



2016/2061(INI)

9.12.2016

OPINION

of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

for the Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality

on the need for an EU strategy to end and prevent the Gender Pension Gap
(2016/2061(INI))

Rapporteur (*): Tania González Peñas

(*) Associated committee – Rule 54 of the Rules of Procedure

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Employment and Social Affairs calls on the Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

- having regard to Articles 22 and 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights,
 - having regard to UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR), General Comment No. 16: The equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights (Article 3 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)), 11 August 2005, E/C.12/2005/, and UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR), General Comment No. 19: The right to social security (Article 9 of the ICESCR), 4 February 2008, E/C.12/GC/19,
 - having regard to Articles 4(2), 4(3), 12, 20 and 23 of the European Social Charter,
 - having regard to the conclusions of the European Committee of Social Rights of 5 December 2014 (XX-3/def/GRC/4/1/EN),
 - having regard to Articles 2 and 3(3) of the Treaty on European Union (TEU) enshrining the fundamental principle of equality between men and women,
 - having regard to Article 8 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) and Article 23 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union enshrining the principle of equality between women and men,
 - having regard to Articles 151 and 153 TFEU,
 - having regard to the conclusions adopted by the Employment, Social Policy, Health and Consumer Affairs Council (EPSCO) in June 2015 entitled 'Equal income opportunities for women and men: Closing the gender gap in pensions',
 - having regard to Article 34 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union,
 - having regard to the European Pact for gender equality (2011-2020) adopted by the Council on 7 March 2011,
 - having regard to the 'Strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019', and in particular objective 3.2 thereof,
 - having regard to its study 'The gender pension gap: differences between mothers and women without children' (2016) and the Commission study 'The Gender Gap in Pensions in the EU' (2013),
 - having regard to Articles 3 and 9 of the ICESCR,
- A. whereas the gender pension gap in the EU was estimated at around 39 % in 2014, with significant variations among the Member States, ranging from 3.7 % in Estonia to 48.8 % in Cyprus; whereas the percentage of older women at risk of poverty and social exclusion stood at 20.2 % in 2014, compared with 14.6 % of men, and by 2050 the proportion of

people over 75 at risk of poverty could reach 30 % in most Member States; whereas in 2015, women on average still earned 16 % less per hour than men for the same work; whereas the gender pay gap often leads to women receiving lower pensions than men and makes women more likely to fall into poverty after retirement; whereas single-parent households are particularly vulnerable since they represent 10 % of all households with dependent children, and 50 % of those are at risk of poverty and social exclusion, double the rate for the population as a whole;

- B. whereas the percentage of the population receiving a pension varies widely between the Member States, standing at 11 % in Cyprus and 25 % in Belgium in 2012, whilst in countries such as Spain, Ireland and Malta, only 10 % or less of women receive a pension;
- C. whereas pension cuts and freezes increase the risk of poverty in old age, particularly among women; whereas the percentage of older women at risk of poverty and social exclusion stood at 20.2 % in 2014, compared with 14.6 % of men, and by 2050 the proportion of people over 75 at risk of poverty could reach 30 % in most Member States;
- D. whereas people over 65 have income worth around 94 % of the average for the population as a whole; whereas, nevertheless, around 22 % of women over 65 live below the at-risk-of-poverty threshold;
- E. whereas access to a decent pension currently depends on many different factors such as lifetime income, type of employment contract, temporary employment, labour market segregation, participation in and access to the labour market, care-related career breaks and life expectancy, and these factors affect women more negatively than men;
- F. whereas pensions linked to individual rather than to derived rights could help guarantee everyone's economic independence, reduce disincentives to participation in formal work and minimise gender stereotypes;
- G. whereas pension credits for men and women as a form of allowance for caring for children or family members could help ensure that career breaks for reasons of care, training or unemployment do not have a negative impact on pensions, and it would be desirable for such schemes to be extended to or stepped up in all the Member States;
- H. whereas pension credits applying to all forms of work could help all workers from paid employees to the self-employed;
- I. whereas universal, residence-based or flat-rate minimum pensions indexed to wages appear to be particularly favourable to gender equality, because the full basic pension is paid irrespective of the previous employment status and family conditions;
- J. whereas many people with part-time contracts, essentially women (32 % against 8.2 % of men) may not have chosen such contracts, or have done so for reasons of combining work and family and care responsibilities, and in many cases this translates into a lower pension;
- K. whereas precarious employment and labour market segregation are obstacles that stand in the way of achieving the goal of equality and social solidarity in old age;

- L. whereas high unemployment rates have forced many families to rely on a single family income, in many cases the pension received by elderly people, generally the grandmothers, with three generations living on this single source of income;
- M. whereas policies designed to increase rates of high-quality employment among groups with the highest unemployment rates, such as women, young people, people with disabilities, people over 55, the long-term unemployed and immigrants, would help preserve the sustainability of the pension system and mitigate the dependency ratio in public systems;
- N. whereas growing individual responsibility for saving decisions entailing different risks also means that individuals have to be clearly informed of the options available and the associated risks; whereas the crisis has shown that private pension funds depend on the evolution of financial markets, in many cases jeopardising the pensions of older people, who are sometimes not well informed of the implications of subscribing to these funds; whereas both women and men, in particular women, have to be supported in improving their financial literacy level at no charge, in order to be able to make informed decisions on an increasingly complex issue;
- O. whereas no ex-ante or ex-post gender impact assessments were conducted for the reforms to pension systems laid out in the Commission's white paper on pensions of 2012; whereas this is evidence of gaps in the EU's policy of ensuring effective gender equality across the board;
- P. whereas trade unions and collective bargaining can play a vital role in ensuring the protection of the rights of older people;
- Q. whereas more investment in universal public health care, a public social services network and good-quality care infrastructure for dependent persons would help to ensure that people can exercise their right to live decently in their old age;
- R. whereas the European Social Charter states, in Article 4.1 on the right to fair remuneration, that with a view to ensuring the effective exercise of the right to a fair remuneration, 'the Parties undertake to recognise the right of workers to a remuneration such as will give them and their families a decent standard of living'; whereas in its conclusions of 5 December 2014 (XX-3/def/GRC/4/1/EN), the European Committee of Social Rights stated that 'in order to ensure a decent standard of living within the meaning of Article 4§1 of the 1961 Charter, remuneration must be above the minimum threshold, set at 60% of the net average wage';
- S. whereas the EU's objective of achieving adequate social protection is enshrined in Article 151 of the TFEU; whereas the EU should therefore support Member States by making recommendations on improving protection for older people entitled to a pension by virtue of their age or personal situation;
- T. whereas the recent reforms to pension systems undertaken in the Member States have: increased the retirement age; reduced indexing levels for the updating of schemes; increased contributory aspects such as the duration and continuity of periods of contribution for the purposes of entitlement to benefits; promoted the role of private pension schemes; contributed to the widening of the gender gap in pensions;

- U. whereas the gender-specific employment gap, pay gap and associated pension gap, women's overrepresentation in precarious work¹ and involuntary part-time work and interruptions in women's careers to care for children or other dependants contribute to the situation whereby women are particularly affected or in risk of poverty;
- V. whereas the European Union primarily has a supporting competence in the field of pension schemes, particularly under Article 153 TFEU;
1. Underlines that gender equality must be ensured in all areas; stresses that increasing the employment level of women is a key condition for eliminating the gender pension gap, which results from the accumulation of disadvantages experienced by women in the labour market throughout their lives; recognises also in this regard that key to preventing and mitigating the gender pension gap is women's access to the labour market, with quality employment, supporting career progression, improved work/life balance for both men and women, and addressing gender segregation in education and employment; notes, further, that today more and better educated young women are entering the labour market;
 2. Draws attention to the important role played by the social partners in the discussion of issues relating to the minimum wage while respecting the subsidiarity principle; stresses the important role of trade unions and collective bargaining arrangements in order to ensure that older people have access to public pensions in line with the principles of solidarity between generations and gender equality; stresses the importance of taking due account of social partners when taking political decisions altering significant legal aspects of eligibility conditions for entitlement to pensions; calls on the EU and the Member States, in cooperation with the social partners and gender equality organisations, to set out and implement policies to close the gender pay gap; recommends that the Member States consider carrying out wage-mapping on a regular basis as a complement to these efforts;
 3. Regrets how the EU gender pension gap is at 39 %, which is more than double the gender pay gap of 16 %, reflecting the lifelong consequences and impacts of the inequality in the labour market on women's rights as well as differences in career developments and caring responsibilities; recalls that, in accordance with Article 157 TFEU, 'Member States shall ensure that the principle of equal pay for male and female workers for equal work or for work of equal value is applied', and that the implementation and promotion of this principle is crucial to reducing pay and pension gaps between men and women and to eliminate the risk of poverty; calls on the Member States and the Commission to take steps to combat all forms of multiple discrimination on gender basis, to ensure application of the principle of non-discrimination and equality in the labour market and in access to employment, and, in particular, to adopt social protection measures to ensure that women's pay and welfare entitlements, including pensions, are in line with the principle of equal pay for male and female workers for equal work or for work of equal value; calls on the Member States to establish appropriate measures to curb violations of the principle of equal pay for the same work and for work of equal value for women and men; takes the view that gender equality, by increasing social and economic well-being, benefits not only women but society as a whole;
 4. Regrets that in many Member States there is a lack of available, affordable and quality child care and long-term care, and that many women have to reduce their working time to

¹ European Parliament resolution of 19 October 2010 on precarious women workers (OJ C 70E, 8.3.2012, p. 1).

care for children, persons with disabilities and other dependents; stresses the need to ensure that women and men are equal earners and equal carers by eliminating gender inequalities in paid and unpaid work, and to promote equal sharing of responsibilities, costs and care; points, in this respect, to the need for ensuring universal access to quality (social) services of general interest and for specific proposals making for better reconciliation of work and private life;

5. Highlights the fact that the gender pension gap is a complex phenomenon, which goes beyond the structures of pension systems; stresses that the inadequate implementation of the Barcelona objectives on childcare facilities by the Member States seriously reduces opportunities for women to fully realise their employment potential and thus leads to pension inequalities; calls on the Commission and the Member States to implement the Barcelona targets by 2020, and to do so in an effective way, to endorse the 2014 quality framework on early childhood education and care and to act on the root causes of the gender pension gap by providing support that allows women to be active on the labour market, to increase the investment in affordable and accessible quality care for children, old people and dependents, and to include care periods in the calculation of social protection rights;
6. Notes that pension policies shall be combined with adequate labour and active ageing policies to reduce gender pay and pension gaps; highlights, in this regard, the vulnerable position of women belonging to racial, ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities; stresses the importance of the fight against gender stereotypes in employment; asks the Member States to implement fully Directive 2006/54/EC with a requirement for companies to draw up measures on gender equality in order to avoid discrimination in training and in the professional promotion of women, including actions on desegregation, the development of pay systems and measures to support women's careers; calls on the Member States to implement the Commission's recommendations on wage transparency, gender-neutral job descriptions and classification, and the reversal of the burden of proof when it comes to challenging gender discrimination in the workplace;
7. Deplores the fact that people's patterns of employment are becoming increasingly uneven and insecure as a result of temporary work, the greater prevalence of involuntary short-term contracts, marginal employment and unemployment; notes that women are more often financially disadvantaged than men, as they tend to have interrupted careers, and that women also struggle more often to build up sufficient contributions across both the private and public pension systems as a result of lower participation in the labour market, the pay gap, career breaks, prevalent part-time jobs, job segregation and atypical contracts, carrying out unpaid caring, and being excluded from the labour market for long periods over the course of their lives; stresses the importance of combating indirect discrimination in pension schemes, not only in occupational schemes, but also in the practices of statutory pension schemes; calls for a focus on the need to address the gender pay gap and job segregation in low-paid sectors; considers that raising wages in low-paid sectors where women are in the majority should be a recommended tool for achieving that goal; calls on the Member States to adopt measures to ensure pension coverage to atypical workers that is on par with that of other workers;
8. Recalls that a decent retirement income is essential to fighting poverty among the elderly; stresses that the feminisation of poverty is the result of several factors, including the

gender pay gap, the pension gap, care responsibilities and related breaks, as well as insufficient support and taxation systems affecting households headed by single mothers; calls on the Member States to ensure that part-time workers, workers facing job discontinuity, assisting spouses and workers with career gaps, or with periods where fewer hours were worked, have the right to access a decent pension scheme without any form of discrimination;

9. Notes that occupational old-age pensions schemes are increasingly run according to insurance principles and this might give rise to many gaps in terms of social protection¹; emphasises that the Court of Justice of the European Union has made it clear that occupational pension schemes are to be considered pay and that the principle of equal treatment therefore applies to these schemes as well;
10. Points out that the transition to a multi-pillar pension system is causing further gender inequalities as regards pensions²; insists that the first of the three pension pillars must remain at the centre of Member States' pension systems, and must be promoted and enabled with a view to helping eliminate pension inequalities, particularly gender-based ones; insists as well that the practice of private pension schemes should remain a voluntary option; points out that the gender gap for pensions is smallest in the first pillar and that schemes under the this pillar have proven to be the most inclusive, the most fair in re-distribution and even the most cost-efficient way of combating old-age poverty; calls on the Commission and the Member States to strengthen public pension systems over other schemes that could aggravate the gender gap in pensions;
11. Highlights the fact that all people have the right to a universally accessible public pension, and recalls that Article 25 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union enshrines the rights of the elderly to lead a life of dignity and independence, and that Article 34 recognises the entitlement to social security benefits and social services that ensure protection in the event of maternity, illness, industrial accident, disability, dependency on long-term care, old age, or loss of employment; points to the importance of public social security systems funded by contributions as an important component of adequate pension provision;
12. Stresses that demographic change should not be advanced as a justification for the dismantling of social entitlements and benefits;
13. Highlights the important role played by survivor' pensions in protecting and safeguarding many older women from the higher risk of poverty and social exclusion they face compared to older men; calls on the Member States to reform, where necessary, their systems for survivors' pensions and widow's pensions in order not to penalise unmarried women; calls on the Member States, supported by the Commission, to study the effects of different systems providing survivor's pensions in light of the high rates of divorce, the incidence of non-married couples on poverty and the social exclusion of older women, and to consider providing for legal instruments to ensure shared pension rights in divorce

¹ http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/conference_sept_2011/dgjustice_oldagepensionspublication3march2011_en.pdf.

² European Parliament, Policy Department C, Citizen's Rights and Constitutional Affairs (Ludovici: 2016): 'The gender pension gap: differences between mothers and women without children', <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/supporting-analyses>.

cases;

14. Reiterates its call on the Member States to consider introducing or, where appropriate, reinforcing, through labour and social security legislation, care credits for both women and men as equivalent periods when these persons' pension entitlements are calculated for the purpose of building up pension rights, in order to protect those taking a break from employment to provide informal care to a dependant or a family member, whatever the family and/or marital status; recalls the call on the Commission to come forward with a proposal for carers' leave directive that offers carers adequate remuneration and social protection, and to put forward good practices for designing pension credit systems in all Member States with a view to modernising and expanding this instrument across the EU, thus helping reduce the pension gap between men and women;
15. Calls on the Member States to provide, when conditions for statutory retirement pension are not met, an adequate public minimum pension that is independent of the recipient's previous working life, and to ensure that formal leaves taken by individuals in order to care for family members are counted when these persons' pension entitlements are calculated; stresses the importance of shifting towards individual, rather than derived, pension entitlements and social benefits in order to avoid situations of dependency within the family; urges the Member States to replace household unit models and corresponding social security rights, so as to ensure individual rights, and to counter dependency status through a partner or through the state; points out, however, that the ratio between the public minimum pension and the average pension arising from working life must be appropriate;
16. Calls on the Commission to carry out a substantive analysis of the best practice to assist Member States in the calculation of such minimum pensions;
17. Is highly concerned that freezes and cuts in pensions in some Member States are affecting people with shorter or interrupted careers, or those with lower wages, the hardest; deplores the fact that it is most often women who are affected; stresses that these measures have led to indirect discrimination in the enjoyment of social security entitlements; calls on the Commission and the Member States to ensure that both men and women have the chance to reach full contribution periods, and likewise to ensure everyone's right to a full pension, with a view of closing the pension gap by fighting gender discrimination in employment, adjusting education and career planning, improving work-life balance and enhancing investment in child- and eldercare; considers that establishing sound regulations on health and safety at the workplace that take account of gendered occupational as well as psycho-social risks, investing in public employment services that are able to guide women of all ages in search of employment, and introducing flexible rules for transitioning from work into retirement is also relevant;
18. Takes the view that economic, employment and social policies need to be changed by strengthening investment and wage improvements in order to boost growth in socially useful, environmentally friendly and employment-generating activities, with a view to overcoming the economic and employment crisis;
19. Points out that high unemployment rates, combined with the impact of the financial and economic crisis, have forced many families to rely on a single income, in many cases the pension received by older people; is convinced that a humane society must necessarily be

based on the principle of solidarity between the generations; defines intergenerational justice as the equal distribution of benefits and burdens between the generations; considers that effective cooperation between generations is based on solidarity, and must be based on mutual respect, responsibility and a willingness to care for one another, without prejudice to the last and main responsibility which must be borne by the Member States;

20. Emphasises that the subsidiarity principle must be applied strictly in the area of pensions as well;
21. Calls on the Member States to increase investments in services for children; calls on the Member States to ensure that affordable, adequate and sufficient high-quality public services are set up; warns of the risks to gender equality represented by the shift from social security pensions to personal funded pensions, since personal pensions are based on individual contributions and do not compensate for times spent caring for children and other dependent relatives, or for periods of unemployment, sick leave or disability; points to the fact that pension system reforms that link welfare benefits to growth, and to the state of labour and financial markets, focus only on macroeconomic aspects and overlook the social purpose of pensions;
22. Stresses that the sustainability of pension schemes can be reinforced by ensuring women equal access to all pension pillars; encourages, in this regard, the Member States to devise awareness-raising information campaigns to encourage and facilitate women's access to second- and third pillar pensions, particularly in feminised sectors where take-up may be low;
23. Insists that pension systems could be made sustainable if, as a matter of priority, social protection systems were to be strengthened and corporate tax fraud and evasion were fought without quarter;
24. Stresses that the sustainability of pension systems has to allow for the challenges posed by demographic changes, population ageing, the birth rate and the ratio between persons in gainful employment and those of pensionable age, the situation of which depends greatly on the number of years in which they worked and paid contributions;
25. Insists that differences in men's and women's average life expectancy can also lead, directly or indirectly, to disadvantaged situations in terms of benefits, especially where pensions are concerned; takes note of the common tendency to ask Member States gradually to raise the pensionable age, which does not allow for generational turnover or a work-life balance, especially since low-paid jobs are more often done by women; calls on the Commission and the Member States to introduce unisex life tariffs in pension schemes and care credits, as well as for derived benefits, so that women can receive equal pension annuities for equal contributions, even if they are expected to live longer than men, and to ensure that female life expectancy is not raised as a pretext for discrimination, more particularly for the calculation of pensions; points out that the use of the sustainability factor that links pension trends to life expectancy and population ageing, which could increase the financial pressure on public social security systems, could be overcome by means of, among other things, an economic policy to promote development and employment, through new public investment, and better redistribution of income;
26. Calls on the Member States, in order to ensure sustainable social security in view of the

rising life expectancy in the EU, urgently to carry out necessary structural changes to the pension systems;

27. Asks the Member States to eliminate obstacles to access to an adequate pension – such as the increase in the minimum contributory years necessary to be eligible for pension entitlements, or the linking of pension benefits to lifetime contributions – that stand in the way for people with interrupted careers (most of which are women);
28. Urges the Commission, as a matter of urgency, to take steps to eliminate the factors preventing access to a decent pension, which essentially affect women, young people and immigrants;
29. Points out that in its General Comment No 16 (2005) on the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights, the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights set out the requirements of Article 3 in relation to Article 9 of the ICESCR, including the requirement of equalising the compulsory retirement age for both men and women and of ensuring that women benefit equally under public and private pension schemes;
30. Points out that the gender pension gap is a consequence of various factors, and calls on the Member States and the Commission to continue investigating this gap, and obtaining comparable data, with a view to designing better-informed policies; calls on the Commission and Member States to follow up on the Council conclusions of 18 June 2015 entitled ‘Equal income opportunities for women and men: closing the gender gap in pensions’, including the call for the inclusion of care periods in the calculation of social protection rights, investment in accessible and affordable care systems, and the development of indicators on the gender pension gap and to promote further research on its causes;
31. Calls on the Member States to put in place respectful and poverty-preventing measures for workers whose health does not allow them to work until the legal retirement age; believes that early retirement arrangements should remain in place for workers exposed to arduous or hazardous working conditions; considers that raising employment rates through quality jobs could help to reduce considerably the future increase of people unable to work until the legal retirement age and, thereby, to alleviate the financial burden of ageing;
32. Is deeply concerned by the impact of the austerity-driven Country Specific Recommendations (CSRs) on pension schemes and on their sustainability and access to contribution-based pensions in a growing number of Member States, and by the negative effects the CSRs have on income levels and on social transfers needed to eradicate poverty and social exclusion;
33. Calls on the Commission to carry out a thorough assessment of the impacts on the most vulnerable groups, and on women in particular, of the CSRs, as well as of the recommendations of the 2012 White Paper on Pensions, aimed at combating the causes of the gender pension gap, to establish a formal indicator of the gender pension gap and to conduct systematic monitoring; calls for adequate evaluation, and gender impact monitoring, of the recommendations or measures taken to date; calls on the Commission to include an indicator for the gender pension gap among the scoreboard indicators, and to support the development of gender-disaggregated statistics and research to enhance the

monitoring and evaluation of the effects of pension reforms on women's prosperity and well-being;

- 34 Calls on the Commission to widen its CSRs on the reform of Member States' pension systems to include clear-cut recommendations on the need to implement measures related to women's participation in the labour market, work-life balance, balance in terms of men's and women's roles in domestic tasks and the care of children and dependants, as well as recommendations on the design of public pension schemes, and on the regulation of private and occupational schemes, with a view to reducing gender pay and pension gaps;
35. Calls on the Member States to compile more and improved data on gender-related imbalances with a view to understanding the problem better and, on that basis, developing appropriate solutions; calls on the Commission to help the Member States compile the data so as to ensure that they are comparable in an EU-wide context; calls on the Member States to remove the elements of their pension systems, and of the reforms implemented, that add to imbalances in pensions (especially gender imbalances such as the present pension gap), taking into account the gender impact of any future pension reforms, as well as to implement measures to eradicate this discrimination; stresses that any policy changes related to pensions should be measured against their impact on the gender gap, with specific analysis comparing the impact of the proposed changes on women and men, and that this should be a feature of the planning, design, implementation and evaluation processes of public policy;
- 36 Urges the Commission and the Member States to review maternity and paternity protection schemes, moving towards a system of parental leave at the choice of the couple, which would remove the exclusive burden of supporting children from one member of the couple, which has in most cases fallen on women; notes, however, that a scheme of this kind cannot replace exclusive leave for fathers and mothers, which should coexist;
37. Stresses the importance of local and regional authorities in the field of social security and social services; calls on the Commission and the Member States to raise awareness of the overall pension gender gap issue amongst policy makers, businesses and civil society, and to provide further assistance in the form of tailored financial literacy, information and advice for both women and men, particularly women, to help them make the right investment decisions; notes that hitherto there has been little public discussion on the issue of the gender-related pensions gap; calls on the Commission and on the Member states to run information campaigns, and to constantly improve pension literacy among women and men; urges the Commission to develop and allocate the funding necessary to implement an EU strategy to eliminate and prevent the gender pension gap.

RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

Date adopted	8.12.2016
Result of final vote	+: 26 -: 21 0: 5
Members present for the final vote	Laura Agea, Brando Benifei, Mara Bizzotto, Enrique Calvet Chambon, David Casa, Ole Christensen, Martina Dlabajová, Elena Gentile, Czesław Hoc, Agnes Jongerius, Rina Ronja Kari, Jan Keller, Ádám Kósa, Agnieszka Kozłowska-Rajewicz, Jean Lambert, Patrick Le Hyaric, Jeroen Lenaers, Verónica Lope Fontagné, Javi López, Thomas Mann, Dominique Martin, Anthea McIntyre, Joëlle Mélin, João Pimenta Lopes, Georgi Pirinski, Marek Plura, Terry Reintke, Sofia Ribeiro, Maria João Rodrigues, Claude Rolin, Anne Sander, Sven Schulze, Romana Tomc, Yana Toom, Ulrike Trebesius, Marita Ulvskog, Renate Weber, Jana Žitňanská
Substitutes present for the final vote	Daniela Aiuto, Georges Bach, Deirdre Clune, Karima Delli, Tania González Peñas, Edouard Martin, Alex Mayer, Joachim Schuster, Tom Vandenkendelaere, Flavio Zanonato, Gabriele Zimmer
Substitutes under Rule 200(2) present for the final vote	John Stuart Agnew, Adam Gierek, Hannu Takkula