



EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2009 - 2014

Committee on Transport and Tourism

2012/0065(COD)

27.11.2012

OPINION

of the Committee on Transport and Tourism

for the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs

on the proposal for a directive of the European Parliament and of the Council concerning flag State responsibilities for the enforcement of Council Directive 2009/13/EC implementing the Agreement concluded by the European Community Shipowners' Associations (ECSA) and the European Transport Workers' Federation (ETF) on the Maritime Labour Convention, 2006, and amending Directive 1999/63/EC
(COM(2012)0134 – C7-0083/2012 – 2012/0065(COD))

Rapporteur: Georges Bach

PA_Legam

SHORT JUSTIFICATION

1. Introduction

This proposal for a Directive takes place in a more general set of European legal measures put in place to enforce several standards of the Maritime Labour Convention (MLC) adopted by the International Labour Organisation (ILO) on 23 February 2006 in Geneva. At this stage, 30 countries have ratified the MLC representing more than 59% of the world fleet tonnage, fulfilling the necessary requirement for the Convention to enter into force, i.e. 30 ratifying countries representing 33 per cent of the world gross tonnage.

The MLC provides comprehensive rights and protection at work for the world's more than 1.2 million seafarers. It covers essential matters such as the minimum requirements for seafarers to work on board a ship (title I of the MLC), conditions of employment (title II of the MLC), accommodation, recreational facilities, food and catering (title III of the MLC) health protection, medical care, welfare and social security protection (title IV of the MLC) and compliance and enforcement (title V of the MLC) in order to guarantee decent working and living conditions on board ships, as well as procedures to implement these provisions.

The MLC aims at establishing a level playing field in the worldwide maritime industry by setting common minimum standards for all flags and seafarers.

The EU has already adopted Council Decision 2007/431/EC of 7 June 2007, authorizing Member States to ratify the MLC. Sixteen Member States are currently in the process of ratifying the Convention, while Spain, Poland, Bulgaria, Luxembourg, Denmark, Latvia, the Netherlands, Sweden and Cyprus have already ratified it.

The EU also adopted Council Directive 2009/13/EC of 16 February 2009, implementing the Agreement concluded by the European Community Shipowners' Associations (ECSA) and the European Transport Workers' Federation (ETF) on the MLC, this Agreement constitutes an outstanding achievement of the sectoral social dialogue.

Directive 2009/13/EC aligned European Legislation with the relevant provisions of the MLC establishing rights for seafarers contained in its titles I, II, III and IV. The European social partners, wishing to implement their agreement by means of a Council decision on the basis of Article 155 TFEU, did not have the power to include in their Agreement the enforcement provisions contained in title V of the MLC and asked the Commission to act in this respect.

The present proposal aims precisely to do this on the flag State responsibilities, recognising the vital importance of title V of the MLC for seafarers.

This proposal is closely associated with the Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Directive 2009/16/EC on port State control, aimed to ensure a global level-playing field for industry by enforcing the MLC in all European ports.

2. The "Transport" dimension of the proposal

This proposal is in line with the Commissions White paper of 28 March 2011 Roadmap to a Single European Transport Area – Towards a competitive and resource efficient transport system declaring *a social agenda for maritime transport*.

It will considerably strengthen the maritime transport dimension by enforcing the seafarers labour law rights as agreed on in the Maritime Labour Convention. It will promote and improve the sectors image and safeguard Europe's interests at world level by creating a global level-playing field.

Your rapporteur welcomes the proposal, which aims to enforce at EU level the very positive achievements of the social dialogue between stakeholders in the maritime sector.

Your rapporteur considers that the current proposal should be more detailed and strengthened by incorporating substantial parts of the Maritime Labour Convention in the text of the proposal itself.

Particularly, the proposed amendments will create a strong guidance framework for Member States acting in their flag states duties by establishing an effective and detailed inspection regime when they ensure the compliance of their ships with Directive 2009/13/EC. In the same spirit, the complaints proceedings as well as the inspection and enforcement procedures were reinforced in line with the Maritime Labour Convention.

AMENDMENTS

The Committee on Transport and Tourism calls on the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following amendments in its report:

Amendment 1

Proposal for a directive Recital 10

Text proposed by the Commission

(10) Although Directive 2009/21/EC governs the flag State responsibilities by incorporating the IMO's flag State audit scheme into Union law and by introducing

Amendment

(10) Although Directive 2009/21/EC governs the flag State responsibilities by incorporating the IMO's flag State audit scheme into Union law and by introducing

the certification of quality of national maritime authorities; a separate directive covering the maritime labour standards is deemed more appropriate and clearer to reflect the different purposes and procedures,

the certification of quality of national maritime authorities; a separate directive covering the maritime labour standards is deemed more appropriate and clearer to reflect the different purposes and procedures. ***Therefore, Directive 2009/21/EC, the provisions of which apply only to IMO Conventions, should not be affected by the present Directive. In any case, Member States could develop, implement and maintain a quality management system for the operational parts of the flag State-related activities of its maritime administration falling within the scope of this Directive.***

Amendment 2

Proposal for a directive Recital 11

Text proposed by the Commission

(11) Directive 2009/13/EC applies to seafarers on board ships flying the flag of a Member State. Member States should ***therefore monitor compliance with all the provisions of that*** Directive by ships flying their flag.

Amendment

(11) Directive 2009/13/EC applies to seafarers on board ships flying the flag of a Member State. Member States should ***ensure the effective discharge of their obligations as flag States with respect to the implementation of the relevant parts of MLC 2006 which correspond to the elements as set out in the Annex to*** Directive 2009/13/EC by ships flying their flag. ***In establishing an effective system for monitoring mechanisms, including inspections, a Member State could grant authorization to public institutions or other organisations within the meaning of MLC 2006.***

Amendment 3

Proposal for a directive Recital 13 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The application and/or interpretation of this Directive should, under no circumstances, lead to a reduction in the level of protection currently enjoyed by workers under Union legislation.

Justification

While minimum international standards are highly desirable, they should not be used to undermine the level of protection currently enjoyed by European seafarers. This is particularly important given the objective of encouraging more European citizens to take up maritime careers

Amendment 4

Proposal for a directive Article 2 – point b a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(ba) “maritime labour certificate”, “interim maritime labour certificate” and “declaration of maritime labour compliance” mean respectively the documents referred to in Standard A5.1.3, paragraph 9 of the Maritime Labour Convention, 2006 drawn up in the form corresponding to the models given in Appendix A5-II of that Convention;

Justification

Giving a definition of these certificates is necessary as they will be referred to in amendments proposed for this Directive.

Amendment 5

Proposal for a directive Article 3 – title

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Compliance monitoring

Compliance monitoring ***and certification***

Justification

Certification is an important part of the compliance monitoring system described in the proposal.

Amendment 6

Proposal for a directive Article 3 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

With respect to ships of less than 200 gross tonnage not engaged in international voyages, Member States may, in consultation with the ship-owners' and seafarers' organisations concerned, decide to adapt, as set out in Article II paragraph 6 of MLC 2006, the monitoring mechanisms, including inspections, to take account of the specific conditions relating to such ships.

Amendment 7

Proposal for a directive Article 3 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Each Member State shall establish an effective system for the inspection and certification of maritime labour conditions, in accordance with Regulations 5.1.3 and 5.1.4 and Standards A5.1.3 and A5.14 of the Maritime Labour Convention, ensuring that the working

and living conditions for seafarers on ships flying its flag meet, and continue to meet, the standards in that Convention.

Justification

The details regarding the issue, inspection, and enforcement of maritime labour certificates and declarations of maritime labour compliance are set out in Standards A5.1.3 and A5.1.4, and these should therefore be explicitly mentioned here.

Amendment 8

**Proposal for a directive
Article 3 – paragraph 1 b (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1b) In establishing an effective system for the inspection and certification of maritime labour conditions, Member States may, where appropriate, authorize public institutions or other organizations (including those of another Member State, if the latter agrees) which it recognizes as competent and independent to carry out inspections or to issue certificates or to do both. In all cases, the Member State shall remain fully responsible for the inspection and certification of the working and living conditions of the seafarers concerned on ships that fly its flag.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.1, paragraph 3.

Amendment 9

**Proposal for a directive
Article 3 – paragraph 1 c (new)**

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1c) A maritime labour certificate, complemented by a declaration of

maritime labour compliance, shall constitute prima facie evidence that the ship has been duly inspected by the Member State whose flag it flies and that the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC relating to working and living conditions of the seafarers have been met to the extent so certified.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.1, paragraph 4.

Amendment 10

Proposal for a directive
Article 3 – paragraph 1 d (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1d) Information about the system referred to in paragraph 1.a of this Article, including the method used for assessing its effectiveness, shall be included in the Member States reports to the International Labour Office pursuant to article 22 of the Constitution of that Office.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.1, paragraph 5;

Amendment 11

Proposal for a directive
Article 3 – paragraph 1 e (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1e) Each Member State shall establish clear objectives and standards covering the administration of its inspection and certification systems, as well as adequate

overall procedures for its assessment of the extent to which those objectives and standards are being attained.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A 5.1.1, paragraph 1.

Amendment 12

Proposal for a directive

Article 3 – paragraph 1 f (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

(1f) Each Member State shall require all ships that fly its flag to have a copy of Directive 2009/13/EC available on board.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.1, paragraph 2.

Amendment 13

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 – title

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Staff in charge of compliance monitoring

Recognised organisations and their staff in charge of compliance monitoring

Justification

To include a requirement, based on the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.3, paragraph 3, for Member States to carry certification.

Amendment 14

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 1 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Inspection and enforcement

1. Each Member State shall verify, through an effective and coordinated system of regular inspections, monitoring and other control measures, that ships that fly its flag comply with the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC as implemented in national laws and regulations.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.4, paragraph 1.

Amendment 15

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 – paragraph 1 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

The European Maritime Safety Agency (EMSA) may assist Member States in the supervision of recognised organisations performing certification tasks on their behalf in accordance with Article 9 of Directive 2009/15/EC, without prejudice to the rights and obligations of flag States.

Justification

Given that the Agency already helps the Commission to supervise recognised organisations, allowing it likewise to assist Member States would result in efficiency gains and reduce the strain on Member States' budgets.

Amendment 16

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 2 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2. Detailed requirements regarding the inspection and enforcement system referred to in paragraph 1 (new) of this Article are set out in paragraphs 3 (new) to 19 (new) of this Article.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.4, paragraph 2.

Amendment 17

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 3 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3. Each Member State shall maintain a system of inspection of the conditions for seafarers on ships that fly its flag which shall include verification that the measures relating to working and living conditions as set out in the declaration of maritime labour compliance, where applicable, are being followed, and that the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC are met.

Justification

Reflecting Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 1.

Amendment 18

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 4 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. Member States shall appoint a sufficient number of qualified inspectors to fulfil its responsibilities under paragraph 3 (new) of this Article. Where recognized organizations have been authorized to carry out inspections, Member States shall require that personnel carrying out the inspection are qualified to undertake these duties and shall provide them with the necessary legal authority to perform their duties.

Justification

Reflecting Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 2.

Amendment 19

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 5 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

5. Adequate provision shall be made to ensure that the inspectors have the training, competence, terms of reference, powers, status and independence necessary or desirable so as to enable them to carry out the verification and ensure the compliance referred to in paragraph 3 (new) of this Article.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 3.

Amendment 20

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 6 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

6. In respect of any Member State to whom Article 3, paragraph 1 a (new) of this Directive applies, inspections shall take place at the intervals required by Standard A5.1.3 of the Maritime Labour Convention, 2006, where applicable. In respect of any other Member State the interval between inspections shall in no case exceed three years.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 4 but distinguishing between Member States in which respect of which the MLC applies (in which case reference can be made to MLC, Standard A5.1.3) and those to which it does not.

Amendment 21

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 7 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

7. If a Member State receives a complaint which it does not consider manifestly unfounded or obtains evidence that a ship that flies its flag does not conform to the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC or that there are serious deficiencies in the implementation of the measures set out in the declaration of maritime labour compliance, the Member State shall take the steps necessary to investigate the matter and ensure that action is taken to remedy any deficiencies found.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 5.

Amendment 22

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 8 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

8. Adequate rules shall be provided and effectively enforced by each Member State in order to guarantee that inspectors have the status and conditions of service to ensure that they are independent of changes of government and of improper external influences.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 6.

Amendment 23

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 9 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

9. Inspectors, issued with clear guidelines as to the tasks to be performed and provided with proper credentials, shall be empowered:

(a) to board a ship that flies the flag of a Member State;

(b) to carry out any examination, test or inquiry which they may consider necessary in order to satisfy themselves that the standards are being strictly observed; and

(c) to require that any deficiency is remedied and, where they have grounds to believe that deficiencies constitute a serious breach of the requirements of

Directive 2009/13/EC (including seafarers' rights), or represent a significant danger to seafarers' safety, health or security, to prohibit a ship from leaving port until necessary actions are taken.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 7(a)-(c)

Amendment 24

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 10 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

10. Any action taken pursuant to paragraph 9(c) of this Article shall be subject to any right of appeal to a judicial or administrative authority.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 8

Amendment 25

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 11 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

11. Inspectors shall have the discretion to give advice instead of instituting or recommending proceedings when there is no clear breach of the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC that endangers the safety, health or security of the seafarers concerned and where there is no prior history of similar breaches.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 9.

Amendment 26

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 12 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

12. Inspectors shall treat as confidential the source of any grievance or complaint alleging a danger or deficiency in relation to seafarers' working and living conditions or a violation of laws and regulations and give no intimation to the ship owner, the ship owner's representative or the operator of the ship that an inspection was made as a consequence of such a grievance or complaint.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 10

Amendment 27

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 13 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

13. Inspectors shall not be entrusted with duties which might, because of their number or nature, interfere with effective inspection or prejudice in any way their authority or impartiality in their relations with shipowners, seafarers or other interested parties.

In particular, inspectors shall:

(a) be prohibited from having any direct or indirect interest in any operation which they are called upon to inspect; and

(b) subject to appropriate sanctions or disciplinary measures, not reveal, even after leaving service, any commercial

secrets or confidential working processes or information of a personal nature which may come to their knowledge in the course of their duties.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 11(a)-(b)

Amendment 28

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 14 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

14. Inspectors shall submit a report of each inspection to the competent authority of the Member State. One copy of the report in English or in the working language of the ship shall be furnished to the master of the ship and another copy shall be posted on the ship's notice board for the information of the seafarers and, upon request, sent to their representatives.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 12

Amendment 29

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 15 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

15. The competent authority of each Member State shall maintain records of inspections of the conditions for seafarers on ships that fly its flag. It shall publish an annual report on inspection activities within a reasonable time, not exceeding six months, after the end of the year.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 13

Amendment 30

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 16 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

16. In the case of an investigation pursuant to a major incident, the report shall be submitted to the competent authority of the Member State concerned as soon as practicable, but not later than one month following the conclusion of the investigation.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 14.

Amendment 31

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 17 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

17. When an inspection is conducted or when measures are taken under this Article, all reasonable efforts shall be made to avoid a ship being unreasonably detained or delayed.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 15

Amendment 32

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 18 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

18. Compensation shall be payable in accordance with national laws and regulations for any loss or damage suffered as a result of the wrongful exercise of the inspectors' powers. The burden of proof in each case shall be on the complainant.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 16

Amendment 33

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a – paragraph 19 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

19. Adequate penalties and other corrective measures for breaches of the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC (including seafarers' rights) and for obstructing inspectors in the performance of their duties shall be provided for and effectively enforced by each Member State.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 17

Amendment 34

Proposal for a directive

Article 4 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 4a

Inspection and enforcement

6. Inspections shall take place at the intervals required by Standard A5.1.3 of the Maritime Labour Convention, 2006.

Justification

Consistent with the Standard A5.1.4, paragraph 4, of the Maritime Labour Convention. As regards maritime labour certificates and declarations of maritime labour compliance, the Commission proposal amending Directive 2009/16/EC on port State control makes no distinction between those Member States which have ratified the MLC and those which have not yet done so. By virtue of the above wording, the requirement to carry out inspections would be imposed on Member States by EU law.

Amendment 35

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 1 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

On-board complaint procedures

1. Member States shall require that ships that fly its flag have on-board procedures for the fair, effective and expeditious handling of seafarer complaints alleging breaches of the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC (including seafarers' rights).

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.5, paragraph 1.

Amendment 36

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 2 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

2. Member States shall prohibit and penalize any kind of victimization of a seafarer for filing a complaint.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.5, paragraph 2.

Amendment 37

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 3 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

3. The provisions in this Article are without prejudice to a seafarer's right to seek redress through whatever legal means the seafarer considers appropriate.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Regulation 5.1.5, paragraph 3.

Amendment 38

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 4 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

4. Without prejudice to any wider scope that may be given in national laws or regulations or collective agreements, the on-board procedures may be used by seafarers to lodge complaints relating to any matter that is alleged to constitute a breach of the requirements of Directive 2009/13/EC (including seafarers' rights).

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.5, paragraph 1.

Amendment 39

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 5 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

5. Each Member State shall ensure that, in its laws or regulations, appropriate on board complaint procedures are in place to meet the requirements of paragraphs 1 (new) to 3 (new) of this Article. Such procedures shall seek to resolve complaints at the lowest level possible. However, in all cases, seafarers shall have a right to complain directly to the master and, where they consider it necessary, to appropriate external authorities.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.5, paragraph 2

Amendment 40

Proposal for a directive

Article 5 a – paragraph 6 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

6. The on-board complaint procedures shall include the right of the seafarer to be accompanied or represented during the complaints procedure, as well as safeguards against the possibility of victimization of seafarers for filing complaints. The term “victimization” covers any adverse action taken by any person with respect to a seafarer for lodging a complaint which is not manifestly vexatious or maliciously made.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.5, paragraph 3.

Amendment 41

Proposal for a directive Article 5 a – paragraph 7 (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

7. In addition to a copy of their seafarers' employment agreement, all seafarers shall be provided with a copy of the on-board complaint procedures applicable on the ship. This shall include contact information for the competent authority in the flag State and, where different, in the seafarers' country of residence, and the name of a person or persons on board the ship who can, on a confidential basis, provide seafarers with impartial advice on their complaint and otherwise assist them in following the complaint procedures available to them on board the ship.

Justification

Reflecting the Maritime Labour Convention, Standard A5.1.5, paragraph 4

Amendment 42

Proposal for a directive Article 5 a (new)

Text proposed by the Commission

Amendment

Article 5 a

Reports

Every five years, the Commission shall submit a report to the European Parliament and the Council on the application of this Directive.

The report shall assess the performance of Member States as flag States and propose any additional measures necessary in order to transpose, and ensure compliance with, the Convention.

Justification

It is essential to encourage transposition of the MLC and help ensure that provisions relating to flag States will be implemented. Regular assessment reports are provided for in Article 9 of Directive 2009/21/EC. Reports of this kind should also be produced on the implementation of the directive being proposed here.

PROCEDURE

Title	Flag State responsibilities for the enforcement of Council Directive 2009/13/EC implementing the Agreement concluded by the European Community Shipowners' Associations (ECSA) and the European Transport Workers' Federation (ETF) on the Maritime Labour Convention, 2006, and amending Directive 1999/63/EC						
References	COM(2012)0134 – C7-0083/2012 – 2012/0065(COD)						
Committee responsible Date announced in plenary	EMPL 29.3.2012						
Opinion by Date announced in plenary	TRAN 29.3.2012						
Rapporteur Date appointed	Georges Bach 18.6.2012						
Discussed in committee	9.10.2012						
Date adopted	27.11.2012						
Result of final vote	<table> <tr> <td>+: </td><td>34</td></tr> <tr> <td>–: </td><td>0</td></tr> <tr> <td>0: </td><td>5</td></tr> </table>	+:	34	–:	0	0:	5
+:	34						
–:	0						
0:	5						
Members present for the final vote	Magdi Cristiano Allam, Inés Ayala Sender, Georges Bach, Erik Bánki, Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, Philip Bradbourn, Antonio Cancian, Michael Cramer, Joseph Cuschieri, Philippe De Backer, Luis de Grandes Pascual, Christine De Veyrac, Saïd El Khadraoui, Ismail Ertug, Carlo Fidanza, Knut Fleckenstein, Jacqueline Foster, Mathieu Grosch, Jim Higgins, Dieter-Lebrecht Koch, Georgios Koumoutsakos, Werner Kuhn, Jörg Leichtfried, Bogusław Liberadzki, Gesine Meissner, Hubert Pirker, Olga Sehnalová, Brian Simpson, Keith Taylor, Giommara Uggias, Peter van Dalen, Artur Zasada, Roberts Zile						
Substitute(s) present for the final vote	Phil Bennion, Spyros Danellis, Markus Ferber, Dominique Riquet, Alfreds Rubiks, Sabine Wils						