



---

*Plenary sitting*

---

**A9-0078/2023**

24.3.2023

# REPORT

on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (before 30.11.2021 the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking) for the financial year 2021  
(2022/2126(DEC))

Committee on Budgetary Control

Rapporteur: Joachim Stanisław Brudziński

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
1. PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION.....	3
2. PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION.....	5
3. MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION.....	7
OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT AND TOURISM.....	13
INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE.....	18
FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE .....	19

## 1. PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION

**on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (before 30.11.2021 the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking) for the financial year 2021  
(2022/2126(DEC))**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the final annual accounts of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2021,
- having regard to the Court of Auditors' annual report on the EU Joint Undertakings for the financial year 2021, together with the Joint Undertakings' replies<sup>1</sup>,
- having regard to the statement of assurance<sup>2</sup> as to the reliability of the accounts and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions provided by the Court of Auditors for the financial year 2021, pursuant to Article 287 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to the Council's recommendation of 28 February 2023 on discharge to be given to the Joint Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the budget for the financial year 2021 (06252/2023 – C9-0108/2023),
- having regard to Article 319 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 July 2018 on the financial rules applicable to the general budget of the Union, amending Regulations (EU) No 1296/2013, (EU) No 1301/2013, (EU) No 1303/2013, (EU) No 1304/2013, (EU) No 1309/2013, (EU) No 1316/2013, (EU) No 223/2014, (EU) No 283/2014, and Decision No 541/2014/EU and repealing Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 966/2012<sup>3</sup>, and in particular Article 71 thereof,
- having regard to Council Regulation (EC) No 558/2014 of 6 May 2014 establishing the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking<sup>4</sup>, and in particular Article 12 thereof,
- having regard to Council Regulation (EU) 2021/2085 of 19 November 2021 establishing the Joint Undertakings under Horizon Europe and repealing Regulations (EC) No 219/2007, (EU) No 557/2014, (EU) No 558/2014, (EU) No 559/2014, (EU) No 560/2014, (EU) No 561/2014 and (EU) No 642/2014<sup>5</sup>, and in particular Article 26 thereof,
- having regard to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/887 of 13 March 2019

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ C 433, 15.11.2022, p. 52.

<sup>2</sup> OJ C 433, 15.11.2022, p. 52.

<sup>3</sup> OJ L 193, 30.7.2018, p. 1.

<sup>4</sup> OJ L 169, 7.6.2014, p. 77.

<sup>5</sup> OJ L 427, 30.11.2021, p. 17.

on the model financial regulation for public-private partnership bodies referred to in Article 71 of Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>6</sup>,

- having regard to Rule 100 of and Annex V to its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the opinion of the Committee on Transport and Tourism,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control (A9-0078/2023),
1. Grants the Executive Director of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking discharge in respect of the implementation of the Joint Undertaking's budget for the financial year 2021;
  2. Sets out its observations in the resolution below;
  3. Instructs its President to forward this decision and the resolution forming an integral part of it to the Executive Director of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking, the Council, the Commission and the Court of Auditors, and to arrange for their publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union* (L series).

---

<sup>6</sup> OJ L 142, 29.5.2019, p. 16.

## 2. PROPOSAL FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT DECISION

**on the closure of the accounts of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (before 30.11.2021 the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking) for the financial year 2021 (2022/2126(DEC))**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the final annual accounts of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2021,
- having regard to the Court of Auditors' annual report on the EU Joint Undertakings for the financial year 2021, together with the Joint Undertakings' replies<sup>1</sup>,
- having regard to the statement of assurance<sup>2</sup> as to the reliability of the accounts and the legality and regularity of the underlying transactions provided by the Court of Auditors for the financial year 2021, pursuant to Article 287 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to the Council's recommendation of 28 February 2023 on discharge to be given to the Joint Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the budget for the financial year 2021 (06252/2023– C9-0108/2023),
- having regard to Article 319 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 July 2018 on the financial rules applicable to the general budget of the Union, amending Regulations (EU) No 1296/2013, (EU) No 1301/2013, (EU) No 1303/2013, (EU) No 1304/2013, (EU) No 1309/2013, (EU) No 1316/2013, (EU) No 223/2014, (EU) No 283/2014, and Decision No 541/2014/EU and repealing Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 966/2012<sup>3</sup>, and in particular Article 71 thereof,
- having regard to Council Regulation (EC) No 558/2014 of 6 May 2014 establishing the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking<sup>4</sup>, and in particular Article 12 thereof,
- having regard to Council Regulation (EU) 2021/2085 of 19 November 2021 establishing the Joint Undertakings under Horizon Europe and repealing Regulations (EC) No 219/2007, (EU) No 557/2014, (EU) No 558/2014, (EU) No 559/2014, (EU) No 560/2014, (EU) No 561/2014 and (EU) No 642/2014<sup>5</sup>, and in particular Article 26 thereof,
- having regard to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/887 of 13 March 2019 on the model financial regulation for public-private partnership bodies referred to in Article 71 of Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ C 433, 15.11.2022, p. 52.

<sup>2</sup> OJ C 433, 15.11.2022, p. 52.

<sup>3</sup> OJ L 193, 30.7.2018, p. 1.

<sup>4</sup> OJ L 169, 7.6.2014, p. 77.

<sup>5</sup> OJ L 427, 30.11.2021, p. 17.

the Council<sup>6</sup>,

- having regard to Rule 100 of and Annex V to its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the opinion of the Committee on Transport and Tourism,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control (A9-0078/2023),
1. Approves the closure of the accounts of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2021;
  2. Instructs its President to forward this decision to the Executive Director of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking, the Council, the Commission and the Court of Auditors, and to arrange for its publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union* (L series).

---

<sup>6</sup> OJ L 142, 29.5.2019, p. 16.

### 3. MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

**with observations forming an integral part of the decision on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (before 30.11.2021 the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking) for the financial year 2021 (2022/2126(DEC))**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to its decision on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2021,
  - having regard to Rule 100 of and Annex V to its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the opinion of the Committee on Transport and Tourism,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Budgetary Control (A9-0078/2023),
- A. whereas the Joint Undertaking for the implementation of the Joint Technology Initiative in Aeronautics was set up in December 2007 under the Seventh Research Framework Programme for a period of ten years (Clean Sky 1); whereas, in May 2014, the Council extended the lifetime of the Joint Undertaking under the Horizon 2020 programme for a period until 31 December 2024 (Clean Sky 2);
- B. whereas, in November 2021, the Council adopted Regulation (EU) 2021/2085<sup>1</sup> (‘Single Basic Act’), setting up the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (the ‘Joint Undertaking’) to replace Clean Sky 2, under the Horizon Europe programme for the period ending on 31 December 2031;
- C. whereas the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking is a public-private partnership for transforming aviation towards a sustainable and climate neutral future;
- D. whereas the founding members of the Joint Undertaking are the Union, represented by the Commission, and organisations from the aviation sector engaged in creating new global standard for reliable and climate-neutral aviation systems;
- E. whereas the Union financial contribution to the Joint Undertaking, including EEA appropriations, to cover administrative costs and operational costs shall be up to EUR 1,7 billion, including up to EUR 39,223 million for administrative costs; whereas the members of the Joint Undertaking other than the Union shall make or arrange for their constituent or affiliated entities to make a total contribution of at least EUR 2,4 billion, including up to EUR 39,223 million for administrative costs, over the ten-year period;

---

<sup>1</sup> Council Regulation (EU) 2021/2085 of 19 November 2021 establishing the Joint Undertakings under Horizon Europe and repealing Regulations (EC) No 219/2007, (EU) No 557/2014, (EU) No 558/2014, (EU) No 559/2014, (EU) No 560/2014, (EU) No 561/2014 and (EU) No 642/2014 (OJ L 427, 30.11.2021, p. 17).

### ***Budgetary and financial management***

1. Welcomes the fact that, according to the report of the Courts of Auditors (the ‘Court’s report’), the annual accounts of the Joint Undertaking for the financial year that ended on 31 December 2021 present fairly, in all material respects, with regard to the financial position of the Joint Undertaking at 31 December 2021, the results of its operations, its cash flows, and the changes in net assets for the year then ended, in accordance with its Financial Regulation and with the accounting rules adopted by the Commission’s accounting officer and that the underlying transactions to the accounts are legal and regular in all material respects;
2. Acknowledges that Horizon Europe envisages ambitious goals for the Joint Undertaking, that can only be achieved if effective solutions that address the weaknesses in the internal control systems and prepare for the future challenges arising from increased responsibilities, e.g. in the area of human resources management and planning, are designed and implemented; points out, in this context, that particularly complicated and burdensome calculations and reporting requirements represent a significant risk of error and calls therefore, for possible simplifications to be explored wherever they are possible and compatible with the existing legal framework;
3. Notes that the Joint Undertaking’s final budget available for 2021 (including re-entered unused appropriations of previous years, assigned revenues, and reallocations to the next year) comprised commitment appropriations of EUR 182,6 million and payment appropriations of EUR 189,9 million;
4. Understands that the budget execution was impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic situation, in particular concerning payment appropriations for administrative expenditure and that nonetheless, the Joint Undertaking had a 99,6 % rate of implementation for the commitment appropriations in 2021 (excluding the unused appropriations not required in current year) and the payment appropriations were executed to 82,3 % of the available funds, excluding the unused appropriations 2021 of EUR 22,9 million (56,3 % of execution rate if the unused appropriations are included as total payment budget);
5. Notes that, at the end of 2021, the Joint Undertaking had almost fully committed EUR 1 716 million of the maximum EU contribution for signed Horizon 2020 grant agreements; notes that, out of this amount, around EUR 273 million (or 16 %) remains to be paid in the coming years; notes, in addition, that the private members had legally committed to provide in-kind contributions of EUR 2 113,8 million;
6. Highlights that the implementation rate for the Joint Undertaking’s 2021 commitment and payment budget available for Horizon 2020 projects was 100 % and 83 % respectively;
7. Notes from the Annual Activity Report that the 2022-2023 planning was revised to include the carry-over from 2020-2021 (unspent efforts and re-planned deliverables) in order to report on the remaining activities until programme end; notes that the next period will be critical, as 70 % of the results are expected to be delivered in the last two years of the programme with a remaining funding of ~10 % at programme level; notes, in addition, that the risk of delays in some Innovative Aircraft Demonstration



Platforms/Integrated Technology Demonstrators (IADP/ITD) areas remains high and requires specific monitoring from the members in order to deliver their results within the lifetime of the Clean Sky 2 programme; notes, moreover, that in the next period, all the Innovative Aircraft Demonstration Platforms (IADPs), Integrated Technology Demonstrators (ITDs) and Transverse Activities (TAs) are expected to confirm the plan to completion via the mid-year assessment (due in July 2022) and the interim progress reviews will play a central role in the assessment of the cumulative performance achieved and confirm the delivery plan of results as per schedule;

### ***Staff and procurement***

8. Notes that Joint Undertaking establishment plan for 2021 contained a total of 42 statutory staff (temporary agents and contract agents) and two seconded national experts with 42 posts filled at the end of the 2021; notes that in 2021 the Joint Undertaking launched the recruitment process of two positions (Team Leader and Project Officer); notes that, in addition to the statutory posts, the Joint Undertaking relies on external service providers such as the webmaster, the IT services firm shared with the other Joint Undertakings, nine interims and one consultant in communications (English Writer) to provide extra support to the Joint Undertaking;
9. Notes with concern, from the follow-up of previous years' observations of the Court of Auditors (the 'Court') that the situation with the increased use of interim staff during the past years remains high at around 13 % of statutory staff; recalls that the high level of contractual staff tends to increase significantly the Joint Undertaking's staff turnover rate and further destabilises the staffing situation; emphasises, moreover, that the use of interim staff should remain a temporary solution as it could otherwise negatively affect the Joint Undertaking's overall performance, such as the retention of key competences, unclear accountability channels, possible judicial disputes and lower staff efficiency; notes the Joint Undertaking's reply, that it has been obliged to constantly enlarge the use of interim staff during the past years due to the limitations of the rigid staff establishment plan under the condition of increasing tasks and workload, and that this trend is expected to continue with the two programmes – the Clean Sky 2 and the new Clean Aviation programme – running in parallel; notes, furthermore that a more optimal solution would be to provide more flexibility to the Joint Undertaking with regards to number of contract agents' posts in the staff establishment plan; reminds, however, that the Joint Undertaking should develop a formalised model or guidance on how to estimate staff needs (including essential competences), with the objective of optimising the use of staff resources;
10. Welcomes the fact that the Joint Undertaking further implemented, together with the other Joint Undertakings, the use of Systal, an online HR tool to perform secure selection processes; notes that, in accordance with the decision of the Governing Board regarding the reclassification system, in 2021 the Joint Undertaking has performed the reclassification exercise and as a result, eleven temporary agents and three contract agents members of staff were reclassified;
11. Regrets that there was no call launched in 2021 for proposals;
12. Commends the strong involvement of small and medium-sized enterprises (SME) in

terms of participation (29 % of the total number of participations in funded projects - 555 out of 1887) and the high level of success of SME applicants (43 %); recalls that the Undertaking creates new opportunities for SMEs;

13. Notes that, in 2021, the 17 contracts which were awarded and signed related to procurement and specific contracts to implement ongoing framework contracts;
14. Notes, from the Annual Activity Report 2021, in terms of gender balance, that the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking has a lower percentage of women in programme participation, project coordinators, advisors and experts compared to the previous year; regrets that these figures have decreased and calls for increased efforts in terms of gender balance;
15. Notes that the part of the employers' contributions for the staff of the Joint Undertakings corresponding to the ratio of their non-EU subsidised revenues to their total revenues, has not been paid by the Joint Undertakings to the Union pension scheme since 2016, as the Commission has neither foreseen this expenditure in the budget of the Joint Undertakings nor formally requested the payments; calls on the Commission to take steps to avoid similar issues in the future;
16. Notes that the follow up on the Court's 2020 recommendation regarding the use of interim staff is still outstanding; calls on the Joint Undertaking to address the issue as soon as possible as this situation creates instability and significant risks for the Joint Undertaking; notes that the implementation of the Joint Undertaking's research and innovation agenda cannot be realized with this level of statutory staffing;

### ***Internal control***

17. Notes that, for Horizon 2020 payments, the Common Audit Service of the Commission's Directorate-General for Research and Innovation is responsible for the ex-post audits, notes that based on the ex-post audit results available at the end of 2021, the Joint Undertaking reported a representative error rate of 1,8 % (compared to 1,60 % in 2020) and a residual error rate of 1,0 % (compared to 0,91 % in 2020) for Horizon 2020 projects (clearings and final payments);
18. Notes that to assess the operational payment controls of the Joint Undertaking, the Court audited randomly sampled Horizon 2020 payments made in 2021, at the level of the final beneficiaries, to corroborate the ex-post audit error rates; deplores that, in one case, the Court found and quantified a systemic error related to the incorrect calculation of the hourly rates for personnel costs;
19. Emphasises that the Court's finding confirmed persistent systemic errors for declared personnel costs and that, in particular, SMEs and new beneficiaries are more error-prone than other beneficiaries; highlights that these errors are also regularly reported in the Court's previous annual reports since 2017; emphasises therefore that streamlining of the Horizon 2020 rules for the declaration of personnel costs and wider use of simplified cost options is a precondition to stabilise error rates to below materiality level; emphasises that Joint Undertaking should strengthen its internal control systems to address the increased risk regarding SMEs and new beneficiaries and strongly encourage the use of the Personnel Costs Wizard by certain categories of beneficiaries

that are more prone to errors, such as SMEs and new beneficiaries; welcomes the fact that in 2022 all Joint Undertakings started implementing actions for error rate reductions in line with the action proposed by the Court, including exploring the options of simplified forms of costs such as unit costs, lump sums and flat rates;

20. Is deeply concerned that, in 2021, important documents (for example, evaluation committee members' declarations of absence of conflict of interests; procurement evaluation reports; recruitment evaluation reports; decisions on recruitment selection boards; procurement award decisions, and employment contracts) were authorised by copying and pasting an image of the signature of the responsible authorising officer into the document in Word format and then converting the file into PDF format; agrees with the Court observation that this practice may present legal risks, as a rejected candidate may challenge the regularity of the signed evaluation documents; calls on the Joint Undertaking to immediately stop this practice and to opt for a secure authorisation method;
21. Notes that there is no harmonised definition of "administrative costs" among the Joint Undertakings, which is a basis for calculating the financial contributions of its members and a precondition for the purpose of comparable figures; with this in mind, calls for common guidelines for all Joint Undertakings to take a harmonised approach for the classification of certain administrative cost expenditure categories, such as expenditure for consultations, studies, analysis, evaluations, and technical assistance;
22. Welcomes the introduction of the digital signature; encourages the Undertaking to work towards further digitalisation;

### ***Internal Audit***

23. Notes, from the Annual Activity Report, that the internal audit functions of the Joint Undertaking were carried out in 2021 by the Internal Audit Service of the Commission (IAS) and by the Internal Audit Officer of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking (IAO) according to Art. 28 and Art. 29 of the Financial Regulation;
24. Notes that, in 2021, the IAS did not carry out a new assurance audit; notes that several follow-up audits were performed on previous recommendations; notes that the follow-up of the Audit on Horizon 2020 grant implementation (final report of 22 October 2020), started in April 2021; notes that the IAS concluded in June 2021 that the three recommendations had been adequately and effectively implemented by the Joint Undertaking and were therefore considered closed;
25. Notes that the follow-up of the Audit on Performance Management (final report of 20 November 2017), started in July 2021: notes that the concerned recommendation related to Monitoring and Reporting on the Performance of Horizon 2020 Projects; notes that the action plan consisted of three sub-actions which addressed weaknesses in the Joint Undertaking's monitoring process regarding the contribution of the Clean Sky 2 projects of partners to the High Level Objectives of Clean Sky 2; notes that, following the implementation process of the actions, the Joint Undertaking has proposed the recommendations to the IAS in several steps as ready for closure, the last update being provided in May 2021; notes that, in a specific note for the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking concerning the year 2021, the IAS concluded that the recommendations are

considered implemented;

26. Notes that the follow-up Audit on Performance Management (final report issued on 20 November 2017) and on the Horizon 2020 Grant Process (from the identification of the call topics to the signature of the grant agreement) (final report issued on 15 November 2016), started in January 2022; notes that the two recommendations concerning the update of the Joint Undertaking's internal procedure descriptions, such as the Management Manual and the Quality Manual, in the light of the current Horizon 2020 processes have been implemented by the Joint Undertaking in several steps and has been proposed to the IAS for final closure in November 2021; notes that in its annual report for the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking concerning the year 2021, the IAS concluded that the recommendations are considered to have been implemented;

### ***Prevention of fraud and conflict of interest***

27. Welcomes the fact that, in 2021, the Joint Undertaking continued to apply the decisions adopted by the Governing Board regarding the rules on the prevention and management of conflicts of interest applicable to the bodies of the Joint Undertaking and to the members of staff of the Joint Undertaking and that the related processes, for instance concerning Members of the Joint Undertaking's Governing Board, experts of evaluation procedures, panels for procurement and recruitment, applied consistently the required precautionary measures to identify potential conflicts; underlines that a Joint Undertaking policy on sensitive functions has been drafted based on a dedicated risk assessment and will be finalised in the year 2022;
28. Points out that, according to an assessment of the Court, the risk of fraudulent bankruptcies or other fraudulent behaviours to escape the financial problems and supply restrictions needs to be considered in the context of the Covid-19 pandemic as an additional threat for legality and regularity; appreciates that the Joint Undertaking has established a specific risk-based sample of ex-post audits to cover the stratum in the Joint Undertaking population of Grant Agreement for Partners (GAP) projects, which indicate a certain exposure to Covid-19 constraints as described by the Court, like financial weaknesses, operational delays, high personal costs as compared to average;
29. Deplores that, in the year 2021, OLAF issued the conclusions and its reports regarding two cases pertaining to grants of Clean Sky 1 and Clean Sky 2 and that the alleged fraud was confirmed in both cases;
30. Notes that the recommendations of OLAF in both cases focus on measures to be taken by the Joint Undertaking to recover the funding and to consider flagging the entity and the person in the EC systems (Exclusion Database); notes that the Joint Undertaking has completed the litigation case before the General Court pertaining to the case in Italy (lodged in 2018) and will try to execute the General Court judgement at national level; notes that with regard to the Belgian case, the Joint Undertaking had registered its financial claims with the liquidator already in 2017, based on the OLAF report and confirmation of fraud, and that the Joint Undertaking is analysing what judicial action may be taken at national level.

## **OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT AND TOURISM**

for the Committee on Budgetary Control

on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Aviation Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2021  
(2022/2126(DEC))

Rapporteur for opinion: Gheorghe Falcă

### **SUGGESTIONS**

The Committee on Transport and Tourism calls on the Committee on Budgetary Control, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

1. Welcomes the finding of the Court of Auditors that the transactions underlying the accounts of the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking ('the Undertaking') for the financial year 2021 are legal and regular in all material respects;
2. Stresses that the Financial Regulation and high management standards have to be observed by all the Union's institutions;
3. Welcomes the introduction of the digital signature; encourages the Undertaking to work towards further digitalisation;
4. Notes that the Undertaking's final budget for 2021 was EUR 182,1 million in commitment appropriations and EUR 189,4 million in payment appropriations;
5. Welcomes the fact that the Undertaking attained a rate of implementation of 99,6 % for the commitment appropriations and 82,3 % for the payment appropriations;
6. Notes that, as of the cut-off date of the final accounts 2021, the private members of the Undertaking have reported cumulative in-kind contributions for operational activities (IKOP) to the value of EUR 823,81 million, and that the Undertaking has validated certified contributions to the value of EUR 581,34 million; notes similarly that the private members have reported cumulative in-kind contributions for additional activities (IKAA), to the value of EUR 1.27 billion, of which EUR 1,03 billion were validated by the Undertaking;
7. Notes that the follow up on the Court of Auditors' 2020 recommendation regarding the use of interim staff is still outstanding; calls on the Undertaking to address the issue as soon as possible as this situation creates instability and significant risks for the Undertaking; notes that the implementation of the Undertaking's research and innovation

agenda cannot be realized with this level of statutory staffing;

8. Regrets that there was no call launched in 2021 for proposals;
9. Commends the strong SME involvement in terms of participation (29 % of the total number of participations in funded projects - 555 out of 1887) and the high level of success of SME applicants (43 %); recalls that the Undertaking creates new opportunities for SMEs;
10. Highlights the essential role played by the Undertaking ensuring aviation sector's involvement in the European Green Deal;
11. Salutes the launch, in December 2021 of the Clean Aviation Joint undertaking that will run the Clean Aviation programme from 2022 to the end 2031 with projected funding of EUR 4,1 billion (including EUR 1,7 billion from the European Union); commends the preparatory work of the Undertaking in that regard and emphasises that its activities should also cover the development of green technologies and their respective fuels;
12. Notes that Clean Sky 2 programme clearly demonstrates the benefits of a true public private partnership; notes that stake holder participation was at a high level, including SMEs (often their first participation in the European framework programme), research centres and academia; also notes that the industry is increasingly using Clean Sky as the focus of their research and innovation programmes because of the efficiency and effectiveness of Clean Sky research at European level; emphasizes that the Undertaking has proven to be an appropriate management body;
13. Welcomes the adoption of the Strategic Research and Innovation Agenda (SRIA) in December 2021; notes that the adoption of the SRIA also confirmed the three key thrusts for the research and innovation efforts in Clean Aviation, that will drive energy efficiency and emissions reductions of future aircraft and they will also form the architecture of the Joint Undertaking's 10-year programme focusing on hybrid electric and full electric architectures, ultra-efficient aircraft architectures and disruptive technologies to enable hydrogen-powered aircraft;
14. Salutes that Clean Sky engages the best talent and resources in Europe and is jointly funded and governed by the Union and the major European aeronautics companies; notes that it utilises the key skills and knowledge of the leading European aeronautic research establishments and academic faculties; emphasizes that small and medium-size enterprises and innovative sub-sector leaders will help to shape promising new supply chains;
15. Welcomes the ongoing progress on delivering vital full-scale in-flight demonstrations of novel architectures and configurations, as well as on advanced technology inserted and demonstrated at full systems level enabling step-changes in environmental and economic performance and bring crucial competitiveness benefits to European industry;
16. Welcomes the fact that, despite the COVID-19 crisis, the programme has entered its delivery phase with 107 demonstrators at completion, 30 % completed in 2021 and above 80 % of deliverables achieved by end 2021; notes however that delays of 6,5 months on average are expected for one fourth of the demonstrators; suggests that necessary and



effective measures should be taken in the future to avoid such delays;

17. Notes the Joint Undertaking's high-level objective, as set out in the Council Regulation 2021/2085, to expand and foster integration of the climate-neutral aviation research and innovation value chains, including academia, research organisations, industry and SMEs, as well as the stated mission of developing disruptive new aircraft technology to pave the way towards the Union's ambition of climate neutrality by 2050;
18. Salutes the progress of the Undertaking in R&D related to technologies for engine manufacturing and SAF and calls for the further intensification of research into aviation green technologies such as on the electrification of aviation but also on the use of hydrogen in order to contribute to the greening of aviation by technological advancements ; calls on the Commission to provide sufficient funding to massively deploy those new technologies including via retrofitting and renewal schemes.
19. Highlights the importance of the consultation with private and public stakeholders in order to cooperate on environmental issues and policies so as to ensure a better transition to climate-neutral aviation;
20. Notes with satisfaction that the ex-post audit results in 2021 had a representative error rate of 2,52 % and that the corresponding residual error rate (remaining error after implementing corrective actions resulting from the ex-post controls) of 1,10 %, is well below the 2 % target;
21. Welcomes the continued implementation of the Undertaking's Anti-Fraud Strategy; calls the Undertaking to follow OLAF recommendations in order to avoid cases of fraud;
22. Encourages the Undertaking to consider incorporating a reduction of non-CO2 emissions in their portfolio;
23. Proposes that Parliament grants discharge to the Executive Director of the Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the Undertaking's budget for the financial year 2021.

## INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

<b>Date adopted</b>	31.1.2023
<b>Result of final vote</b>	<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <span>+: 39</span> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <span>–: 0</span> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between;"> <span>0: 0</span> </div>
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Andris Ameriks, José Ramón Bauzá Díaz, Erik Bergkvist, Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, Ciarán Cuffe, Karima Delli, Anna Deparnay-Grunenberg, Gheorghe Falcă, Isabel García Muñoz, Jens Gieseke, Elsi Katainen, Elena Kountoura, Bogusław Liberadzki, Peter Lundgren, Benoît Lutgen, Elżbieta Katarzyna Łukacijewska, Marian-Jean Marinescu, Tilly Metz, Caroline Nagtegaal, Jan-Christoph Oetjen, Philippe Olivier, Dominique Riquet, Vera Tax, Henna Virkkunen, Petar Vitanov, Lucia Vuolo, Roberts Zīle, Kosma Złotowski
<b>Substitutes present for the final vote</b>	Sara Cerdas, Ignazio Corrao, Clare Daly, Nicola Danti, Markus Ferber, Maria Grapini, Colm Markey, Beata Mazurek, Ljudmila Novak, Jörgen Warborn
<b>Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote</b>	Achille Variati



## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

39	+
ECR	Peter Lundgren, Beata Mazurek, Roberts Zīle, Kosma Złotowski
ID	Philippe Olivier
PPE	Gheorghe Falcă, Markus Ferber, Jens Gieseke, Elżbieta Katarzyna Łukacijewska, Benoît Lutgen, Marian-Jean Marinescu, Colm Markey, Ljudmila Novak, Henna Virkkunen, Lucia Vuolo, Jörgen Warborn
Renew	José Ramón Bauzá Díaz, Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, Nicola Danti, Elsi Katainen, Caroline Nagtegaal, Jan-Christoph Oetjen, Dominique Riquet
S&D	Andris Ameriks, Erik Bergkvist, Sara Cerdas, Isabel García Muñoz, Maria Grapini, Bogusław Liberadzki, Vera Tax, Achille Variati, Petar Vitanov
The Left	Clare Daly, Elena Kountoura
Verts/ALE	Ignazio Corrao, Ciarán Cuffe, Karima Delli, Anna Deparnay-Grunenberg, Tilly Metz

0	-

0	0

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention

## INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<b>Date adopted</b>	28.2.2023
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+ : 25 - : 2 0 : 0
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Gilles Boyer, Olivier Chastel, Caterina Chinnici, Corina Crețu, Ryszard Czarnecki, José Manuel Fernandes, Luke Ming Flanagan, Daniel Freund, Isabel García Muñoz, Monika Hohlmeier, Jean-François Jalkh, Mislav Kolakušić, Joachim Kuhs, Alin Mituța, Jan Olbrycht, Markus Pieper, Michèle Rivasi, Sándor Rónai, Petri Sarvamaa, Eleni Stavrou, Angelika Winzig, Lara Wolters, Tomáš Zdechovský
<b>Substitutes present for the final vote</b>	Eider Gardiazabal Rubial, Elżbieta Rafalska
<b>Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote</b>	Fabienne Keller, Katrin Langensiepen

## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

25	+
ECR	Ryszard Czarnecki, Elżbieta Rafalska
ID	Jean-François Jalkh
PPE	José Manuel Fernandes, Monika Hohlmeier, Jan Olbrycht, Markus Pieper, Petri Sarvamaa, Eleni Stavrou, Angelika Winzig, Tomáš Zdechovský
Renew	Gilles Boyer, Olivier Chastel, Fabienne Keller, Alin Mituța
S&D	Caterina Chinnici, Corina Crețu, Isabel García Muñoz, Eider Gardiazabal Rubial, Sándor Rónai, Lara Wolters
The Left	Luke Ming Flanagan
Verts/ALE	Daniel Freund, Katrin Langensiepen, Michèle Rivasi

2	-
ID	Joachim Kuhs
NI	Mislav Kolakušić

0	0

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention