



---

*Plenary sitting*

---

**A9-0159/2023**

27.4.2023

**\*\*\*I**  
**REPORT**

on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council  
on the labelling of organic pet food  
(COM(2022)0659 – C9-0396/2022 – 2022/0390(COD))

Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development

Rapporteur: Martin Häusling

### ***Symbols for procedures***

- \* Consultation procedure
- \*\*\* Consent procedure
- \*\*\*I Ordinary legislative procedure (first reading)
- \*\*\*II Ordinary legislative procedure (second reading)
- \*\*\*III Ordinary legislative procedure (third reading)

(The type of procedure depends on the legal basis proposed by the draft act.)

### ***Amendments to a draft act***

#### **Amendments by Parliament set out in two columns**

Deletions are indicated in ***bold italics*** in the left-hand column. Replacements are indicated in ***bold italics*** in both columns. New text is indicated in ***bold italics*** in the right-hand column.

The first and second lines of the header of each amendment identify the relevant part of the draft act under consideration. If an amendment pertains to an existing act that the draft act is seeking to amend, the amendment heading includes a third line identifying the existing act and a fourth line identifying the provision in that act that Parliament wishes to amend.

#### **Amendments by Parliament in the form of a consolidated text**

New text is highlighted in ***bold italics***. Deletions are indicated using either the **■** symbol or ~~strikeout~~. Replacements are indicated by highlighting the new text in ***bold italics*** and by deleting or striking out the text that has been replaced.

By way of exception, purely technical changes made by the drafting departments in preparing the final text are not highlighted.

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION .....	5
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT .....	15
OPINION IN THE FORM OF LETTER FROM THE COMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENT, PUBLIC HEALTH AND FOOD SAFETY .....	17
PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE .....	20
FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE .....	21



## DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION

**on the proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on the labelling of organic pet food  
(COM(2022)0659 – C9-0396/2022 – 2022/0390(COD))**

**(Ordinary legislative procedure: first reading)**

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to the Commission proposal to Parliament and the Council (COM(2022)0659),
  - having regard to Article 294(2) and Article 43(2) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, pursuant to which the Commission submitted the proposal to Parliament (C9-0396/2022),
  - having regard to Article 294(3) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
  - having regard to the opinion of the European Economic and Social Committee of 24 January 2023<sup>1</sup>,
  - having regard to Rule 59 of its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the letter from the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development (A9-0159/2023),
1. Adopts its position at first reading hereinafter set out;
  2. Calls on the Commission to refer the matter to Parliament again if it replaces, substantially amends or intends to substantially amend its proposal;
  3. Instructs its President to forward its position to the Council, the Commission and the national parliaments.

### **Amendment 1**

**Proposal for a regulation  
Recital -1 (new)**

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ C 140, 21.4.2023, p. 55.

**(-1) Taking into consideration the objectives of the Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) of ensuring a fair income for farmers and responding to the demands of society of food and health, the growing consumer demand for organic products is an opportunity for further expansion of the pet food sector and for an increase in the income of farmers engaged in organic production. Acknowledging the fact that the pet food sector has a role to play in contributing to the European Green Deal objectives, and recognising those new labelling measures and the uniform use of the organic production logo of the European Union will help to develop and promote the pet food sector, both through the sale of products to consumers who are mindful of the organic content of the products they buy, and through the opportunity to bring added value to organic by-products. The pet food sector will thus be able to contribute, albeit modestly, to achieving an increase in Union agricultural land under organic farming by 2030, as envisaged in the Commission Communication of 19 April 2021 on an Action Plan for the development of organic production.**

## Amendment 2

### Proposal for a regulation

#### Recital 1

*Text proposed by the Commission*

(1) Regulation (EU) 2018/848 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>4</sup> lays down rules on **the** labelling of **feed and** applies both to feed for food-producing animals and to feed for pets, i.e. pet food. Under that Regulation, **while** non-organic ingredients of agricultural

*Amendment*

(1) Regulation (EU) 2018/848 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>4</sup> lays down rules on **organic production and** labelling of **organic products. That Regulation** applies both to feed for food-producing animals and to feed for pets, i.e. pet food. Under that Regulation, non-

origin **are** authorised in the production of organic feed, a term referring to organic production cannot be used in the sales description where not all agricultural ingredients are organic, **even if to a low** extent. Moreover, such feed cannot bear the organic production logo of the European Union. Consequently, final consumers are not directly informed about the compliance of the product with organic production rules.

organic ingredients of agricultural origin **may be** authorised **for all types** of organic feed, **while** a term referring to organic production cannot be used in the sales description where not all agricultural ingredients are organic, **regardless of** extent. Moreover, such feed cannot bear the organic production logo of the European Union. Consequently, final consumers are not directly informed about the compliance of the product with organic production rules.

### Amendment 3

#### Proposal for a regulation

##### Recital 2

###### *Text proposed by the Commission*

(2) Professional operators are informed about the composition and the proportion of organic, in-conversion and non-organic compounds in feed in accordance with point 2.1.2 of Annex III to Regulation (EU) 2018/848. By contrast, when feed is sold directly at retail level to final consumers, there are currently no rules concerning the provision of information on the organic compounds **in the** feed where not all of agricultural ingredients are organic. **This** is particularly relevant for pet food.

###### *Amendment*

(2) Professional operators are informed about the composition and the proportion of organic, in-conversion and non-organic **ingredients** in **compound** feed in accordance with point 2.1.2 of Annex III to Regulation (EU) 2018/848. By contrast, when feed is sold directly at retail level to final consumers, there are currently no rules concerning the provision of information on the organic **ingredients in** compound feed where not all of agricultural ingredients are organic. **The presence of non-organic agricultural ingredients** is particularly relevant for pet food. **Final consumers should be appropriately informed about the composition of pet food containing both organic and non-organic agricultural ingredients, enabling consumer confidence and fair competition between operators in the pet food sector.**

### Amendment 4

#### Proposal for a regulation

##### Recital 4

(4) The labelling rules for organic pet food at Union level should therefore mirror those for organic food, given that both categories of products are mainly sold at retail level to final consumers. Information on compliance with organic production rules should be provided through the terms referring to organic production in the sales description and through the use of the organic production logo of the European Union. In order to facilitate awareness about compliance with organic production rules, the organic production logo of the European Union should be obligatory for all prepacked pet food complying with Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and this Regulation and produced within the Union, as is the case with prepacked food pursuant to Article 32(1), point (b), of Regulation (EU) 2018/848.

(4) ***For the purposes of consumer information, consistency and transparency of the market, and to create adequate incentives for the use of organic ingredients, it should also be possible to refer, under certain conditions, to organic production in the sales description and in the list of ingredients of pet food.*** The labelling rules for organic pet food at Union level should therefore mirror those for organic food, given that both categories of products are mainly sold at retail level to final consumers. ***It is therefore appropriate to lay down labelling requirements for pet food that are specific within the meaning of Article 2(5) of Regulation (EU) 2018/848. The provisions of that Regulation which apply to feed, in particular those concerning production, certification, control, marketing and trade with third countries, should remain applicable since pet food is feed for a specific category of animals.*** Information on compliance with organic production rules should be provided through the terms referring to organic production in the sales description, ***in the list of ingredients*** and through the use of the organic production logo of the European Union. In order to facilitate awareness about compliance with organic production rules, the organic production logo of the European Union should be obligatory for all prepacked pet food complying with Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and this Regulation and produced within the Union, as is the case with prepacked food pursuant to Article 32(1), point (b), of Regulation (EU) 2018/848.

## **Amendment 5**

### **Proposal for a regulation Recital 5**



*Text proposed by the Commission*

(5) In order to promote the further development of the pet food sector, it is appropriate to introduce specific provisions on the labelling of organic pet food, on the use of terms referring to organic production in the sales description and in the list of ingredients, and on the use of the organic production logo of the European Union.

*Amendment*

(5) In order to promote the further development of the pet food sector, it is appropriate to introduce specific provisions on the labelling of organic pet food, on the use of terms referring to organic production in the sales description and in the list of ingredients, and on the use of the organic production logo of the European Union. ***Special labelling provisions should also be laid down to enable final consumers to identify organic ingredients used in products which consist mainly of an ingredient that stems from hunting or fishing, as long as all other ingredients are organic and only feed additives and processing aids authorised pursuant to Article 24 of Regulation (EU) 2018/848 are used.***

**Amendment 6**

**Proposal for a regulation  
Recital 5 a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***(5a) After the entry into force of Regulation (EU) 2018/848, operators continued to label pet food in accordance with national rules or private standards due to the restricted availability under organic form of certain necessary agricultural ingredients such as certain feed materials and feed additives to enhance palatability of pet food, or to ensure nutritional value. It is therefore appropriate to allow the exhaustion of stocks of products which have been labelled in accordance with those national rules or private standards accepted or recognised by the Member States in accordance with Article 95(5) of Regulation (EC) No 889/2008 before the date of the entry into force of this Regulation. Therefore, this Regulation***

*should authorise the products belonging to such stocks to be labelled as organic.*

## **Amendment 7**

### **Proposal for a regulation Recital 5 b (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***(5b) It is appropriate to provide for a deferred date of application of the obligation to use the organic production logo of the European Union on the labelling of prepacked pet food in order to enable operators to prepare fully for the application of the new labelling requirements.***

## **Amendment 8**

### **Proposal for a regulation Article 1 – paragraph 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

This Regulation lays down specific labelling requirements for pet food produced in accordance with the rules concerning organic production **provided** in Regulation (EU) 2018/848.

This Regulation lays down specific labelling requirements for pet food produced in accordance with the rules concerning organic production ***of feed laid down*** in Regulation (EU) 2018/848 ***and constitutes other specific Union law relating to the placing of the products on the market for the purposes of Article 2(5) of that Regulation.***

## **Amendment 9**

### **Proposal for a regulation Article 2 – paragraph 1 – point 1**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

1. ‘pet food’ means feed intended for pets as defined in Article 3(2), point (f), of Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>6</sup>;

1. ‘pet food’ means ***feed as defined in Article 3, point 4, of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002 and*** intended for pets as defined in Article 3(2), point (f), of Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 of the European

Parliament and of the Council<sup>6</sup>;

---

<sup>6</sup> Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 July 2009 on the placing on the market and use of feed, amending European Parliament and Council Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and repealing Council Directive 79/373/EEC, Commission Directive 80/511/EEC, Council Directives 82/471/EEC, 83/228/EEC, 93/74/EEC, 93/113/EC and 96/25/EC and Commission Decision 2004/217/EC (Feed marketing Regulation) (OJ L 229, 1.9.2009, p. 1).

---

<sup>6</sup> Regulation (EC) No 767/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 July 2009 on the placing on the market and use of feed, amending European Parliament and Council Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and repealing Council Directive 79/373/EEC, Commission Directive 80/511/EEC, Council Directives 82/471/EEC, 83/228/EEC, 93/74/EEC, 93/113/EC and 96/25/EC and Commission Decision 2004/217/EC (Feed marketing Regulation) (OJ L 229, 1.9.2009, p. 1).

**Amendment 10**  
**Proposal for a regulation**  
**Article 3 – paragraph 1 a (new)**

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

***1a. For pet food containing ingredients stemming from hunting or fishing, the terms referred to in Article 30(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/848 may be used in the sales description and in the list of ingredients, provided that:***

***(a) the main ingredient is a product of hunting or fishing;***

***(b) those terms are clearly related in the sales description to an organic ingredient other than the main ingredient;***

***(c) all other agricultural ingredients are organic;***

***(d) only feed additives and processing aids authorised pursuant to Article 24 of Regulation (EU) 2018/848 are used in the processing of the pet food;***

***(e) the pet food complies with the detailed production rules set out in points 1.5, 2.1, 2.2 and 2.4 of Part V of Annex II to Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and with the processing techniques laid down in accordance with Article 17(3) of that***

## ***Regulation.***

### **Amendment 11**

#### **Proposal for a regulation Article 3 – paragraph 2**

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

2. The list of ingredients referred to in **paragraph 1** shall indicate which ingredients are organic. The references to organic production may only appear in relation to the organic ingredients.

##### *Amendment*

2. The list of ingredients referred to in **paragraphs 1 and 1a** shall indicate which ingredients are organic. The references to organic production may only appear in relation to the organic ingredients.

### **Amendment 12**

#### **Proposal for a regulation Article 3 – paragraph 3**

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

3. The list of ingredients referred to in paragraph 1, point (b), shall include an indication of the total percentage of organic ingredients in proportion to the total quantity of agricultural ingredients.

##### *Amendment*

3. The list of ingredients referred to in paragraph 1, point (b), **and paragraph 1a** shall include an indication of the total percentage of organic ingredients in proportion to the total quantity of agricultural ingredients.

### **Amendment 13**

#### **Proposal for a regulation Article 3 – paragraph 4**

##### *Text proposed by the Commission*

4. The terms referred to in Article 30(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and the indication of the percentage referred to in paragraph 3 of this Article shall appear in the same colour, identical size and style of lettering as the other indications in the list of ingredients referred to in **paragraph 1** of this Article.

##### *Amendment*

4. The terms referred to in Article 30(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and the indication of the percentage referred to in paragraph 3 of this Article shall appear in the same colour, identical size and style of lettering as the other indications in the list of ingredients referred to in **paragraphs 1 and 1a** of this Article.

## Amendment 14

### Proposal for a regulation Article 4 – paragraph 2

*Text proposed by the Commission*

2. In the case of prepacked pet food ***bearing a term*** referred to in Article 30(1) of Regulation (EU) 2018/848, the organic production logo of the European Union shall appear on the packaging.

*Amendment*

2. In the case of prepacked pet food ***complying with the conditions*** referred to in Article 3(1a), the organic production logo of the European Union shall appear on the packaging.

## Amendment 15

### Proposal for a regulation Article 4 a (new)

*Text proposed by the Commission*

*Amendment*

#### *Article 4a*

##### *Transitional measures*

***Stocks of pre-packed organic pet food labelled in accordance with national rules or, in their absence, private standards accepted or recognised by Member States in accordance with Article 95(5) of Regulation (EC) No 889/2008 before ... [the date of entry into force of this Regulation], including pet food that does not bear the organic production logo of the European Union due to national rules, may continue to be placed on the market until stocks are exhausted.***

## Amendment 16

### Proposal for a regulation Article 5

*Text proposed by the Commission*

Article 5

Entry into force

This Regulation shall enter into force on the third day following that of its publication in the Official Journal of the European Union.

*Amendment*

Article 5

Entry into force ***and application***

This Regulation shall enter into force on the third day following that of its publication in the Official Journal of the European Union.

***However, Article 4(2) shall apply from ... [six months after the date of entry into force of this Regulation].***

## EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

On 1 January 2022, Regulation (EU) 2018/848 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on organic production and labelling of organic products and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 834/2007 and Commission Regulation (EC) No 889/2008 laying down detailed rules for the implementation of Council Regulation (EC) No 834/2007 became applicable.

Council Regulation (EC) No 834/2007 and articles 59 and 95(5) of Commission Regulation (EC) No 889/2008 allowed Member States to establish distinct national rules to label pet food as organic or, in the absence thereof, to recognise private standards.

Unfortunately, Regulation (EU) 2018/848 fails to integrate labelling rules adapted to the pet food market. Under the current law it is not allowed for pet food to mention any organic ingredient if not all of the ingredients are produced as organic in the sales description. Furthermore, 2018/848 does not foresee the use of the European Organic logo for pet food products.

The rapporteur welcomes the EU Commission proposal for a separate regulation dedicated to the labelling of organic pet food as a *lex specialis* to Regulation (EU) 2018/848 and considers it appropriate that the labelling of pet food is in line with the labelling of organic food as both labels are designated for the same consumers. Additionally, as organic pet food is not intended for human consumption, there is no sound reason for stricter labelling rules for pet food in comparison to organic food.

The rapporteur supports a fast adoption of the legal text but recommends to add some technical modifications to the Commission proposal e.g. to install transitional measures. In addition but also in line with the rules applied to food in Regulation (EU) 2018/848, the rapporteur supports adding to special labelling provisions, which would allow operators to identify the organic ingredients that are used in products, whose main ingredients stems from hunting or fishing.

Furthermore, the rapporteur is in favour of giving the possibility for operators to market all products already in stock.

This means the large volumes of existing stocks of organic pet food could still be sold to consumers until those stocks are exhausted

Moreover, a transitional period of 6 months after this regulation's entry into force should be installed during which the mandatory use of the EU organic logo does not apply.

These two measures will allow a smooth transition and avoid the waste of organic products and packaging material, without affecting negatively the consumers, as the composition of the pet food itself is already currently conform to the future rules.

According to estimations of the European Commission, the organic pet food sector has currently a market share of about 5-6%. However, the market is not only a growing market, but also a needed outlet for organic meat cuts that are not being sold as food and in order to avoid waste.

The new rules for organic pet food would therefore support the target of achieving 25% of EU

agricultural land under organic farming by 2030. The Commission's proposal is one appropriate element of the measures to ensure this market keeps developing. The rapporteur encourages the Commission and the Member States to communicate on this new Regulation and its objectives, in order to further strengthen consumer demand and confidence in organic products.



**OPINION IN THE FORM OF LETTER FROM THE COMMITTEE ON  
ENVIRONMENT, PUBLIC HEALTH AND FOOD SAFETY**

**European Parliament**

2019-2024



---

*Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety  
The Chair*

---

Mr Norbert Lins  
Chair  
Committee on Agriculture and  
Rural Development  
BRUSSELS

Subject: Opinion on the proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on the labelling of organic pet food (COM(2022)659 – C9-030936 – (2022/0390(COD)))

Dear Mr Lins,

Under the procedure referred to above, the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety has been asked to submit an opinion to your committee. At its meeting of 24 January 2023, the committee decided to send the opinion in the form of a letter. It considered the matter at its meeting of 22 March 2023 and adopted the opinion at that meeting<sup>1</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> The following were present for the final vote: Pascal Canfin (Chair), Bas Eickhout (Vice-Chair), César Luena, (Vice-Chair), Marian-Jean Marinescu (Vice-Chair), Maria Arena, Margrete Auken, Sergio Berlato, Malin Björk, Michael Bloss, Milan Brglez, Traian Băsescu, Sara Cerdas, Mohammed Chahim, Tudor Ciuhodaru, Nathalie Colin-Oesterlé, Maria Angela Danzi, Christian Doleschal, Matthias Ecke, Cyrus Engerer, Agnès Evren, Pietro Fiocchi, Emmanouil Fragkos, Heléne Fritzon, Malte Gallée, Gianna Gancia, Andreas Glück, Teuvo Hakkarainen, Martin Hojsík, Yannick Jadot, Adam Jarubas, Romana Jerković, Virginie Joron, Ska Keller, Petros Kokkalis, Joanna Kopcińska, Peter Liese, Sylvia Limmer, Javi López, Liudas Mažylis, Marina Measure, Tilly Metz, Silvia Modig, Dolors Montserrat, Marlene Mortler, Ville Niinistö, Ljudmila Novak, Grace O'Sullivan, Jutta Paulus, Jessica Polfjärd, Stanislav Polčák, Erik Poulsen, Frédérique Ries, María Soraya Rodríguez Ramos, Robert Roos, Katarína Roth Nevedálová, Massimiliano Salini, Silvia Sardone, Christel Schaldemose, Christine Schneider, Günther Sidl, Ivan Vilibor Sinčić, Vincenzo Sofo, Maria Spyraiki, Nils Torvalds, Véronique Trillet-Lenoir, Edina Tóth, Achille Variati, Petar Vitanov, Alexandr Vondra, Pernille Weiss, Emma Wiesner, Michal Wiezik, Esther de Lange

Despite its title and its format of a stand-alone regulation, the Commission proposal is of a technical nature, as it intends to align the rules for labelling organic pet food with the labelling rules for organic food, laid down in Regulation (EU) 2018/848 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 30 May 2018 on organic production and labelling of organic products.

In order for pet food to be labelled as organic and bear the organic production logo of the European Union, at least 95% in terms of weight of the agricultural ingredients will have to be organic. When less than 95% of the agricultural ingredients will be organic, the reference to organic may only be used in the list of ingredients in relation to organic ingredients with an indication of the total percentage of organic ingredients in proportion to the total quantity of agricultural ingredients.

The ENVI Committee welcomes these new labelling measures, which could boost the organic pet food market and could contribute to achieving the 25% target of EU agricultural land devoted to organic farming by 2030. In a broader sense, ENVI would like to recall that the production of organic pet food should adhere to animal welfare standards, taking into consideration the health and wellbeing of animals, which aligns with the One Health initiative.

To permit a smooth transition from the country-based regulation to the new EU-based framework, the ENVI Committee urges the AGRI Committee to introduce the possibility for operators to place existing products on the market until stocks are exhausted, and to plan a transitional period of six months after the entry into force of this Regulation during which the mandatory use of the EU organic logo would not be required.

The Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Food Safety therefore calls on the Committee on Agriculture and Rural Development to propose that Parliament adopt its position at first reading, taking over the Commission proposal without substantial changes and taking into consideration the additions as detailed above.

Yours sincerely,

Pascal Canfin



## PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<b>Title</b>	Labelling of organic pet food
<b>References</b>	COM(2022)0659 – C9-0396/2022 – 2022/0390(COD)
<b>Date submitted to Parliament</b>	28.11.2022
<b>Committee responsible</b> Date announced in plenary	AGRI 12.12.2022
<b>Committees asked for opinions</b> Date announced in plenary	ENVI 12.12.2022
<b>Rapporteurs</b> Date appointed	Martin Häusling 10.2.2023
<b>Discussed in committee</b>	28.2.2023                      22.3.2023
<b>Date adopted</b>	25.4.2023
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+:                      45 -:                      1 0:                      1
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Mazaly Aguilar, Clara Aguilera, Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Álvaro Amaro, Attila Ara-Kovács, Carmen Avram, Adrian-Dragoş Benea, Benoît Biteau, Daniel Buda, Isabel Carvalhais, Asger Christensen, Paolo De Castro, Jérémy Decerle, Salvatore De Meo, Herbert Dorfmann, Paola Ghidoni, Martin Häusling, Martin Hlaváček, Krzysztof Jurgiel, Jarosław Kalinowski, Elsi Katainen, Norbert Lins, Elena Lizzi, Chris MacManus, Colm Markey, Marlene Mortler, Maria Noichl, Juozas Olekas, Daniela Rondinelli, Bronis Ropė, Bert-Jan Ruissen, Anne Sander, Simone Schmiedtbauer, Veronika Vrecionová, Juan Ignacio Zoido Álvarez
<b>Substitutes present for the final vote</b>	Franc Bogovič, Rosanna Conte, Marie Dauchy, Claude Gruffat, Pär Holmgren, Petros Kokkalis, Benoît Lutgen, Irène Tolleret, Achille Variati, Emma Wiesner
<b>Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote</b>	Catherine Griset, Anja Hazekamp
<b>Date tabled</b>	27.4.2023

## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

<b>47</b>	<b>+</b>
ECR	Mazaly Aguilar, Krzysztof Jurgiel, Bert-Jan Ruissen, Veronika Vrecionová
ID	Rosanna Conte, Marie Dauchy, Ivan David, Paola Ghidoni, Catherine Griset, Elena Lizzi
PPE	Álvaro Amaro, Franc Bogovič, Daniel Buda, Salvatore De Meo, Herbert Dorfmann, Jarosław Kalinowski, Norbert Lins, Benoît Lutgen, Colm Markey, Marlene Mortler, Anne Sander, Simone Schmiedtbauer, Juan Ignacio Zoido Álvarez
Renew	Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Asger Christensen, Jérémy Decerle, Martin Hlaváček, Elsi Katainen, Irène Tolleret, Emma Wiesner
S&D	Clara Aguilera, Attila Ara-Kovács, Carmen Avram, Adrian-Dragoş Benea, Isabel Carvalhais, Paolo De Castro, Maria Noichl, Juozas Olekas, Daniela Rondinelli, Achille Variati
The Left	Petros Kokkalis, Chris MacManus
Verts/ALE	Benoît Biteau, Claude Gruffat, Martin Häusling, Pär Holmgren, Bronis Ropè
<b>0</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
The Left	Anja Hazekamp

### Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention