



2022/0212(BUD)

8.9.2022

OPINION

of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

for the Committee on Budgets

on the draft general budget of the European Union for the financial year 2023
(2022/0212(BUD))

Rapporteur for opinion: Dragoș Pîslaru

PA_NonLeg

SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Employment and Social Affairs calls on the Committee on Budgets, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

- A. whereas the crisis resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic and the war in Ukraine will have a serious impact on the social and economic situation in the Union, inter alia on the Union labour markets and living conditions and risks negatively impacting growth and employment;
 - B. whereas increasing inflation and, in particular, rapid increases in food and energy prices across the Union are affecting the most vulnerable, further increasing inequality, and aggravating poverty and energy poverty; whereas wages are not projected to increase as fast as inflation and therefore workers are losing purchasing power and might see their living conditions worsen in the next few months; whereas that will also exert greater pressure on social policy capacity, as well as on automatic stabilisers such as national unemployment schemes; whereas the European instrument for temporary support to mitigate unemployment risks in an emergency (SURE) adopted by the Commission was a success;
 - C. whereas the European Pillar of Social Rights (EPSR) Action Plan set a target for the Union to reduce the number of people at risk of poverty or social exclusion by at least 15 million, including at least 5 million children, and adopted a series of proposals in order to reach that goal by 2030; whereas in the current context, reaching the target is becoming more challenging, given the projected increase in poverty and unemployment in the months to come; whereas social protection systems are under severe pressure to mitigate the social impact of the crisis, to give support to refugees and to ensure decent living conditions for all, as well as access to quality essential services such as health, education and housing;
1. Stresses that the social and economic consequences of the Russian invasion of Ukraine, the high inflation, and more generally the uncertain economic outlook are affecting the post-pandemic economic recovery of the Union and require a strong response, particularly for the young generation, families, workers and businesses, especially SMEs; highlights in that regard the crucial role of the annual Union budget for 2023 and in particular the Union funds and financial instruments in the social and employment area, including the NextGenerationEU (NGEU) with the Recovery and Resilience Facility (RRF), to ensure an economically and socially sustainable, just, inclusive and non-discriminatory recovery; points out that the European Social Fund Plus (ESF+) is the key driver for strengthening the social dimension of the Union and the main instrument for investing in people, promoting high employment levels, building social protection and developing a skilled and resilient workforce ready for the transition to a green and digital economy in line with the principles of the European Pillar of Social Rights; highlights as well the importance of the European Globalisation Adjustment Fund for Displaced Workers (EGF), the Just Transition Fund (JTF), ReactEU with its additional resources for ESF+, the Youth Employment Initiative (YEI) and the Fund for European Aid to the Most Deprived (FEAD);

2. Supports all efforts in welcoming people fleeing the war in Ukraine, regardless of their origin or nationality; welcomes the triggering of the Temporary Protection Directive (TPD) and the Cohesion's action for refugees in Europe (CARE) with regard to persons fleeing the war and seeking refuge on the Union territory, and calls for continuing funding for its implementation; calls on the Commission to carefully monitor the implementation of the TPD by Member States and to provide the relevant guidance to facilitate that implementation; is concerned with existing forms of discrimination and exploitation, and unequal treatment in terms of wages and working conditions affecting refugees in many Member States ; highlights the socio-economic and infrastructural challenges faced by Member States hosting persons fleeing the war in Ukraine – particularly those bordering Ukraine and experiencing the biggest influx of such persons;
3. Appreciates the current measures put in place by the Union and Member States to address the disruption coming from the war in Ukraine and to help integrate refugees and alleviate the impact of energy prices on businesses and households, but believes that additional efforts are needed to prevent unemployment and underemployment coming from the effects of the war, by refinancing and prolonging SURE to support employment support measures in the Member States; calls in this regard to reinforce measures for income protection, fight against poverty, just transition and to help alleviate the impact of high levels of inflation on the poorer workers and households over the next couple of years by reactivating and expanding the scope of SURE to support short time work schemes and workers that would be temporarily laid-off; calls also to introduce a permanent instrument in form of a European Unemployment Reinsurance Scheme to protect employment and fight against unemployment, including the preservation of jobs and workers' income in situations of external shocks;
4. Regrets that budgetary tracking of social impacts is very undeveloped in order to measure the objectives in the Action Plan to implement the Social Pillar; recalls that the European Semester was identified as the vehicle to monitor the developments at Union and Member State level via the Social Scoreboard; welcomes the enriched Social Scoreboard after the 2021 Social Summit in Porto which serves as a reference framework to monitor “social progress” and aims to detect the most significant employment and social challenges facing the Member States, the Union and the euro area, as well as progress achieved over time;
5. Is of the opinion that monetary support, given all uncertainties related to the war in Ukraine, to the COVID developments, to inflation, to industrial restructuring and the ecological transition, will still be strongly needed in the months to come;
6. Recalls that ESF+ is expected to contribute to the implementation of the EPSR Action Plan and to the relevant country specific recommendations adopted in the framework of the Semester; reminds that programs and their envelopes should be respected and calls for fresh money for new tasks; is concerned about the very limited margins available under the MFF and insist for the need to enhance spending to speed up the implementation of the EPSR Action Plan;
7. Highlights that the Union budget must help Member States foster a just transition, social and economic justice and resilience, create quality employment and decent working conditions, with adequate wages and social security protection, high occupational health

and safety standards and gender-balanced opportunities, eradicate poverty, reduce inequalities, especially affecting children and increase upward socio-economic convergence, particularly in a time of unprecedented and cumulated crises so that no one is left behind; stresses that factors such as supply chain disruption, including in the food supply, high energy prices, rising inflation and continued pressure on essential services have exacerbated social and economic inequalities and worsened the living and working conditions, as well as the mental health and well-being of many workers and their families, and will put the Union economy at risk in many sectors, with consequences in terms of unemployment, reduction of purchasing power of households and workers, drop into poverty and social inequalities affecting the most vulnerable populations of our societies; insists on the need to tackle territorial and regional disparities and to increase support to the most vulnerable, deprived and disadvantaged groups; takes note of the Commission's intention to come up with an amending letter this autumn with regards to the budgetary consequences of the war in Ukraine and the RePowerEU initiative; stresses in that regard the importance of taking into account the socio-economic implications of the war and recommends that the potential of supplementing ESF+ funding be analysed;

8. Calls for a temporary European social resilience package coordinating a set of measures and means to strengthen social welfare and social protection systems in the Union, including the continuation and refinancing of SURE as long as the socio-economic consequences of the war continue to have a negative impact on the labour market, and the creation of a new Union fund for social emergencies (a 'social rescue facility'), for crises situations of a different nature, which are becoming increasingly multi-faceted, hybrid and complex;
9. Welcomes the creation of the CARE and CARE + initiatives; considers that the Union should first use existing financial resources to mitigate the consequences of the war and address the immediate needs of Ukrainian displaced persons; underlines, in that respect, the need to fully use the flexibility provisions to disburse available Union funds as soon as possible; calls on the Commission to make it possible for Member States to use financial resources from unrequested RRF loans to cover the negative economic and social costs resulting from the war;
10. Calls on both the Commission and Member States to ensure that RePowerEU is deployed as quickly as possible and targeted to people, businesses and industries who are disproportionately affected by growing energy prices;
11. Believes that addressing social gaps with the Union and governments' budgets through social investment in key policy areas improving the living and working conditions for people affected by the high inflation, the war in Ukraine, the health crisis or by transition of the accelerating green and digital transformations should be at the heart of the recovery strategy of the Union; to this end, considers that detecting social risks and taking into account the divergent employment effects and long-term unemployment across particular industries should be adequately addressed; calls therefore on the Commission to present a Sustainable Development Goal expenditure and tracking methodology for the social expenditure in the Union budget based on the principles of the EPSR and a Social Scoreboard and well-being indicators to measure the overall impact of different funds, instruments and facilities financed under the MFF and the NGEU;

12. Highlights the need to ensure that the “do no significant harm” (DNSH) principle is mainstreamed in all Union's activities through the budgetary implementation as agreed in the IIA and welcomes the Commission proposal for amending the Financial Regulation to include DNSH in the regulation in line with the Union’s commitment to sustainable financing and the green transition; calls on the Commission to monitor the proper implementation of the DNSH principle and to take immediate corrective measures if and when needed;
13. Highlights that the COVID-19 pandemic continues to create uncertainties and that it is therefore important to continue supporting the recovery and addressing the social and employment-related challenges resulting from the pandemic, as well as supporting workers and businesses in the move towards a more solidarity-based digital, greener and climate neutral economy; stresses the importance of adequate policies and measures to support just labour market transition, to strengthen the competitiveness of our economies, as well as to invest in social inclusion and further develop resilient and sustainable social protection systems across the Union, not least by supporting measures for children, young and older people ; insists on the need for the creation of decent and sustainable quality jobs, up- and reskilling, and life-long learning policies for workers, to strengthen education and training programmes that keep up with the demands of a modern labour market; insists on the need to invest in social infrastructures to address the demographic challenge, and for unemployment prevention mechanisms and professional reconversion tools to be made available to workers in order to sustainably support the green and digital transition and in order to achieve the objectives of the Action Plan adopted in Porto; in that regard, highlights the need to fully implement the Just Transition Mechanism and to swiftly adopt the Social Climate Fund; insists on adequate housing as a human right and the need to have access to decent and affordable housing for all; calls on the Commission to ensure sufficient funding for the European Platform on Combatting Homelessness in order to achieve the objective of ending homelessness by 2030; recalls that the integration into the labour market of those who are able to work and of the most vulnerable groups, such as people in poverty or at risk of poverty and social exclusion, people with disabilities, young and older people, Roma people, the (long-term) unemployed, migrants, refugees and people displaced from Ukraine, as well as migrants and refugees affected by different conflicts in the world, is paramount; highlights that investing in employment and quality services in rural areas is key to combatting territorial inequalities and addressing demographic trends in those areas;
14. Underlines the link between socio-economic factors such as unemployment, housing insecurity, academic pressures and mental health and well-being and insist that they must be addressed to ensure a holist approach towards mental health at the Union level; calls on Member States to make mental health an integral part of the Union recovery from the COVID-19 pandemic and from the current inflation situation; notes with concern the worsening of conditions for many young people already suffering from long-term unemployment and employment uncertainty and social exclusion, and calls for a coordinated approach in creating and offering them opportunities for social inclusion in the framework of the reinforced Youth Guarantee, ESF+ and the RRF;
15. Is concerned that wages have been on a decreasing trend and that real wages are currently falling following a series of exceptional energy price shocks; considers that there is an urgent need for wage increases, in order to sustain internal demand and inclusive growth,

and to reduce the impact of the double crisis on workers and households and that additional efforts are required to help social partners in delivering wage increases through tripartite capacity building frameworks, thus anticipating the expected positive impact of the Directive on Adequate Minimum Wages;

16. Takes note of the Commission proposal to allocate EUR 16,7129 billion in 2023 to ESF+ to support Member State policies to ensure equal opportunities, equal access to the labour market, fair and quality working conditions, social protection and inclusion, in particular focussing on quality and inclusive education and training, lifelong learning, investment in children and young people and access to basic services but expresses general concerns with the significantly reduced margin for heading 2a and 2b, which will reduce the flexibility to react in a time of rising inflation, uncertain socio-economic situation as a consequence of the war in Ukraine and the ongoing health crisis; insists that ESF+ must continue playing a key role in supporting Member States, people and regions to achieve high employment levels that ensure adequate wages, decent working conditions, healthy work environments and social security coverage, fair social protection and a skilled, competitive and resilient workforce ready for the transition to a green and digital economy and for the future world of work, as well as inclusive and cohesive societies aiming to eradicating poverty and delivering on the principles set out in the EPSR; calls therefore for a reinforced ESF+ supplemented by a social rescue facility with increased public support for existing instruments aimed at the poorest in our society;
17. Notes that the ESF+ was adopted before the current crisis situation, which currently implies higher public and social investment than planned so far and that the current financial programming risks not meeting the existing needs;
18. Recognises that ESF + and the RRF must contribute to the implementation of the EPSR by putting its principles into practice and mainstreaming social objectives in all relevant legislation, policies and implementing plans linked to the NGEU; stresses that adequate resources should be allocated to fund and implement the EPSR Action Plan adopted in Porto and to achieve the Porto headline targets and that the RRF should be made permanent and include a minimum 30 % of the funds to be social investment strengthening social welfare systems and investing in social security, access to healthcare and education, affordable housing, employment, justice and social services for vulnerable groups; calls in this regard on the Commission to ensure adequate staffing to support this task; believes that the Porto poverty targets should be detailed better in all national recovery and resilience plans and at Union level with an action plan and a strong anti-poverty strategy supported by substantial investments that addresses all aspects of poverty, including in-work poverty;
19. Stresses the need for policymakers at both Union and national level to prioritise combating youth unemployment, in particular as part of the European recovery effort, and to facilitate and support young people (re-) entering and remaining in the labour market, accessing good quality housing, and completing their educational trajectory and developing skills, including digital and green economy skills and to make full use of existing initiatives, such as the Youth Guarantee; recalls the obligation by Member States with a higher share than the Union average of young people between 15 to 29 years who are not in employment, education or training to allocate at least 12,5 % of their ESF+ resources to implement the Reinforced Youth Guarantee and calls on all Member States,

not only those most affected by youth unemployment, to continue to invest sufficient ESF+ resources in measures to support youth employment; calls on the Member States to make the best use of the Employment and Social Innovation strand (EaSI) of ESF+ for investment in social innovation, and for stimulating labour mobility; regrets the late start of EaSI in 2021 and the reduced budget for 2023 as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic and other issues, and highlights the need to catch up and reach its full working regime in 2024, not least to fully and effectively implement the measures foreseen in the Union Action Plan for Social Economy; stresses the importance of following up the European Year of Youth 2022 with concrete actions and policies proposed by young people for social inclusion, housing, and to combat precariousness, and low wages and the violation of the right to decent housing, and to protect workers' rights, as well as to further develop employment and entrepreneurship measures for young people, beyond 2023 and supported by adequate funding; recalls that the Commission should report on a regular basis on the implementation of the Council recommendations establishing a European Child Guarantee and reinforcing a Youth Guarantee;

20. Deplores the fact that more than a quarter of all children in the Union are in or at risk of poverty or social exclusion; stresses that, in the context of the war in Ukraine, tackling child poverty will become even more important in the coming years; welcomes, in that regard, the creation of the European Child Guarantee and calls for the Commission to provide an analysis on the contribution of the each national operational programme to the European Child Guarantee; calls on the Commission and the Member States to pay particular attention to the implementation of the European Child Guarantee towards ensuring access to free quality services for children in need, especially those fleeing Ukraine so that they are on an equal footing with their Union national peers in the hosting countries; repeats its calls to urgently increase the funding of the European Child Guarantee with a dedicated budget of at least EUR 20 billion; recalls in this regard the Parliament position that all Member States, not only those most affected by child poverty, should allocate at least 5 % of the ESF+ resources under shared management to support activities under the European Child Guarantee; moreover calls on the Commission to make available - and on the Member States to make full use of - all available resources for the effective implementation of the Child Guarantee including, inter alia, the ESF+, ReactEU, and the RRF;
21. Warns of the impact of the ongoing war on global food supply chains and food prices, and the consequences for the purchasing power; in light of the increase of food prices, highlights the adopted increased minimum allocation towards social inclusion measures in the new ESF+ as well the 3 % on top of those for measures within FEAD and encourages Member States to allocate more than the minimum amounts required in line with ESF+;
22. Recalls that the current crises severely impact older people too and stresses the lack of policy responses to the impact of demographic change in the Union, such as the lack of adequate and affordable housing, quality care facilities and sufficient care and support services; stresses that the budget should underline the importance of safeguarding and promoting the dignity of the older persons and their fundamental rights in the Union by introducing an “ageing-in-dignity” criteria and sufficient funding to support investment in housing in order to tackle effectively the growing problems of a lack of affordable housing, poor housing conditions, housing exclusion and homelessness;

23. Reiterates that women are more widely affected by the current crises and war in Ukraine and are more at risk of suffering the employment and social fallout; stresses that the employment headline target adopted in Porto can only be achieved by adopting ambitious targets at national level to include women in the labour market, including refugees, by creating incentives, infrastructures and removing barriers and discriminations; calls for a mainstreaming of gender responsive budget to better align policies and activities that promote the equal participation of women in the labour market and to have comprehensive systems to monitor and measure gender budget allocations, women participation in the labour market, access to employment, pay and pension gaps;
24. Recalls the importance of the EGF to demonstrate solidarity with and provide reactive assistance to displaced workers or self-employed persons, whose activity has ceased due to major restructuring events, to support them in returning to decent and sustainable employment, in particular those affected by globalisation, important changes in world trade patterns, trade disputes, significant changes in trade relations of the Union or the composition of the internal market and financial or economic crises, as well as the transition to a low-carbon economy or as a consequence of digitisation or automation; takes note that the level of EGF commitment appropriations in reserve for 2023 is set at EUR 205,3 million (approximately +1 % compared to 2022 and corresponding to the maximum MFF amount);
25. Calls for the establishment of a programme to promote awareness-raising campaigns on the importance of trade unions, unionising and collective bargaining and agreements with a view to achieving a fairer society by improving working conditions, wages and living conditions, among other means;
26. Recalls that the JTF provides support for territories and people facing socio-economic and employment challenges deriving from the transition process towards a climate neutral economy of the Union by 2050; takes note of the Commission appropriations in 2023 of EUR 1,4662 billion; highlights its importance for addressing the social aspects of the transition, in particular support to jobseekers, including job search assistance, upskilling and reskilling and their active inclusion into the labour market as well as investments in smart and sustainable mobility, other activities in the areas of education and social inclusion, including investments in social infrastructure for the purposes of training centres, child- and elderly-care facilities and the possibility to support investments in large enterprises in 'assisted areas' pursuant to regional State aid guidelines, if such support is necessary for job creation in the identified territory;
27. Strongly supports cohesion funding as the prime funding instrument of the Union budget that enables economic, social and territorial cohesion, and one of the cornerstones of the recovery; highlights its role in reaching Union strategic objectives such as employment, fight against poverty, gender equality, climate neutral economy, and innovation, and as a driving force of a more inclusive and sustainable Union; highlights that the regional policy must play a key role in boosting equal job opportunities among all genders and supporting the reskilling of workers by providing adequate life-long training;
28. Recalls that the Porto Declaration of 7 of May 2021 set the target to reduce the number of people at risk of poverty or social exclusion by at least 15 million by 2030; welcomes that FEAD was integrated in ESF+ and that, in 2023, at least 3 % of the ESF+ budget

shall be spent on food aid and basic material assistance for the most deprived persons; welcomes the Commission assessment that the ESF+ should also contribute to the eradication of poverty by supporting relevant national schemes and that a minimum of 4 % of its resources under shared management shall support the most deprived persons, including refugees;

29. Calls on the European Commission to ensure that the Union budget, including the RRF, is socially inclusive and that gender and disability are mainstreamed in the 2023 general budget, not least by providing a monitoring system tracking the budgetary allocations which promote the equal participation and independent living of women and people with disabilities in line with the Union's commitments under the European Gender Equality and Disability Rights Strategies and the UNCRPD;
30. Recalls that pilot projects (PPs) and preparatory actions (PAs) are essential to test new policy initiatives in the fields of employment and social inclusion, including through data collection; recalls that their assessment is anchored in the Interinstitutional agreement and repeats its call on the Commission to evaluate PP/PA proposals impartially on the basis of a legal and financial assessment, so that the grades reflect the merit of the proposals; expresses its disappointment over the poor and unclear assessment of the proposals for the budget 2023 and asks the Commission to receive precise and detailed explanations of these assessments, together with concrete examples of the Union actions that are considered to 'cover' the proposals; also recalls that the implementation of an adopted PP/PA must remain faithful to the adopted proposal;
31. Recalls that the Union agencies play an important role in providing Union institutions and countries with specialised knowledge notably on employment and social issues and that they must be given the necessary resources to fulfil their tasks which are evolving; takes note that the 2023 budgetary estimates for agencies are in line with the budget programming; welcomes that the steep increase in the Irish coefficient corrector for Eurofound is at least partly compensated; recalls the need to ensure an adequate allocation of funds for the European Labour Authority (ELA), which is crucial to ensure stability and full delivery of its mandate, including by providing adequate and permanent staffing and for attracting the best qualified candidates for the posts; recognises that ELA should have the necessary resources to support and strengthen the capacity of national labour inspectorates and authorities, as well as social partners, in order to contribute to fair labour mobility and tackle cross-border fraud and abuses;
32. Regrets the decrease in the allocation for the Budget line 07 20 04 06 (Specific competences in the area of social policy, including social dialogue); recalls that strong social dialogue is a key feature of the European Social model and the commitment of the Union to promote the role of social partners and to facilitate social dialogue, in line with Article 152 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union; stresses the need to ensure adequate support for social dialogue and to develop and improve the capacity of social partners and to increase the allocation for this budget line, as well as to guarantee adequate support for information and training measures for workers' organisations, taking also into account the impact of inflation on staff expenditure in the budgets of the trade union institutes;
33. Considers it essential to protect and promote the principle of multilingualism, which helps

to foster democratic participation and transparency; calls, in this regard, for an adequate increase in funding for the Union institutions' interpreting and translation services, including those of the European Parliament and the European Commission;

34. Calls for decent working conditions and fair pay for crèche, cleaning and catering workers to be guaranteed at the Union institutions, including the European Parliament; calls strongly, in this regard, for those services and their workers to be brought in-house;
35. Recalls the importance of budgetary accountability and prioritisation; underlines that the flexibility available under the current 2021-2027 multiannual financial framework (MFF) is not sufficient to fully cover the financial needs generated by the war in Ukraine and the COVID-19 pandemic; recalls that these instruments were neither designed nor conceived in terms of size to address the new challenges and future crisis situations while simultaneously maintain investments in the Union's programmes and policies, including important priorities like the just, green and digital transitions; stresses the importance of increased flexibility and sufficient resources to respond to major crises and their social and labour market implications, while recalling that inflation puts a great pressure on the ceilings in the MFF leaving no margins available to tackle the biggest challenges in the annual budgetary procedure, calls on the Commission to conduct an in-depth analysis of the different implications of the current challenges on the whole MFF 2021-2027, and to carry out an urgent and comprehensive revision of the current MFF as soon as possible and no later than the first quarter of 2023 in order to provide additional flexibility needs in the Union budget, including the full use of decommitments, to respond to unforeseen and urgent needs; expects such a vision to take into account the long-term implications of the war in Ukraine and the emergency measures taken;
36. Recalls that currently, the only tracking methodology is the Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2021/2105 which defines the methodology for reporting social expenditure, however, this cannot be considered mainstreaming the Social Pillar in the RRF, as it is rather a reporting of the spending under the RRF using macro categories that cannot be linked to any social objectives; calls on the Commission to introduce in the upcoming MFF a methodology for social mainstreaming the expenditure programme on social objectives; such methodology should be a tracking system of how specific actions contribute to a given policy priority and provide the possibility to count and aggregate expenditure at the level of the Union budget and monitor progress;
37. Welcomes the gender budgeting classification undertaken by the Commission and expresses the need to work further on the analysis of the 0* programs as well as the methodology to track the implementation of the third gender action plan; reminds that women have been particularly negatively affected by the economic and social crisis stemming from the COVID-19 pandemic, including the growth of the cases of gender-based violence; requests in this regards increased funding for the Daphne Programme; highlights that gender mainstreaming and gender equality is a key building stone for allowing Europe to reach its full potential; underlines the important role played by the European Institute for Gender Equality and the need to ensure adequate funding and staff for its tasks;
38. Calls for the implementation of gender budgeting by assigning budget allocations taking into account a gender-responsive evaluation of the previous budgetary period and

ensuring equal participation in the budgetary process; stresses that gender budgeting also requires linking the budget to gender equality objectives , tracing spending on gender equality and ensuring a gender-sensitive review of the programmes and spending to adjust them in the following period.

INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

| | |
|---|--|
| Date adopted | 8.9.2022 |
| Result of final vote | +: 34 -: 5 0: 2 |
| Members present for the final vote | Gabriele Bischoff, Milan Brglez, Jordi Cañas, David Casa, Ilan De Basso, Margarita de la Pisa Carrión, Jarosław Duda, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Cindy Franssen, Helmut Geuking, Alicia Homs Ginel, Agnes Jongerius, Radan Kanev, Stelios Kypourouropoulos, Katrin Langensiepen, Miriam Lexmann, Elena Lizzi, Sandra Pereira, Dragoş Pişlaru, Dennis Radtke, Elżbieta Rafalska, Guido Reil, Mounir Satouri, Eugen Tomac, Romana Tomc, Tomáš Zdechovský |
| Substitutes present for the final vote | Alex Agius Saliba, Konstantinos Arvanitis, Carmen Avram, Rosa D'Amato, Lina Gálvez Muñoz, Pierfrancesco Majorino, Alin Mituța, Samira Rafaela, Eugenia Rodríguez Palop, Birgit Sippel, Véronique Trillet-Lenoir, Marie-Pierre Vedrenne |
| Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote | Pietro Bartolo, Morten Løkkegaard, João Pimenta Lopes |

FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

| 34 | + |
|-----------|--|
| PPE | David Casa, Jarosław Duda, Cindy Franssen, Helmut Geuking, Radan Kanev, Stelios Kypourouopoulos, Miriam Lexmann, Dennis Radtke, Eugen Tomac, Romana Tomc, Tomáš Zdechovský |
| RENEW | Jordi Cañas, Morten Løkkegaard, Alin Mituța, Dragoș Pîslaru, Samira Rafaela, Véronique Trillet-Lenoir, Marie-Pierre Vedrenne |
| S&D | Alex Agius Saliba, Carmen Avram, Pietro Bartolo, Gabriele Bischoff, Milan Brglez, Ilan De Basso, Estrella Durá Ferrandis, Lina Gálvez Muñoz, Alicia Homs Ginel, Agnes Jongerius, Pierfrancesco Majorino, Birgit Sippel |
| THE LEFT | Eugenia Rodríguez Palop |
| VERTS/ALE | Rosa D'Amato, Katrin Langensiepen, Mounir Satouri |

| 5 | - |
|----------|--|
| ECR | Margarita de la Pisa Carrión |
| ID | Guido Reil |
| THE LEFT | Konstantinos Arvanitis, Sandra Pereira, João Pimenta Lopes |

| 2 | 0 |
|-----|-------------------|
| ECR | Elżbieta Rafalska |
| ID | Elena Lizzi |

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention