



Plenary sitting

A9-0161/2024

25.3.2024

REPORT

on the proposal for a Council regulation amending Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 as regards an EuroHPC initiative for start-ups to boost European leadership in trustworthy Artificial Intelligence
(COM(2024)0029 – C9-0013/2024 – 2024/0016(CNS))

Committee on Industry, Research and Energy

Rapporteur: Maria da Graça Carvalho

Symbols for procedures

- * Consultation procedure
- *** Consent procedure
- ***I Ordinary legislative procedure (first reading)
- ***II Ordinary legislative procedure (second reading)
- ***III Ordinary legislative procedure (third reading)

(The type of procedure depends on the legal basis proposed by the draft act.)

Amendments to a draft act

Amendments by Parliament set out in two columns

Deletions are indicated in ***bold italics*** in the left-hand column. Replacements are indicated in ***bold italics*** in both columns. New text is indicated in ***bold italics*** in the right-hand column.

The first and second lines of the header of each amendment identify the relevant part of the draft act under consideration. If an amendment pertains to an existing act that the draft act is seeking to amend, the amendment heading includes a third line identifying the existing act and a fourth line identifying the provision in that act that Parliament wishes to amend.

Amendments by Parliament in the form of a consolidated text

New text is highlighted in ***bold italics***. Deletions are indicated using either the **■** symbol or ~~strikeout~~. Replacements are indicated by highlighting the new text in ***bold italics*** and by deleting or striking out the text that has been replaced.

By way of exception, purely technical changes made by the drafting departments in preparing the final text are not highlighted.

CONTENTS

	Page
DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION	5
ANNEX: ENTITIES OR PERSONS FROM WHOM THE RAPPORTEUR HAS RECEIVED INPUT.....	15
PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE	16
FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE	17

DRAFT EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT LEGISLATIVE RESOLUTION

**on the proposal for a Council regulation amending Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 as regards an EuroHPC initiative for start-ups to boost European leadership in trustworthy Artificial Intelligence
(COM(2024)0029 – C9-0013/2024 – 2024/0016(CNS))**

(Special legislative procedure – consultation)

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the Commission proposal to the Council (COM(2024)0029),
 - having regard to Article 187 and the first subparagraph of Article 188 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union pursuant to which the Council consulted Parliament (C9-0013/2024),
 - having regard to Rule 82 of its Rules of Procedure,
 - having regard to the report of the Committee on Industry, Research and Energy (A9-0161/2024),
1. Approves the Commission proposal as amended;
 2. Calls on the Commission to alter its proposal accordingly, in accordance with Article 293(2) of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union;
 3. Calls on the Council to notify Parliament if it intends to depart from the text approved by Parliament;
 4. Asks the Council to consult Parliament again if it intends to substantially amend the Commission proposal;
 5. Instructs its President to forward its position to the Council, the Commission and the national parliaments.

Amendment 1

AMENDMENTS BY THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT*

to the Commission proposal

2024/0016(CNS)

Proposal for a

COUNCIL REGULATION

amending Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 as regards an EuroHPC initiative for start-ups to boost European leadership in trustworthy Artificial Intelligence

THE COUNCIL OF THE EUROPEAN UNION,

Having regard to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, and in particular Article 187 and Article 188, first paragraph, thereof,

Having regard to the proposal from the European Commission,

Having regard to the opinion of the European Parliament¹,

Having regard to the opinion of the European Economic and Social Committee²,

Acting in accordance with a special legislative procedure,

Whereas:

- (1) Regulation (EU) 2024/... of the European Parliament and of the Council³ laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence (the ‘Artificial Intelligence Act’) aims to improve the functioning of the internal market by laying down a uniform legal framework in particular for the development, marketing and use of artificial intelligence in conformity with Union values.
- (2) Since 2021, when Council Regulation (EU) 2021/1173⁴ was adopted, the field of artificial intelligence (AI) has seen enormous technical progress and become a highly strategic and contested domain globally. The Union is at the forefront of efforts to

* Amendments: new or amended text is highlighted in bold italics; deletions are indicated by the symbol **|**.

¹ OJ C , , p. .

² Opinion of.., OJ C, p.

³ Regulation (EU) 2024/... of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) and amending certain union legislative acts (OJ L ...).

⁴ Council Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 of 13 July 2021 on establishing the European High Performance Computing Joint Undertaking and repealing Regulation (EU) 2018/1488 (OJ L 256, 19.7.2021, p. 3, ELI: <http://data.europa.eu/eli/reg/2021/1173/oj>).

support *ethical and* responsible innovation in trustworthy AI, while setting guardrails and developing effective governance.

- (3) On 13 September 2023, as part of a comprehensive approach to support responsible innovation in AI, the Commission announced a new strategic initiative to make the Union's high performance computing capacity available to innovative European startups in trustworthy AI to train their models. That complements work on setting guardrails for AI through Regulation (EU) 2024/... , establishing governance structures, and supporting innovation through the Coordinated Plan on Artificial Intelligence.
- (3a) *In order to capitalise on its supercomputing infrastructure and to foster an innovative European AI ecosystem, including through the establishment of AI Factories across the Union, the communication of the Commission of 24 January 2024 on 'Boosting start-ups and innovation in trustworthy artificial intelligence' sets out a strategic investment framework to allow start-ups and industry in the Union to fulfil their potential of becoming global front-runners in trustworthy advanced AI models, systems and applications.*
- (4) Given that the Union's most powerful world-class supercomputing capacity is found in the European High Performance Computing Joint Undertaking's (the 'Joint Undertaking') facilities, it is those facilities that should be made available in order for the Commission's initiative to become a reality. It is accordingly necessary to introduce a further objective to the existing six objectives of the Joint Undertaking that would cover the contribution made by its supercomputers to the new AI initiative of the Union, *ensuring fairness, transparency, trustworthiness and a positive societal impact and responding to the needs and goals of the Union.*
- (5) The new objective would allow the Joint Undertaking to perform activities in the domains of *upgrading or* acquiring and operating AI-dedicated supercomputers or partitions of supercomputers to enable fast machine learning and training of *trustworthy and ethical* large AI foundation models *thus strengthening the Union's competitiveness and industrial base in AI*. The Joint Undertaking should also be allowed to create a new access mode to its computing resources *in particular* for AI startups and the wider scientific community active in AI and to develop dedicated AI applications *models and systems optimised* to run on its supercomputers *while safeguarding open access, fairness and transparency*. Those changes would enable the Joint Undertaking to offer tailored computing power and services to nurture large-scale AI training and development and uptake in the Union, which is not feasible under the current Regulation.
- (5a) *A one-stop shop should be established by the Joint Undertaking on the basis of the principles of open access, in a way that different types of users can fully leverage the potential of AI in supercomputing. The opportunities provided by AI Factories should be widely communicated to start-ups, small and medium enterprises (SMEs), the innovation ecosystem and researchers engaged in Union programmes, highlighting the numerous benefits that AI can offer in supercomputing applications. Moreover, Union-level cooperation of AI Factories should make computing power available as a service across the Union, which is essential to the support services offered, further easing access to this critical infrastructure. This should also serve to develop demand-oriented EuroHPC supercomputers, ensuring that the infrastructure meets the evolving needs of users and sectors across the Union.*

- (5b) *The resolution of the European Parliament of 14 December 2023 on increasing innovation, industrial and technological competitiveness through a favourable environment for start-ups and scale-ups⁵ stresses that scale-ups play a critical role in driving innovation, job creation, and economic growth in the Union and calls on the Commission and Member States to adopt a proper definition of scale-ups based on scalability, while taking into account how they differ from start-ups, scale-ups and SMEs. The Joint Undertaking's governing board should define conditions to access such AI-dedicated supercomputers and relevant support services for different categories users, such as start-ups, scale-ups, SMEs, higher education institutions and research centres, with the aim of overcoming cost constraints and a lack of resource expertise.*
- (5c) *As the use of supercomputers for AI requires a higher usage of data, it is important that they are either located nearby or connected to an existing or planned data centre via high-speed networks. Furthermore, such data centres should fully comply with the requirements laid down in Article 12 of Directive (EU) 2023/1791 of the European Parliament and of the Council⁶ and should, in the future, be interconnected with the Common European Data Spaces to facilitate the training of models in key sectorial domains. Hosting entities should be able to effectively use financial support from the Common European Data Spaces to enhance their infrastructure, including to acquire or upgrade data centres. Synergies between the different initiatives should be promoted.*
- (5d) *As the use of supercomputers for AI requires a significant increase in computational power, which in turn leads to a greater consumption of energy, the hosting entities should have plans regarding their energy efficiency and environmental sustainability. Those plans should ensure that the supercomputer has access to a secure and stable grid connection and electricity supply, preferably through clean affordable energy, including the use of power purchase agreements, which can also be based on renewable energy, and the use of electricity that is locally generated. Furthermore, AI models should comply with energy consumption requirements laid down in Regulation ... [the Artificial Intelligence Act]. Reporting obligations for general-purpose AI models laid down in that Regulation are to be complied with.*
- (5e) *AI Factories will provide comprehensive supercomputing support services to AI start-ups, small innovative companies, and the broader research and innovation ecosystem. Those services are crucial for facilitating access to supercomputers, offering dedicated programming facilities and algorithmic support for the development, testing, evaluation and validation of AI training models and systems. Furthermore, they assist in the creation of novel use cases and emerging applications across the Union strategic areas, including for robotics and manufacturing, new materials and batteries, aerospace, mobility, connected and automated driving, health and care, biotechnology, energy, climate change and adaptation, complex system dynamics, virtual worlds and digital twins, cybersecurity, aerospace, agricultural practices, research and innovation and the public sector.*

⁵ Texts adopted, P9_TA(2023)0480.

⁶ Directive (EU) 2023/1791 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 September 2023 on energy efficiency and amending Regulation (EU) 2023/955 (recast) (OJ L 231, 20.9.2023, p. 1).

- (6) In order to align the application date of this Regulation with the application date of the provisions of Regulation (EU) 2024/... of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence, it should apply without undue delay.
- (7) Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 should therefore be amended accordingly,
- HAS ADOPTED THIS REGULATION:

Article 1

Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 is amended as follows:

- (1) Article 2 is amended as follows:
- (a) the following points (3a) and (3b) are inserted:
- ‘(3b) ‘Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer’ means a supercomputer that is primarily designed for training large scale, *civil* general-purpose artificial intelligence models and emerging artificial intelligence applications, **and for developing technologies and systems**;
- (3c) ‘Artificial Intelligence Factory’ means a centralised or distributed *open ecosystem* providing an Artificial Intelligence supercomputing service infrastructure which is composed of an Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer *or* Artificial Intelligence partition of supercomputer, *or EuroHPC supercomputer upgraded for Artificial Intelligence*, an associated data centre, dedicated access and artificial intelligence-oriented supercomputing services **that openly and actively develop, attract, retain and pool** talent to provide the competences, **skills and knowledge** required, **that assist and guide users in the utilisation of** the supercomputers for Artificial Intelligence, **and that provide the services required for their maintenance**’;
- (b) point (9) is replaced by the following:
- ‘(9) ‘EuroHPC supercomputer’ means any computing system fully owned by the Joint Undertaking or co-owned with other Participating States or a consortium of private partners, which can be a classical supercomputer (high-end supercomputer, industrial-grade supercomputer, Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer or mid-range supercomputer), a hybrid classical-quantum computer, a quantum computer or a quantum simulator’;
- (2) in Article 3(2), the following point (h) is added:
- ‘(h) to develop and operate the Artificial Intelligence Factories in support of the further development of a highly competitive, **sustainable, trustworthy and ethical** and innovative Artificial Intelligence ecosystem in the Union’;
- (3) in Article 4(1), the following point (h) is added:

- (h) Artificial Intelligence Factory pillar for trustworthy and ethical Artificial Intelligence, covering activities for the provision of an Artificial Intelligence-oriented supercomputing service infrastructure that is aiming at further developing the innovation capabilities and skills of the Artificial Intelligence ecosystem; *those* activities ***shall address, inter alia***:
- (i) the acquisition and operation of Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers co-located with █ data centres or connected to data centres via very high speed networks;
 - (ii) the upgrade of existing EuroHPC supercomputers with Artificial Intelligence capabilities;
 - (iii) providing access to the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers or EuroHPC supercomputers upgraded with Artificial Intelligence ***capabilities***, including widening their use to a large number of public and private users, including ***start-ups, scale-ups, SMEs, higher education institutions and the wider scientific community***;
 - (***iiia***) ***broadly communicating the opportunities offered by the Artificial Intelligence Factories to start-ups, scale-ups and research and innovation communities***;
 - (iv) the operation of centralised or distributed Artificial Intelligence-oriented supercomputing service centres in support of the Artificial Intelligence ***start-up*** and research and innovation ecosystem, ***assisting and guiding users, fostering interdisciplinary research*** providing algorithmic support, support for the further development, training, testing, evaluation and validation of Artificial Intelligence training models and systems, and support for the development of emerging large-scale Artificial Intelligence applications in strategic areas █ ;
 - (v) the operation of supercomputer-friendly programming facilities, including for the parallelisation of Artificial Intelligence applications for optimising the use of supercomputing capabilities, ***and the operation of other Artificial Intelligence-enabling supercomputing services***;
- █
- (vii) ***through a transparent, equal opportunities and open process***, attracting, pooling, █ training ***and retaining*** talent, ***including students, developers, researchers, scientists and the user community*** to develop their competences, █ ***skills and knowledge*** in using the EuroHPC supercomputers for Artificial Intelligence, ***as well as providing tailor-made coaching***;
 - (viii) interacting with the other Artificial Intelligence Factories, making their services accessible across Europe, ***paying constant attention to geographical and gender balance***, and cooperating with the EuroHPC Competence Centres and Centres of Excellence, and with relevant Artificial Intelligence initiatives of the Union, such as the hubs of Artificial Intelligence startups, the Artificial Intelligence and data ecosystems, the Artificial Intelligence Testing and Experimentation Facilities, the European central Artificial Intelligence platform, the Artificial

Intelligence-oriented Digital Innovation Hubs, the Artificial Intelligence-related European Institute of Innovation and Technology Knowledge and Innovation Communities, *the Artificial Intelligence-related Horizon Europe joint undertakings and partnerships* relevant European research infrastructures and other related initiatives.

(viii) maintaining and optimising supercomputers with artificial intelligence capabilities, ensuring their reliability and performance for advanced computational tasks.’;

(4) ■ Article 9(5) *is amended as follows:*

(a) the following point (g) is added:

‘(g) for the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers the following additional selection criteria shall apply for the hosting entities:

(i) proximity *or connection via very high speed networks* with *a planned or an established data centre, in accordance with Article 12 of Directive (EU) 2023/1791;*

(ia) vision and plans of the hosting entity regarding the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer's energy efficiency and environmental sustainability, making use of a lifecycle approach, the availability of adequate access to clean affordable energy, also through power purchase agreements which may be based on renewable energy, and the use of electricity that is locally generated;

(ii) vision, plans and capability of the hosting entity to address the challenges of the Artificial Intelligence *start-up* and research and innovation ecosystem and the Artificial Intelligence user community, *enhancing such an ecosystem by promoting synergies and innovation, including investments in future technologies, contributing* and providing a supportive centralised or distributed Artificial Intelligence-oriented supercomputing service;

(iii) quality and pertinence of experience and know-how available at the intended team that would be in charge for the supportive Artificial Intelligence-oriented supercomputing service environment;

(iv) plans for interaction and cooperation with other Artificial Intelligence Factories, with EuroHPC Competence Centres and EuroHPC Centres of Excellence and with relevant Artificial Intelligence activities such as the hubs of Artificial Intelligence *start-ups*, the Artificial Intelligence and data ecosystems, the Artificial Intelligence Testing and Experimentation Facilities, the European central Artificial Intelligence platform, the Artificial Intelligence-oriented Digital Innovation Hubs and other related initiatives;

(v) existing capabilities and future plans of the hosting entity to contribute to the development, *attraction, training and retention* of the talent pool *and the creation of skills, capabilities and competences to use the supercomputers, including in the form of support for start-ups through incubator or accelerator programmes.’;*

(ga) an existing hosting entity selected by the Governing Board through a fair and transparent process and after a call for expressions of interest, may establish an Artificial Intelligence Factory if meet the criteria referred to in Article 9(5), point (g).’;

(5) in Article 9, the following paragraph (6a) is added:

‘(6a) For the Artificial Intelligence dedicated supercomputers referred to in Article 12a, as well as for EuroHPC supercomputers referred to in Articles 11, 12, 12a, 14, 15, the hosting entities shall create a one-stop shop for the start-ups, scale-ups, SMEs and other users to facilitate access to its support services and to support the development of their skills and competences.’;

(6) in Article 10(2), point (l) is replaced by the following:

‘(l) the specific conditions applicable when the hosting entity operates a EuroHPC supercomputer for industrial usage, an Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer or an existing EuroHPC supercomputers upgraded with Artificial Intelligence capabilities.’;

(7) the following Article 12a is inserted:

‘Article 12a

Acquisition and ownership of Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers

1. The Joint Undertaking shall acquire Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers and shall own them.
2. The Union financial contribution referred to in Article 5(1) shall cover up to 50 % of the acquisition costs plus up to 50 % of the operating costs of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers.

The remaining total cost of ownership of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers shall be covered by the Participating State where the hosting entity is established or by the Participating States in the hosting consortium, possibly supplemented by the contributions referred to in Article 6.
3. The selection of the supplier of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers shall be based on tender specifications that shall be demand-driven, shall take into account the user requirements and the general system specifications provided by the selected hosting entity in its application for the call for expression of interest. The selection shall also address the security of the supply chain.
4. The Joint Undertaking may act as first user of Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers that integrate technologies primarily developed in the Union.
5. The Governing Board may decide in the work programme, if duly justified for security reasons, to condition the participation of suppliers in the acquisition of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers in accordance with Article 12(6) of Regulation (EU) 2021/694 or to limit the participation of suppliers for security reasons or actions directly related to the Union's strategic autonomy, in accordance with Article 18(4) of that Regulation.
6. The Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers shall be located in a hosting entity of a EuroHPC supercomputer located in the Union.

7. Without prejudice to the winding up of the Joint Undertaking, as referred to in Article 23(4) of the Statutes, at the earliest *five* years after the successful acceptance test by the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer installed in a hosting entity, the ownership of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer may be transferred to that hosting entity, sold to another entity or decommissioned upon decision of the Governing Board and in accordance with the hosting agreement. In the case of transfer of ownership of a Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer, the hosting entity shall reimburse the Joint Undertaking the residual value of the supercomputer that is transferred. If there is no transfer of ownership to the hosting entity but a decision for decommissioning, the relevant costs shall be shared equally by the Joint Undertaking and the hosting entity. The Joint Undertaking shall not be liable for any costs incurred after the transfer of ownership of the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputer or after its sale or decommissioning.’
- (8) Article 15 is amended as follows:
- (a) paragraph 1 is replaced by the following:
- ‘1. The Joint Undertaking may launch a call for expressions of interest to upgrade the EuroHPC supercomputers it owns or co-owns, *to raise the performance level of the supercomputer close to exascale, or for increasing the Artificial intelligence capabilities of the supercomputer, or to increase the operational performance of the supercomputer in any other way, including quantum accelerators.*’; paragraph 2 is deleted;
- (b) 5 is replaced by the following:
- ‘5. The percentage of the Union’s financial contribution for the acquisition costs of the upgrade shall be the same as the percentage of the Union’s financial contribution for the original EuroHPC supercomputer, depreciated over the expected remaining lifetime of the original supercomputer. The percentage of the Union’s financial contribution for the additional operational costs of the upgrade shall be the same as the percentage of the Union’s financial contribution for the original EuroHPC supercomputer.’;
- (9) Article 16 is amended as follows:
- (a) the following paragraph 1b is inserted:
- ‘1b. The Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers and EuroHPC supercomputers upgraded for Artificial Intelligence capabilities shall primarily be used for the development, testing, evaluation, and validation of large scale, general purpose artificial intelligence training models and emerging Artificial Intelligence applications, as well as for the further development of artificial intelligence solutions in the Union requiring High Performance Computing and the execution of large-scale Artificial Intelligence algorithms for the resolution of science problems.’;
- (b) the following paragraph 2b is inserted:
- ‘2b. The Governing Board shall define **■** access conditions for the Artificial Intelligence-dedicated supercomputers and the EuroHPC

supercomputers upgraded for Artificial Intelligence capabilities in accordance with Article 17 taking into account the specific needs of the Artificial Intelligence *start-up* and research ecosystem. ***The Governing Board may define specific access conditions for different types of users or applications, including dedicated access to start-ups, scale-ups and SMEs. The security and quality of service shall be the same for all users within each user category.*** Only proposals for developing trustworthy and ethical Artificial Intelligence models, systems and applications that are in line with *Union rules and values, in particular those enshrined in Article 2 of the Treaty on European Union and in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union*, shall be eligible for access. ***The access criteria, methodologies and guidance on access prioritisation will be defined in accordance to the Ethics By Design approach for Artificial Intelligence and with the support of the Ethics Appraisal Mechanism of Horizon Europe.***’;

(10) Article 17, paragraph 1 is replaced by the following:

- ‘1. The share of the Union's access time to each high-end, quantum, *and Artificial Intelligence-dedicated EuroHPC supercomputer* shall be directly proportional to the financial contribution of the Union referred to in Article 5(1) to the total cost of ownership of the EuroHPC supercomputer and shall thus not exceed 50 % of the total access time of the EuroHPC supercomputer.’

Article 2

This Regulation shall enter into force on the twentieth day following that of its publication in the *Official Journal of the European Union*.

This Regulation shall be binding in its entirety and directly applicable in all Member States.

Done at ...,

For the Council
The President

**ANNEX: ENTITIES OR PERSONS
FROM WHOM THE RAPPORTEUR HAS RECEIVED INPUT**

The rapporteur declares under her exclusive responsibility that she did not receive input from any entity or person to be mentioned in this Annex pursuant to Article 8 of Annex I to the Rules of Procedure.

PROCEDURE – COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

Title	Amending Regulation (EU) 2021/1173 as regards an EuroHPC initiative for start-ups to boost European leadership in trustworthy Artificial Intelligence
References	COM(2024)0029 – C9-0013/2024 – 2024/0016(CNS)
Date Parliament was consulted	14.2.2024
Committee responsible Date announced in plenary	ITRE 11.3.2024
Rapporteurs Date appointed	Maria da Graça Carvalho 14.2.2024
Date adopted	20.3.2024
Result of final vote	+: 47 –: 3 0: 3
Members present for the final vote	François-Xavier Bellamy, Hildegard Bentele, Tom Berendsen, Paolo Borchia, Marc Botenga, Markus Buchheit, Cristian-Silviu Buşoi, Ignazio Corrao, Beatrice Covassi, Josianne Cutajar, Nicola Danti, Marie Dauchy, Christian Ehler, Lina Gálvez Muñoz, Jens Geier, Bart Groothuis, Christophe Grudler, Henrike Hahn, Robert Hajšel, Ivo Hristov, Ivars Ijabs, Romana Jerković, Michael Kauch, Seán Kelly, Zdzisław Krasnodębski, Thierry Mariani, Marisa Matias, Georg Mayer, Marina Mesure, Angelika Niebler, Niklas Nienaß, Ville Niinistö, Johan Nissinen, Mauri Pekkarinen, Mikuláš Peksa, Tsvetelina Penkova, Markus Pieper, Manuela Ripa, Robert Roos, Sara Skyttedal, Grzegorz Tobiszowski, Patrizia Toia, Henna Virkkunen, Carlos Zorrinho
Substitutes present for the final vote	Franc Bogovič, Francesca Donato, Alexis Georgoulis, Jordi Solé, Susana Solís Pérez
Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote	Radan Kanev, Grace O’Sullivan, Emil Radev, Aušra Seibutytė
Date tabled	25.3.2024

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE RESPONSIBLE

47	+
ECR	Zdzisław Krasnodębski, Johan Nissinen, Robert Roos, Grzegorz Tobiszowski
ID	Paolo Borchia, Georg Mayer
NI	Francesca Donato, Alexis Georgoulis
PPE	François-Xavier Bellamy, Hildegard Bentele, Tom Berendsen, Franc Bogovič, Cristian-Silviu Buşoi, Christian Ehler, Radan Kanev, Seán Kelly, Angelika Niebler, Markus Pieper, Emil Radev, Aušra Seibutytė, Sara Skytvedal, Henna Virkkunen
Renew	Nicola Danti, Bart Groothuis, Christophe Grudler, Ivars Ijabs, Michael Kauch, Mauri Pekkarinen, Susana Solís Pérez
S&D	Beatrice Covassi, Josianne Cutajar, Lina Gálvez Muñoz, Jens Geier, Robert Hajšel, Ivo Hristov, Romana Jerkovič, Tsvetelina Penkova, Patrizia Toia, Carlos Zorrinho
Verts/ALE	Ignazio Corrao, Henrike Hahn, Niklas Nienä, Ville Niinistö, Grace O'Sullivan, Mikuláš Peksa, Manuela Ripa, Jordi Solé
3	-
The Left	Marc Botenga, Marisa Matias, Marina Mesure
3	0
ID	Markus Buchheit, Marie Dauchy, Thierry Mariani

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention