



2021/2251(INI)

29.4.2022

OPINION

of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

for the Committee on Budgets and Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs

on the implementation report on the Recovery and Resilience Facility
(2021/2251(INI))

Rapporteur for opinion (*): Dragoş Pişlaru

(*) Associated committee – Rule 57 of the Rules of Procedure

PA_NonLeg

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Employment and Social Affairs calls on the Committee on Budgets and Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs, as the committees responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

- having regard to Regulation (EU) 2021/241 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 February 2021 establishing the Recovery and Resilience Facility (RRF)¹,
 - having regard to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2106 of 28 September 2021 on supplementing Regulation (EU) 2021/241 of the European Parliament and of the Council establishing the Recovery and Resilience Facility by setting out the common indicators and the detailed elements of the recovery and resilience scoreboard²,
 - having regard to the Recovery and Resilience Scoreboard,
 - having regard to Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2105 of 28 September 2021 supplementing Regulation (EU) 2021/241 of the European Parliament and of the Council establishing the Recovery and Resilience Facility by defining a methodology for reporting social expenditure³,
 - having regard to the Commission report of 1 March 2022 on the implementation of the Recovery and Resilience Facility (COM(2022)0075),
 - having regard to the armed conflict in Ukraine and the refugee crisis faced by the Member States, in particular those on the EU's external border with Ukraine,
- A. whereas the COVID-19 pandemic has significantly affected the EU's economy and society; whereas the COVID-19 pandemic is placing a heavy burden on people in the EU, particularly on women and vulnerable groups such as persons with disabilities, children, young people and older people, and especially on frontline workers and their families, whose everyday lives, working lives and livelihoods are affected;
- B. whereas, according to the Recovery and Resilience Scoreboard, Member States have put forward 228 measures with a focus on supporting children and young people; whereas 74 % of the measures focus on general, vocational and higher education and training capacity, as well as accessibility, affordability, quality and inclusiveness, including digitisation and infrastructure, the performance of education and increasing capacity in higher education; whereas 14 % of the measures deal with early childhood education and care, early school leaving and child poverty; whereas 12 % of the measures focus on tackling youth unemployment through job creation, hiring, job transition incentives and support for self-employment;
- C. whereas the RRF created an unprecedented structure under the NextGenerationEU recovery instrument, making available EUR 338 billion in grants and EUR 385.8 billion

¹ OJ L 57, 18.2.2021, p. 17.

² OJ L 429, 1.12.2021, p. 83.

³ OJ L 429, 1.12.2021, p. 79.

in loans⁴; whereas the RRF is expected to mitigate the economic and social impact of the COVID-19 pandemic through reforms and investments and to positively contribute to the EU's economy and society, making them more sustainable, inclusive, resilient and better prepared for the green and digital transitions, while also ensuring that these transitions are socially fair and just;

- D. whereas the RRF will drive Member States' reforms and investments in line with the EU's priorities as set out in its six pillars; whereas social and territorial cohesion and policies for the next generation are two of the six pillars of the RRF; whereas contributing to upward economic and social convergence, restoring and promoting sustainable and inclusive growth, competitiveness of SMEs, research, development and innovation, fostering high-quality sustainable employment creation and contributing to the implementation of the European Pillar of Social Rights are among the objectives included in the RRF Regulation; whereas these objectives should be achieved through a comprehensive package of reforms and investments that ensure equality and access to opportunities and social protection, protect vulnerable groups and improve the living standards of all, and promote social impact investments as well as quality employment contracts, decent wages, collective bargaining and social protection coverage, while also tackling gender-specific socio-economic issues on the path to recovery;
- E. whereas Member States should keep investing in a sustainable transition in order to maintain the recovery from the pandemic;
- F. whereas a large number of reforms and investments aim to improve territorial infrastructure and services provided at local level; whereas these measures can also boost the local economy, national competitiveness and institutional resilience;
- G. whereas the methodology for reporting on social expenditure in Member States' recovery and resilience plans should ensure all reforms and investments with a primary social dimension are associated to one of nine social policy areas under the four broader social categories set out in the delegated act; whereas additionally all measures of a social nature that include a focus on children and young people, or on gender equality, should be flagged in order to ensure specific reporting on expenditure under the RRF on these areas;
- H. whereas poverty including in-work poverty is on the rise again in the EU; whereas according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), a fiscal response worth 0.5 % of GDP targeting support for the most vulnerable could substantially mitigate the economic impact of this current crisis without substantially adding to inflation; whereas inflation can potentially lead to a negative change in the expected positive outcome of the RRF; whereas young people have experienced a significant decrease in personal income and a higher risk of poverty and social exclusion; whereas an increasing number of young adults are now relying on the parental home to protect them from poverty, but 29 % of households with three generations are at risk of poverty and 13 % are severely deprived⁵; whereas the consequences of the Russian invasion of Ukraine are placing a heavy burden on

⁴ https://ec.europa.eu/info/business-economy-euro/recovery-coronavirus/recovery-and-resilience-facility_en

⁵ European Parliament resolution of 17 December 2020 on a strong social Europe for Just Transitions. OJ C 445, 29.10.2021, p. 75.

households due to the increase in prices of basic necessities including energy, transport and food, and services; whereas integrating refugees in this economic context requires the mobilisation of public and social services;

- I. whereas the COVID-19 pandemic has exacerbated the demographic trends that already represented a challenge to the EU before the pandemic; whereas the pandemic has deprived young people of opportunities related to training or employment; whereas in 2022 and 2023, 3.4 million jobs are expected to be created, therefore making it essential to ensure that young people take part of these new employment opportunities; whereas the youth unemployment rate in the EU, while showing initial signs of recovery by mid-2021, still stood at 17.4 % in the second quarter of 2021, nearly triple the unemployment rate of the population aged 25-74;
- J. whereas the digital skills indicator shows that only 56 % of people in the EU have at least basic digital skills; whereas, according to the EU's digital objectives, the basic digital skills indicator should increase to 80 % by 2030⁶; whereas the constant development of digital skills, as well as the development of skills with economic potential such as green or entrepreneurial skills, is key for a healthy, inclusive and future-oriented European labour market; whereas the same applies to vocational education, trade skills and life skills; whereas 40 % of employers cannot find people with the right skills to fill their vacancies⁷ and need to take stock of the potentially large volume of existing unrecognised and underutilised skills in the labour market; whereas current social security rules do not allow workers whose Member State of employment is different from their Member State of residence to telework from a Member States other than that of their employer;
- K. whereas the release of funds under the RRF is contingent on the satisfactory fulfilment of relevant milestones and targets of reforms and investments by Member States as set out in their recovery and resilience plans (RRPs); whereas Article 16 of the Regulation requires the Commission to present a review report on the implementation of the RRF to Parliament and the Council by 31 July 2022; whereas this report should assess the extent to which implementation of the recovery and resilience plans is in line with the six pillars and contributes to the general objective of the Regulation; whereas evaluation of the implementation of the RRF is needed to implement lessons learned and to update the structures currently in place; whereas implementing lessons learned from the pandemic can contribute to strengthening recovery and resilience;
- L. whereas the consultation and involvement of EU stakeholders varies significantly between countries and regions; whereas local and regional authorities play a key role in implementing national recovery and resilience plans (NRRPs); whereas local and regional authorities are responsible for one third of all public expenditure and more than half of public investment in the EU⁸, a large portion of which is in policy areas that are central to the RRF;
- M. whereas the NRRPs of four Member States have still not been approved by the

⁶ European Commission, Digital Economy and Society Index 2021, p. 15.

⁷ <https://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1146>

⁸ OECD, Key data on Local and Regional Governments in the European Union (brochure), 2018. Available at: <https://www.oecd.org/regional/EU-Local-government-key-data.pdf>

Commission;

1. Highlights that the COVID-19 crisis has impacted vulnerable groups the most and that it has already left many people, particularly women and young people, unemployed, in precarious employment or without access to vocational education, traineeships or apprenticeships; stresses the need to adapt labour market policy and social protection instruments to support those groups that are particularly disadvantaged on the labour market, such as young people, women, persons with disabilities, people with a low level of qualifications and older people; recalls the importance for the EU of leaving no one behind;
2. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to fight against unemployment and to ensure that young people, especially those not in employment, education or training (NEETs), receive an adequate, paid and high-quality first working experience and access to training; condemns the practice of unpaid internships as a form of exploitation of young workers and a violation of their rights, and calls on the Commission and the Member States, in collaboration with Parliament and with respect for the principle of subsidiarity, to propose a common legal framework to ensure fair remuneration for traineeships and apprenticeships in order to avoid exploitative practices, including unpaid internships;
3. Welcomes the RRF as a key instrument and a unique opportunity for the EU to emerge stronger from the COVID-19 crisis; notes the Commission's view that most Member States have satisfactorily drawn up NRRPs in a short space of time; points out that in the context of a new challenge for the EU and the world, namely the war in Ukraine, funds should reach the Member States as soon as possible; welcomes the early disbursement of EUR 56.6 billion in pre-financing by the Commission to 21 Member States in order to ensure the frontloading of financial support to address the crisis and its impacts; emphasises nevertheless that in several Member States the NRRPs are only part of broader national recovery plans, and points to the need to draw lessons on the shortcomings that have been identified and for an exchange of best practices between Member States, local and regional authorities, social partners, civil society organisations, youth organisations and other relevant stakeholders, as well as for a comprehensive approach at European level, in order to overcome the crisis and make the EU economy more robust, resilient and competitive for the future;
4. Stresses that the Russian invasion in Ukraine will have negative and asymmetrical effects on the EU economy, its Member States and particularly EU households in the context of the ongoing energy crisis; is concerned about the social consequences of the energy crisis and the risk it poses to social equality; stresses that the RRF will play a crucial role in the future development of the EU's economic and social policies, including the acceleration towards the energy transition that will lead to more independence; calls on the Commission to reassess the potential amount of EUR 220 billion in RRF loan support that is currently not requested by the Member States; encourages Member States to make use of the potential funding available to support the needs of refugees, in particular their educational, care, social and labour market integration, in advance of the request deadline for loan support in mid-2023; calls on the Commission to reflect on a more flexible framework for the allocation of these loans to Member States with approved plans in the context of the Russian

aggression against Ukraine;

5. Highlights that the COVID-19 pandemic shifted many work activities to an online or hybrid environment, which could help people from remote or rural areas to find better opportunities in the labour market and thus prevent brain drain from these areas to bigger cities or abroad; recalls that there is RRF funding expressly available for the development of education, training and skills, particularly digital skills with a special focus on vulnerable groups; calls on the Member States to ensure such investment in people, in particular through up- and re-skilling and requalification of the workforce as well as through reintegration of the unemployed, including of workers who lost their jobs during the pandemic;
6. Stresses the need to transform and modernise education and training in the light of the digital and green transitions, enhancing the acquisition of digital skills and education in particular and promoting vocational education and training and lifelong learning; welcomes the fact that reforms and investments proposed by many Member States to support digital objectives exceed the requirement of at least 20 % of total allocations in each NRRP, amounting to EUR 117 billion or 26 % of the total; stresses in particular the importance of investments in digital skills and digital literacy development for workers and citizens and digitalisation of businesses including SMEs that promote sustainable economic growth and strengthen competitiveness and promote productivity in the long term, as well as of improving connectivity infrastructure, particularly in rural areas, to reduce the digital divide; further encourages Member States to support quality infrastructure (including digital infrastructure) in remote and rural regions in order to enhance opportunities, attract young people and contribute to combating brain drain;
7. Notes that, according to the Commission estimates provided to the European Parliament working group on the Recovery and Resilience Facility, Member States included in their plans measures dedicated to children and youth worth EUR 49.21 billion, representing approximately 11.5 % of the total budget of the 22 recovery and resilience plans currently approved; calls on the Commission and the Member States to fight against youth unemployment and to ensure that young people, especially from vulnerable and disadvantaged environments, receive adequate, paid and high-quality jobs and first working experiences, and that both children and young people have access and opportunity related to education, health, nutrition and housing; is concerned that many NRRPs do not properly reflect the ambitions set by the European Child Guarantee and that they reflect only partially those of the reinforced Youth Guarantee;
8. Notes that social expenditure in the NRRPs includes employment incentives for specific disadvantaged groups, reforms of employment protection legislation and labour contract regulation; stresses that Member States should focus on reforms and investments to support quality job creation and the transition to new sectors and occupations, in line with the European Skills Agenda, the European Green Deal and the EU's new updated Industrial Strategy⁹; emphasises that 10 NRRPs contain measures to improve the training, development and working conditions of civil servants by facilitating flexible working arrangements and implementing a better pay system in the public service, and that the modernisation of recruitment processes and the effectiveness of judicial systems

⁹ Commission communication entitled 'Updating the 2020 New Industrial Strategy: Building a stronger Single Market for Europe's recovery' (COM(2021)0350).

are found in 13 NRRPs; stresses that reforms and investments should also target older people in the spirit of lifelong learning and promoting social inclusiveness, digital skills, green skills and especially financial literacy; regrets that only some NRRPs contain measures for the development of proper care services and temporary support measures; calls for Member States to create or strengthen public and affordable high-quality care and education for children, persons with disabilities, the elderly and people with long-term care needs;

9. Welcomes the fact that measures supporting social and territorial cohesion amount to EUR 193 billion of estimated expenditure including EUR 17.4 billion for adult learning, employment support and modernisation of labour market institutions, EUR 45.6 billion for accessibility, especially for persons with disabilities, affordable housing, early childhood education and care, and EUR 37 billion for healthcare resilience¹⁰; regrets that social investment measures are rather restricted towards social infrastructure and do not allow the development of proper care services, housing and temporary relief measures; calls on the Commission and the Member States to support legislative and policy initiatives aimed at reducing inequalities and ensuring decent working conditions for all, with a particular focus on teleworking, the right to disconnect, mental well-being at work, occupational health and safety, ensuring quality and safe jobs for all, in particular for essential workers, promoting and strengthening the role of the social partners and collective bargaining; calls for constructive cooperation between the Commission, Parliament and the Member States with a view to adopting the directives on improving working conditions in platform work, on adequate minimum wages and pay transparency, and enforcement mechanisms in the European Union;
10. Notes that, according to the Commission's estimates provided to the European Parliament working group on the Recovery and Resilience Facility, the total expenditure on healthcare-related measures is estimated at EUR 37 billion; welcomes the opportunity for investment in health and long-term care systems which are essential in the context of demographic change; recalls the detrimental effects of the COVID-19 crisis on people's mental health and regrets that Member States did not include measures to make mental health care accessible and affordable for all age groups, especially early ages, initiatives that promote sport, leisure and culture, and measures to address health inequalities through the provision of adequate support to vulnerable groups; recalls that those living alone, those with lower socio-economic status and those who were unemployed¹¹ had higher rates of mental distress, and that the mental health of young people has worsened significantly, with the incidence of mental ill-health almost doubling in several Member States compared to pre-crisis levels; highlights that mental health should represent an integral part of the EU's socio-economic recovery from the pandemic and an occupational health priority, in particular in educational and workplace environments;
11. Believes that the social milestones and targets that have been set out are insufficient; points out the particular importance of indicators related to the implementation of the

¹⁰ https://ec.europa.eu/economy_finance/recovery-and-resilience-scoreboard/assets/thematic_analysis/5_Health.pdf

¹¹ OECD Tackling the mental health impact of the COVID-19 crisis: An integrated, whole-of-society response <https://www.oecd.org/coronavirus/policy-responses/tackling-the-mental-health-impact-of-the-covid-19-crisis-an-integrated-whole-of-society-response-0ccafa0b/>

European Pillar of Social Rights principles of quality employment, upward social convergence, equality of and access to opportunities and social protection, education and skills, and investment in access and opportunities for children and young people, in line with the objectives of the Child Guarantee and Youth Guarantee; calls on the Commission to closely monitor Member States' investment in this area via the Semester cycle and the national reform programmes in line with the RRF, while involving Parliament, the social partners and civil society organisations in the monitoring and evaluation of the national recovery and resilience plans;

12. Welcomes the fact that the Commission has already received its first payment requests under the RRF; urges the Commission to ensure the fast deployment of payments and to closely monitor the implementation of reforms and investments; notes that regions that were already lagging behind in their development before the outbreak of the pandemic are at risk of suffering from an even greater development gap in employment, educational attainment, business support, green transition and digitalisation, mobility or other key policy areas; highlights that measures to enhance the civil service also reduce regulatory and administrative burdens, improve public procurement procedures and contribute to the effectiveness of public administration; invites the Commission to actively support local and regional authorities that have experienced problems absorbing EU funds in the past in addressing these problems, so that the NRRPs can be successfully implemented across the EU;
13. Stresses that Member States should ensure complementarity between the RRF, the European Social Fund Plus and other relevant EU programmes; calls for coordination with the other programmes funded by the NextGenerationEU recovery package (e.g. Recovery Assistance for Cohesion and the Territories of Europe (REACT-EU)) and for alignment between existing and new programmes funded by NextGenerationEU concerning ambitions for a green and digital transition and effective implementation by local and regional authorities of the recovery programmes; calls for clear coordination between NRRPs and European Structural and Investment Funds (ESIF) programmes; calls for the synergies between NRRPs and ESIF programmes to be included as part of the Commission's annual reports on the implementation of the RRF and to be subject to scrutiny by Parliament;
14. Urges the Commission to verify that the social partners were properly consulted by Member States during the drafting of the NRRPs, in accordance with national rules and practices; urges the Commission to verify the proper implementation of the social objectives of the country-specific recommendations in the NRRPs, so as to mitigate the employment impact of the crisis and ensure the social protection of workers, in particular workers in non-standard forms of employment;
15. Calls on the Commission to use the social component of the RRF to promote entrepreneurship and talent, focusing especially on young people, as a means of developing the single market;
16. Reminds the Commission that the rule of law conditionality mechanism is an essential component of the RRF; calls on the Commission to refrain from approving the NRRPs of Member States as long as concerns regarding the observance of the rule of law and the prevention and detection of and fight against fraud, conflicts of interest and

corruption persist in those countries, and to ensure that all the measures set out in their plans comply with the EU values enshrined in Article 2 of the Treaty on European Union;

17. Notes the steps taken by the Commission in order to ensure full transparency in implementing of the RRF, such as making the operational arrangements concluded with the Member States available on the dedicated RRF website; reiterates the obligation to regularly update Parliament on the progress of the RRF and the implementation of the NRRPs, given its role in scrutinising the implementation of the RRF; reiterates the importance of the Recovery and Resilience Scoreboard as a performance-reporting tool to monitor the implementation of the RRF generally as well as Member States' individual recovery and resilience plans and to enhance transparency for the general public; asks the Commission to update the monitoring of the implementation of the six pillars, to ensure that granular data is made available in the RRF scoreboard and to properly reflect the role of local and regional authorities; urges the Member States to provide detailed information to the Commission in order to ensure the effective reporting of the impact of the RRF; calls on the Commission to better reflect the tracking of the implementation of the 20 principles of the European Pillar of Social Rights through complementary social indicators included in the thematic analysis of the scoreboard;
18. Stresses the importance of mainstreaming gender equality and equal opportunities for all throughout the implementation of NRRPs; notes that many NRRPs include explanations of how they address gender-related concerns; observes that some NRRPs contain measures focusing on the participation of women in the labour market and the reduction of the gender pay gap; notes, however, that the extent to which such measures are covered varies greatly and could be improved for a number of Member States; notes that the delegated act on social expenditure and on the resilience scoreboard will not be sufficient to track and to report on the gender dimension and impacts of the RRF; calls on the Commission to consider coming forward with complementary gender indicators, notably with a view to tracking the gender impacts of the NRRPs;
19. Points out that there is a need for strong parliamentary oversight of the Commission and governments during the process; deplores the fact that national parliaments, regions and local authorities, as well as civil society organisations, including youth organisations, have had limited involvement in designing national plans; regrets the fact that the RRF Regulation does not contain a formal assessment criterion when it comes to the involvement of local and regional authorities, social partners, civil society organisations, youth organisations and other relevant stakeholders and how their input is reflected; recalls that stakeholders are at the forefront of local NRRP implementation and asks the Commission and the Member States to ensure that they are properly and deeply involved in the implementation of the plans in accordance with their national legal frameworks, and that there is effective coordination between the relevant levels of government;
20. Reiterates the importance of successful implementation by the Member States in order to ensure the long-term impact on the EU's economy and society; urges the Commission to explore how the lessons learned from the creation and implementation of the RRF could be used in the review of the EU's macro-economic governance

framework, in particular with regard to establishing a more transparent and democratic coordination process and better cooperation between the European institutions, as well as with national governments and stakeholders; considers that the RRF could serve as a model for an instrument that is made available in crises of similar severity, and that can be accessed more quickly; stresses, however, that the weaknesses of the RRF should be corrected in the new instrument, including by setting more ambitious social goals and firmly establishing the sustainable development of prosperity and wellbeing;

21. Underlines that the RRF aims to contribute to the implementation of the European Pillar of Social Rights, introducing better policies for the next generation; considers that clear methodologies for displaying progress on the implementation of the recovery and resilience plans are crucial regarding in order for the delegated acts on the Recovery and Resilience Scoreboard and on social expenditure to comply and be in line with the aims of the Regulation;
22. Is pleased to note that several Member States provide data at regional level and invites the other Member States to provide data at regional level; calls on the Commission to update its monitoring of the implementation of the six pillars and to ensure that granular data is made available in the RRF scoreboard and that the European Parliament is regularly updated, to continue and enhance its role in scrutinising the implementation of the RRF;
23. Welcomes the share of RRF social expenditure under the four social categories of employment and skills (20.4 %), education and childcare (33 %), health and long-term care (32 %) and social policies (14.6 %) for the NRRPs endorsed thus far; calls on Member States to ensure ambitious social objectives in their investments and reforms;
24. Underlines that the social expenditure methodology must follow the structure of the European Pillar of Social Rights and analyse the contribution to each one of the 20 principles; stresses that common indicators must include indicators reflecting all the social areas included in the RRF that allow an assessment of its performance; calls on the Commission to come forward with complementary social indicators tracking notably the implementation of the 20 principles of the European Pillar of Social Rights through the NRRPs;
25. Calls on the Commission and the Member States to speed up the implementation of energy resilience projects and to identify sustainable solutions to mitigate the impact of rising energy prices on the population;
26. Concludes that the design and implementation of the RRF offer important lessons and can serve as inspiration for reforming the European Semester; calls on the Commission to effectively integrate the social dimension into the Semester process;
27. Recalls that respect for the rule of law is an essential precondition for compliance with the principles of sound financial management and that RRF funds are subject to the Conditionality Regulation¹².

¹² Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2020/2092 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 December 2020 on a general regime of conditionality for the protection of the Union budget. OJ L 433I , 22.12.2020, p. 1.

INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

Date adopted	28.4.2022
Result of final vote	<div style="display: flex; justify-content: flex-end; align-items: center;"> <div style="text-align: right; padding-right: 10px;">+:</div> <div>27</div> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: flex-end; align-items: center;"> <div style="text-align: right; padding-right: 10px;">-:</div> <div>17</div> </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: flex-end; align-items: center;"> <div style="text-align: right; padding-right: 10px;">0:</div> <div>10</div> </div>
Members present for the final vote	<p>Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Dominique Bilde, Gabriele Bischoff, Vilija Blinkevičiūtė, Milan Brglez, Sylvie Brunet, Jordi Cañas, David Casa, Ilan De Basso, Margarita de la Pisa Carrión, Özlem Demirel, Klára Dobrev, Jarosław Duda, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Lucia Ďuriš Nicholsonová, Rosa Estaràs Ferragut, Nicolaus Fest, Loucas Fourlas, Cindy Franssen, Helmut Geuking, Elisabetta Gualmini, Alicia Homs Ginel, France Jamet, Agnes Jongerius, Radan Kanev, Ādām Kósa, Stelios Kympouropoulos, Miriam Lexmann, Elena Lizzi, Sara Matthieu, Giuseppe Milazzo, Sandra Pereira, Kira Marie Peter-Hansen, Dragoş Pişlaru, Manuel Pizarro, Dennis Radtke, Guido Reil, Daniela Rondinelli, Mounir Satouri, Monica Semedo, Michal Šimečka, Beata Szydło, Eugen Tomac, Romana Tomc, Marie-Pierre Vedrenne, Marianne Vind, Maria Walsh, Stefania Zambelli, Tomáš Zdechovský</p>
Substitutes present for the final vote	<p>Alex Agius Saliba, Konstantinos Arvanitis, Romeo Franz, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop, Veronika Vrecionová</p>

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

27	+
NI	Daniela Rondinelli
PPE	Loucas Fourlas, Cindy Franssen, Stelios Kypouropoulos, Maria Walsh
Renew	Atidzhe Alieva-Veli, Sylvie Brunet, Jordi Cañas, Dragoş Pîslaru, Monica Semedo, Marie-Pierre Vedrenne, Lucia Ďuriš Nicholsonová, Michal Šimečka
S&D	Alex Agius Saliba, Gabriele Bischoff, Vilija Blinkevičiūtė, Milan Brglez, Ilan De Basso, Klára Dobrev, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Elisabetta Gualmini, Alicia Homs Ginel, Agnes Jongerius, Manuel Pizarro, Marianne Vind
The Left	Konstantinos Arvanitis, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop

17	-
ECR	Giuseppe Milazzo, Beata Szydło, Veronika Vrecionová, Margarita de la Pisa Carrión
ID	Dominique Bilde, Nicolaus Fest, France Jamet, Guido Reil
PPE	David Casa, Jarosław Duda, Rosa Estaràs Ferragut, Helmut Geuking, Radan Kanev, Dennis Radtke, Eugen Tomac, Romana Tomc, Tomáš Zdechovský

10	0
ID	Elena Lizzi, Stefania Zambelli
NI	Ádám Kósa
PPE	Miriam Lexmann
The Left	Özlem Demirel, Sandra Pereira
Verts/ALE	Romeo Franz, Sara Matthieu, Kira Marie Peter-Hansen, Mounir Satouri

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention