



**2019/2101(DEC)**

22.1.2020

## **OPINION**

of the Committee on Transport and Tourism

for the Committee on Budgetary Control

on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Sky 2  
Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2018  
(2019/2101(DEC))

Rapporteur for opinion: Maria Grapini

PA\_NonLeg

## SUGGESTIONS

The Committee on Transport and Tourism calls on the Committee on Budgetary Control, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions into its motion for a resolution:

1. Welcomes the finding of the Court of Auditors that the transactions underlying the accounts of the Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking ('the Undertaking') for the financial year 2018 are legal and regular in all material respects;
2. Emphasises that the objectives of the Joint Undertaking should be adjusted to progressive decarbonisation and that the necessary financial and human resources should be automatically provided for any adjustments made;
3. Notes that the Undertaking is a public-private partnership between the Union and the aeronautic industry whose goal is to develop breakthrough technologies to significantly increase the environmental performance of aeroplanes and air transport; notes that it was set up as the "Clean Sky Joint Undertaking" in 2007 under the Seventh Framework Programme for Research and Technological Development ("FP7") and became the "Clean Sky 2 Joint Undertaking" in 2014 under the Horizon 2020 Framework Programme for Research and Innovation;
4. Notes that the Undertaking's programmes are jointly funded under Horizon 2020 (for the period 2014-2020) through subsidies of the Union up to EURO 1 755 million and in-kind contributions from the private members of at least EURO 2 193,75 million; notes that the Union and the private members equally share the administrative costs that shall not exceed EUR 78 million over that period;
5. Welcomes the major contribution made by the Undertaking to increased efficiency in the aviation sector; highlights the very good results and the essential role played by the Undertaking in Europe to ensure net accelerations in green technologies aiming at reducing CO<sub>2</sub>, gas emissions and noise levels produced by aircrafts; highlights the strategic importance that this Undertaking should play under the future Horizon Europe programme towards contributing to the new 2050 "climate neutrality" goals and to the planned CO<sub>2</sub> reductions due to technological progress;
6. Points out that global use of the technologies created and promoted by the Joint Undertaking could eliminate the equivalent of total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions by the Netherlands;
7. Stresses that Clean Sky I technologies have reduced CO<sub>2</sub> emissions per passenger by 19% on long-haul and 40% on medium-haul flights; calls for the Joint Undertaking to be given all necessary human and financial resources to build on this successful approach;
8. Notes that up to 40% of the Undertaking funding is allocated to its 16 Leaders and their affiliates i.e. to the industrials committed to deliver the full Clean Sky 2 programme throughout its duration; notes that 30% of the Undertaking funding shall be awarded via calls for proposals and calls for tenders to its Core partners (selected for long-term commitments to the programme); further notes that the remaining 30% of the funding shall be awarded via calls for proposals and calls for tenders to other partners (participating in specific topics and projects in the context of a well-defined, limited commitment);

9. Notes that the Undertaking's final budget for 2018 was EUR 367,6 million in commitment appropriations and EUR 340,3 million in payment appropriations; notes that 98,7% of commitment appropriations and 98,6% of payment appropriations consist of Commission subsidies and carry over from previous years;
10. Notes that the Undertaking attained a rate of implementation of 99,97% for the commitment appropriations and 98,21% for the payment appropriations; notes the decrease in the execution rate of payment appropriations for administrative expenditures to 79,23% (from 93,13% in 2017);
11. Notes that, as of the cut-off date of the provisional accounts 2018 (end of February 2019), the private members of the Undertaking have reported a cumulative sum of EUR 399 million as In-Kind contributions for Operational activities (IKOP), and that the Undertaking has validated certified contribution to the value of EUR 279,9 million; notes similarly that the private members have reported a cumulative EUR 827,9 million in In Kind contributions for Additional Activities (IKAA), of which EUR 620 million were validated by the Undertaking;
12. Notes that the Undertaking now counts 16 Leaders, 193 Core partners (including 50 SMEs) and that nine calls for proposals were launched (to allocate the remaining of funds to other partners); notes that eight of these calls have been evaluated leading to the selection of 560 partners (including 31% of SMEs that account for 25% of funding) from 27 countries;
13. Notes that the Undertaking is planning to revise its Financial Rules in order to align them to the new financial rules applicable to the general budget of the Union in accordance with Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of the Council<sup>1</sup>;
14. Notes that the *ex-post* audits of the Undertaking projects led under the FP7 between 2011-2018 reveal an accumulated residual error (after corrective measures) of 1,21%, which lies well below the target of 2%; notes that the *ex-post* audits of the Undertaking's projects led under the Horizon 2020 programme reveal an accumulated residual error of 1,11% for the sample examined between 2016 and 2018;
15. Notes that the Internal Audit Service issued a very important recommendation to the Undertaking for elaborating a consolidated risk register, which should cover risk affecting the programme and the Undertaking as a stand-alone entity; notes that the Internal Audit Officer (IAO) declared to the management of the Undertaking a lack of objectivity due to their repeated involvement in management tasks and due to the quality management processes; urges the Undertaking to immediately resolve this issue and fully implement the recommendation of the Internal Audit Officer;
16. Notes with concern that the IAO identified several risk areas, which require actions of the

---

<sup>1</sup> Regulation (EU, Euratom) 2018/1046 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 July 2018 on the financial rules applicable to the general budget of the Union, amending Regulations (EU) No 1296/2013, (EU) No 1301/2013, (EU) No 1303/2013, (EU) No 1304/2013, (EU) No 1309/2013, (EU) No 1316/2013, (EU) No 223/2014, (EU) No 283/2014, and Decision No 541/2014/EU and repealing Regulation (EU, Euratom) No 966/2012 (OJ L 193, 30.7.2018, p. 1).

Undertaking's management; expects the Undertaking's management to take all necessary measures to mitigate those risks;

17. Notes that during the year 2018, three cases of alleged fraudulent activities were detected in connection with beneficiaries receiving funds from the Undertaking and were notified to OLAF; calls on the Undertaking to take all necessary measures to prevent cases of fraud in the future;
18. Proposes that Parliament grants discharge to the Executive Director of the Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the Undertaking's budget for the financial year 2018.

## INFORMATION ON ADOPTION IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

<b>Date adopted</b>	21.1.2020
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+: 43 -: 5 0: 1
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Scott Ainslie, Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, David Bull, Marco Campomenosi, Ciarán Cuffe, Johan Danielsson, Andor Deli, Anna Deparnay-Grunenberg, Ismail Ertug, Gheorghe Falcă, Giuseppe Ferrandino, Søren Gade, Isabel García Muñoz, Jens Gieseke, Kateřina Konečná, Elena Kountoura, Julie Lechanteux, Bogusław Liberadzki, Peter Lundgren, Benoît Lutgen, Elżbieta Katarzyna Łukacijewska, Marian-Jean Marinescu, Tilly Metz, Cláudia Monteiro de Aguiar, June Alison Mummery, Caroline Nagtegaal, Jan-Christoph Oetjen, Philippe Olivier, Dominique Riquet, Vera Tax, Barbara Thaler, Petar Vitanov, Elissavet Vozemberg-Vrionidi, Lucia Vuolo, Roberts Zīle, Kosma Złotowski
<b>Substitutes present for the final vote</b>	Clotilde Armand, Leila Chaibi, Angel Dzhambazki, Markus Ferber, Maria Grapini, Pierre Karleskind, Andrey Novakov, Catherine Rowett, Henna Virkkunen
<b>Substitutes under Rule 209(7) present for the final vote</b>	Tiziana Beghin, Elena Lizzi, Juozas Olekas, Tsvetelina Penkova

## FINAL VOTE BY ROLL CALL IN COMMITTEE ASKED FOR OPINION

43	+
ECR	Angel Dzhambazki, Peter Lundgren, Roberts Zīle, Kosma Złotowski
GUE/NGL	Leila Chaïbi, Kateřina Konečná, Elena Kountoura
ID	Philippe Olivier
NI	Tiziana Beghin
PPE	Andor Deli, Gheorghe Falcă, Markus Ferber, Jens Gieseke, Elżbieta Katarzyna Łukacijewska, Benoît Lutgen, Marian-Jean Marinescu, Cláudia Monteiro de Aguiar, Andrey Novakov, Barbara Thaler, Henna Virkkunen, Elissavet Vozemberg-Vrionidi
RENEW	Clotilde Armand, Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, Søren Gade, Pierre Karleskind, Caroline Nagtegaal, Jan-Christoph Oetjen, Dominique Riquet
S&D	Johan Danielsson, Ismail Ertug, Giuseppe Ferrandino, Isabel García Muñoz, Maria Grapini, Bogusław Liberadzki, Juozas Olekas, Tsvetelina Penkova, Vera Tax, Petar Vitanov
VERTS/ALE	Scott Ainslie, Ciarán Cuffe, Anna Deparnay-Grunenberg, Tilly Metz, Catherine Rowett

5	-
ID	Marco Campomenosi, Elena Lizzi, Lucia Vuolo
NI	David Bull, June Alison Mummery

1	0
ID	Julie Lechanteux

Key to symbols:

+ : in favour

- : against

0 : abstention