



2020/2010(INI)

15.1.2021

OPINION

of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

for the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs

on new avenues for legal labour migration
(2020/2010(INI))

Rapporteur for opinion (*): Elżbieta Rafalska

(*) Associated committee – Rule 57 of the Rules of Procedure

PA_NonLeg

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Employment and Social Affairs calls on the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

- A. whereas there are three types of legal status benefiting from international protection: people with refugee status, people seeking asylum, and people benefiting from subsidiary protection; whereas social inclusion and labour-market integration policies should be tailored to their specific needs and ensure equal treatment with nationals;
- B. whereas the number of third-country nationals that are posted from one Member State to another has increased significantly over the past years; whereas a third-country national worker who obtained a work and residence permit in one Member State can be posted by their employers to any other;
- C. whereas Member States retain the right to determine the volumes of admission for third-country nationals to seek work and determine their access to residence and working permits; whereas the criteria and practices between the Member States differ considerably;
- D. whereas free movement of persons stimulates the Member States' economies, allowing for an efficient matching of skills with EU labour market demand and vacancies; whereas social, employment, migration, housing, health, education and training policies play a crucial role in legal labour migration and labour market integration; whereas the coordination of the different social policy areas remains a challenge for the EU; whereas access to work is a much stronger incentive for migration than welfare for both EU and non-EU citizens;
- E. whereas in 2019, the EU-27 employment rate for people aged 20 to 64 years was 64.4 % for those born outside the EU, 73.9 % for the native-born population and 75.3 % for those born in another Member State; whereas in 2019, the EU-27 unemployment rate for people aged 20 to 64 years was 12.3 % for those born outside the EU, 7.3 % for those born in another Member State and 6.0 % for the native-born population¹; whereas the EU's fragmented migration policy may have a negative impact on businesses, since it may limit their possibility of using the internal market as and attracting third-country nationals (TCNs) to work for them;
- F. whereas women and minors have specific protection needs; whereas all social inclusion and labour market integration policies for third-country nationals need to include a gender and child protection perspective;
- G. whereas the demographic change and other societal and economic factors such as the current pandemic are gradually bringing about qualitative shortages on the labour market, making it hard to find suitably qualified workers, and, as demographic trends become increasingly unfavourable with an expected rise of old-age dependency ratio to

¹ https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Migrant_integration_statistics_-_labour_market_indicators

increase from 29.6 % in 2016 to 51.2 % in 2070², there are also quantitative shortages, in particular in strategic areas such as artificial intelligence (AI) and information and communication technologies (ICTs) as well as a general shortfall in the number of people who are willing and able to take up employment in specific sectors, including the care sector, the construction industry, the agricultural sector and the domestic sector, thus leading to a general mismatch between the jobs available on the market and workers' skills and competences, regardless whether or not efforts are made to match supply in terms of the skills and knowledge that can contribute to filling this gap in the EU labour market;

- H. whereas according to the Commission communication of 12 September 2019 entitled 'enhancing legal pathways to Europe: an indispensable part of a balanced and comprehensive migration policy' (COM(2018)0635), the share of employers reporting difficulties filling jobs is on the rise, reaching on average more than 40 %; whereas TCNs play an important role in addressing Europe's demographic trends, filling vacancies and boosting jobs and growth in the EU; whereas this role should be taken into account in terms of the mobility rights for TCNs; whereas the lack of skilled workforce is often the direct consequence of poor working conditions and lack of attractive career paths offered; whereas the EU attracts migrants from different backgrounds and who possess different kinds of knowledge, as well as sets and grades of skills; whereas the Union could make better use of the free movement of workers from the Member States, labour mobility and the labour force of persons who already have the right to legally reside in the EU;
- I. whereas discrimination, along with linguistic, educational, and institutional factors, are the most significant barriers for TCNs; whereas language courses play a key role in the successful integration of migrants from third-countries in the labour market; whereas according to Eurofound research³, fostering entrepreneurship for migrants could create social leadership and generate the creation of jobs through good policy initiatives;
- J. whereas as regards integration and access to the labour market, there is an ongoing discussion within CEAS (Common European Asylum System) to reduce the current maximum waiting time for asylum seekers' access to the labour market from 9 months to 6 months after applying; whereas multi-level cooperation between the Member States, local and regional administrations, social partners, civil society, and non-governmental organisations are required to unify efforts and face potential challenges that could arise in labour-market integration processes;
- K. whereas according to Eurofound⁴, workers with a foreign background and first-generation migrant workers tend to be overrepresented in sectors dominated by lower-skilled employment, including commerce and hospitality, transport, construction and other services such as home care, long-term care, and the agri-food sector; whereas the Commission's Fitness check on legal migration of March 2019⁵ emphasised the

² European Commission (2018). The 2018 Ageing Report: economic and budgetary projects for the 28 EU Member States (2016-2070).

³ https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/sites/default/files/ef_publication/field_ef_document/ef1138en.pdf

⁴ https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/sites/default/files/ef_publication/field_ef_document/ef19004en.pdf

⁵ European Commission (2019). Legal Migration Fitness Check. <https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/legal-migration/fitness->

substantial obstacles in legal migration pathways for low and middle skilled workers, despite increased labour demand;

- L. whereas the decline of fertility in a number of European countries has led and continues to lead to much smaller cohorts of new labour-market entrants;
- M. whereas the condition of thousands of agricultural workers is particularly critical in this emergency period, with thousands of them living segregated in informal dwellings with poor sanitary conditions and in constant fear of deportation;
- N. whereas Eurofound research found that migrants' region of origin plays a bigger role than their status in their integration into the labour force; whereas immigrants from all regions of the world, except North America, are more likely to hold jobs lower down the occupational ladder than the native population; whereas overall, the evidence suggests that there is no automatic gradual assimilation of immigrants and their descendants into the same patterns of employment as natives, with many instances of persistent disadvantage for individuals from certain regions of origin;
- O. whereas the EU attracts fewer highly-educated TCNs than other Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) destinations and should provide more transparent and more comprehensive information for potential qualified legal migrants and regarding verification of their qualifications; whereas, of all the migrants residing in OECD countries in 2015-16, just 25 % of workers with a high level of education chose an EU destination⁶; whereas the EU aims to become stronger in the global competition for qualified professionals;
- P. whereas the COVID-19 crisis has shown the significant contribution of migrant workers in supporting European economies, public services, filling labour shortages and boosting jobs and growth in the EU; whereas 13 % of key workers in essential jobs in the EU are migrants, the share of migrant workers in these professions is close to 20 % in many countries and in some key sectors (e.g. domestic work and construction) up to a third of keyworkers are migrants⁷; whereas the COVID-19 crisis shed new light on, inter alia, the working and housing conditions affecting a vast proportion of migrant workers employed in some sectors of the economy, such as food manufacturing and agriculture; whereas the COVID-19 pandemic, and its possible economic consequences, could affect the movement of legal labour migration;
- Q. whereas many EU citizens who migrate for work reasons and 40 % of highly educated TCNs in employment in the EU work below their qualification levels⁸; whereas Eurofound⁹ research shows that lack of language skills and lack of recognition of qualifications are among the main barriers preventing first-generation migrants, from obtaining jobs equivalent to their qualifications; whereas the Commission's fitness

check_en#:~:text=Background%20to%20the%20Legal%20Migration%20Fitness%20Check&text=%20Fitness%20Check%20aimed%20at,management%20of%20legal%20migration%20flows.

⁶ COM(2018)0635.

⁷ Fasani & Mazza (2020): Immigrant Key Workers: their contribution to Europe's COVID19 response. <https://www.iza.org/publications/pp/155>

⁸ https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/legal-migration/integration/integration-labour-market_en

⁹ https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/sites/default/files/ef_publication/field_ef_document/ef19004en.pdf

check on legal migration (March 2019)¹⁰ underscores the challenge raised by the sectorial approach to EU labour migration that determines different rights and rules depending on the level of qualification of workers, which can lead to confusion and discrimination among workers;

- R. whereas the Global Skills Partnership, which is designed to channel migration pressures into tangible, mutual benefits for both a country of origin and a country of destination, allow the workforce to be attracted in accordance with the exact needed set of skills; whereas select innovative European pilot projects on labour migration have already incorporated the main tenets of the Global Skills Partnership in the spirit of encouraging north-south cooperation, as enshrined in the UN Sustainable Development Goals, and have increasingly shown the positive outcomes of legal labour migration pathways;
1. Emphasises that, in accordance with Article 79 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, the EU should pursue a migration policy that is aimed at ensuring fair treatment of third-country nationals residing legally in the EU, including inclusive standards, equal opportunities, decent working conditions and equal treatment; stresses however that reference to labour market challenges must not lead to the spread of unfair competition or the violation of EU and national rules on legal migration;
 2. Emphasises that a structured immigration policy should already start in the country of origin with language training and courses on values and the legal foundations of the country of destination; underlines that bureaucratic procedures should enable legal migrants to bring their potential fully to the fore;
 3. Recalls its resolution of 19 June 2020 on European protection of cross-border and seasonal workers in the context of the COVID-19 crisis¹¹;
 4. Underlines that, due to an increase in demographic changes – in particular an ageing population, a fast-changing global and digital environment in the labour markets, and the unprecedented COVID-19 crisis – there is a growing demand for workers in specific, sectors and professions, for example in some Member States in sectors such as care for the elderly, long-term care, the health sector, construction, agriculture, tourism, domestic, ICTC and AI sectors; emphasises the need to attract workers that can fill in the gap in these specific sectors within the labour market; emphasises that there is also a need for regulated labour migration, including temporary labour migration, with not only a focus on highly skilled labour but also on the middle skilled sector¹² and low skill labour; calls on the Commission and the Member States to promote policies that assist with the entry of these migrants into the labour market and that recognise workers from these specific trades and professions, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic; notes that such policies could support the promotion of legal labour migration, including temporary labour migration; considers that effective integration of TCNs into the EU labour-force could support local communities and bring an added value to the Member

¹⁰ European Commission (2019). Legal Migration Fitness Check. https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/legal-migration/fitness-check_en#:~:text=Background%20to%20the%20Legal%20Migration%20Fitness%20Check&text=The%20Fitness%20Check%20aimed%20at,management%20of%20legal%20migration%20flows.

¹¹ Texts adopted, P9_TA(2020)0176.

¹² <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/c9d28c24-en/index.html?itemId=/content/component/c9d28c24-en>

States, by filling the existing gap in terms of skills and knowledge, generating economic activity and growth, and bringing a positive return to host communities; recalls that the current crisis has shown evidence that no profession should be a reason for contempt; notes that low-skilled workers often develop an essential role in their jobs for society and should not be underestimated, or high-skilled TCNs prioritised, in labour-market integration policies and activities;

5. Notes that providing incentives for high-skilled migrants that could enrich European science and research would help the European Union to achieve its goal of becoming a leader in the area of science and research;
6. Emphasises that there is also a need for regulated temporary labour migration, which does not solely focus on highly skilled labour but also on the middle-skilled sector;
7. Calls for the European institutions to resume discussions and agree on reducing the current maximum waiting time for asylum seekers to have access to the labour market from 9 to 6 months after applying, which would significantly facilitate the integration process and its success;
8. Emphasises that the situation for mobile and seasonal workers, including third-country workers, may not be consistent with the relevant legislation and mobility rules, thus leading to sometimes unacceptable, and precarious living standards and working conditions and potential breaches of human and workers' rights, loss of social security coverage or at the very least its adverse fragmentation; stresses the need to better protect third-country migrants at work; calls on the Member States to ensure healthy living conditions, security of residence, access to consultation and information about the applicable labour rights for all workers and to ensure that work places comply with occupational safety and health standards; stresses, in addition, that the internal market and the free movement of workers must be protected;
9. Emphasises the need to better protect third country migrants at work; calls on the Member States and the Commission to guarantee full social protection, minimum standards for accommodation, access to consultation and information about applicable labour rights;
10. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to identify and address the reasons explaining the EU's lack of attractiveness for global talents and stresses the need for better coordination among the Member States in order to improve the collection of accurate and comparative data; notes that the Member States should provide a clearer picture of different target groups of skilled workers, include the collection of information on the demand for skills and their equivalents and ensure consistent legislation, best practices and information on the implementation of EU law, and the mobility of TCNs in the EU by providing support for networks of experts and research, and by presenting their own statistics in real-time; asks the Commission to conduct an extensive investigation into the trends of posted TCNs and emphasises the need for possible policy measures at EU or national level based on the outcome of the investigation; calls on the Member States and the Commission to ensure data collection on the impact of COVID-19 on legal labour migration in the EU;
11. Emphasises the need to improve the functioning of work permit routes for non-EU

migrants to reach Europe and enforce respect for migrants and refugee workers' rights; calls, in that respect, on the Commission to regulate all recruitment agencies, potentially through the European Labour Authority (ELA);

12. Emphasises the need to strengthen existing legal migration pilot projects in dialogue with trade unions and other organisations working with migrant workers;
13. Emphasises the need to create a more favourable environment for the integration and protection of migrant workers' rights, irrespective of their skills or wage level, immigration status or nationality, ultimately leading to a European Migration Code;
14. Emphasises the need to make common agriculture policy payments conditional on the respect of applicable working conditions resulting from relevant collective labour agreements and national and EU social and labour law;
15. Emphasises that differential treatment of TCNs undermines the EUs ability to attract workers; stresses the need to combat unfair competition between service providers, and the nationals of the Member States and TCNs by ensuring equal treatment in the terms of employment, by means such as access to social protection from the first day, the right to strike and to join a trade union, access to public services and to education and by taking action to prevent the abuse and the exploitation of workers regardless of their status; calls on the Member States to ensure effective compliance with commonly shared standards and labour laws and conventions to prevent discrimination and the exploitation of workers; underlines that existing EU legislation on regular migration such as the Seasonal Workers Directive¹³ and the Blue Card Directive¹⁴ do not correspond to the current labour market context, demands, and needs; stresses that existing legislation, such as the Employer's Sanctions Directive¹⁵, which establishes measures protecting workers from abuses and exploitation at the workplace, must be applied and properly implemented in all Member States; recalls that EU legislation promotes equal treatment and access to employment rights for all; underlines the importance of the Blue Card Directive, which could help make the EU an attractive place for global talents and provide European companies the skills they need to stay competitive; stresses that the Member States could make use of the Blue Card scheme;
16. Calls on the Member States to participate in the migration pilot projects launched by the Commission in 2017 (Delivery of the European Agenda on Migration, COM(2017)0558 final) and to actively promote the role that migration can play in the labour market; further calls on the Commission to ensure that these pilot projects are inclusive and guarantee equal treatment and equal opportunities for TCNs;
17. Emphasises the need for more opportunities for regular migration and for economic migrants to enter and work in the EU and the need to enforce respect of minimum

¹³ Directive 2014/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 26 February 2014 on the conditions of entry and stay of third-country nationals for the purpose of employment as seasonal workers, OJ L 94, 28.3.2014, p375.

¹⁴ Council Directive 2009/50/EC of 25 May 2009 on the conditions of entry and residence of third-country nationals for the purposes of highly qualified employment, OJ L 155, 18.6.2009, p.17.

¹⁵ Directive 2009/52/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 June 2009 providing for minimum standards on sanctions and measures against employers of illegally staying third-country nationals, OJ L 168, 30.6.2009, p. 24.

rights, decent working standards and the equal treatment principle in favour of all workers regardless of their migration status, including minimum rights that ensure the transition from irregular to regular employment;

18. Stresses that measures should be proposed that promote a requirement to boost the potential of legally residing immigrants in the EU, so that they develop the skills needed on the labour market they are seeking to access by means of training schemes that enhance employability through the pursuit of excellence;
19. Stresses the need to maintain flexibility in EU regulations in order to take into account the specific circumstances of the individual Member States, including their own labour market situations, with the possibility of optional clauses in directives;
20. Stresses that further opportunities for labour mobility within the Union must be legally guaranteed;
21. Highlights that slow and excessively bureaucratic procedures may affect refugees and asylum seekers' access to education and the labour market, thus making them increasingly at risk over time of having to resort to undeclared work and falling in situations of vulnerability; points out that a lengthy processing of international protection applications and the failed registration of asylum seekers at their arrival not only impedes timely and legal access of refugees and asylum seekers to the labour market, but also generates conditions for the development of undeclared work practices and all forms of exploitation and abuse;
22. Calls on the Member States to step up their efforts to make their countries more attractive places for mobile human capital in the international arena, including investors and businesspeople, who are increasingly regarded as valuable assets to be attracted;
23. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to further develop legal pathways for labour migration, while taking into account the demands and needs of the national labour market and with a focus on occupations with a systemic shortfall of workers;
24. Underlines the importance of providing legal migrants within the Union with relevant opportunities to benefit from their labour skills and from the opportunities offered by EU mobility;
25. Calls for equal opportunities for men and women in all policies and procedures relating to social inclusion and to labour market integration of TCNs, bearing in mind that often women take responsibility than men do for the care of children, elderly, or other dependent family members; recalls that provision of quality and accessible childcare and care for other dependants, as well as flexible working arrangements and the implementation of existing EU legislation such as the Work-life balance Directive¹⁶, are examples of how to improve access to labour markets for all parents and carers and enable their economic and social empowerment;
26. Welcomes the Commission's initiatives of bringing together economic and social

¹⁶ Directive (EU) 2019/1158 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 June 2019 on work-life balance for parents and carers and repealing Council Directive 2010/18/EU, OJ L 188, 12.7.2019, p. 79.

partners on the topic of integration in the labour market; stresses the need to continue initiatives such as ‘Employers together for integration’, ‘European partnership on integration’, and ‘European dialogue on skills and migration’ to spur the support and understanding of benefits and pitfalls in terms of labour migration; calls, in this respect, on the Commission and the Member States to continue dialogue with economic and social partners and other stakeholders on the topic of labour migration;

27. Calls on the European institutions to resume discussions on the revision of the Blue Card Directive immediately, and to unblock the situation at the Council;
28. Underlines that undeclared TCN workers find themselves in a particularly vulnerable situation in which they are without job security and access to social protection and are at risk of abuse; considers that undeclared TCN workers may experience particular difficulties in reporting abuse, since they are afraid of losing not only their job but also their home and residency; calls on the ELA and the Member States to step up their efforts in tackling undeclared work and to enforce effectively the obligations of employers to end exploitation and to declare and regularise their workers; calls for the introduction of firewalls between labour inspectorates and migration authorities in order to guarantee that the rights of undocumented migrant workers are respected;
29. Highlights the crucial work done by social partners, civil society, local and regional authorities and volunteer organisations in offering support for the empowerment and integration of migrants from outside the EU into the labour force, and in providing migrant workers with information, in particular about their rights and duties and the protection to which they are entitled; calls, moreover, for the full involvement of these stakeholders in the policy-making process;
30. Considers that it is important to provide adequate training on employment legislation, rights, and duties to TCNs, as well as to institutional authorities, to ensure that migrants are not exploited through undeclared work practices and other forms of severe labour exploitation or discrimination in the workplace;
31. Underlines the fact that labour market conditions within host countries are one of the determining factors when it comes to ensuring sustainable and successful integration of TCNs; is aware of the fact that these persons are heterogenic in terms of age, skills, knowledge, and background; stresses that unemployment in the EU, in particular youth and long-term unemployment, is still at alarming levels in some countries and regions, and that the Commission and the Member States should continue to prioritise policies and investments aimed at providing quality employment for the whole of society, with a particular focus on the most vulnerable people, regardless of their situation and birth place; recalls that actions to create quality employment for all promote active labour markets and growth, having a positive impact on national gross domestic products;
32. Notes that TCNs may be posted either from a third country to a Member State, or may obtain a work permit in a Member State prior to their posting to another Member State; emphasises that where TCN workers are posted from one Member State to another, the host Member State does not have the possibility to determine how many or which TCN work in its territory; emphasises, further, that such TCN workers are often in a vulnerable position because their permit is tied to their employment contract and they

are therefore dependent on the employer for their permit; stresses the need to strengthen cooperation and information exchange between Member States, in particular with regard to the intra-EU mobility of TCN workers; underlines that the increase of posted TCN workers in the EU is not problematic per se, but there is the worrying risk of abuse, exploitation and violation of workers' rights in relation to this particularly vulnerable group of workers; urges the Commission and the Member States to step up their efforts to tackle abuse in relation to such TCN workers, and notes that such abuse could include bogus subcontracting, temporary work agencies, letter-box companies, bogus self-employment arrangements, bogus posting and undeclared posted workers; underlines the importance of ELA in coordinating and providing support in this regard and stresses the need to provide relevant information on the rights of workers and obligations of employers as regards TCN workers in the EU; recalls that the ELA's function is to coordinate and support concerted and joint inspections on posting and undeclared work, and that this extends to TCN workers;

33. Draws attention to the problem of people working in jobs that they are too qualified for; emphasises the need to improve the existing system of recognition of professional qualifications among the Member States, as difficulties in recognition of foreign qualifications remain a substantial obstacle for employment matching, which hampers mobility, and notes that this constitutes a precondition for facilitating labour mobility; calls, therefore, for the strengthening of the European Qualifications Framework with a view to achieving the adequate recognition of skills, competences, and qualifications obtained outside European borders; calls, furthermore, on the Member States to recognise, validate and certify existing skills, and formal and non-formal competences, talents and know-how, of legal migrants from third countries; underlines the importance of guaranteeing to all TCNs, and in particular, girls and women, young people and persons from a disadvantaged background, access to formal, informal and non-formal education and life-long quality training; emphasises the need for continuous support for life-long learning for both EU citizens and TCNs residing in the European Union in order to encourage the acquisition of the needed skills to function in the labour market and therefore calls on the Commission to encourage the financing of skills partnership projects that focus on labour migration and inclusion under the umbrella of the European Social Fund Plus (ESF+) and the Asylum, Migration and Integration Fund; calls on the Commission and the Member States to increase their efforts in order to retain foreign students after graduating from EU universities; stresses that granting graduates access to intra-EU mobility and valid jobseekers visa could increase the attractiveness of the EU as a whole; recalls the importance of using integration funds for real integration measures, and that the objective of labour market integration of TCNs must be reflected in greater importance being given to the ESF+ ; stresses that insufficient sums have been allocated to this fund while acknowledging the big challenges and the number of key initiatives that are to be financed by the fund, and calls for investment and additional resources;
34. Recalls the protective standards for TCNs that are laid down in the Seasonal Workers Directive; highlights the need to improve the monitoring of working conditions; calls on the Commission and the Member States to protect seasonal workers, who are essential for strategic economic sectors in the EU and to establish clear rules as regards their rights and underlines that they should be guaranteed equal treatment and protection with their local counterparts; calls on the Commission to undertake urgent actions regarding

the general situation of the employment and health and safety conditions of posted TCNs and seasonal workers, including the role of temporary work agencies, recruiting agencies, other intermediaries, and subcontractors, and to identify protection gaps and the possible need to revise the existing legislative framework, such as the legislative framework for health and safety at work, the Seasonal Workers Directive and Directive 2008/104/EC on temporary agency work¹⁷, as well as pandemic-proofing; stresses that not only are the lessons learned valid concerning the COVID-19 crisis, they should also strengthen evidence-based policy-making to address the shortcomings of EU and national legislation in times of crises and normality;

¹⁷ Directive 2008/104/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 19 November 2008 on temporary agency work, OJ L 327, 5.12.2008, p. 9.

INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

Date adopted	14.1.2021
Result of final vote	+: 34 -: 6 0: 13
Members present for the final vote	Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Marc Angel, Dominique Bilde, Gabriele Bischoff, Vilija Blinkevičiūtė, Andrea Bocskor, Milan Brglez, Sylvie Brunet, David Casa, Margarita de la Pisa Carrión, Özlem Demirel, Klára Dobrev, Jarosław Duda, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Lucia Ďuriš Nicholsonová, Rosa Estaràs Ferragut, Nicolaus Fest, Loucas Fourlas, Cindy Franssen, Heléne Fritzon, Elisabetta Gualmini, Alicia Homs Ginel, France Jamet, Agnes Jongerius, Radan Kanev, Ádám Kósa, Stelios Kympouropoulos, Katrin Langensiepen, Miriam Lexmann, Elena Lizzi, Radka Maxová, Kira Marie Peter-Hansen, Dragoş Pîslaru, Dennis Radtke, Elżbieta Rafalska, Guido Reil, Daniela Rondinelli, Mounir Satouri, Monica Semedo, Beata Szydło, Eugen Tomac, Romana Tomc, Yana Toom, Marie-Pierre Vedrenne, Marianne Vind, Maria Walsh, Stefania Zambelli, Tatjana Ždanoka, Tomáš Zdechovský
Substitutes present for the final vote	Konstantinos Arvanitis, Ilana Cicurel, José Gusmão, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

34	+
EPP	David CASA, Jarosław DUDA, Loucas FOURLAS, Stelios KYMPOUROPOULOS, Eugen TOMAC, Maria WALSH, Tomáš ZDECHOVSKÝ
S&D	Marc ANGEL, Gabriele BISCHOFF, Vilija BLINKEVIČIŪTĖ, Milan BRGLEZ, Estrella DURÁ FERRANDIS, Heléne FRITZON, Elisabetta GUALMINI, Alicia HOMES GINEL, Agnes JONGERIUS, Marianne VIND
RENEW	Atidzhe ALIEVA-VELI, Sylvie BRUNET, Ilana CICUREL, Radka MAXOVÁ, Dragoş PÎSLARU, Monica SEMEDO, Yana TOOM, Marie-Pierre VEDRENNE
GREENS/EFA	Katrin LANGENSIEPEN, Kira Marie PETER-HANSEN, Mounir SATOURI, Tatjana ŽDANOKA
ECR	Margarita DE LA PISA CARRIÓN, Lucia ĎURIŠ NICHOLSONOVÁ, Elżbieta RAFALSKA, Beata SZYDŁO
NI	Daniela RONDINELLI

6	-
ID	Dominique BILDE, Nicolaus FEST, France JAMET, Elena LIZZI, Guido REIL, Stefania ZAMBELLI

13	0
EPP	Andrea BOCSKOR, Rosa ESTARÀS FERRAGUT, Cindy FRANSSEN, Radan KANEV, Ádám KÓSA, Miriam LEXMANN, Dennis RADTKE, Romana TOMC
S&D	Klára DOBREV
THE LEFT	Konstantinos ARVANITIS, Özlem DEMIREL, José GUSMÃO, Eugenia RODRÍGUEZ

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention