, social position or country of origin or residence, and represents a major barrier to equality between women and men;

O. whereas meeting the EU’s 2020 anti-poverty targets requires an ambitious political impetus and drastic action, taking into account the feminisation of poverty; whereas the anti-poverty targets cannot be met unless socio-economic gender inequalities are addressed;

P. whereas women still face discrimination in accessing and staying in employment, as well as a denial of labour rights owing, in particular, to pregnancy and maternity;
Q. whereas European labour markets are gender segregated; whereas the Commission also acknowledged this in its communication of 8 March 2016 on the European Pillar of Social Rights (COM(2016)0127, Annex I), stating that ‘women continue to be underrepresented in employment, overrepresented in part-time work and low-paid sectors, and receive lower hourly wages also when performing equivalent work and even though they have surpassed men in educational attainment’;

R. whereas women’s access to the job market is an economic growth factor; whereas, according to the European Added Value Assessment conclusions, a one-percentage-point decrease in the gender pay gap will increase economic growth by 0.1 %;

1. Calls for the EPSR to have a binding mechanism for both the monitoring and implementation of existing and updated social rights, especially as regards equal opportunities, including female participation in the labour market, and women in board and in management positions, fair working conditions, precarious work, and adequate and sustainable social protection for women; calls on the Commission to work with the Member States to identify the most appropriate measures for closing the gender pension gap;

2. Stresses that the main barriers to increasing female participation in the labour market include a lack of adequate work-life balance policies, fiscal disincentives for second earners and excessive taxation of labour, and stereotypes about the distribution of household tasks, the role of women in society, and fields of study and occupation; emphasises, further, that many Member States do not offer sufficient possibilities or incentives for men to take family leave, thus obliging women to act as caregivers, with the consequent effect on the rate of employment of women;

3. Considers that promoting women’s participation in the labour market and their economic independence is crucial for meeting the Europe 2020 target of a 75 % overall employment rate and would boost GDP; calls on the Commission and the Member States, therefore, to strengthen policies and increase investment supporting female employment in quality jobs, particularly in sectors and positions where women are underrepresented, such as in the science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) and green economy sectors, or senior management positions across all sectors;

4. Reiterates that the inclusion of social indicators in economic governance objectives and procedures, particularly the European Semester, in no way alters the basic objectives of these mechanisms;

5. Stresses that a work-life balance needs to be guaranteed as a universal fundamental right, in the spirit of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, with measures being available without discrimination;

6. Stresses the need to consider the multiple discrimination faced by specific groups of women, including but not limited to migrant women, women with disabilities, LGBTI women, women who belong to minorities, and elderly women;

---

7. Calls on the Commission to include gender mainstreaming as an integral part of the EPSR and to include systematic gender impact assessments as part of the fundamental rights compliance assessment;

8. Recalls that work-life balance is a wide-ranging concept that embraces all overarching policies of a legislative and non-legislative nature aimed at promoting an appropriate and proportionate balance between the various aspects of people’s lives; considers that achieving a genuine work-life balance requires robust, cross-cutting, structural, coherent and comprehensive policies, including incentives and efficient measures for balancing work, caring for and spending time with family and personal development;

9. Calls for the rapid approval and implementation of the Anti-Discrimination Directive, recognising the need for specific sensitivity and targeted actions to counter multiple layers of discrimination and the need for tools to tackle discrimination horizontally in all sectors of society;

10. Regrets in this context that no EU gender equality strategy 2016-2020 was adopted and, echoing the Council conclusions on gender equality of 16 June 2016, calls on the Commission to enhance the status of its strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019 by adopting it as a communication;

11. Calls for renewed efforts for the implementation of the Employment Equality Directive in order to promote diversity and fight stereotypes and discrimination in the workforce;

12. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to implement gender budgeting as a tool for ensuring that budgetary decisions take into account the gender dimension and address differentiated impacts;

13. Calls on the Commission to step up efforts to increase the representation of women in decision-making in the political and economic sphere by pursuing a dual approach that combines gender mainstreaming and targeted measures;

14. Calls for the development of a comprehensive, effective gender-sensitive social policy framework promoting policy coherence between social, employment and macroeconomic policies, with consistent gender mainstreaming; calls on the Commission and the Member States to include policy coherence in impact studies for social and economic policy;

15. Calls on the Commission to improve the collection, analysis and dissemination of comprehensive, comparable, reliable and regularly updated data on women’s participation in decision-making;

16. Regrets that the 2012 proposal for a directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on improving the gender balance among non-executive directors of companies listed on stock exchanges and related measures is still blocked, and calls on the Council to finally adopt a common position on this proposal;

17. Calls on the Commission to exploit and better target the Digital Agenda and the Digital Single Market Strategy with a view to addressing the severe gender gap within the ICT sector, fostering education and training of women and girls in ICT, increasing the visibility of women in the digital arena, enhancing gender equality and participation of
women through better access to funding and supporting civil society and women’s organisations in making an inclusive internet a reality;

18. Urges the Commission to come forward with a package of legislative and non-legislative measures regarding work-life balance with a view to achieving gender equality, including revising the directives on maternity and parental leave and proposing directives on paternity and carers’ leave; stresses that legislative proposals should include equality between men and women as a legal basis;

19. Deplores the persistence of the gender pay and pension gap, which constitutes an infringement of the fundamental principle of equal pay for equal work for female and male workers enshrined in Article 157 TFEU; calls on the EU and the Member States, in cooperation with the social partners and gender equality organisations, to set out and implement policies to close the gender pay and pension gaps;

20. Calls for attention to be focused on new poverty affecting the most vulnerable social groups, among whom women are at greatest risk of social exclusion, such as vulnerable adults, families at risk of poverty and low-income workers, for which European social policies should be equipped with innovative preventive and proactive instruments;

21. Urges the Commission to present to the Council for approval a European carers’ programme and policy framework directive;

22. Stresses that flexible working arrangements, including teleworking, made possible by advances in digital technology, can also help in striking the right work-life balance;

23. Calls on the Member States to effectively implement the Barcelona targets by 2020 and to endorse the 2014 quality framework on early childhood education and care;

24. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to introduce targets on care for elderly people, people with disabilities and other dependants, of a similar nature to the Barcelona targets, with monitoring tools which should measure quality, accessibility and affordability; calls on Eurostat, Eurofound and the European Institute for Gender Equality (for its Gender Index), to collect relevant data and to carry out studies to support this work;

25. Calls for the development of a European framework on the quality of long-term care, using the European Quality Framework for Long-Term Care Services, to develop quality care services catering to all needs, including the most complex cases, and fostering the opportunity for independence of people with care needs for as long as possible;

26. Underlines the fact that only a small proportion of men use their right to parental leave; calls therefore for concrete action to be taken in order to move towards parental leave rights that are as individual and non-transferable as possible;

27. Stresses that the risk of poverty and social exclusion among children is strongly linked to their parents’ situation in the labour market and their social conditions;

28. Notes that women are disproportionately and often involuntarily concentrated in precarious work, including high levels of part-time work and low-paid, fixed-term and
zero-hour contracts; recalls in this context that equality between men and women can only be achieved through a fair distribution of paid and unpaid work and of work, family and care responsibilities;

29. Highlights the importance of minimum income schemes in order to fight poverty; calls on the Commission therefore to evaluate the manner of, and the means for, providing an adequate minimum income above the poverty threshold of 60% of the national median income in all Member States;

30. Recommends the establishment of national wage floors through legislation or collective bargaining, with the objective of setting them at at least 60% of the respective national median wage and exceeding the national or regional living wage;

31. Calls for the revision of Directive 2006/54/EC on the implementation of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation and to include, inter alia, a compulsory requirement for companies to draw up measures or plans on gender equality, including actions on desegregation, the closure of persisting gender pay and pension gaps, and the development of pay systems and measures to support women’s careers; reiterates the importance of Member States clearly prohibiting in their national legislation any discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity; believes that the current legal protection accorded by the directive should be extended to all transgender people; calls for the utmost attention to be given to gender balance when developing worker consultation, participation and information models in corporate management processes;

32. Notes that combating the gender pay and pension gap is at the core of a socially just, gender-equal society, and therefore strongly repeats its call on the Member States to finally start actively implementing the Commission Recommendation on strengthening the principle of equal pay between men and women through transparency and continued positive action, preferably by means of legislation, and to introduce wage transparency measures and gender-neutral job evaluations;

33. Asks for special attention to be paid to safeguarding and restoring the equity function of social security pensions in pension reforms, including through care credits in pension schemes and the allowing of more flexible transitions from work into retirement;

34. Calls for real action to eliminate the gender pay gap, which has a negative impact on the social and economic position of women; calls for action to develop models for eliminating the gender gap in pensions, which results from the gender employment and pay gap and from time for caring for children and other family members not being taken into account;

35. Recommends ensuring a high level of protection for workers from all risks that may arise at work on the basis of the precautionary principle;

36. Recommends adequate protection for the increasing number of atypical workers in European social insurance systems;

37. Recalls that the EPSR will not deliver without social investment, especially in available and affordable high-quality infrastructure for caring for children and other dependent persons and also measures to combat discrimination between women and men, with the
support of the European Social Fund (ESF), the European Regional Development Fund (ERFD) and the European Fund for Strategic Investments (EFSI); stresses the importance of equipping the Youth Guarantee with resources and specific objectives for young women to help with their integration into the job market, especially in areas where social indicators show there to be a major gender imbalance;

38. Reiterates that macro-economic policies promoting austerity and structural reforms that promote public sector cuts impact women and girls disproportionately, stifle economic growth, and exacerbate poverty and social exclusion; reiterates its call on the Commission and the Member States to refocus their macro-economic approach on encouraging public sector social investment for sustainable and inclusive growth, which would benefit those who are most vulnerable in society, particularly women and girls;

39. Stresses that the EU is bound by the TEU to combat social exclusion and discrimination, and that the TFEU enshrines the elimination of inequalities and the promotion of equality between women and men as EU objectives; highlights that the principle of equality in no way hinders the maintenance or adoption of measures providing for specific advantages in favour of the underrepresented sex, as stipulated by Article 23 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights;

40. Calls for the adoption and rapid implementation of the European Accessibility Act;

41. Strongly deplores the fact that the Council has still not adopted the 2008 proposal for a directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation; welcomes the prioritisation of this directive by the Commission and reiterates its call on the Council to adopt the proposal as soon as possible;

42. Recommends that housing be made adaptable to accommodate the needs of an ageing population, to ensure that older people can stay at home as long as they wish;

43. Notes that women and girls are disproportionately affected by poverty and social exclusion, and calls for a renewed political impetus for an ambitious European anti-poverty strategy and a fresh commitment to meet the European 2020 anti-poverty targets; urges the Member States to outline detailed anti-poverty national strategy plans, and the Commission to emphasise poverty reduction within the European Semester;

44. Stresses that violence against women constitutes a systematic abuse of fundamental rights; calls for the EU and its Member States therefore to ratify the Istanbul Convention as soon as possible, and reiterates its call on the Commission to submit a proposal for an EU directive on violence against women and gender-based violence;

45. Condemns all forms of discrimination and violence against LGBTI people;

46. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to include measures to protect women and LGBTI people against harassment in the workplace;

47. Calls for all EPSR indicators and targets to be gender sensitive;

48. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to involve the social partners and civil
society in gender equality policies; stresses the importance of adequate funding for such policies, of collective agreements and collective bargaining in combating discrimination and promoting gender equality at work, and of research and exchange of good practices.
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date adopted</th>
<th>29.11.2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Result of final vote | +: 15  
| | --: 9  
| | 0: 2  |
| Members present for the final vote | Daniela Aiuto, Beatriz Becerra Basterrechea, Malin Björk, Vilija Blinkevičiūtė, Iratxe García Pérez, Anna Hedh, Mary Honeyball, Elisabeth Köstinger, Agnieszka Kozłowska-Rajewicz, Florent Marcellesi, Angelika Niebler, Maria Noichl, Marijana Petir, João Pimenta Lopes, Michaela Šojdrová, Ernest Urtasun, Elissavet Vozemberg-Vrionidi, Jadwiga Wiśniewska, Jana Žitňanská |
| Substitutes present for the final vote | Biljana Borzan, Stefan Eck, Clare Moody, Sirpa Pietikäinen, Marc Tarabella, Monika Vana, Julie Ward |
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date adopted</th>
<th>8.12.2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Result of final vote | +: 34  
|                  | –: 14  
|                  | 0: 4  |
| Members present for the final vote | Laura Agea, Brando Benifei, Mara Bizzotto, Vilija Blinkevičiūtė,  
|                       | Enrique Calvet Chambon, David Casa, Ole Christensen, Martina  
|                       | Dlabajová, Czeslaw Hoc, Agnes Jongerius, Rina Ronja Kari, Jan Keller,  
|                       | Ádám Kós, Agnieszka Kozłowska-Rajewicz, Jean Lambert, Patrick Le  
|                       | Hyaric, Jeroen Lenaers, Verónica Lope Fontagné, Javi López, Thomas  
|                       | Mann, Dominique Martin, Anthea McIntyre, João Pimenta Lopes,  
|                       | Georgi Pirinski, Marek Plura, Terry Reintke, Sofia Ribeiro, Maria João  
|                       | Rodrigues, Claude Rolin, Anne Sander, Sven Schulze, Romana Tomc,  
|                       | Yana Toom, Ulrike Trebesius, Renate Weber, Jana Žitňanská |
| Substitutes present for the final vote | Daniela Aiuto, Maria Arena, Georges Bach, Deirdre Clune, Karima  
|                               | Delli, Tania González Peñas, Edouard Martin, Alex Mayer, Joachim  
|                               | Schuster, Tom Vandenkendelaere, Flavio Zanonato, Gabriele Zimmer |
| Substitutes under Rule 200(2) present for the final vote | John Stuart Agnew, Adam Gierek, Maite Pagazaurtundúa Ruiz, Hannu  
|                                      | Takkula |
### FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALDE</td>
<td>Enrique Calvet Chambon, Maite Pagazaurtundúa Ruiz, Yana Toom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFDD</td>
<td>Laura Agea, Daniela Aiuto</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUE/NGL</td>
<td>Tania González Peñas, Patrick Le Hyaric, Gabriele Zimmer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPE</td>
<td>Georges Bach, David Casa, Deirdre Clune, Jeroen Lenaers, Verónica Lope Fontagné, Sofia Ribeiro, Claude Rolin, Anne Sander, Romana Tomc, Tom Vandenkendelaere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;D</td>
<td>Maria Arena, Brando Benifei, Vilija Bliukeniūtė, Ole Christensen, Agnes Jongerius, Jan Keller, Javi López, Edouard Martin, Alex Mayer, Georgi Pirinski, Maria João Rodrigues, Joachim Schuster, Flavio Zanonato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VERTS/ALE</td>
<td>Karima Delli, Jean Lambert, Terry Reintke</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 14 | - |
| ALDE | Martina Dlabajová, Hannu Takkula, Renate Weber |
| ECR | Czesław Hoc, Anthea McIntyre, Ulrike Trebesius, Jana Žižňanská |
| EFDD | John Stuart Agnew |
| ENF | Mara Bizzotto, Dominique Martin |
| GUE/NGL | João Pimenta Lopes |
| PPE | Agnieszka Kozłowska-Rajewicz, Marek Plura |
| S&D | Adam Gierek |

| 4 | 0 |
| GUE/NGL | Rina Ronja Kari |
| PPE | Ádám Kósa, Thomas Mann, Sven Schulze |

**Key to symbols:**
- +: in favour
- -: against
- 0: abstention