# EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2004



2009

Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality

2005/0187(CNS)

22.3.2006

## OPINION

of the Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality

for the Committee on Industry, Research and Energy

on the proposal for a Council decision concerning the specific programme "People" implementing the 7th Framework Programme (2007-2013) of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities (COM(2005)0442 – C6-0383/2005 – 2005/0187(CNS))

Draftswoman: Amalia Sartori

## SHORT JUSTIFICATION

The European Community's Seventh Framework Programme (2007-2013) for research, technological development and demonstration activities is part of an integrated human resources strategy for research and development in the European Union.

With regard to the principle of equality between women and men, in this opinion the European Parliament's Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality draws attention to the underused potential of women in scientific disciplines and calls for more specific measures to promote their participation. In most EU Member States, the number of women graduates is proportionally higher than for men. Despite this success in terms of education, the labour market in the scientific field is still dominated by men, while women are in a minority in the sciences and in decision-making bodies concerned with scientific issues. The framework programme should therefore encourage more people to study science, above all by persuading women to go into science and technology, and should foster the participation of women on an equal footing in all scientific disciplines and at all levels.

Consequently, the research activities carried out under this programme should respect fundamental ethical principles, including those enshrined in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, for instance the right to the integrity of the person, equality between men and women and reconciling work and family life.

The framework programme is divided into four types of activities. One of these, entitled 'People', supports the training and career development of individual researchers. We take the view that it is of the utmost importance to ensure gender mainstreaming in the 'People' programme, for example by promoting new undertakings and innovation by women entrepreneurs; it is also vital that such initiatives should be properly reflected in the financial framework.

## AMENDMENTS

The Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality calls on the Committee on Industry, Research and Energy, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following amendments in its report: Text proposed by the Commission<sup>1</sup>

Amendments by Parliament

### Amendment 1 Recital 2

(2) The Framework Programme is structured in four types of activities: transnational cooperation on policy-defined themes ("Cooperation"), investigator-driven research based on the initiative of the research community ("Ideas"), support of training and career development of researchers ("People"), and support of research capacities ("Capacities"). Activities under "People" as regards indirect actions should be implemented by this specific programme. Does not apply to the English version - the term 'researcher' is gender neutral in English.

## Amendment 2 Recital 4

(4) The Framework Programme should complement the activities carried out in the Member States as well as other Community actions that are necessary for the overall strategic effort for the implementation of the Lisbon objectives, alongside in particular with those on structural funds, agriculture, education, training, competitiveness and innovation, industry, health, consumer protection, employment, energy, transport and environment. (4) The Framework Programme should complement the activities carried out in the Member States as well as other Community actions that are necessary for the overall strategic effort for the implementation of the Lisbon objectives, alongside in particular with those on structural funds, agriculture, education, training, *employment, equal opportunities and equal treatment,* competitiveness and innovation, industry, health, consumer protection, employment, energy, transport and environment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Not yet published in OJ.

### Justification

Equal opportunities and equal treatment are fundamental Community principles which must be implemented in the interests of achieving the Lisbon objectives, to which the framework programme should contribute.

### Amendment 3 Recital 5

(5) Innovation and SME-related activities supported under this Framework Programme should be complementary to those undertaken under the framework programme for Competitiveness and Innovation. (5) Innovation and SME-related activities supported under this Framework Programme should be complementary to those undertaken under the framework programme for Competitiveness and Innovation *and should help to support small family enterprises and SMEs run by women*.

## Justification

Difficulties in accessing appropriate forms of financing can be an obstacle to participation in research, technological development and demonstration activities, particularly for SMEs, small family enterprises and small enterprises run by women.

#### Amendment 4 Recital 7

(7) The international dimension is a fundamental component of human resources in research and development in Europe. As provided for under Article 170 of the Treaty, this specific programme is open to the participation of countries having concluded the necessary agreements to this effect, and is also open on the project level, and on the basis of mutual benefit, to the participation of entities from third countries and of international organisations for scientific cooperation. Moreover, all actions, as well as dedicated actions in this specific programme are open to participation of individual researchers from third countries. (7) The international dimension is a fundamental component of human resources in research and development in Europe. As provided for under Article 170 of the Treaty, this specific programme is open to the participation of countries having concluded the necessary agreements to this effect, and is also open on the project level, and on the basis of mutual benefit, to the participation of entities from third countries and of international organisations for scientific cooperation. Moreover, all actions, as well as dedicated actions in this specific programme are open, *without discrimination of any kind*, to participation

AD\608138EN.doc

of individual researchers from third countries. To that effect, efforts should be made to speed up mutual recognition of professional qualifications acquired in third countries.

## Justification

Participation in the programme should not be subject to any form of discrimination. Moreover, in order to attract foreign researchers it is essential to speed up the mutual recognition of qualifications acquired in third countries so as to fully utilise the human potential in research and technology in Europe and avoid hindering the free movement of researchers within the European Union.

### Amendment 5 Recital 8

(8) Research activities carried out within this programme should respect fundamental ethical principles, including those which are reflected in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union. (8) Research activities carried out within this programme should respect fundamental ethical principles, including those which are reflected in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, *such as the right to the integrity of the person, equality between men and women <u>and the possibility</u> <u>of reconciling family and professional life</u>.* 

## Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men.

### Amendment 6 Recital 9 a (new)

(9a) The Framework Programme should encourage people to study science, above all by persuading women to go into science and technology.

## Justification

It is important to take action at the different levels of research (academic study, career, etc) in order to achieve a real policy of equal access and equal opportunity in the research sector. This amendment is also in line with the new Recital 13a proposed by the draftswoman.

## Amendment 7 Recital 13

(13) In the implementation of this programme adequate attention needs to be paid to *gender mainstreaming*, as well as to, inter alia, the working conditions, transparency of recruitment processes, and career development as regards the researchers recruited on projects and programmes funded under the actions of this programme, for which the Commission Recommendation of 11 March 2005 on the European Charter for Researchers and on a Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers offers a reference framework. (13) In the implementation of this programme adequate attention needs to be paid to equal treatment and equal opportunities for men and women, equal rights, with appropriate funding, as well as to, inter alia, working conditions, particularly with a view to enabling reconciliation of work and family life, transparency and non-discrimination in recruitment processes, and career development as regards researchers recruited on projects and programmes funded under the actions of this programme, for which the Commission Recommendation of 11 March 2005 on the European Charter for Researchers and on a Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers offers a reference framework, *paying particular* attention to the needs of disabled researchers

## Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to give particular consideration to gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear, where necessary and with appropriate terminology, that the activities apply to both women and men and that this principle will have specific consequences in terms of funding. Furthermore, the disabled should enjoy equal access to all activities and special facilities should be provided for them to this end. Consideration must also be given in the implementation of the programme to the need to reconcile work and family life, as well as to respect for the principle of non-discrimination in the selection of researchers.

Amendment 8

Recital 13 a (new)

(13a) In most EU countries the number of women graduates is proportionally higher than for men. However, the labour market in science is dominated by men. The gap between women and men aged 20-24 attaining higher education was 5 percentage points in the EU 2004<sup>1</sup>. It is therefore necessary to boost the presence and women in the research sector, with gender mainstreaming except for specific reasons.

## Justification

Measures should be taken to promote the representation of women in the research sector at all levels given that in some areas it is still not possible to apply a policy of equal opportunities because of the small percentage of women.

## Amendment 9 Recital 14

(14) This programme is in conformity with and underpins the further development and implementation of the integrated strategy on human resources in research and development in Europe on the basis of the "Mobility Strategy for the ERA" and the "Researchers in the ERA: one profession, multiple careers", as well as takes into account the Council conclusions on human resources in R&D of 18 April 2005.

(14) This programme is in conformity with and underpins the further development and implementation of the integrated strategy on human resources in research and development in Europe on the basis of the "Mobility Strategy for the ERA", which, in relation to the principle of equality between men and women, draws specific attention to the underused potential of women in scientific careers in Europe, and the "Researchers in the ERA: one profession, multiple careers", as well as takes into account the Council conclusions on human resources in R&D of 18 April 2005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Report from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions on equality between women and men, 2005 (COM(2005)0044).

## Justification

This amendment seeks to focus the programme on rectifying the shortcomings identified in the Mobility Strategy for the ERA.

## Amendment 10 Article 2, subparagraph 1

The Specific Programme shall support the activities for "People", strengthening, quantitatively and qualitatively, the human potential in research and technology in Europe. The activities supporting training and career development of researchers, referred to as "Marie Curie Actions", will be reinforced with a better focus on the key aspects of skills and career development and strengthened links with national systems.

The Specific Programme shall support the activities for "People", encouraging people to take up a career as a researcher and strengthening, quantitatively and qualitatively, the human, and especially *female*, potential in research and technology in Europe, while ensuring equal access for men and women and paying special attention to the needs of disabled *researchers*. The activities supporting training and career development of researchers, referred to as "Marie Curie Actions", will be reinforced with a better focus on the key aspects of skills and career development and strengthened links with national systems.

## Amendment 11 Article 4, paragraph 1

1. All research activities carried out under the Specific Programme shall be carried out in compliance with fundamental ethical principles. 1. All research activities carried out under the Specific Programme shall be carried out in compliance with fundamental ethical principles. *Research shall receive financial support only where it is in conformity with human rights, in particular human dignity.* 

## Amendment 12 Article 4, paragraph 3, 1st indent

- research activities that are prohibited in *all* Member States - research activities that are prohibited in Member States *on the basis of fundamental* 

AD\608138EN.doc

## considerations relating to human rights and constitutional principles

## Amendment 13 Article 6, paragraph 3

3. The work programme will specify the criteria on which proposals for indirect actions under the funding schemes shall be evaluated and projects selected. The criteria will be those assessing qualitative aspects of the proposers (researchers/organisations) and their potential for further progression, including where appropriate their implementing capacity; the quality of the proposed activity in scientific training and/or transfer of knowledge terms; the Community added value and the structuring effect of the proposed activity in terms of contribution to the objectives of the specific programme and Work Programme. These criteria and any weightings and thresholds may be further specified or complemented in the work programme.

3. The work programme will specify the criteria on which proposals for indirect actions under the funding schemes shall be evaluated and projects selected. The criteria will be those assessing qualitative aspects of the proposers (researchers/organisations) and their potential for further progression, including where appropriate their implementing capacity; the quality of the proposed activity in scientific training and/or transfer of knowledge terms; the Community added value and the structuring effect of the proposed activity in terms of contribution to the objectives of the specific programme and Work Programme and the implementation of the principle of equal treatment and equal opportunities for women and men. These criteria and any weightings and thresholds may be further specified or complemented in the work programme.

## Justification

Consistent with Recital 13 of the Commission proposal using appropriate terminology.

## Amendment 14 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 1

One of the main competitive edges in science and technology is the quantity and quality of its human resources. As a prerequisite for increasing Europe's capacity and performance in research and technological development and for consolidating and further developing the European Research Area, the overall One of the main competitive edges in science and technology is the quantity and quality of its human resources. As a prerequisite for increasing Europe's capacity and performance in research and technological development and for consolidating and further developing the European Research Area, the overall

strategic aim of this programme is to make Europe more attractive to researchers. This shall be done by pursuing a considerable structuring effect throughout Europe on the organisation, performance and quality of research training, on the active career development of researchers, on knowledgesharing through researchers between sectors and research organisations, and on strong participation by women in research and development. strategic aim of this programme is to make Europe more attractive to researchers. This shall be done by pursuing a considerable structuring effect throughout Europe on the organisation, performance and quality of research training, on knowledge-sharing through researchers between sectors and research organisations, *on the active career development of researchers, with particular reference to* participation by women in research and development *while promoting the reconciliation of work and family life*.

### Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men. In addition, efforts should be made to create the conditions that will enable women to play a more active part in the world of research, while enjoying scope for reconciling work and family life.

## Amendment 15 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 2

The programme will be implemented by systematic investments in people, mainly through a coherent set of 'Marie Curie Actions', addressing researchers in terms of their skills and competence development at all stages of their careers, from initial research training to career development and life-long training. Mobility, both transnational and intersectoral, recognition of experiences acquired in different sectors and countries, and adequate working conditions are key elements throughout the 'Marie Curie Actions'.

The programme will be implemented by systematic investments in people, mainly through a coherent set of 'Marie Curie Actions', addressing researchers in terms of their skills and competence development at all stages of their careers, from initial research training to career development and life-long training. Mobility, both transnational and intersectoral, recognition of experiences and qualifications acquired in different sectors and countries, and adequate working conditions are key elements throughout the 'Marie Curie Actions', *taking* account of the principle of gender equality and the need for special facilities for disabled researchers.

Or. pl

Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men. Moreover, the disabled should enjoy equal access to all activities and special facilities should be provided for them to this end. To enable researchers from third countries to participate it is essential to take measures ensuring recognition of qualifications acquired in those countries. In addition, 'Marie Curie Actions' should encourage working conditions to be implemented which take into account not only gender equality but also the need to reconcile work and family life.

## Amendment 16 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 4

A strong participation by enterprises, including SMEs, is considered a crucial added value for this programme. The enhancement of industry-academia cooperation in terms of research training, career development and knowledge-sharing is encouraged throughout the "Marie Curie Actions", while a dedicated action is addressing industry-academia pathways and partnerships. A strong participation by enterprises, including SMEs, is considered a crucial added value for this programme. The enhancement of industry-academia cooperation in terms of research training, career development and knowledge-sharing is encouraged throughout the "Marie Curie Actions", while a dedicated action is addressing industry-academia pathways and partnerships, *encouraging the setting up of new undertakings and innovations by women entrepreneurs*.

## Justification

The digital divide is particularly marked in the small-business sector, which does not help the competitiveness of small and medium-sized businesses in which many women are involved. Specific attention should be paid to this aspect when implementing the programme.

## Amendment 17 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 5

The international dimension, as a fundamental component of human resources in research and development in Europe, will be addressed in terms of career development, as well as of strengthening and enriching international cooperation through researchers and attracting research talent to Europe. The international dimension will be incorporated throughout the "Marie Curie Actions" and in addition will be subject to The international dimension, as a fundamental component of human resources in research and development in Europe, will be addressed in terms of career development, *for both women and men,* as well as of strengthening and enriching international cooperation through researchers and attracting research talent to Europe. The international dimension will be incorporated throughout the "Marie Curie

Actions" and in addition will be subject to self-standing actions.

## Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men.

## Amendment 18 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 6

Due account will be taken of the principles of sustainable development and gender equality. The programme aims to ensure gender mainstreaming by encouraging equal opportunities in all 'Marie Curie Actions' and by benchmarking gender participation (a target of at least 40% participation by women). In addition, the actions will be designed to ensure that researchers can achieve an appropriate work/life balance and to contribute to facilitate resuming a research career after a break. Furthermore, considerations of the ethical, social, legal and wider cultural aspects of the research to be undertaken and its potential applications. as well as socio-economic impacts of scientific and technological development and foresight, will be addressed under this specific programme where relevant.

Due account will be taken of the principles of sustainable development and gender equality. The programme aims to ensure gender mainstreaming by encouraging equal opportunities in all 'Marie Curie Actions' and by benchmarking gender participation (a target of at least 40% participation by women). In addition, the actions will be designed to ensure that researchers, particularly women, can achieve an appropriate balance between work and family life and to contribute to facilitate resuming a research career after a break, particularly after a period of maternity leave or parental leave, also taking particular account of the importance of demographic change. Furthermore, considerations of the ethical, social, legal and wider cultural aspects of the research to be undertaken and its potential applications, as well as socio-economic impacts of scientific and technological development and foresight, will be addressed under this specific programme where relevant.

### Justification

Women do not enjoy the same promotion opportunities as men in the field of research. Measures therefore need to be adopted to allow them to resume their careers after a break, particularly after a period of parental or maternity leave.

## Amendment 19 Annex, Introduction, paragraph 7

In order to fully exploit Europe's potential for becoming more attractive to researchers, the 'Marie Curie Actions' will create concrete synergies with *other* actions both within the framework of the Community research policy, as well as within actions under other Community policies, *e.g. on* education, cohesion and employment. Such synergies will also be sought with actions at national and international level. In order to fully exploit Europe's potential for becoming more attractive to researchers, the 'Marie Curie Actions' will create concrete synergies with actions both within the framework of the Community research policy, as well as within actions under other Community policies, *making sure to include gender mainstreaming in fields such as* education, cohesion and employment. Such synergies will also be sought with actions at national and international level.

## Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men.

## Amendment 20 Annex, Ethical aspects, paragraph 1

During the implementation of this specific programme and in the research activities arising from it, fundamental ethical principles are to be respected. These include, inter alia, the principles reflected in the Charter of fundamental Rights of the EU, including the following: protection of human dignity and human life, protection of personal data and privacy, as well as animals and the environment in accordance with Community law and the latest versions of relevant international conventions, guidelines and codes of conduct, e.g. the Helsinki Declaration, the Convention of the Council of Europe on Human Rights and Biomedicine signed in Oviedo on 4 April 1997 and its Additional Protocols, the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, the

During the implementation of this specific programme and in the research activities arising from it, fundamental ethical principles are to be respected. These include, inter alia, the principles reflected in the Charter of fundamental Rights of the EU, including the following: protection of human dignity and human life, protection of personal data and privacy, as well as animals and the environment in accordance with Community law and the latest versions of relevant international conventions, guidelines and codes of conduct, e.g. the Helsinki Declaration, the Convention of the Council of Europe on Human Rights and Biomedicine signed in Oviedo on 4 April 1997 and its Additional Protocols, the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, the

Universal Declaration on the human genome and human rights adopted by UNESCO, UN Biological and Toxin Weapons Convention (BTWC), International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture, and the relevant World Health Organisation (WHO) resolutions. Universal Declaration on the human genome and human rights adopted by UNESCO, *UN General Assembly resolution 59/280 of 8 March 2005,* UN Biological and Toxin Weapons Convention (BTWC), International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture, and the relevant World Health Organisation (WHO) resolutions.

## Amendment 21 Annex, Ethical aspects, paragraph 3

In compliance with the principle of subsidiarity and the diversity of approaches existing in Europe, participants in research projects must conform to current legislation, regulations and ethical rules in the countries where the research will be carried out. In any case, national provisions apply and no research forbidden in any given Member State or other country will be supported by Community funding to be carried out in that Member State or country. In compliance with the principle of subsidiarity and the diversity of approaches existing in Europe, participants in research projects must conform to current legislation, regulations and ethical rules in the countries where the research will be carried out. In any case, national provisions apply and no research forbidden in any given Member State or other country will be supported by Community funding to be carried out in that Member State or country. *As a matter of principle, research shall receive financial support from the Community only where it is in conformity with human rights, in particular human dignity.* 

## Amendment 22 Annex, Activities, Initial training of researchers, paragraph 1

This action supports the initial training of researchers, typically directed at the first four years of researchers' careers, plus up to one additional year if necessary for the completion of the initial training. Through a trans-national networking mechanism, aimed at structuring a substantial share of the highquality initial research training capacity throughout Member States and associated countries in both public and private sectors, This action supports the initial training of researchers, typically directed at the first four years of researchers' careers, plus up to one additional year if necessary for the completion of the initial training, *ensuring a fair gender balance in participation*. Through a trans-national networking mechanism, aimed at structuring a substantial share of the high-quality initial research training capacity throughout

the action aims to improve researchers' career perspectives in both sectors, thereby also enhancing the attraction of young researchers to research careers. Member States and associated countries in both public and private sectors, the action aims to improve researchers' career perspectives in both sectors, thereby also enhancing the attraction of young researchers, *and of women in particular*, to research careers.

### Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men.

## Amendment 23 Annex, Activities, Life-long training and career development, paragraph 1

This action targets experienced researchers at different stages of their careers, by enhancing their individual competence diversification in terms of acquisition of multi- or interdisciplinary skills or the undertaking of inter-sectoral experiences. The aim is to support researchers in attaining and/or strengthening a leading independent position, e.g. principal investigator, professor or other senior position in education or enterprise. It will also assist researchers to resume a career in research after a break or to (re)integrate researchers into a research career in Member States and associated countries, including in their country of origin, after a mobility experience.

This action targets experienced researchers at different stages of their careers, by enhancing their individual competence diversification in terms of acquisition of multi- or interdisciplinary skills or the undertaking of inter-sectoral experiences. The aim is to support researchers in attaining and/or strengthening a leading independent position, e.g. principal investigator, professor or other senior position in education or enterprise. It will also assist researchers to resume a career in research after a break, *particularly after a period of maternity leave or parental leave*, or to (re)integrate researchers into a research career in Member States and associated countries, including in their country of origin, after a mobility experience, while promoting better reconciliation of work and family life to take account of, inter alia, demographic change. To that end, mutual recognition of qualifications acquired in the European Union and of those acquired in third countries will need to be improved.

### Justification

As the Commission proposal plans to focus specifically on gender mainstreaming, it should be made clear where appropriate that the activities apply to both women and men.

## Amendment 24 Annex, Activities, Lifelong training and career development, Paragraph 2

Researchers addressed under this action should have *at least* four years of *full-time* research experience; as the action is directed at life-long training and career development, it is however expected that the researchers will typically have a more senior profile in terms of experience. Researchers addressed under this action should have *in total* four years of research experience; as the action is directed at lifelong training and career development, it is however expected that the researchers will typically have a more senior profile in terms of experience.

## Justification

The experience possessed by the researchers in question should be four years in total and take into account all previous experience before and after parental leave in the case of women researchers.

## Amendment 25 Annex, Activities, specific actions, paragraph 1

In support of the creation of a genuine European labour market for researchers, a coherent set of accompanying actions is to be implemented, with a view to removing obstacles to mobility and to enhancing the career perspectives of researchers in Europe. These actions will aim, in particular, at raising stakeholders and general public awareness, including through 'Marie Curie' awards, at stimulating and supporting action at Member State level and at complementing Community actions. In support of the creation of a genuine European labour market for researchers, a coherent set of accompanying actions is to be implemented, with a view to removing obstacles to mobility and to enhancing the career perspectives of researchers in Europe, *making it easier to reconcile work and family life.* These actions will aim, in particular, at raising stakeholders and general public awareness, including through 'Marie Curie' awards, at stimulating and supporting action at Member State level and at complementing Community actions.

Justification

Efforts should be made to create the conditions that will enable women to play a more active part in the world of research, while enjoying scope for reconciling work and family life.

## PROCEDURE

Title	Proposal for a Council decision concerning the specific programme "People" implementing the 7th Framework Programme (2007-2013) of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities
Procedure number	(COM(2005)0442 - C6-0383/2005 - 2005/0187(CNS))
Committee responsible	ITRE
<b>Opinion by</b> Date announced in plenary	FEMM 17.11.2005
Enhanced cooperation – date announced in plenary	
Drafts(wo)man Date appointed	Amelia Sartori 30.11.2005
Previous drafts(wo)man	
Discussed in committee	24.1.2006 0.0.0000 0.0.0000
Date adopted	23.3.2006
Result of final vote	$\begin{array}{ccc} +: & 19 \\ -: & 0 \\ 0: & 0 \end{array}$
Members present for the final vote	Edit Bauer, Hiltrud Breyer, Edite Estrela, Ilda Figueiredo, Věra Flasarová, Lissy Gröner, Zita Gurmai, María Esther Herranz García, Rodi Kratsa-Tsagaropoulou, Pia Elda Locatelli, Astrid Lulling, Angelika Niebler, Siiri Oviir, Teresa Riera Madurell, Amalia Sartori, Britta Thomsen, Corien Wortmann-Kool, Anna Záborská
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Lidia Joanna Geringer de Oedenberg
Substitute(s) under Rule 178(2) present for the final vote	
Comments (available in one language only)	